

**Unclassified**

**ENV/JM/MONO(2011)6**

Organisation de Coopération et de Développement Économiques  
Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

**14-Apr-2011**

**English - Or. English**

**ENVIRONMENT DIRECTORATE  
JOINT MEETING OF THE CHEMICALS COMMITTEE AND  
THE WORKING PARTY ON CHEMICALS, PESTICIDES AND BIOTECHNOLOGY**

**Cancels & replaces the same document of 02 March 2011**

**REPORT OF THE OECD SEMINAR ON RISK REDUCTION THROUGH PREVENTION,  
DETECTION AND CONTROL OF THE ILLEGAL INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN AGRICULTURAL  
PESTICIDES**

**Series on Pesticides  
No. 59**

**19 May 2010, OECD, Paris**

**JT03300253**

Document complet disponible sur OLIS dans son format d'origine  
Complete document available on OLIS in its original format



**ENV/JM/MONO(2011)6  
Unclassified**

**English - Or. English**



OECD Environment, Health and Safety Publications  
Series on Pesticides

No. 59

**Report of the OECD Seminar on Risk Reduction  
through Prevention, Detection and Control  
of the Illegal International Trade  
in Agricultural Pesticides**

**IOMC**

**INTER-ORGANIZATION PROGRAMME FOR THE SOUND MANAGEMENT OF CHEMICALS**

A cooperative agreement among **FAO, ILO, UNEP, UNIDO, UNITAR, WHO, World Bank and OECD**

**Environment Directorate**

**ORGANISATION FOR ECONOMIC COOPERATION AND DEVELOPMENT**

**Paris 2011**

***Also published in the Series on Pesticides***

- No. 1 *Data Requirements for Pesticide Registration in OECD Member Countries: Survey Results* (1993)
- No. 2 *Final Report on the OECD Pilot Project to Compare Pesticide Data Reviews* (1995)
- No. 3 *Data Requirements for Biological Pesticides* (1996)
- No. 4 *Activities to Reduce Pesticide Risks in OECD and Selected FAO Countries. Part I: Summary Report* (1996)
- No. 5 *Activities to Reduce Pesticide Risks in OECD and Selected FAO Countries. Part II: Survey Responses* (1996)
- No. 6 *OECD Governments' Approaches to the Protection of Proprietary Rights and Confidential Business Information in Pesticide Registration* (1998)
- No. 7 *OECD Survey on the Collection and Use of Agricultural Pesticide Sales Data: Survey Results* (1999) [see also No.47]
- No. 8 *Report of the OECD/FAO Workshop on Integrated Pest Management and Pesticide Risk Reduction* (1999)
- No. 9 *Report of the Survey of OECD Member Countries' Approaches to the Regulation of Biocides* (1999)
- No. 10 *Guidance Notes for Analysis and Evaluation of Repeat-Dose Toxicity Studies* (2000)
- No. 11 *Survey of Best Practices in the Regulation of Pesticides in Twelve OECD Countries* (2001)
- No. 12 *Guidance for Registration Requirements for Pheromones and Other Semiochemicals Used for Arthropod Pest Control* (2001)
- No. 13 *Report of the OECD Workshop on Sharing the Work of Agricultural Pesticide Reviews* (2002)
- No. 14 *Guidance Notes for Analysis and Evaluation of Chronic Toxicity and Carcinogenicity Studies* (2002).
- No. 15 *Persistent, Bioaccumulative and Toxic Pesticides in OECD Member Countries*, (2002)
- No. 16 *OECD Guidance for Industry Data Submissions for Pheromones and Other Semiochemicals and their Active Substances (Dossier Guidance for Pheromones and other Semiochemicals)* (2003)

- No. 17 *OECD Guidance for Country Data Review Reports for Pheromones and Other Semiochemicals and their Active Substances* (Monograph Guidance for Pheromones and other Semiochemicals) (2003)
- No. 18 *Guidance for Registration Requirements for Microbial Pesticides* (2003)
- No. 19 *Registration and Work sharing, Report of the OECD/FAO Zoning Project* (2003)
- No. 20 *OECD Workshop on Electronic Tools for data submission, evaluation and exchange for the Regulation of new and existing industrial chemicals, agricultural pesticides and biocides* (2003)
- No. 21 *Guidance for Regulation of Invertebrates as Biological Control Agents (IBCA<sub>s</sub>)* (2004)
- No. 22 *OECD Guidance for Country Data Review Reports on Microbial Pest Control Products and their Microbial Pest Control Agents* (Monograph Guidance for Microbials) (2004)
- No. 23 *OECD Guidance for Industry Data Submissions for Microbial Pest Control Product and their Microbial Pest Control Agents* (Dossier Guidance for Microbials) (2004)
- No. 24 *Report of the OECD Pesticide Risk Reduction Steering Group Seminar on Compliance* (2004)
- No. 25 *The Assessment of Persistency and Bioaccumulation in the Pesticide Registration Frameworks within the OECD Region* (2005)
- No. 26 *Report of the OECD Pesticide Risk Reduction Group Seminar on Minor Uses and Pesticide Risk Reduction* (2005)
- No. 27 *Summary Report of the OECD Project on Pesticide Terrestrial Risk Indicators (TERI)* (2005)
- No. 28 *Report of the OECD Pesticide Risk Reduction Steering Group Seminar on Pesticide Risk Reduction through Good Container Management* (2005)
- No. 29 *Report of the OECD Pesticide Risk Reduction Steering Group Seminar on Risk Reduction through Good Pesticide Labelling* (2006)
- No. 30 *Report of the OECD Pesticide Risk Reduction Steering Group: The Second Risk Reduction Survey* (2006)
- No. 31 *Guidance Document on the Definition of Residue* [also published in the series on Testing and Assessment, No. 63] (2006, revised 2009)
- No. 32 *Guidance Document on Overview of Residue Chemistry Studies* [also published in the series on Testing and Assessment, No. 64] (2006, revised 2009)

- No. 33 *Overview of Country and Regional Review Procedures for Agricultural Pesticides and Relevant Documents* (2006)
- No. 34 *Frequently Asked Questions about Work Sharing on Pesticide Registration Reviews* (2007)
- No. 35 *Report of the OECD Pesticide Risk Reduction Steering Group Seminar on "Pesticide Risk Reduction through Better Application Technology"* (2007)
- No. 36 *Analysis and Assessment of Current Protocols to Develop Harmonised Test Methods and Relevant Performance Standards for the Efficacy Testing of Treated Articles/Treated Materials* (2007)
- No. 37 *Report on the OECD Pesticide Risk Reduction Steering Group Workshop "Pesticide User Compliance"* (2007)
- No. 38 *Survey of the Pesticide Risk Reduction Steering Group on Minor Uses of Pesticides* (2007)
- No. 39 *Guidance Document on Pesticide Residue Analytical Methods* [also published in the series on Testing and Assessment, No. 72] (2007)
- No. 40 *Report of the Joint OECD Pesticide Risk Reduction Steering Group EC-HAIR Seminar on Harmonised Environmental Indicators for Pesticide Risk* (2007)
- No. 41 *The Business Case for the Joint Evaluation of Dossiers (Data Submissions) using Work-sharing Arrangements* (2008)
- No. 42 *Report of the OECD Pesticide Risk Reduction Steering Group Seminar on Risk Reduction through Better Worker Safety and Training* (2008)
- No. 43 *Working Document on the Evaluation of Microbials for Pest Control* (2008)
- Guidance Document on Magnitude of Pesticide Residues in Processed Commodities* - only published in the Series on Testing and Assessment, No. 96 (2008)
- No. 44 *Report of Workshop on the Regulation of BioPesticides: Registration and Communication Issues* (2009)
- No. 45 *Report of the Seminar on Pesticide Risk Reduction through Education / Training the Trainers* (2009)
- No. 46 *Report of the Seminar on Pesticide Risk Reduction through Spray Drift Reduction Strategies as part of National Risk Management* (2009)
- No. 47 *OECD Survey on Countries' Approaches to the Collection and Use of Agricultural Pesticide Sales and Usage Data: Survey Results* (2009)
- No. 48 *OECD Strategic Approach in Pesticide Risk Reduction* (2009)

- No. 49 *OECD Guidance Document on Defining Minor Uses of Pesticides* (2009)
- No. 50 *Report of the OECD Seminar on Pesticide Risk Reduction through Better National Risk Management Strategies for Aerial Application* (2010)
- No. 51 *OECD Survey on Pesticide Maximum Residue Limit (MRL) Policies: Survey Results* (2010)
- No. 52 *OECD Survey of Pollinator Testing, Research, Mitigation and Information Management: Survey Results* (2010)
- No.53 *Report of the 1<sup>st</sup> OECD BioPesticides Steering Group Seminar on Identity and Characterisation of Micro-organisms* (2010)
- No. 54 *OECD Survey on Education, Training and Certification of Agricultural Pesticide Users, Trainers and Advisors, and Other Pesticide Communicators: Survey Results* (2010)
- No. 55 *OECD Survey on How Pesticide Ingredients Other than the Stated Pesticide Active Ingredient(s) are Reviewed and Regulated: Survey Results* (2010)
- No. 56 *OECD MRL Calculator User Guide* (2011)
- No. 57 *OECD MRL Calculator MRL Statistical White Paper* (2011)
- No. 58 *Report of the OECD Seminar on Pesticide Risk Reduction Strategies Near/in Residential Areas* (2011)

***Published separately***

*OECD Guidance for Country Data Review Reports on Plant Protection Products and their Active Substances-Monograph Guidance* (1998, revised 2001, 2005, 2006)

*OECD Guidance for Industry Data Submissions on Plant Protection Products and their Active Substances-Dossier Guidance* (1998, revised 2001, 2005)

*Report of the Pesticide Aquatic Risk Indicators Expert Group* (2000)

*Report of the OECD Workshop on the Economics of Pesticide Risk Reduction* (2001)

*Report of the OECD-FAO-UNEP Workshop on Obsolete Pesticides* (2000)

*Report of the OECD Pesticide Aquatic Risk Indicators Expert Group* (2000)

*Report of the 2nd OECD Workshop on Pesticide Risk Indicators* (1999)

*Guidelines for the Collection of Pesticide Usage Statistics Within Agriculture and Horticulture* (1999)

*Report of the [1st] OECD Workshop on Pesticide Risk Indicators* (1997)

*Report of the OECD/FAO Workshop on Pesticide Risk Reduction* (1995)

**© OECD 2011**

Applications for permission to reproduce or translate all or part of this material should be made to: Head of Publications Service, RIGHTS@oecd.org, OECD, 2 rue André-Pascal, 75775 Paris Cedex 16, France



## About the OECD

The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) is an intergovernmental organisation in which representatives of 34 industrialised countries in North and South America, Europe and the Asia and Pacific region, as well as the European Commission, meet to co-ordinate and harmonise policies, discuss issues of mutual concern, and work together to respond to international problems. Most of the OECD's work is carried out by more than 200 specialised committees and working groups composed of member country delegates. Observers from several countries with special status at the OECD, and from interested international organisations, attend many of the OECD's workshops and other meetings. Committees and working groups are served by the OECD Secretariat, located in Paris, France, which is organised into directorates and divisions.

The Environment, Health and Safety Division publishes free-of-charge documents in ten different series: **Testing and Assessment; Good Laboratory Practice and Compliance Monitoring; Pesticides and Biocides; Risk Management; Harmonisation of Regulatory Oversight in Biotechnology; Safety of Novel Foods and Feeds; Chemical Accidents; Pollutant Release and Transfer Registers; Emission Scenario Documents;** and **Safety of Manufactured Nanomaterials.** More information about the Environment, Health and Safety Programme and EHS publications is available on the OECD's World Wide Web site ([www.oecd.org/ehs/](http://www.oecd.org/ehs/)).

*This publication was developed in the IOMC context. The contents do not necessarily reflect the views or stated policies of individual IOMC Participating Organizations.*

The Inter-Organisation Programme for the Sound Management of Chemicals (IOMC) was established in 1995 following recommendations made by the 1992 UN Conference on Environment and Development to strengthen co-operation and increase international co-ordination in the field of chemical safety. The Participating Organisations are FAO, ILO, UNEP, UNIDO, UNITAR, WHO, World Bank and OECD. UNDP is an observer. The purpose of the IOMC is to promote co-ordination of the policies and activities pursued by the Participating Organisations, jointly or separately, to achieve the sound management of chemicals in relation to human health and the environment.

**This publication is available electronically, at no charge.**

**For this and many other Environment,  
Health and Safety publications, consult the OECD's  
World Wide Web site ([www.oecd.org/ehs/](http://www.oecd.org/ehs/))**

**or contact:**

**OECD Environment Directorate,  
Environment, Health and Safety Division  
2 rue André-Pascal  
75775 Paris Cedex 16  
France**

**Fax: (33-1) 44 30 61 80**

**E-mail: [ehscont@oecd.org](mailto:ehscont@oecd.org)**

## FOREWORD

This document is the report of the OECD *Seminar on Risk Reduction through Prevention, Detection and Control of the Illegal International Trade in Agricultural Pesticides* that took place on 19 May, 2010 at OECD, Paris, France, and was chaired by Dr. Wolfgang Zornbach of the German Federal Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Consumer Protection. It was attended by representatives of the pesticide regulatory authorities of 16 OECD countries, the European Commission, Estonia, Brazil and PR China, representatives from industry, and international experts such as national custom officers and inspectors.

This was the twelfth in a series of Seminars organised by the OECD Pesticide Risk Reduction Steering Group, a sub-group of the OECD Working Group on Pesticides. These Seminars focus on key issues in pesticide risk reduction of concern to OECD governments. The Seminars are intended to provide an opportunity for OECD governments to discuss the issues together with non-governmental stakeholders and to develop recommendations for further OECD activities.

The topic of “Illegal International Trade in Agricultural Pesticides” (covering both trade in counterfeited pesticides and trade in pesticides that are not registered in the country of destination) was selected for this seminar considering the significant impacts for pesticide risk reduction in the fields of human health, food chain safety, obsolete stocks, and the environment. Pesticides are among the most regulated products in the world, but international shipments of counterfeit active ingredients and finished products often escape oversight by pesticide regulators and custom offices in OECD countries. This does not only lead to a distortion of pesticide national, import/export markets but undermines the national legislation on registration, which aims at avoiding or reducing risks to human health, the environment and crops.

After a series of presentations on governments’ and other stakeholders’ approaches and experiences (copies of all presentations are in [Annex 4](#)), the Seminar discussed the various issues associated with the illegal international trade of pesticides: risks and consequences of using illegal pesticides, risks linked to the pesticide supply/logistical chain, existing systems in place in countries, difficulties faced by authorities and customs, etc. The Seminar developed a set of recommendations targeted at governments, industry, all stakeholders and OECD.

The Seminar report was approved out-of-session by the Working Group on Pesticides by written procedure that was finished on 15 January 2011.

This document is being published under the responsibility of the Joint Meeting of the Chemicals Committee and the Working Party on Chemicals, Pesticides and Biotechnology, which has agreed that it be unclassified and made available to the public.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>PARTICIPANTS .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>PURPOSE OF THE SEMINAR.....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>SCOPE OF THE SEMINAR .....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>STRUCTURE OF THE SEMINAR.....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>GOVERNMENT AND STAKEHOLDER EXPERIENCE, PERSPECTIVES AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....</b>	<b>15</b>
Stock taking of the situation.....	16
Recommendations from speakers.....	17
<b>SEMINAR RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE VARIOUS STAKEHOLDERS .....</b>	<b>19</b>
Recommendation to governments .....	19
Recommendation to industry.....	19
Recommendation to all stakeholders.....	19
Recommendations to OECD .....	19
<b>ANNEX 1: LIST OF OECD SEMINARS ON PESTICIDE RISK REDUCTION.....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>ANNEX 2: SEMINAR PROGRAMME .....</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>ANNEX 3: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS.....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>ANNEX 4: LIST OF PRESENTATIONS .....</b>	<b>30</b>

## INTRODUCTION

1. This report presents the results and recommendations of an *OECD Seminar on risk reduction through prevention, detection and control of the illegal international trade in agricultural pesticides*. This one-day Seminar, held on 19 May 2010, was chaired by Wolfgang Zornbach (Germany), Chairman of the OECD Risk Reduction Steering Group (RRSG), and took place at OECD, in Paris, France.

2. This Seminar was the twelfth in a series of Seminars organised by the OECD RRSG, a sub-group of the OECD Working Group on Pesticides (WGP), a group composed primarily of representatives of the 34 OECD governments but that also includes representatives of the European Commission and other international organisations, the pesticide industry, and the environmental community. RRSG Seminars focus on key issues in pesticide risk reduction of concern to OECD countries. The Seminars are intended to provide an opportunity for OECD governments to discuss these issues together with non-governmental stakeholders and to develop recommendations for further follow-up OECD activities. The OECD Pesticides Programme has made great accomplishments toward helping national governments coordinate the efficiency and effectiveness of pesticide risk reduction work, in part because of Seminars such as the one held on pesticide illegal trade issues. Past OECD Risk Reduction Seminars are listed in [Annex 1](#).

3. Members of the RRSG selected “Risk Reduction through Prevention, Detection and Control of the Illegal International Trade in Agricultural Pesticides” as the title and topic of this seminar considering the **significant impacts for pesticide risk reduction** in the fields of human health, food chain safety, obsolete stocks, and the environment. The worldwide increase in known incidents of illegal pesticides was noted during earlier OECD meetings of the WGP during which members requested a seminar on the topic. Pesticides are among the most regulated products in the world, but international shipments of counterfeit active ingredients and finished products often escape oversight by pesticide regulators and custom offices in OECD countries. This does not only lead to a **distortion of pesticide markets** but **undermines the national legislation on registration**, which aims at avoiding or reducing risks to human health, the environment and crops. With particular concern to the safe export and import of active ingredients and pesticide products, and taking into account the requirements of the Rotterdam Convention and the International Code of Conduct on the Distribution and Use of Pesticides, new practices and cooperation between stakeholders needed to be addressed to ensure that only legal pesticides are sold and used. Developing best practices and improved collaboration between pesticide regulators, customs, and other stakeholders was considered crucial for reducing risk to health and the environment.

## PARTICIPANTS

4. People attending the OECD Seminar included:

- Representatives of the pesticide regulatory authorities of OECD countries (Australia, Austria, Belgium, Canada, Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, France, Germany, Japan, Mexico, the Netherlands, New Zealand, Slovak Republic, Switzerland, United Kingdom and United States), the European Commission, Brazil and PR China (two OECD enhanced engagement countries).

- Representatives from industry, including CropLife International (an international association of pesticide manufacturers) and BIAC (Business and Industry Advisory Committee to the OECD)
  - International experts dealing with issues associated with illegal trade of pesticides such as national custom officers and inspectors.
5. A participant list is provided in Annex 3.

## **PURPOSE OF THE SEMINAR**

6. The main objectives of the Seminar were:
- to collect information about the extent of the problem and possible future trends
  - to get a better overview of national current practices and activities for the control of imports/exports of agricultural pesticides
  - to identify ways to improve information exchange and cooperation between regulators and customs within a country and among countries
  - to identify ways to reduce risk through avoiding illegal trade of pesticides
  - to suggest and discuss options of further steps for governments and key stakeholders in OECD and non-OECD countries in order to address the identified issues and implement solutions in an effective manner
  - to recommend possible further steps for OECD work

## **SCOPE OF THE SEMINAR**

7. The scope of the Seminar was on issues and risk reduction strategies regarding international illegal trade in agricultural pesticides. For the purpose of this Seminar, “illegal trade” refers to both:
- trade in counterfeited pesticides, and
  - trade in pesticides that are not registered in the country of destination.

8. In particular, the following issues were considered during the Seminar:
- Best practices in OECD countries to address risks of illegal trade of pesticides and possible elements for efficient risk reduction strategies (e.g. increased transparency, information sharing, traceability)
  - Best practices by pesticide manufacturing countries to ensure legal exports of legal pesticides
  - Potential risks inherent in current import/export systems
  - How criminals avoid detection in shipping illegal pesticides
  - Results of inspections and investigation cases
  - Possible elements of risk reduction strategies
  - Reasons for demands by growers for illegal pesticides (e.g. lower price, no other pesticides are available for minor uses)
  - Recommendations for avoiding illegal trade and improving risk reduction strategies.

## **STRUCTURE OF THE SEMINAR**

9. The first part of the Seminar in the morning and early afternoon was devoted to informative presentations from governments and other stakeholders. The second part of the afternoon consisted of roundtable discussions that built on issues that arose from the presentations, and recommendations for the OECD. The Seminar Programme is provided in [Annex 2](#).

## **GOVERNMENT AND STAKEHOLDER EXPERIENCE, PERSPECTIVES AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

10. First, government representatives of Australia, Brazil, China, France, Germany, and the US presented their experiences and initiatives with issues associated with illegal trade of pesticides in their own countries/regions. Then the European Commission introduced provisions related to exports of chemicals in the European Union arising from implementation of the Rotterdam Convention. Finally the industry (representing pesticide manufacturers) presented their actions, concerns and solutions related to unregulated international trade. Most presentations included informative examples of real cases of illegal trade of pesticides (e.g. seizures, custom controls, detection of illegal shipments, illegal behaviours, investigations) as well as speakers' strategies and own recommendations based on their experience to improve the situation and reduce illegal trade and shipments to a minimum.

11. Below are listed the main topics covered in the presentations. More detailed and illustrative information can be found in the slides of presentations that are grouped in Annex 4.

### *Stock taking of the situation*

- *Various forms/aspects of illegal pesticides:* in this Seminar, illegal pesticides referred to both counterfeited products and pesticides that are not registered in the country of destination. Participants presented numerous cases of deliberate ‘illegality’, such as mislabelling (e.g. wrong name, spelling mistake, fake batch numbers, unapproved label format) or misbranding (leading to patent or trademark infringements), inappropriate composition (e.g. an insecticide instead of a fungicide), use of wrong active ingredients or co-formulants, presence of impurities of concern, inappropriate bottles, unapproved or nonexistent manufacturing facility. In the European Union, some illegal/counterfeited products are fraudulently marketed as parallel import products. Some speakers also referred to cases leading to situations including obsolete pesticides.
- *Current situation and trends in countries regarding illegal trade of pesticides:* while most countries reported known cases of illegal pesticides, it is difficult to assess the actual size of the problem. Some countries do not have history or evidence of large-scale counterfeit products (e.g. US) whereas others (e.g. Brazil) estimate illegal trade accounting for a significant and growing part of their national pesticide trade.
- *Risks and consequences of illegal pesticides:* if the use of illegal pesticides may directly cause a number of problems associated with e.g. (unknown) health and environmental hazards, toxic residues in food, unexpected phyto-toxicity (damages to crops), low or inadequate product performance and efficiency leading to a reduction in farmers revenues, there are many other consequences for industry and governments. First, illegal trade generates costs on legitimate companies, affects their reputation and creates trade distortion and unfair business. Second, as it threatens the public, it may therefore undermine countries’ registration systems and affect public trust and confidence in regulatory and compliance policies put in place by governments. Third, it imposes costs on the taxpayer for e.g. funding inspection, custom services or storage and destruction of seized products.
- *Who’s involved (and responsible) in pesticide illegal trade and counterfeiting?* It appears that the whole supply and logistical chain is concerned in both OECD and non-OECD countries, from the actual “counterfeiters” to the exporters/importers, transport/vessel companies, wholesalers and distributors (who thus increase their profit margins) to the end-buyers (farmers and pesticide users). The demand side plays an important role in “encouraging” illegal pesticide sales hence the need to address minor use issues in particular. It was also mentioned that, as for any illegal activity, organized crime and corruption were part of the overall picture.
- *Existing systems in place in countries:* presentations described systems in place to control, prevent and fight against pesticide illegal trade and ultimately to ensure pesticide safety: import requirements, export certificates, checks of documents and control of shipments, anti-counterfeiting brigade, etc. Countries often have multi-agency mechanisms involving cooperation among inter alia custom authorities, regulatory agencies, police/army, judges/prosecutors, foreign authorities or Europol (in the European Union). Governments have also developed comprehensive databases to help with the identification of illegal shipments of pesticides. At the international level, the Rotterdam Convention specifies the obligations (e.g. prior consent and



export notification) related to the export of certain hazardous chemicals and pesticides. Rotterdam Convention information related to EU member states is centralized in the Edexim database (<http://edexim.jrc.ec.europa.eu>).

- *Difficulties for countries and customs to control and seize illegal shipments:* custom representatives explained that it may be very difficult to detect, stop and seize illegal pesticides. Most illegal products are not declared as “dangerous goods”, shipping documents are unclear (and often importing and exporting documents for the same shipment are different/inconsistent), or fake/fraudulent names and misleading/deceptive labels are used. It may sometimes be very problematic for authorities to stop suspicious shipments for sampling and analysis, to collect evidence of fraud and to prove illegality. It was noted that in some larger countries where borders are very long, smuggling of pesticides was thus facilitated. To add to the complexity of the situation, often only the active ingredients are imported (under a false name/description) to avoid trademark counterfeiting/infringement, and the formulated products are prepared in the country of destination. In some countries/regions, the legal background was felt to be too weak, in particular as regards transit shipments, to allow authorities to seize illegal shipments. Finally, countries have also to address the problem of dealing with the seized products and (the costs of) their storage and destruction.

### *Recommendations from speakers*

- *Need for more transparency and traceability in shipping (export/import) documents:* in view of the cases described in the above paragraph, some speakers made a plea for improving shipping documents in order to ensure that they are available to both regulators and customs in evaluating if pesticides are legal and registered in the country of manufacturer and in the country of intended use.
- *Need for more compliance and enforcement tools and better risk analysis:* many speakers recognised that more controls and enforcement actions would be necessary. They recommended developing more compliance tools, improving monitoring and inspections/controls along the whole supply chain and applying stronger administrative and financial sanctions. Risk analysis was also recognised as an important tool to better target potential illegal trade.
- *Importance of training and communication:* some countries put a lot of efforts on training to educate those concerned, such as importers, distributors or farmers, about the consequences of using illegal pesticides. Industry also devotes much time and money on anti-counterfeiting stewardship activities. Examples of educational materials, manuals, brochures, guidance documents or e-learning programmes were provided. It was emphasised that increasing awareness of the issues linked to pesticide illegal trade was important, e.g. through media coverage.
- *Need for more international cooperation:* all speakers agreed that, due to the increasing globalization of pesticide trade, international cooperation was key. Although some information networks already exist in some regions (e.g. in the European Union), stronger cooperation mechanisms with foreign authorities, between exporting and importing countries, between custom and regulatory authorities, were encouraged. Suggestions were made to establish an international cooperation structure. As a major pesticide exporter, China mentioned that they

signed Memoranda of Understanding with many countries and indicated that they were willing to cooperate with OECD countries.

12. Following the presentations that addressed many issues associated with illegal trade of pesticides, as listed in the above paragraphs, the floor was opened to all Seminar participants for a roundtable discussion. The following points guided the discussion:

- Key issues concerning pesticide risk reduction through avoiding illegal trade in pesticides
- Key issues for the improvement of information exchange and cooperation between regulators and customs within a country as well as between countries
- Reasons for demands for illegal pesticides and communication aspects
- Good practices and innovative approaches as regards the control of both imports and exports of agricultural pesticides
- Solutions for reducing the risks from illegal international trade of pesticides
- Opportunities for further development for all stakeholders, governments, industry and OECD.

13. As an introduction to the discussion, the Chair invited participants to reflect on the actual scale of the problem associated with illegal trade of pesticides. Are cases presented by speakers isolated/single cases? Or is the problem larger than what is visible? It was mentioned that due to the very nature of the problem, it was difficult to have realistic figures. Data are based on scattered data, e.g. collected during controls and investigations. The Seminar participants however acknowledged that countries and industry were facing a serious problem that needed to be addressed whatever its actual size was. As with any other illegal activity, **government participants agreed that they could not accept any form/level of illegal trade of pesticides.**

14. All participants made knowledgeable interventions which contributed to a better understanding of the issues associated with illegal and counterfeited pesticides, and helped the group reach recommendations on follow-up steps for OECD and other stakeholders on this topic.

## SEMINAR RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE VARIOUS STAKEHOLDERS

15. The recommendations from the seminar participants to the various stakeholders are the following:

### *Recommendation to governments*

**a. Increasing cooperation between customs and pesticide regulatory authorities**

→ *Customs and regulatory authorities should be better connected. The Seminar recommended using experience gained in sectors other than pesticides to find ways to develop communication channels between the two authorities. Training of custom officers about illegal pesticides was encouraged. Sharing of findings from controls and investigations would also be critical. It was suggested that increased cooperation may be linked to changes in the legal framework.*

### *Recommendation to industry*

**b. Introducing a more effective anti-counterfeit protection**

→ *Trade marks should be used on all packaging in order to better protect goods.*

### *Recommendation to all stakeholders*

**c. Ensuring traceability along the pesticide chain**

→ *Pesticides should be better identified and traced in the export/import chain. The product labels/containers and the corresponding shipping documents should be more explicit about their content, origin and destination. The quality of shipping documents should be improved and easy access should be made possible to both regulators and customs. All links in the chain (sellers, buyers and transporters) should know who their suppliers and customers are.*

### *Recommendations to OECD*

**d. Setting an OECD network of experts and inspectors knowledgeable and active in fighting illegal trade of pesticides that could be used for rapid exchange of information on suspicious or rejected shipments**

→ *Participants indicated that it would be important to create opportunities for more efficient exchange of information among national competent authorities and between authorities and industry on suspicious and rejected shipments. OECD should facilitate the process by collecting, centralizing and disseminating within the network the details of those experts and inspectors. These persons could then become contact points if a “rapid alert system” was to be put in place. The extent of the exchange of information would need to be defined and agreed upon as it would be subject to limitations such as confidential business information. Issues related to language would need to be considered in light of OECD experience in similar projects. However, it was recognised that there was room for cooperation.*

- e. **Establishing an OECD forum for national competent authorities**
  - *A forum should be established within the OECD framework where representatives of national competent authorities could discuss relevant issues with their counterparts, such as traceability, integrated inspection, risk analysis, risk communication or multilateral cooperation, with a view to exchanging experience, learning from each other and elaborating solutions to identified common problems.*
  
- f. **Reaching out to non-member countries**
  - *It was felt important to reach out to non-OECD countries as not only OECD countries are faced with illegal trade of pesticides. Involvement in OECD activities of Brazil and the People's Republic of China, two countries that participated in the seminar and expressed interest in further cooperation, is possible thanks to the OECD Enhanced Engagement programme with these countries.*  
*The OECD should help reach out to other non-member countries as well.*
  
- g. **Establishing an effective communication platform about risks towards pesticide users/re-sellers**
  - *Participants expressed the need to communicate effectively to the pesticide users/sellers, such as farmers, growers, retailers, distributors, about the risks of buying and using illegal and counterfeited pesticides. It was suggested establishing a platform, which could include a public website, information brochures or training sessions that would communicate the right messages to the targeted audiences.*

Note:

The recommendations developed by the Seminar participants will be forwarded to the relevant subsidiary bodies of the OECD Pesticides Programme, the members of which will consider these recommendations and agree on which one(s) to initiate, if any.

## ANNEX 1

## LIST OF OECD SEMINARS ON PESTICIDE RISK REDUCTION

<b>Title of Seminar</b> [references of publication]	<b>Date</b>	<b>Place</b>
<b>Compliance and Risk Reduction</b> <i>ENV/JM/MONO(2004)6</i> (Series on Pesticides No. 24)	10 March 2003	Paris, France
<b>Minor Uses and Pesticide Risk Reduction</b> <i>ENV/JM/MONO(2005)4</i> (Series on Pesticides No. 26)	4 Nov. 2003	Canberra, Australia
<b>Pesticide Risk Reduction through Good Container Management</b> <i>ENV/JM/MONO(2005)12</i> (Series on Pesticides No. 28)	22 June 2004	Bonn, Germany
<b>Risk Reduction through Good Pesticide Labelling</b> <i>ENV/JM/MONO(2006)13</i> (Series on Pesticides No. 29)	1 March 2005	Paris, France
<b>Pesticide Risk Reduction through Better Application Technology</b> <i>ENV/JM/MONO(2007)3</i> (Series on Pesticides No. 35)	30 Nov. 2005	Wellington, New Zealand
<b>Joint OECD/EC Seminar on Harmonised Environmental Indicators For Pesticide Risk (HAIR)</b> <i>ENV/JM/MONO(2007)27</i> (Series on Pesticides No. 40)	13 Nov. 2006	Bonn, Germany
<b>Risk Reduction through Better Worker Safety and Training</b> <i>ENV/JM/MONO(2008)9</i> (Series on Pesticides No. 42)	21 March 2007	Brno, Czech Republic
<b>Risk Reduction through Education / Training the Trainers</b> <i>ENV/JM/MONO(2009)35</i> (Series on Pesticides No. 45)	15 Nov. 2007	Mexico City, Mexico
<b>Risk Reduction through Spray Drift Reduction Strategies as Part of National Risk Management</b> <i>ENV/JM/MONO(2009)36</i> (Series on Pesticides No. 46)	12 June 2008	Paris, France
<b>Pesticide Risk Reduction through Better National Risk Management Strategies for Aerial Application</b> <i>ENV/JM/MONO(2010)22</i> (Series on Pesticides No. 50)	24 Feb. 2009	San Francisco, US
<b>Pesticide Risk Reduction Strategies near/in Residential Areas</b> <i>ENV/JM/MONO(2011)5</i> (Series on Pesticides No. 58)	17 November 2009	Tokyo, Japan

The reports from these Seminars are available on the OECD public web site at: <http://www.oecd.org/env/pesticides>, under the section "Risk Reduction."

**ANNEX 2**

**OECD SEMINAR ON RISK REDUCTION  
THROUGH PREVENTION, DETECTION AND CONTROL  
OF THE ILLEGAL INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN AGRICULTURAL PESTICIDES**

*Wednesday 19 May 2010, OECD, Paris, France*

**Final Programme**

**Chair: Wolfgang Zornbach, Germany**

9.30 am	<p><b>Introduction</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Purpose and structure of the seminar</li> <li>• Tour de table to introduce participants</li> </ul>
	<p><b>Government Experience and Perspectives (from OECD countries and others)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Germany:</b> <i>Detection of shipments containing illegal Plant Protection Products in the port of Hamburg – Experiences and strategies of the involved authorities</i> (Gregor Hilfert, BWA, Hamburg)</li> <li>• <b>USA:</b> <i>Ensuring Safety and Integrity of Imported Pesticide Products: The US approach</i> (Jay Ellenberger, US-EPA)</li> <li>• <b>Australia:</b> <i>Recent issues in Australia - illegal behaviour in the pesticides industry</i> (Eva Bennet-Jenkins, CEO, APVMA)</li> <li>• <b>People’s Republic of China:</b> <i>Crack Down Illegal Trade to Promote Sustainable Development of the Pesticide International Trade</i> (Gu Baogen, Deputy Director General, Institute for the Control of Agrochemicals (ICAMA), Ministry of Agriculture)</li> <li>• <b>Brazil:</b> <i>Integrated inspections against the illegal pesticides</i> (Marcelo Bressan/Marcella Texeira, Ministry of Agriculture, Livestock and Food Supply)</li> <li>• <b>France:</b> <i>Investigations on counterfeit and illegal Plant Protection Products in France and new thoughts about the means of fighting</i> (Maurice Boureau, Brigade Nationale d’Enquêtes Vétérinaires et Phytosanitaires (BNEVP))</li> </ul>
	<p><b>Stakeholder Experience and Perspectives</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>European Commission:</b> <i>Provisions related to exports of chemicals in the European Union arising from implementation of the Rotterdam Convention</i> (Juergen Helbig, DG Environment)</li> <li>• <b>Industry (CropLife International):</b> <i>Counterfeit and illegal pesticides smuggling caused by unregulated international trade</i> (D’Arcy Quinn, CropLife International)</li> </ul>
	<p><b>Lunch</b></p>

	<p><b>Round-table Discussion</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Key issues concerning pesticide risk reduction through avoiding illegal trade in pesticides</li> <li>• Key issues for the improvement of information exchange and cooperation between regulators and customs within a country as well as between countries</li> <li>• Reasons for demands by growers for illegal pesticides (e.g. lower price, minor use gaps) and communication aspects</li> <li>• Regulatory requirements that exist in different countries</li> <li>• Good practices and innovative approaches as regards the control of both imports and exports of agricultural pesticides. Possible elements for efficient risk reduction strategies: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ more transparency in export / import documents and ensuring they are available to regulators and customs in evaluating if pesticides are legal and registered in the country of manufacturer and in the country of intended use</li> <li>○ better and more effective information sharing with customs</li> <li>○ traceability in shipping documents</li> <li>○ pros and cons of domestic versus international inspections</li> <li>○ matching regulatory documents with import documents</li> <li>○ licensed sources of manufacturing.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Barriers to and solutions for reducing the risks from illegal international trade of pesticides <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Options for further steps: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ for OECD countries and key stakeholders in OECD and manufacturing countries to address the identified issues</li> <li>○ for effective implementation of the above-mentioned options</li> <li>○ for OECD future work</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> </ul>
	<p><b>Summary of the discussion</b></p> <p><b>Possible solutions and challenges for their effective implementation</b></p> <p><b>Recommendations for further OECD work</b></p>
6.00 pm	End of the Seminar

**ANNEX 3**  
**OECD SEMINAR ON RISK REDUCTION**  
**THROUGH PREVENTION, DETECTION AND CONTROL**  
**OF THE ILLEGAL INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN AGRICULTURAL PESTICIDES**

**Wednesday 19 May 2010**

**OECD, Paris, France**

**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

<b>Australia/Australie</b>	Dr. Eva BENNET-JENKINS CEO Australian Pesticides & Veterinary Medicines Authority
<b>Austria/Autriche</b>	Mr. Johann KOHL AGES Austrian Federal Agency for Health & Food Safety Institute for Plant Protection Products Evaluation & Authorization
<b>Belgium/Belgique</b>	Mr. Steven BOVEN Collaborateur FAVV - Food Safety Center  M. Jean-François SCHMIT Collaborateur AFSCA - Politique de contrôle
<b>Canada</b>	Ms. Marion LAW Chief Registrar Pest Management Regulatory Agency Health Canada  Karen REYNOLDS Director, Submission and Information Management Division Registration Directorate Health Canada
<b>Czech Republic/République Tchèque</b>	Ms. Helena CIZKOVA First Secretary Permanent Delegation



**Denmark/Danemark**

Mr. Leif Lykke NIELSEN  
Chief Adviser  
Danish Environmental Protection Agency

**France**

M. Maurice BOUREAU  
Chargé d'enquêtes, relations internationales  
Cellule phytosanitaire:  
Ministère de l'Agriculture et de la Pêche

M. Bruno DESPAGNE  
Enquêteur  
Cellule phytosanitaire  
Ministère de l'Agriculture et de la Pêche

M. Hervé GILLET  
Chef de la cellule phytosanitaire  
Ministère de l'Agriculture et de la Pêche

Mme Camille HOSTIOU  
Juriste  
Direction générale de l'alimentation (DGAL)/Service de la protection des  
risques sanitaires de la production primaire (SPRSPP)/ Sous-direction de  
la qualité et de la protection des végétaux (SDQPV)  
Ministère de l'Alimentation, de l'Agriculture et de la Pêche  
Bureau de la réglementation et de la mise sur le marché

M. Dominique JULIEN  
Enquêteur  
Cellule phytosanitaire  
Ministère de l'Agriculture et de la Pêche

Mr. Vincent TIRILLY  
Ministère de l'Agriculture et de la Pêche  
SG/SDTPS  
Bureau santé et sécurité au travail

**Germany/Allemagne**

Dr. Wolfgang ZORNBAACH  
Plant Protection Unit  
Federal Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Consumer Protection  
(BMELV)

Mr. Gregor HILFERT  
Pflanzengesundheitskontrolle  
Behörde für Wirtschaft und Arbeit (BWA)

Mrs. Andrea KUERBS  
Bundesministerium der Finanzen (BMF)

Nils KURLEMANN  
German Federal Office of Consumer Protection and Food Safety

Mrs. Brigitte WEIGAND  
FB Genehmigung und Kontrollen  
Landwirtschaftskammer NRW (LWK)

**Japan/Japon**

Ms. Atsuko HORIBE  
Deputy Director  
Agricultural Chemicals Office, Plant Products Safety Division  
Ministry of Agriculture Forestry and Fisheries  
Food Safety and Consumer Affairs Bureau

Dr. Noriko SARUTA  
Deputy Director  
Standards and Evaluation Division  
Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare  
Department of Food Safety

Dr. Yukiko YAMADA  
Deputy Director-General  
Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries  
Food Safety and Consumer Affairs Bureau

**Mexico/Mexique**

Dr. Eugenio DEISTER MATEOS  
Executive Director  
Sanitary Ruling  
Federal Commission for the Protection against Sanitary Risks

**Netherlands/Pays-Bas**

Dr. Susanne SÜTTERLIN  
Senior Officer  
Directorate Agriculture  
Ministry of Agriculture, Nature & Food Quality

**New Zealand/Nouvelle-Zélande** Mr. Warren HUGHES  
Senior Manager (ACVM Standards)  
Approvals and ACVM Group  
New Zealand Food Safety Authority

Mr. John REEVE  
Principal Adviser (Toxicology)  
New Zealand Food Safety Authority

**Slovak Republic/République slovaque** Ms. Bronislava SKARBOVA  
Department of Plant Commodities  
Ministry of Agriculture of the Slovak Republic

**Switzerland/Suisse** Dr. Beat SCHMITTER  
Federal Department of Economic Affairs  
Federal Office for Agriculture

**United Kingdom/Royaume-Uni** Mr. Paul ADAMSON  
Enforcement Officer  
Chemicals Regulation Directorate  
Health and Safety Executive (Operations)

Mr. Richard DAVIS  
Director of Regulatory Operations  
Chemicals Regulation Directorate  
Health and Safety Executive

**United States/États-Unis** Mr. Jay ELLENBERGER  
Deputy Director, Field and External Affairs Division  
Office of Pesticide Programs  
US Environmental Protection Agency

Kathy MONK  
Senior Regulatory Specialist  
Office of Pesticide Programs  
US EPA

Ms. Lois ROSSI  
Director  
Registration Division  
US Environmental Protection Agency  
Office of Pesticide Programs

**EU/UE**

Mr. Wolfgang REINERT  
Administrator  
Health & Consumers Directorate-General  
European Commission

Mr. Juergen HELBIG  
Policy Officer  
DG Environment  
European Commission  
Unit D3 - Chemicals and Nanomaterials

**Estonia/Estonie**

Miss Evelin HILLEP  
Head of Bureau  
Plant Health Department Plant Protection Bureau  
Ministry of Agriculture, Republic of Estonia

**Brazil/Brésil**

Mr. Marcelo BRESSAN  
Federal Inspector  
Ministry of Agriculture

Ms. Marcella TEIXEIRA  
Ministry of Agriculture

**People's Republic of  
China/République populaire  
de Chine**

Mr. Gu BAOGEN  
Deputy Director General  
Institute for control of Agrochemicals  
Ministry of Agriculture (ICAMA)

**Business and Industry  
Advisory Committee  
(BIAC)/Comité consultatif  
économique et industriel  
(BIAC)**

Mr. William GRAHAM  
International Regulatory Affairs Lead  
Agricultural Sector  
Monsanto UK Ltd

Mr. Peter HORNE  
Global Regulatory Affairs Manager  
DuPont Crop Protection Products

Dr. Bernhard JOHNEN  
Director International Regulatory Policy  
CropLife International

Dr. Michael KAETHNER  
Head of Developmental Affairs  
Bayer Crop Science AG

Dr. Felix MEIER-MANZ  
Head Regulatory Support  
Syngenta Crop Protection AG

Mr. Robby SCHREIBER  
European Crop Protection Association

Mr. D'Arcy QUINN  
Director Anti-Counterfeiting  
CropLife International

M. Laurent GIEZENDANNER  
Head of Corporate Security

Gerwin BOUILLON  
Bayer CropScience AG

Dr. Tom MCHALE  
DuPont UK Limited

Denis TROALEN  
Sumitomo Chemical Agro Europe SA  
Parc d'Affaires de Crécy

Mr. Gerold MARTI  
Syngenta International AG

**OECD/OCDE**

Ms. Beatrice GRENIER  
ENV/EHS  
OECD

Ms. Sylvie PORET  
Principal Administrator  
ENV/EHS  
OECD