The third round monitoring report on Azerbaijan was adopted in September 2013. Progress updates contain self-assessment and expert assessment of progress made since then. The document includes progress updates at the following ACN plenary meetings: 16-18 April 2014; 8-10 October 2014; 23-24 March 2015 and 7-9 October 2015.
SUMMARY

13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014: The progress report on implementation of the recommendations adopted in the third round was submitted on 3 April 2014 by Mr Kamran Aliyev, Director of the Anticorruption Department of the Prosecutor’s Office of Azerbaijan and the Azerbaijan National Coordinator at the ACN. This progress update was reviewed by: Ms Anca Jurma, Romania; Ms Inese Gaika, OECD; and Mr Aleksandras Zinovičius, Lithuania.

The monitoring meeting congratulated Azerbaijan on progress recorded in the implementation of the 7 out of 20 recommendations since 2013, and noted that no progress was recorded regarding 11 recommendations. The table below summarises the assessment, including the recommendations where progress was noted or where it was lacking.

14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014: The progress report was submitted by the Anti-corruption Directorate with the Prosecutor General. This progress update was reviewed by Mr Andrei Kukharuk (Ukraine), Mr Romas Zienka (Lithuania) and Ms Inese Kušķe (the Secretariat).

The monitoring meeting congratulated Azerbaijan on additional progress recorded in the implementation of the 5 out of 20 recommendations since 2013, and noted that no progress was recorded regarding 15 recommendations.

15th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 23-24 March 2015: The progress report was submitted by the Anti-corruption Directorate with the Prosecutor General. Besides, information was provided by TI Azerbaijan. This progress update was reviewed by Ms Anca Jurma (Romania), Mr Romas Zienka (Lithuania), Mr Sayan Akhmetzhanov (Kazakhstan) and Ms Inese Kušķe (the Secretariat).

The monitoring meeting congratulated Azerbaijan on additional progress recorded in the implementation of the 9 out of 20 recommendations since 2013, and noted that no progress was recorded regarding 11 recommendations. The table below summarises the assessment, including the recommendations where progress was noted or where it was lacking.

16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 7-9 October 2015: The progress report was submitted by the Anti-corruption Directorate with the Prosecutor General. Alternative report was provided by the NGO "Constitution" Researches Fund. This progress update was reviewed by Ms Anca Jurma (Romania), Mr Ruslan Rayboshapka (Ukraine) and Ms Inese Kušķe (the Secretariat).

The table below summarises the assessment, including the recommendations where progress was noted or where it was lacking.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendation</th>
<th>Progress in implementation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Recommendation 1: anti-corruption policy</td>
<td>Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Recommendation 2: civil society involvement, awareness-raising</td>
<td>Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Recommendation 4: offences, legal persons, proactive investigations</td>
<td>Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Recommendation 5: foreign bribery</td>
<td>Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Recommendation 6: effective regret, immunities</td>
<td>Lack of progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Recommendation 7: confiscation</td>
<td>Lack of progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Recommendation 8: access to financial data</td>
<td>Lack of progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Recommendation 9: data bases, internal investigations</td>
<td>Lack of progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Recommendation 10: corruption and organised crime</td>
<td>Lack of progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Recommendation 11: money-laundering</td>
<td>Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Recommendation 12: integrity in the public service</td>
<td>Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Previous recommendation 3.4.: public financial control and audit</td>
<td>Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Recommendation 14: public procurement</td>
<td>Lack of progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Recommendation 15: access to information</td>
<td>Lack of progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Recommendation 16: political corruption</td>
<td>Lack of progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Recommendation 17: immunities of judges; corruption in judiciary</td>
<td>Lack of progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Recommendation 18: independence and integrity of judges</td>
<td>Lack of progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Previous Recommendation 3.9.: business integrity</td>
<td>Lack of progress</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PART I: PROGRESS IN IMPLEMENTING RECOMMENDATIONS

Pillar 1. Anti-corruption policy and institutions

Recommendation 1

- Develop a methodology and conduct, on a regular basis, surveys of corruption situation in Azerbaijan and assessments of anti-corruption efforts. Their outcomes should be widely disseminated, discussed and used in the anti-corruption policy.
- Ensure the existence of a strategic basis of anti-corruption policy taking into account the results of the assessment and the discussion and reflecting main corruption problems in different areas, priorities and measures to fight corruption in a systematic way; effectively implement, monitor and regularly review it.
- Develop common guiding principles and methodology for anti-corruption plans by state and local public institutions, promoting their own corruption risk assessment, and enforce these plans; ensure units responsible for implementation of anti-corruption plans in state and local public institutions and promote their networking under the umbrella of the competent central government anti-corruption institution.
- Analyse corruption problems at municipal level and develop measures to target them. Ensure a central institution has clearly defined mandate and takes leadership in prevention of corruption in local governments.

13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014

Measures taken to implement this recommendation  (brief summary of measures taken to implement recommendations provided by the National Coordinator)

For the last 6 months many methodological means, pamphlets, newsletters, journal and other means were prepared and published by Anti-corruption Directorate with the Prosecutor General of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

Centre for the Work with Municipalities in the Ministry of Justice is leading the efforts of prevention of corruption in municipalities. The Centre conducts trainings and audits of the implementation of the municipal legislation.

Assessment of Progress  
(Assessment of progress prepared by the monitoring experts and summary of the discussion at the IAP plenary)

PROGRESS
Some progress is demonstrated regarding methodologies and assessment of anti-corruption measures in Azerbaijan. The Anti-Corruption Directorate regularly analyses complaints received by the hotline and proposes preventive measures. Two reports assessing anti-corruption efforts in Azerbaijan were published on November 2013: the Report on Monitoring of the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan for
2011-2015; and the Monitoring Report on implementation of Azerbaijan of Open Government Initiative National Action Plan 2012-2015. Both reports were developed by a group of NGOs (Transparency Azerbaijan, “Constitution” Research Foundation, Economic Research Center and others) and funded by the USAID. It would be useful to further monitor how the Government is using these assessments and whether the conclusions are taken into account. No progress reported on other elements of this recommendation.

### 14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

For the last year many methodological means, pamphlets, newsletters, journal and other means were prepared and published by Anti-corruption Directorate with the Prosecutor General of the Republic of Azerbaijan. Two reports assessing anti-corruption efforts in Azerbaijan were published on November 2013: the Report on Monitoring of the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan for 2012-2015; and the Monitoring Report on implementation of Azerbaijan on Open Government Initiative National Action Plan 2012-2015. Both reports were developed by a group of NGOs (Transparency Azerbaijan, “Constitution” Research Foundation, Economic Research Center and others) and funded by the USAID.

About analysing the municipal corruption problems - Centre for the Work with Municipalities in the Ministry of Justice is leading the efforts of prevention of corruption in municipalities. The Centre conducts trainings and audits of the implementation of the municipal legislation.

**Assessment of Progress**

Azerbaijan informed that steps are taken to develop a methodology to assess the implementation of the Anti-Corruption Action Plan, which covers the part of the recommendation to assess anti-corruption efforts (but not generally corruption problems, which can be outside the scope of the Action Plan). In September 2014 a working group was set up during the meeting of legislation working group under the CCC, which will be in charge of developing methodology of corruption surveys. The Government has received proposals from NGO regarding topics for studies on corruption; however, it did not lead to conduct of any such study, as recommended. The Government argued that it can conduct its own regular surveys, but the impartiality of such surveys gets questioned. A permanent working group on drafting legislation is set up under the CCC. Under it, a group has started to work on research into corruption, including NGOs, which is working on methodology to assess the implementation of the anti-corruption action plan. In the meantime, no progress is made in the area of anti-corruption strategic basis, anti-corruption plans by state and local public institutions and tackling corruption at municipal level. However, on the basis of additional information provided, the meeting agreed that there is progress in implementing this recommendation.

### 15th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 23-24 March 2015

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)**

The National Anticorruption Plan comes to an end at the end of this year. Therefore the Commission has charged the Working Group on the Improvement of Legislation to develop a methodology, principle and format of the evaluation of anti-corruption efforts under this action plan. Along with the representatives of civil society, the representatives of the public institutions within the working group will evaluate the degree of implementation of the measures, reflected in the Action plan. The results of the evaluation are planned to be discussed at the round table and published officially.

The Commission and Directorate continued their efforts in developing common guiding principles and
methodology for anti-corruption plans by state and local public institutions. Recently, the Directorate has engaged itself in the survey of corruption detection capacities of the state institutions, their ability at corruption risk assessment. After the completion of the survey, the ACD is planning a series of events aimed at training and networking of the specialized anticorruption units in various institutions. The Commission on Combatting Corruption collected anti-corruption plans in state and local public institutions in January and is about to finalize its evaluation as well.

**Assessment of Progress**

As already noted in October 2014, in line with this recommendation the CCC’s Working Group on Improvement of Legislation develops a methodology to assess anti-corruption action plan implementation and intends to conduct an evaluation of the National Anticorruption Plan. Besides, this recommendation called on Azerbaijan to conduct surveys on corruption. No progress is reported by the government on this. Meanwhile, the civil society, in alternative information provided before the March 2015 plenary meeting, reported two reports - the National Integrity System Assessment in July 2014 ([http://transparency.az/alac/files/NIS_AZERBAIJAN%20final%20Eng.pdf](http://transparency.az/alac/files/NIS_AZERBAIJAN%20final%20Eng.pdf)); and the report on Monitoring of E-services in December in 2014 ([http://transparency.az/alac/files/E-services%20final%20report%20%20eng%20TI%20Az.pdf](http://transparency.az/alac/files/E-services%20final%20report%20%20eng%20TI%20Az.pdf)).

No progress is reported concerning strategic basis for anti-corruption efforts. Perhaps this element of recommendation will be taken into account in the work on the new anti-corruption Action Plan. It is commendable that the assessment of previous anti-corruption Action Plan implementation will be used in developing of the new Action Plan. It was recommended to Azerbaijan to monitor and regularly review anti-corruption strategy.

It is reported that anti-corruption plans in state and local institutions are being assessed and work is ongoing on drafting guiding principles for municipalities and local governments, as recommended. However, no steps are reported to analyse corruption at municipal level or that an institution would be doing something to tackle corruption at this level.

Lithuania noted there is progress in Azerbaijan demonstrated through their bilateral co-operation since 2008 in developing the anti-corruption system in Azerbaijan, including different IT systems. The meeting agreed that THERE IS PROGRESS in implementing this recommendation.

**16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting 7-9 October 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

**Government information:**

The Commission on Combatting Corruption has developed its methodology of assessing the action plan. The Commission has elaborated this methodology based on the best practice of foreign anticorruption agencies and consultations with the local civil society experts. The Commission is planning to conduct this evaluation starting from October. The outcome of the evaluation will be reflected in the final report and form the basis for the elaboration and review mechanism of the forthcoming action plan.

Annual reports of the Commission on the implementation of the AP have been uploaded to the web-site of the Commission and are available in the reports section (see 2012, 2013 and 2014 reports). The final report of the Commission will comprise anticorruption surveys conducted by the Commission and other reports that it has collected.

TI Azerbaijan and Constitution Research foundation has published their reports on the evaluation of implementation of the Action Plan 2012-2015 on the 18th September.
The anticorruption surveys are regularly conducted by the anticorruption agencies. The results of these surveys are announced to the public on a quarterly basis, which usually takes the form of joint press conferences. As an example, the ACD Directorate has announced the results of the survey on the irregularities and corruption offences in the construction sector, described the causes and patterns of the violations, gaps in the legislation and faults in the state regulatory mechanism. In a joint effort, the ACD and State Committee on Property Affairs have formulated a set of legislative and practical measures to prevent abuses in this area.

The Ministry of Education has conducted a series of surveys into corruption in education. As a result of the surveys, the Ministry has introduced (as of the 15 September 2015) a single register of the primary education pupils.

The Ministry of Industry and Economy has conducted a survey on the inquiries conducted by the law enforcement and state audit agencies. The results of the surveys were discussed at the Session of the Cabinet of Ministers presided by the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan. In his address to the Cabinet of Ministers, the President has stressed it as a subject of concern. The appropriate commissions have been given, including the establishment of the single roll of the inquiries in the private sector.

The Commission has issued in September 2015 to the central executive authorities instructions on evaluation of the anticorruption plans, which shall be submitted at the end of the year. In these instructions, the Commission reflected its requirement of corruption risk self-assessment. In July 2015, the Working Group of the Commission held a wide session with the involvement of the Internal Oversight units responsible for the implementation of anti-corruption plans.

At the municipal level, the Anticorruption Directorate has prepared a report on the situation with corruption at the municipal level. The Report was based on the content of complaints, results of the inquiries and investigations. The report was submitted and considered by the Commission. Alternatively, the Centre for Municipalities under the Ministry of Justice provided its semi-annual report to the Commission. Among others, reports indicate a substantial decrease in the corruption at the municipal level. Moreover, the Centre has intensified its coordinating role in the promotion of the lawful activity of the municipalities. In the report period, the Centre conducted trainings on the uniform documentation of land lending and sale, collection of municipal levies etc. The ACD and the Centre have discovered such violations as imprecise delineating of the land lots, which gave an opportunity to corrupted municipal officers to lend state lands as municipal lands.

**NGO information:**
The National Anticorruption Plan comes to an end at the end of this year. On September 18, 2015, Transparency Azerbaijan and Constitution” Researches Foundation have published their reports on implementation of NAP 2012-2015.

This report covers the results of the monitoring of implementation of the National Anti-corruption Action Plan (NAP) for 2012-2014. The report focuses on the implementation of NAP and provides recommendations to governmental bodies, committees, municipalities and State-owned companies. The main focus of the report is on the progress made on the implementation of activities in 28 areas envisaged in NAP.

**Assessment of Progress**

Regarding part of the recommendation to develop a new methodology for conducting surveys on corruption in Azerbaijan and to conduct such surveys, the information submitted by Azerbaijani authorities does not indicate a new methodology or conducting of such comprehensive surveys on
corruption. Meanwhile, during the plenary meeting Azerbaijan provided a list of surveys on corruption in certain sectors conducted recently. Moreover, there are

Regarding assessing of how efficient the Government’s anti-corruption efforts are, the Commission on Combating Corruption prepares its annual reports and reports under the OGP, which to some extent address this issue. An assessment of implementation of National Anti-Corruption Action Plan 2012-2015 should start in October 2015.

While there are different elements that could contribute to a strategic basis/anticorruption policy in Azerbaijan such as methodology and the upcoming assessment of National Anti-corruption Plan based on a special methodology, sectoral surveys and researches conducted by governmental agencies and NGOs covering various corruption issues, informing public on results of such evaluations and surveys, enhanced cooperation with civil society institutions in anti-corruption. These steps taken by the Government are welcomed. Meanwhile, this part of the recommendation rather supported providing a systemic approach to anti-corruption efforts starting with an assessment of the causes and characteristics of corruption phenomena, then formulating correspondent anticorruption policy and then - coordinating its implementation. As it was stated above, there are no instruments for measuring corruption levels and a common formulated anticorruption policy based on a vision of what corruption is in Azerbaijan.

Regarding part of Recommendation 1 calling to provide guidance for anti-corruption plans by state and local public institutions, promoting their risk assessment, in September 2015 the Commission for Combating Corruption has sent instructions on evaluation of the anti-corruption plans to the central executive authorities, taking into account corruption risks self-assessment.

Both Government and NGO information suggests that Commission is more actively organising meetings involving public institutions. Information also indicates that in some institutions internal oversight units have been put in charge of anti-corruption and also there are regular contact points coming to the Commission’s meetings.

Finally regarding work on corruption at municipal level, Azerbaijani authorities provided an information on Anti-Corruption Directorate’s report on situation with corruption at municipal level. It does not seem that the Ministry of Justice’s Centre for Municipalities was involved. No information has been provided on measures taken in practice to address corruption issues at the level of municipalities.

The meeting agreed that there is PROGRESS regarding this recommendation.

**Recommendation 2**

- **Ensure more effective and regular involvement of civil society in the development, implementation and monitoring of anti-corruption policies, research on corruption and in the work of the CCC, for example, by including a representative of the civil society as a member of the CCC.**

- **Set up a mechanism under the authority of CCC to carry out monitoring and evaluation of the implementation of anti-corruption policy including civil society.**

- **Implement well-targeted awareness raising activities in the most corruption-prone sectors and assess their outcomes.**
**13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Civil society organisations were consulted in developing the new anti-corruption action plans and some of their proposals were taken into account. Under the new anti-corruption action plans the state increased financial support to NGOs for anti-corruption activities. There were held roundtables with civil society and international partners or supporting some corruption surveys by NGOs during the last period. The state increases financial support to NGOs for activities in the anti-corruption area. More anti-corruption projects implemented by NGOs are supported by the Council on State Support to Non-governmental Organizations under the President. More than 40 projects of NGOs have been financed since 2010 covering such topics as, for example, public awareness and research. ACD actively cooperates with the Informative Network of the Anticorruption NGOs (IN ACNGO). In the beginning of 2012, the ACD signed Memorandum on Understanding with the IN ACNGO.

ACD officers participate at the events run by NGOs. Civil society representatives contribute to the training of the ACD officers. Also, ACD holds joint with NGOs and civil society representative’s annual and semi-annual conferences with participation of Mass Media about the work done in the fight against corruption. During these conferences NGOs and civil society representatives actively participate and give questions and opinions about actual issues.

ACD receives from NGOs (such as ALAC run by the Azerbaijani Chapter of the Transparency International) information on corruption allegations, which serve as a ground for launching criminal investigations.

**Assessment of Progress**

**PROGRESS**

There are some steps reported in relation to involvement of civil society in anti-corruption efforts. Namely, in November – December 2013 a series of seminars were conducted jointly by NGOs and the Anti-Corruption Directorate and generally this practice of joint NGOs – ACD anti-corruption activities, already noted in the third round monitoring report, is developing. However, no progress is reported on the specific requirements of the recommendation. A permanent working group on drafting legislation is set up under the CCC. Under it, a group has started to work on research into corruption, including NGOs, which is working on methodology to assess the implementation of the anti-corruption action plan.

---

**14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Civil society organisations were consulted in developing the new anti-corruption action plans and some of their proposals were taken into account. Under the new anti-corruption action plans the state increased financial support to NGOs for anti-corruption activities. There were held roundtables with civil society and international partners or supporting some corruption surveys by NGOs during the last period. The state increases financial support to NGOs for activities in the anti-corruption area. More anti-corruption projects implemented by NGOs are supported by the Council on State Support to Non-governmental Organizations under the President. More than 40 projects of NGOs have been financed since 2010 covering such topics as, for example, public awareness and research. ACD actively cooperates with the Informative Network of the Anticorruption NGOs (IN ACNGO). In the beginning of 2012, the ACD signed Memorandum on Understanding with the IN ACNGO.
ACD officers participate at the events run by NGOs. Civil society representatives contribute to the training of the ACD officers. Also, ACD holds jointly with NGOs and other civil society representatives annual and semi-annual conferences with participation of Mass Media about the work done in the fight against corruption. During these conferences NGOs and civil society representatives actively participate and give questions and opinions about actual issues.

ACD receives from NGOs (such as ALAC run by the Azerbaijani Chapter of the Transparency International) information on corruption allegations, which serve as a ground for launching criminal investigations.

**Assessment of Progress**

As already mentioned in relation to the Recommendation 1, methodologies to assess the implementation of the Anti-Corruption Action Plan and to conduct corruption surveys are developed and, according to the Government, this work is led by civil society organisations. Civil society organisations also lead an *ad hoc* working group to draft a whistleblowers protection act. Such initiatives are very positive and show that there is some progress in implementing this recommendation. However, it is essential to continue involving civil society organisations in a more regular manner and more specifically in the activities stated in the recommendation.

**15th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on March, 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)**

In September 2014, the *ad hoc* group on improvement of legislation set up a group, which was charged with development a methodology of regular basis, surveys of corruption situation in Azerbaijan and assessments of anti-corruption efforts. Working group elaborated recommendations on drafting annual reports. These recommendations were taking into account by the commission on combating corruption. The mentioned recommendations were included in the Directive on the elaboration of reports concerning the implementation of the anticorruption corruption strategy items. Accordingly the ministries and other agencies of central executive elaborated their reports on the implementation of anticorruption strategy based on this directive. The commission on combating corruption received these report is in the beginning of the year. Accordingly the recommendations of the working group will be taken into account after processing of all reports submitted by the Ministry and are the agencies of the central executive authority.

As 2015 is the final year for the recent anticorruption strategy, the Commission has already launched the overall assessment of the implementation, aimed at formulation of the assessment. The Commission has also launched set of regular consultations with the Anticorruption Directorate of the Prosecutor’s Office, State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan and civil society in order to gather information on corruption problems in different areas. In the outcome, the Commission is planning to reflect these findings in the framework of its priorities and measures. It is the intention of the commission to elaborate immune system of monitoring which will provide for this systematic review of the implementation of the strategy.

Based on the reports received from the ministries and other agencies of the central executive authority, the working group is planning to collaborate concise document reflecting guiding principles and methodology for anti-corruption plans by state and local public institutions.

Commission continued his efforts aimed at bringing together, starting dialogue and promote exchange of opinion between units responsible for implementation of anti-corruption plans in state and local
public institutions. The Anticorruption Directorate was used as a venue for a series of meetings and consultations.

Whistle-blowers protection draft law elaborated by Civil society organisations-led ad hoc working group was submitted for review and submission of proposals to state institutions.

The Municipality Centre under the Ministry of Justice continued to analyse corruption problems at municipal level. Ineffective channel of communication between this centre and the Anticorruption Directorate was built. As a result of the effective work of this channel a number of criminal cases were launched in the Anticorruption Directorate. If it’s turn the directorate provided this centre with the feedbacks, which were used by the latter in the development of internal methodology for detection of corruption. As a result of the quality of the materials concerning corrupt practices In the municipalities has raised.

**Assessment of Progress**

Civil society opinions were taken into account in preparing a new directive on preparation of implementation reports for the current National Anti-corruption Action Plan. Meanwhile, no information with regard to the involvement of civil society in elaboration of the new anti-corruption action plan or awareness raising in corruption-prone areas is provided. It is concluded that there is no tangible progress regarding this recommendation.

**16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 7-9 October 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

**Government information:**

Commission on Combating Corruption regularly conducts the assessment of anticorruption action plans and disseminates the results to public. Such as results of action plans on the year of 2012, 2013 and 2014 were placed in the website of CCC (http://bit.ly/1PbqhmT)

There are also independent assessments carried out by national chapter of Transparency International and Constitutional Research Foundations for the years of Action Plans.

The links are following:


Civil society opinions were taken into account in preparing a new directive on preparation of implementation reports for the current National Anti-corruption Action Plan. Considering the fact that the current Action Plans end at the end of December (2012-2015) and drafting of a new plan takes time with consultations, expertise and etc. the decision was made to initiate the drafting of New Action Plan in mid-October. Action Plan is intended to be adopted either end of December of beginning of January. Consultation process for the drafting of New Action Plan will be open, participatory and with broad engagement of civil society as it was practiced before. As soon as the process is launched civil society institutions will be invited to submit their proposals. Furthermore, preparation of new Action Plan will be open to everyone and any organization including our international partners who also can contribute and be part of a process.

The effective and regular involvement of civil society in the development, implementation and monitoring of anti-corruption policies, research on corruption and in the work of the CCC, has been continued through the involvement of the civil society representatives into the work of the Working Group, which held several sessions during this period.

The commission has set up a working mechanism ensuring evaluation of the implementation of anti-
corruption policy including civil society representatives, by disclosing all information on the implementation of the national anticorruption plan and institutional measures to the civil society experts. The experts had the opportunity to visit state institutions of their choice and require additional documentation with the support of the Commission. TI Azerbaijan and Constitution Research foundation has published the result of their monitoring and evaluation of implementation of the Action Plan 2012-2015 on the 18th September 2015. According to their findings, out of total 125 measures foreseen by the AP 2012-2015, only 34% were implemented in 2013. This figure was published in its 2013 report. The joint evaluation showed that within 2 years and 4 months, which passed since the previous report 71.47% of the measures have been implemented. Out of 125 measures, 91 were supposed to be accomplished in 2014. 53 of these have been implemented by 100%. 30 measures were implemented just over 50%. 11 measures have not been implemented satisfactorily, with the indicator of implementation just under 30%. A source of serious concern is a failure to pass draft Law on Conflict of Interests, which allows big room for unlawful engagements of the public officials. Criticised were also delays in reforming the simplification licensing, regulation of the activity of real estate realtors, diminishing the frequency of financial declarations.

OGO Information:
General Prosecutor’s Office informed that it continued close cooperation with the non-governmental organizations, including Transparency Azerbaijan, implementing anti-corruption education and legal aid programs. Thus, the General Prosecutor’s Office cooperated with the Advocacy and Legal Aid Center project implemented by the American Bar Association’s Central and Eastern Europe Legal Initiative (ABA-CEELI), the Main Anti-Corruption Office investigated the appeals on corruption allegations received from Transparency Azerbaijan and initiated criminal proceedings on some facts. In response to the inquiry, the Ombudsman office and the Anti-Corruption Commission informed that both agencies closely cooperate with the Information and Cooperation Network of Anti-corruption NGOs. The Anticorruption Directorate publicizes annual and semi-annual report in collaboration with the civil society institutions. Representation of the civil society institutions has been increased in the Legislative Improvement Working Group of the Anti-Corruption Commission.

Assessment of Progress
Authorities reported a significant enhancing of cooperation with civil society organisations, particularly regarding analysis of implementation of anti-corruption action plan, developing new anti-corruption legislation, conducting surveys, participating in trainings. All these activities were implemented using the venues of Commission on Combating Corruption and the Anti-Corruption Directorate. According to NGO information the number of civil society organisations in the CCC Legislative Improvement Working Group has been increased.

There is no information on institutionalizing participation of civil society within the work led by the Commission on Combating Corruption on monitoring and evaluation of the implementation of anti-corruption policy. It was said during the plenary meeting that the new Anti-corruption Action Plan will be elaborated in cooperation with the civil society.
Authorities have not provided any information with regard to implementation of the part of the recommendation related to well-targeted awareness raising activities in corruption prone-sectors and their assessment.

Taking into account steps taken to promote co-operation with civil society, it can be noted that there is SOME PROGRESS in this area.

Recommendation 3

**Conduct an assessment of co-ordination of anti-corruption efforts in Azerbaijan, in particular the capacity of the Commission on Combating Corruption and its Secretariat.**

**Take measures to ensure a more active role of the Commission on Combating Corruption in conducting its mandate, ensure the necessary degree of independence and take measures to better resource its Secretariat.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Measures taken to implement this recommendation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assessment of Progress</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO PROGRESS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Secretariat of the Commission on Combating Corruption and its Secretariat Conduct has continued implementation co-ordination of anti-corruption efforts in Azerbaijan, as a principal trend of its mandate. The Secretariat has revised the rules of reporting by the ministries and other agencies of the central executive authority in order to collect comprehensive information. Thus the commission have reviewed the mechanisms of training in the field of anti-corruption, conflict of interests, assets declaration. As a result the commission recommended elaboration of amendments in the regulatory system, Including elaboration of rules, decrees and statutory provisions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assessment of Progress</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 7-9 October 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Measures taken to implement this recommendation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Government information:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commission on Combatting Corruption is the specialised anticorruption prevention institution, with a clearly defined mandate. Its mandate derives from the Law. As such, it continues to collect information, analyse it, and formulate draft laws and specific practical measures aimed at preventing corruption. A number of steps taken by the CCC have been reported, including development of the Directive for public institutions to report about implementation of the National Anti-corruption Action Plan, with inputs from civil society. CCC is active in legal drafting in anti-corruption area. It strongly pursues its task be proactive in conducting its mandate. To this end, it has intensified the work of its working groups, including sessions in wide format. Such format involves extra participants from internal oversight units. Furthermore, the cooperating of the CCC with the ACD, Ministry of Industry and Economy, State Committee on Civil Service and the State Agency responsible for ASAN Service has been translated into</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
regular ad hoc format, with the specified agencies appointing contact points. This practice has been adopted in May 2015 and produced positive results from the point of view updating and streamlining anticorruption prevention related information to the Commission. The Commission has become operational in terms of multi-source identification and research of corruption-prone areas. The most recent product of this activity was Commission brokered reform abolishing of the requirement of the Domicile Confirmation Deed from the Local executives during the registration of the real estate property.

**NGO Information:**
Increase of coordination in the activity of the state bodies responsible for implementation of NAP had been observed. This is seen in speed up of adoption of the normative acts that should be agreed by the several bodies. Besides, this is felt in organization and improvement of the electronic services and improvement of the electronic information exchange systems. Undoubtedly, Commission Combating Corruption as a coordinating body in the field of anticorruption played a significant role in this improvement.

**Assessment of Progress**
While in practice work of the Commission in coordinating anti-corruption work by state institutions is improving, a self-assessment of mandate, guaranties of independence and other practical issues of Commission’s activity as such has not been conducted yet. It seems that there no plans to reconsider these issues in the future. Thus, NO PROGRESS is noted under the Recommendation 3.

---

**Pillar 2. Criminalisation of Corruption**

**Recommendation 4**

- Develop training curricula and organize training sessions for investigators and prosecutors with regard to detecting, investigating and prosecuting of bribery offences, when the bribe was merely offered or promised, as well as cases based on non-material benefits as an object of bribery.

- Introduce criminal procedure provisions for the enforcement of the criminal liability of legal persons that will enable investigators and prosecutors to effectively pursue corruption cases that involve legal persons. Ensure autonomous nature of the corporate liability, namely that it is not dependent on investigation, prosecution or adjudication of the case against a natural person.

- Develop guidelines for investigators, prosecutors and judges on the application of both substantial and procedural rules on criminal liability of legal person.

- Organize training sessions for the above mentioned practitioners based on the legislation and the guidelines for practical application and use successful examples of application of this concept by other jurisdictions.

- Consider introducing in the legislation an exemption (defence) from liability for legal persons with effective internal controls and compliance programmes.

- Facilitate the detection and investigation of newly introduced provisions and new elements of the previously existing corruption offences:
  1. increase pro-activeness of the law enforcement and prosecution authorities notably through an increased use of analytical tools;
  2. use more actively other detection tools in addition to intelligence information gathered by law enforcement, such as media reports, information received from other jurisdictions, referrals from tax
inspectors, auditors and FIUs, as well as complaints received via government websites and hotlines, as well as information from other complaint mechanisms, as a basis for launching investigations.

13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Within the partnership in the Technical Assistance and Information Exchange (TAIEX) instrument managed by the Department-General Enlargement of the European Commission on 28-29 January 2014 was organised workshop on *Criminal liability of legal entities* in co-operation with Anti-Corruption Directorate. This was the first stage of this workshop, second stage will be held in May 2014.

Therefore, legislation drafts on applying criminal legal measures to legal entities were prepared by the Anticorruption Directorate with the Prosecutor General and have been submitted to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Azerbaijan. After the law adoption the other proceedings will be conducted.

**Assessment of Progress**

**PROGRESS**

An important development under this recommendation is that legislation on applying criminal measures on legal persons was drafted and submitted to the Cabinet of Ministers in January 2014. However, it remains draft.

Overall there seem to be an effort to organise regularly training for anti-corruption prosecutors and investigators. For example, in January 2014 a first workshop on criminal liability of legal entities in co-operation with Anti-Corruption Directorate was organised. It was reported that the issue of offering a bribe was several times discussed during the training.

14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Within the partnership in the Technical Assistance and Information Exchange (TAIEX) instrument managed by the Department-General Enlargement of the European Commission on 28-29 January 2014 was organised workshop on *Criminal liability of legal entities* in co-operation with Anti-Corruption Directorate. This was the first stage of this workshop, second stage will be held in December 2014.

Therefore, legislation drafts on applying criminal legal measures to legal entities were prepared by the Anticorruption Directorate with the Prosecutor General and have been submitted to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Azerbaijan. A draft ordinance of the Prosecutor General on guidelines of rules for prosecutors and investigators has been prepared by the ACD and after the law adoption this guidelines and other proceedings will be conducted.

On 15-16 September was held seminar on Liability of legal persons for corruption offences within the Eastern Partnership Programme of the Council of Europe with the participation of the prosecutors, investigators, judges and academicians of the national universities. Presentations were made by Council of Europe experts Tilman Hoppe and Thomas Melzer.

ACD actively uses other information for investigating, these include reports of governmental organizations and also citizen’s complaints. For the period of 2012-2014 4 criminal cases were launched based on the information received from the Ministry of Taxes, 4 cases based on the information received from the Chamber of Accountants, for the period of 2013-2014 16 cases based on the information received from the Financial Monitoring Service, and for the period of 2011-2014 (first half) 96 criminal cases were launched based on the complaints from the hot-line of the ACD.

**Assessment of Progress**
As mentioned by Azerbaijani delegation during the meeting, there is a working group in the prosecution service reviewing procedural and other rules and perhaps this could lead to developing guidelines/methodology also for investigating and prosecuting corruption offences, and it could include guidelines for investigating and prosecuting corruption committed by legal persons. The procedural rules to enable investigators and prosecutors to enforce responsibility of legal persons for corruption also remain a draft. Information available does not allow to properly assessing to what extent the work on the existing rules and the draft rules regarding liability of legal persons meet the requirements of this recommendation.

Regarding training for prosecutors and investigators, on the liability of legal persons a seminar took place in January, as mentioned previously, a new one in September and there is one planned in December. It would be important to train prosecutors and investigators on the prosecution and investigation of corporate liability in Azerbaijan once the procedural rules and the guidelines are adopted. No information was provided on training on cases when bribe was merely offered or promised and cases based on non-material benefits as an object of bribery.

The plenary concluded that some progress is made under this recommendation.


As the ACD has become the exclusive agency for the investigation of corruption offences, the practical trainings are planned within the Directorate. The Organization and Information Support Department of the ACD has developed training curricula. Training sessions for investigators and prosecutors with regard to detecting, investigating and prosecuting of bribery offences, including instances when the bribe was merely offered or promised, as well as cases based on non-material benefits as an object of bribery, were held in 2 ACD Departments: Preventive Measures and Inquiry Department and Investigation Department.

The criminal procedure provisions for the enforcement of the criminal liability of legal persons have not been adopted into Law yet.

According to the statistic data, the ACD looked at 3,194 communications from citizens, 218 out them were considered as communications on corrupt activities. 82% of the communications on corrupt activities became the basis for institution of criminal cases.

During 2014, 4,495 communications were received by means of the ACD Hot-line. 21 communications laid the basis for institution of criminal cases.

During 2014, 807 applied to the ACD, 139 of them were received in person.

16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting 7-9 October 2015

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (provided by national coordinator)**

**Government information:**

After the reformation of the Anticorruption Directorate, the specialised anticorruption agency in the field of criminal investigation of corruption offences gain full capacity to become exclusive investigation authority in this area. The number of investigators, prosecutors and technical personnel in the newly established Criminal Investigations Department is sufficient to investigate all the criminal cases at the national level, develop the methodology of investigations and conduct trainings. Head of the department and his deputy, assisted by the 6 prosecutors, conducts the supervision of the investigation. There are special prosecutors in the Department who are charged with the development of methodology and training of the investigators. As a result, the Department has conducted 18 training
sessions in the May-September 2015. The training is conducted according to the training curricula developed and endorsed in the beginning of 2015. While 12 training sessions were conducted specifically for investigators of the CID, the rest was conducted for the ACD detectives and district prosecutor’s offices. In August 2015, the ACD Senior Prosecutors and CID Senior Investigators on Serious Crimes conducted 8 trainings in the Educational Centre of the General Prosecutor’s Office, according to the Curricula approved by the Prosecutor General. The local investigators’ training was conducted with the purpose of increasing their capacities and skills in cases when they are involved in the investigation teams for the investigation of large cases.

As mentioned above, CID conducted 6 joint trainings with the detectives. These trainings conducted mainly sting operation techniques, based on the manuals of detection and investigation of bribery cases. These manuals were developed based on the best practice of the CID, including the cases of offered or promise. Currently, the CID works on the elaboration of manuals on non-material benefits as an object of bribery.

The criminal procedure provisions for the enforcement of the criminal liability of legal persons have not been passed into law. Nevertheless, ACD continues to study the foreign experience and best practice in this area, within the limits of the criminal law provisions. The liability of the legal persons is listed as a topic of the training curricula of the CID.

Furthermore, the Inquiry and Preventive Measures Department within the report period, have assigned prosecutors to each auditing institution, FIU and internal oversight units of the central executive authorities. The IPMD has built effective channels of communication, which allows feedbacking and excludes formalism and loss of time for unnecessary correspondence.

One criminal case was launched basing on information launched received from media reports.

**NGO Information:**

Procedural issues for Criminal liability of legal person are not implemented into Criminal Procedure Code yet. Nevertheless, efforts aimed at review of international experience in this field are continued. Topics on criminal liability of legal persons are regularly included into training curricula of the relevant law enforcement agencies.

---

**Assessment of Progress**

Azerbaijan reported organizing a series of training seminars by the ACD for the ACD detectives and investigators as well as elaborating manuals for training purposes. Allegedly the merely offered or promise bribe as a form of active bribery as well as non-material benefits are also covered by the manuals. However, the prosecutors’ strategy for detecting and investigating corruption remains still at the level of identifying the closed/complete pact between the briber and the bribed official, as having most chances to get a conviction in court. Therefore, more efforts in this field are needed. With regard to the procedural provisions for the enforcement of the criminal liability of legal persons, there is no progress on the draft law that is still waiting for the opinions of various stakeholders. We are concerned by the fact that there is no official deadline set by the authorities in charge. Some progress has been obtained in increasing the pro-activeness of the ACD prosecutors who now use in some cases media reports, reports from NGOs and complaints received through hotlines.

The meeting noted some PROGRESS made under this recommendation.

---

**Recommendation 5**

- Develop training curricula and organize training sessions for investigators and prosecutors with regard to detecting, investigating and prosecuting of bribery of foreign public officials.
- Develop guidelines for investigators, prosecutors and judges on the application of the offence of bribery of foreign public officials.
- Increase pro-activeness of the prosecution authorities in detection of foreign bribery (last bullet point of Recommendation 4 applies here)

**13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014**

*Measures taken to implement this recommendation*

Each Saturday according to the Ordinance of the Prosecutor General training curricula are held at the Directorate for investigators, prosecutors and detectives on various themes, including detection, investigation and prosecution of bribery of foreign public officials. Also, within the partnership in the Technical Assistance and Information Exchange (TAIEX) instrument managed by the Department-General Enlargement of the European Commission it is planned to held seminars in co-operation with Anti-Corruption Directorate.

*Assessment of Progress*

NO PROGRESS

**14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014**

*Measures taken to implement this recommendation*

Each Saturday according to the Ordinance of the Prosecutor General training curricula are held at the Directorate for investigators, prosecutors and detectives on various themes, including detection, investigation and prosecution of bribery of foreign public officials. It is planned to hold seminar on this theme with the participation of foreign experts in January 2015. Draft guidelines for investigators and prosecutors for the offence of bribery of foreign officials has been prepared by the ACD and sent for reviewing to the other departments of the General Prosecutor’s Office. Also, within the partnership in the Technical Assistance and Information Exchange (TAIEX) instrument managed by the Department-General Enlargement of the European Commission were held seminars in co-operation with the Anti-Corruption Directorate in February 2014 on theme of the increasing pro-activeness of the prosecution authorities in detection of foreign bribery.

*Assessment of Progress*

In February 2014, training for investigators and prosecutors on foreign bribery took place financed by the EU TAIEX programme. Azerbaijan noted during the plenary meeting that prosecutors from Baltic countries and the United Kingdom participated. Guidelines to investigate foreign bribery are being developed by the ACD, but it remains a draft and cannot be taken into account in the assessment. No curriculum was developed for training on foreign bribery. Therefore, only some minor progress is made under this recommendation.

**15th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on March, 2015**

*Measures taken to implement this recommendation*

Detecting, investigating and prosecuting of bribery of foreign public officials, as atopic, was included in the training curricula developed by the ACD Organization and Information Support Department for the training sessions run by the ACD Investigation Department and the ACD Preventive Measures and
Inquiry Department.

ACD has developed draft guidelines for investigators, prosecutors, which have been submitted for review by the departments of the General Prosecutor’s Office. After completion of the review, it is planned to hold joined consultations with the Ministry Of Justice.

**Assessment of Progress**

Regarding training, guidelines and detection of foreign bribery, Azerbaijan reports some training on this issue by the Anti-Corruption Department, but no concrete information regarding the quantity and quality of it was provided. The number of prosecutors/detectives trained with the exception of above-mentioned EU program, in relation to which also limited information is provided. The guidelines remain a draft. In this light, the plenary concluded that there is a LACK OF PROGRESS under this recommendation.

---

**16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 7-9 October 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (provided by national coordinator)**

The ACD has developed the manuals on the investigation and prosecution of bribery of foreign public officials. It is included in the training curriculum of the CID. Azerbaijani business community recently starts to operate in large scale abroad. Therefore, the ACD has not come across of such instances. Neither did the ACD receive any such communication from its foreign counterparts. Moreover, two trainings (in May and September of 2015) on foreign bribery issues were organized by Scientific and Training Center of the Prosecutor General’s office. The events were attended by 31 prosecutorial employees, including investigators and public prosecutors.

**Assessment of Progress**

While a few seminars on bribery of foreign officials were organized for ACD staff, cases are still inexistent, and there is no indication that detection of foreign bribery offences is a matter tackled by the Azerbaijani authorities. The plenary noted LACK OF PROGRESS under this recommendation.

---

**Recommendation 6**

- Further analyse application of the effective regret defence with the view of identifying the elements that can be revised in order to limit its application and incentivise the detection and discouragement of the active bribery offences.
- Pursue the efforts to reduce the scope of immunity of the MPs and judges and regulate the procedure for lifting the immunity in such a manner that would not be an obstacle for the investigation and prosecution.

**13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Draft Law on Plea Bargain had been sent to the Cabinet of Ministers and after its adoption active bribery will be reviewed. Reduction of judges' immunity is noted in the National Anti-corruption Plan 2012-2015 and the work in this section is in progress.

**Assessment of Progress**

NO PROGRESS

Azerbaijani authorities have prepared the draft law on Plea Bargain (a copy was provided to the monitoring team). It was explained during the plenary that in preparing this draft law experience in Georgia and the United States was examined. After this law is adopted it is planned to repeal the
effective regret defence and introduce a new note in the Criminal Code.
No information provided on immunities of judges and MPs.

14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

The use in practice of the special defence provided by the note to section 312 PC, in the Prosecutor’s Office and in the Anti-Corruption Department of the General Prosecutor’s Office in particular, has been examined repeatedly, most recently in May-July 2012 in the context of the UNCAC Implementation Review as well as in October 2012 within GRECO III Evaluation Round. The analysis reveals, inter alia, that out of 11 criminal cases initiated against 16 persons for passive bribery in 2011, in seven cases criminal prosecution for active bribery was refused on grounds of coercion by the public official (bribe-taker). It must be stressed that the decision to apply the defence provision can be contested. In 2011, in several cases the bribe-takers launched such complaints at different stages of proceedings (before and during the trial), but the investigators, supervising prosecutors and finally the courts confirmed that there had been coercion by the bribe-takers and that the decisions to apply the defence provision contained in the note to section 312 PC were therefore well-founded.

Along with abovementioned, it is necessary to emphasize that the main cause substantiating the exemption from prosecution under the note to section 312 PC is the clandestine nature of bribery. At the moment, the cancellation of the provision or adding new terms in its structure will cause a sharp reduction in number of complaints or other information regarding corruption offences and create the conditions for such crimes remain latent. However we stress, that respected authorities understand the importance of revision of the mentioned NOTE and even some significant steps were made towards that direction. Recently, the capacity of the Anti-Corruption Directorate to detect corruption crimes has increased, since it has been granted wider powers to use special investigative measures by the Detective-Search Activity (Amendment) Act of 18 March 2011. Now that the Directorate does not rely so heavily on the voluntary information of parties to bribery. In addition, whilst this issue was discussed in the Directorate it was agreed to replace the NOTE through inclusion of provisions on "Plea Bargaining" to the Criminal Code. In connection with that decision the appropriate draft law was submitted to Ministry of Justice.

Reducing of judges’ immunity is noted in the National Anti-corruption Plan 2012-2015 and the work in this section is in progress.

Procedures for lifting the immunity of the MPs and judges have been prepared by the ACD and draft was sent for review to the relevant ministries.

**Assessment of Progress**

While it is positive that the ACD continues to support procedures for lifting the immunity of the MPs and judges, no progress is reported in adopting such procedures. The draft law on Plea Bargain, as stated by Azerbaijani delegation during the plenary, is now with the Parliament. Hence, at this stage the plenary concluded that **no additional progress is made**.


**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)**

The ACD continued to analyse application of the effective regret defence with the view of identifying the elements. Although it is still a provision of the law, it has not been relied much in the activity of the ACD. The Directorate continued to employ measures of intelligence based operations to catch bribe-takers.
The appropriate draft legislation on reduction of the scope of immunity of the MPs and judges has been sent for proposals to the relevant state agencies, as reported at the previous stage. The proposals were communicated to the Commission on Combatting Corruption, Judicial Legal Council and the Parliament. As the proposals received from the ministries and other state institutions were conflicting each other, the proposals are subject to additional review. Despite differences in the positions, immunity provision is planned to be implemented in time, according to the schedule of the Anticorruption Strategy.

**Assessment of Progress**

Azerbaijan reports some changes in its practice, namely about more cases being built on reports received by citizens before they pay the bribes and that in many cases active bribery is not punished for reasons of coercion. However, not sufficient information was provided demonstrating that steps would have been taken to identify elements that could be revised in the legal defense of effective regret and not enough efforts are taken to improve detection and discouragement of active bribery.

The law on plea bargaining that is supposed to significantly reduce the scope of effective regret is still in the drafting phase; therefore, no progress is reported under this element. Finally, no progress is reported on reducing the immunities.

The meeting agreed there is no tangible progress under this recommendation.

---

**16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting 7-9 October 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (provided by national coordinator)**

**Government information:**

During the reporting period, the effective regret provision has been applied in a limited number of cases with full emphasis on the requirement of advance notification of the law enforcement agencies about the fact of the bribery. The draft law on plea bargaining have not been adopted yet. So far, Azerbaijan has demonstrated that there are sufficient mechanisms to secure transparency and fairness in the implementation of this procedure. The practice is applied as an exception, under strict supervision of the prosecutor and is subject to judicial control. The measure could be challenged and quashed at any stage of the criminal proceedings, including criminal investigation and trial. The application for quashing this measure could be filed by the victim, defendant, supervising prosecutor. The ACN is requested to provide explanation as to its remark ‘demonstrating that steps would have been taken to identify elements that could be revised in the legal defence of effective regret’.

The feedback of all the state institutions on the draft legislative amendments regarding immunity has been collected. It remains a measure of the AP 2012-2015, which awaits its implementation. The draft legislation formulated on the basis of international organization provides for the limitation of period of consideration of the motion of the Prosecutor General for lifting immunity.

**NGO information:**

Draft Law on Amendments to the Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on Courts and Judges has been prepared by the General Prosecutor’s Office and submitted to the Cabinet of Ministers. The Ministry of Justice as well as other relevant state agencies provided respective opinion to the draft law. Despite that reducing immunity for judges and MPs is not implemented we strongly believe that legislation procedures will be finalized within this year.

**Assessment of Progress**

No progress is reported with regards to the effective regret defence. Authorities of Azerbaijan informed that the Supreme Court issued a decision in which gives more precision in how to use the effective regret defence. However, it is not clear how this decision could have the limiting effect sought by the recommendation. The ACD gathered statistics regarding the frequency of the
application of effective regret, but these statistics are not encouraging as for the sanctioning of the active bribery offences, rather the contrary - they show that 99% of the active bribery cases are dismissed due to the self-reporting of the bribe giver. No progress on reducing the scope of immunities of MPs or in improving the procedure of lifting the immunity. Hence, NO PROGRESS can be noted under this recommendation.

Recommendation 7

- Continue to monitor the effectiveness of the confiscation regime.
- Continue to collect and analyse accurate statistics on what property is being confiscated, how the property is being disposed of, and the amount of proceeds of crime recovered.

13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014

Measures taken to implement this recommendation

Analysis of the practice of application of confiscation provisions is a regular item of the work plan of the Anticorruption Directorate and other Departments of the General Prosecutor’s Office responsible for supervision over the lawfulness of investigation in all competent bodies. During the last year total value of confiscated assets and property amounted to approximately 3.36 million Manats. ACD is collecting and regularly providing data in regards to confiscation applied in corruption cases.

Assessment of Progress

During the meeting it was clarified by Azerbaijani authorities that the last year total value of confiscated assets and property - approximately 3.36 million Manats (4.2 million USD) - is the amount confiscated by the Anti-Corruption Directorate and it is the figure after court decision.

While it was pointed out during the meeting that Anti-Corruption Directorate’s (ACD) regular reports include information about confiscation, however, no specific information was provided about monitoring of effectiveness of confiscation, what property is confiscated, how it is disposed of and the amount of proceeds recovered. Therefore, the meeting decided that there is lack of progress.

14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014

Measures taken to implement this recommendation

Analysis of the practice of application of confiscation provisions is a regular item of the work plan of the Anticorruption Directorate and other Departments of the General Prosecutor’s Office responsible for supervision over the lawfulness of investigation in all competent bodies. During the 2012 year total value of confiscated assets and property amounted to approximately 9.716 million Manats and in 2013 it was 3.36 million Manats. This properties are residential and non-residential premises, land areas, cars and apartments. For 2012 land areas valued at 839.688 manats, residential premises valued at 3.791.000 manats, non-residential premises valued at 5.065.974 manats and cars valued at 20.000 manats were confiscated by the ACD. For 2013 residential premises valued at 3.327.497 manats and non-residential premises valued at 30.000 manats were confiscated. ACD is collecting and regularly providing data in regards to confiscation applied in corruption cases.

Subject to the instruction of the Cabinet of Ministers, relevant state organizations reviewed the Rules on Registration, Evaluation, Storage, Usage and Sale of the Property Confiscated, Inherited by State. The
Assessment of Progress
Some additional information is provided regarding the types of property that was confiscated in 2012 and in 2013. Yet no information is provided about monitoring of the effectiveness of confiscation, how confiscated property is disposed of and the amount of proceeds recovered. Therefore, the meeting decided that there is lack of progress.


Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)
ACD has developed the mechanism of monitoring the effectiveness of the confiscation regime. This mechanism allows maintaining the statistics of the property to be seized or frozen. ACD continued to collect and analyse accurate statistics on what property is being confiscated, how the property is being disposed of, and the amount of proceeds of crime recovered. Thus, out of 15,680,482.00 manat damage to state property 6,309,352.00 manat, i.e. 40.2% was recovered. Out of 60,483,452.00 manat damage to private property 48,575,232.00 manat, i.e. 80.3% was recovered. Out of 1,107.00 manat damage to municipal property 1,107.00 manat, 100% was recovered.

Assessment of Progress
Azerbaijan provided some statistics on the amount of money recovered in cases, in which the court required from convicted persons to compensate the damage causes to the victim (state or private entity). However, no information was made available on a proper monitoring of the effectiveness of the confiscation, in order to address the concerns of the monitoring report, such as: how seized and confiscated property is evaluated, stored, managed during trial, what happens to property that is losing its value, how it is disposed of – and that in the absence of a specialised agency for assets’ management. There is no information on the follow-up to the discussions on setting up an Asset Management Office in Azerbaijan.
The monitoring meeting decided that there was no progress in the current reporting period.

16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting 7-9 October 2015

Measures taken to implement this recommendation (provided by national coordinator)
Government information:
In the monitoring period, the Prosecutor’s Office of Azerbaijan have introduced mandatory e-crime registration for all criminal cases investigated in the ACD, Serious Crime Investigation Department and several regional offices. The e-crime contains a series of parameters related to the property, including categories of property. The system will be integrated into the e-court system. Currently the ACD continues to collect statistical data on the property, subject to provisional measures by the ACD. In addition, the ACD is collecting the statistical data on the confiscated property, not just statistics on the amount of money recovered in cases, in which the court required from convicted persons to compensate the damage causes to the victim. The e-crime database will produce tentative figures at the end of the year.
The Asset Management Office is still in the process of establishment due to objective reasons. The State Committee on Property Affairs, which will act as an umbrella agency for the AMO, goes through the process of digitalisation of its operations.

NGO Information:
ACD continues its effort in the field of recovering of financial damage in terms of seizing and freezing
criminal proceeds and other property which can be used for this purpose. Implementation of electronic crime system in our opinion may contribute to more precise counting of confiscated property.

**Assessment of Progress**

ACD introduced an electronic statistic data base containing the number of the cases, value of the frozen assets, as well as decision of the court regarding the assets forfeiture. The plenary noted that this is a commendable step. However, this is not actually addressing the concerns expressed by the recommendation 7. There is still no information regarding a proper monitoring of the effectiveness of the confiscation, which would explain: what property is confiscate; how seized and confiscated property is evaluated, stored, managed during trial; what happens to property that is losing its value; and how it is disposed of.

Also, it is not clear from the statistics whether the data collected regards only assets seized in order to secure the recovery of the damage caused by the offence or an order of confiscation of proceeds of corruption. Moreover, there is no information on the follow-up to the discussions on setting up an Asset Management Office in Azerbaijan.

The plenary noted PROGRESS under this recommendation.

**Recommendation 8**

- Introduce measures to ease the proceedings for the access of the prosecutors, and particularly in corruption cases, to bank, financial and commercial records.
- Consider amending the Criminal Procedure Code to allow these activities to be performed by order of a prosecutor, without authorization from a court.

**13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Draft Laws on accessing of the prosecutors to bank, financial and commercial records in corruption cases had been prepared by the ACD and sent for reviewing to the relevant Ministries.

**Assessment of Progress**

NO PROGRESS

It was indicated during the meeting that the draft legislation to ease the access to bank and financial information by anti-corruption prosecutors was sent to the ministries for review in December 2013, that it is planned this to be an amendment to the regulation on the Anti-Corruption Directorate. Regarding amendment to the Criminal Procedure Code, there are discussions at the Ministry of Justice.

**14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Draft Law on accessing of the prosecutors to bank, financial and commercial records in corruption cases had been prepared by the ACD and sent for reviewing to the relevant Ministries.

Draft Law on amendments to Criminal Procedure Code regarding the accession of the prosecutors to bank, financial and commercial records in corruption cases has been prepared by the ACD and sent for reviewing to the relevant Ministries.

**Assessment of Progress**

No new information was provided; the meeting concluded that there is lack of progress.

**15th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on March, 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)**
ACD has received responses from ministries regarding the draft laws and works on introduction of the proposals.

**Assessment of Progress**
The draft law hoped to address the issues raised by this recommendation is still under discussions. NO PROGRESS.

---

**16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 7-9 October 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (provided by national coordinator)**

**Government information:**
The Draft Law on Amendments to Criminal Procedure Code regarding the accession of the prosecutors to bank, financial and commercial records in corruption cases prepared by the ACD, has been a subject of debates not only in the legal community, but also the public sector. The prevalent opinion is that current system of collection of documents has been built with all necessary judicial safeguards, in the aftermath of the prosecutorial general supervision. Although the Prosecutor’s Office is listed among organizations least affected by corruption (according to the reports of the TI), the implementation of this recommendations requires continuous public discussions.

**NGO information:**
Draft Law on accessing of the prosecutors to bank, financial and commercial records in corruption cases had been prepared by the ACD. Now, the process of review of this draft comes to the end. We strongly believe that this process will be finalized at the end of 2015.

**Assessment of Progress**
Access to bank and commercial records remains a difficulty for the anti-corruption prosecutors in Azerbaijan. Meanwhile, the authorities affirm that the possibilities to amend the criminal legislation were considered. The judicial procedure to be followed in order to obtain bank or commercial evidence was taken into consideration. Nevertheless, the conclusion was to keep it unchanged. However, the problem remains in relation with the practical application of this legislation, to ensure that, in practice, the procedure of obtaining such evidence is no longer cumbersome and lengthy. It was concluded that there is PROGRESS in implementing this recommendation.

---

**Recommendation 9**

- Further develop and make full use by Anti-Corruption Department of the information contained in the National Corruption Crimes Database and other sources in order to identify most frequent typologies of corruption, most vulnerable sectors and vulnerabilities within internal regulations and/or working methods of the public agencies that have been targeted by corruption investigations.
- Pursue efforts to grant the prosecutors direct and swift access to the relevant information detained by public institutions (i.e. criminal record, personal record, passports, vehicles registration, border police data, register of immovable property, etc.).
- Further strengthen the capacity of the internal investigation, control, audit or inspection bodies within the ministries or other public authorities to identify corruption or corruption related incidents within the institutions they control and to notify Anti-Corruption Department whenever a suspicion of a corruption offence is revealed.

---

**13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014**
**Measures taken to implement this recommendation:**

Anti-Corruption Directorate based on the information gathered from Central Data Base, in the course of investigation of cases and examination of facts and information sent for consideration develops motions and gives recommendations directly to the ministries and other relevant agencies on the existing problems with the applicable bylaws. The Ministries and other relevant agencies are obliged to study the motions and take appropriate measures within one month.

The prosecutors of the ACD have an access to the passports, border police data and personal details. Also Draft on laws of ACD joining the databases of the relevant ministries, including vehicle and real estate registers were sent to the Cabinet of Ministers.

The internal investigation, control, audit or inspection bodies within the ministries or other public authorities regularly sent suspicious materials to be examined at the ACD.

**Assessment of Progress**

**NO PROGRESS**

Steps are taken to pursue efforts to grant access to various data basis. Draft laws on ACD accessing the databases of the relevant ministries, including vehicle and real estate registers were sent to the Cabinet of Ministers. However, as noted during the plenary, these drafts were rejected. In the meantime, this measure is in the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan and therefore work will continue.

**14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Anti-Corruption Directorate based on the information gathered from Central Data Base, in the course of investigation of cases and examination of facts and information sent for consideration develops motions and gives recommendations directly to the ministries and other relevant agencies on the existing problems with the applicable by-laws. The Ministries and other relevant agencies are obliged to study the motions and take appropriate measures within one month.

The prosecutors of the ACD have an access to the passports, border police data and personal details. Also Draft on laws of ACD joining the databases of the relevant ministries, including vehicle, condemnation registers, “Student-graduate” database and database of the Ministry of Communications and High Technologies were sent to the Cabinet of Ministers.

The internal investigation, control, audit or inspection bodies within the ministries or other public authorities regularly sent suspicious materials to be examined at the ACD:

- For the period of 2013 174 materials were sent from the internal bodies of relevant ministries, agencies and other private entities to be examined by the ACD. 158 criminal cases were launched based on these materials.
- For the 1st half of 2014 169 materials were sent from the internal bodies of relevant ministries, agencies and other private entities to be examined by the ACD. 90 criminal cases were launched based on these materials.

**Assessment of Progress**

The importance of direct access to information for the purposes of analytical and operational work in Azerbaijan was highlighted during the meeting. The meeting welcomed the work of the Anti-Corruption Department in developing draft legislation, which could ensure a better access to the information necessary to detect and prosecute corruption. The work should continue. At this stage, the meeting
concluded that no progress is reached in implementing this recommendation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Measures taken to implement this recommendation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Anticorruption Directorate continued to diversify its sources. In addition to the National Corruption Crimes Database, 161-Hot Line and written information from citizens and legal persons, ACD has also developed a system of reception of citizens. Organization and Information Support Department of the Directorate were trained to receive citizens and record the appropriate information. They are operated on regular shift basis. In addition, the management of the ACD receives the citizens on regular basis several times a week. Within first half of 2015, 1313 persons were received, their complaints were recorded and analysed. According to its newly developed Charter, Organization and Information Support Department (which used to be a division) of the Directorate, has started to carry its function to develop strategy of the Directorate based on typologies for corruption, charting of public sector areas according to their vulnerability to corruption practices. The Strategy serves, among others, as a roadmap for detective operations. During the reporting period, the ACD received on-line access to the Database of the State Commission on Admission of Students (to universities), which include information on education and certificates. In addition, in November 2014, President of the Republic has signed the Order on the Access of the ACD to all public databases on movable property, including vehicle registration.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assessment of Progress</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan reports that Organization and Information Support Department of the ACD started to develop the strategy of the ACD, based on typologies of corruption, charting public sector according to their vulnerability to corruption. The intention is to use it as a roadmap for detection work. The meeting appreciated and commended Azerbaijan for this initiative, however, more information is needed to support this assertion, for instance, examples of vulnerable sectors charted and the number of detective operations launched accordingly), otherwise it remains difficult to assess the progress made on this issue. Regarding granting prosecutors with access to public records, information was provided that now prosecutors have direct access to new data base of student’s graduates (on education, certificates). Also, they have legal basis (following a Presidential decree) to access some public data basis on movable property, including vehicles. However, this access is not operational in practice yet. The meeting concluded that there is progress in this area.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting 7-9 October 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Measures taken to implement this recommendation (provided by national coordinator)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Government information:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In the reporting period, the Anticorruption Directorate finalized its preparatory work and operationalized access all the principal databases in the domain of the state institutions, including all the registers of the Ministry of Internal Affairs as conviction, car register, citizen registration, arm registration, vehicle registration; the databases of the Ministry of Justice; register of movable and immovable property; register of motorized vehicles, registry of private naval vehicles run by Ministry of Emergency Situations, registry of air ships run by AZAL (state air transportation company), registry of military vehicles run by Ministry of Defence and the databases of other state agencies. While the Anti-Corruption Department continues to operate National Corruption Crimes Database, it has</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
been introducing the e-crime database, which is wider in its scope and contains greater number of parameters. In addition to the information collected during the inquiry preceding investigation and investigation, the Organization and Information Support Department of the ACD collects information based on the analysis of media, private citizens’ complaints and information received from the state agencies.

**NGO information:**
As it is clearly seen from the previous reports that significant steps were taken in order to broaden prosecutorial capacity in the terms of easy access to databases run by other state agencies. Currently, in our opinion ACD has access to all necessary databases. At the same time, we should particularly emphasize the ACD activities on analysing corruption-prone areas. The information received through 161 hot line call centers played an important role in this issue.

**Assessment of Progress**
The capacity of the ACD to use and develop the NCCDatabase that the Directorate is keeping and to analyze the information introduced in it (information gathered from the investigations, as well as from the complaints they receive through hotlines or from media reports and NGOs) seem to improve. We have been informed that ACD drafts, based on this information, specific sector analysis in which they identify frequent typologies of corruption and vulnerable areas. These analysis reports are allegedly used both for prioritizing the ACD investigations and to be sent to the relevant ministries in order for them to take the necessary preventive measures. Further, the Azerbaijani authorities report making operational the direct access of the prosecutors and investigators od ACD to the various registers and databases kept by the relevant state agencies such as criminal record, car register, citizens register, register of movable and immovable property, etc. Not yet any information on the strengthened capacity of the control, inspection or audit state bodies to detect and report corruption. Therefore, under both parts of this recommendation is noted PROGRESS.

**Recommendation 10**
- Take measures that Ministry of Internal Affairs and the Prosecutor General’s Office, mainly its Anti-Corruption Department, place more emphasis in identifying and investigating cases in which organized crime and corruption are linked.
- Continue to organize joint trainings in these connected areas for investigators and prosecutors of the Ministry of Internal Affairs and Anti-Corruption Department of the Prosecutor General’s Office.

**13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014**

*Measures taken to implement this recommendation:*

**Assessment of Progress**
NO PROGRESS

**14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014**

*Measures taken to implement this recommendation:*

As it is mentioned in the Law on Combating Corruption all relevant bodies fight against corruption within their competence. During the last 3 years 172 criminal cases out of 474 were jointly investigated with the relevant authorities (including Ministry of Internal Affairs). In 2012 this was 40, in 2013 45 and in the 8 months of 2014 it was 87 criminal cases. As we see from the statistics, numbers of jointly investigated criminal cases are increasing. Also 8 criminal cases were sent to ACD to continue the investigation by the Ministry of Internal Affairs during
Joint trainings with the investigators of the Ministry of Internal Affairs and ACD prosecutors and investigators will be held in March 2015 regarding corruption offences.

**Assessment of Progress**

The meeting welcome information on jointly investigated cases and training foreseen in 2015, but concluded that **no progress** is made at this moment.

---

**15th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on March, 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)**

The Ministry of Internal Affairs is not entitled by law to investigate corruption cases. The MIA is not entitled to carry out detective (SIM) measures aimed at corruption, except for cases authorized by the ACD. According to the provisions of the Code of Criminal Proceedings, the criminal investigation shall be carried out in secrecy. Violation of these rules shall be subject to criminal prosecution, according to the Penal Code of the Republic of Azerbaijan. Therefore, the ACD is not sharing investigating information with the police. In cases, where the ACD identifies organized criminal groups engaged in corruption activities, it has sufficient ability to investigate these cases without participation of police. The ACD always involves police officers when it organizes multi-agency trainings. The ACD seeks clarification from the IAP regarding the ways of implementation of this recommendation.

**Assessment of Progress**

Azerbaijan indicates that the ACD has a unique competence in corruption and it is able to handle alone (without the help of police) cases, in which organised groups are engaged in corruption. During the plenary meeting Azerbaijan mentioned about a number of cases in which corruption and organised crime were investigated by the ACD. This is to be commended. Nevertheless, even when an agency has exclusive mandate on certain types of offences (such as corruption), that does not exclude the need to ensure inter-institutional co-operation. Agencies with general competence, such as police, should always be ready to help and support anti-corruption body and the later should not isolate itself. Joint meetings, joint training could be useful. It is important to encourage police to identify possible corruption elements of the organised crime cases they investigate, even if this means to transfer the case to the ACD. However, no information about efforts to implement this recommendation by the Ministry of Internal Affairs is provided.

In sum, the meeting concluded that there is some progress.

---

**16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on October, 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (provided by national coordinator)**

ACD has prepared draft on amendments to the relevant Presidential Decree regulating jurisdiction of investigational bodies. According to the new amendments, in case of detection of legalization of criminally obtained funds within investigation carried out on predicative offence, the investigation will be continued within the competence of the same investigation body (in case of investigations carried out by Ministry of Taxes and internal affairs bodies) without organizing joint investigation group with prosecutorial bodies. The draft was submitted for consideration to the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Azerbaijan. Within 9 month of 2015, 41 inquiry materials linked to criminal cases related to corruption offences...
were sent to the ACD by Ministry of internal affairs. These materials were attached to the ongoing criminal cases investigated by the ACD.

Within reporting period 2 inquiry materials were sent to ACD by the Ministry of Internal Affairs according to jurisdiction and one of these materials was a ground for launching criminal case.

Alongside with this 18 criminal cases investigated by Ministry of Internal Affairs were sent to ACD according to the jurisdiction, as elements of corruption related offences were detected in the framework of investigation. 4 of these cases were previously investigated by the Department for Combating Organized Crimes with which Anticorruption Directorate has stable cooperation.

101 joint investigation groups with participation of officers of internal affairs bodies were created in the framework of investigation of corruption related crimes. As it is clearly seen from the figures related to the previous years number of jointly investigated corruption related crimes are steadily increasing. For reference, in 2012 this was 40, in 2013 45 and in the 8 months of 2014 it was 87 criminal cases.

Launching of criminal case on facts of committing embezzlement, fraud, abuse of power and bribe-taking by organized group of employees of “Qala Muhafize” security service and joint investigation of this case by ACD and representatives of Ministry Internal Affairs is an estimable example of mutual cooperation of ACD with bodies of internal affairs. Currently, the investigation is underway and 14 persons were arrested in relation with this case.

**Assessment of Progress**

During the previous examination, experts got the impression that the law enforcement authorities competent for corruption offences and those competent to deal with organised crime do not cooperate and nobody investigates possible links between the two, now the situation seems to have improved. The AZ authorities report a better approach of the institutional cooperation in identifying and investigating cases, in which organised crime and corruption are linked. A number of cases were reported, in which the investigation started by the police on fraud allegations, while during the investigation elements of organized crime and corruption appeared and the cases were then referred to ACD for further investigation.

The meeting noted SOME PROGRESS as compared to the previous progress update.

**Recommendation 11**

- Continue to improve the capacity of the Financial Monitoring Service to analyse financial information and detect suspicious transactions, as well as the quality and percentage of referrals it makes to the prosecution.
- Evaluate the needs to fully use or further develop the data mining and analysis of information IT software currently in place and the training needs of the persons operating it.
- Pursue with the draft legislation to implement FATF Recommendation 12 regarding the domestic and international PEPs, their family members and close associates and develop subsequent bylaws and guidelines to be used by the reporting entities for the implementation of this legal provision.
- Take the necessary measures (either by normative acts, or instructions to prosecutors, training of judges and prosecutors, disseminating relevant jurisprudence, etc.) in order to clarify that criminal liability for money laundering offences should not be dependent on a conviction for the predicate offence, nor limited to predicate offence committed within Azerbaijan’s jurisdiction, should go beyond self-laundering, and should consider the possibility to infer the subjective element also from objective, factual circumstances.
- Continue with the organization of joint trainings for FMS officers, investigators, prosecutors and judges in the field of money laundering and anti-corruption.
### 13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation:**

#### Assessment of Progress

**NO PROGRESS**

### 14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Improvement of the system on receiving information and analysing it according to the *Fight against Legalization of Money and other Property and Financing of Terrorism Act 2009* and renewal of the *Criteria (Special Indicators) for Detection of Suspicious Cases or the Cases Creating Sufficient Grounds for Such Suspicions Concerning Criminally Obtained Funds or Other Property or Financing of Terrorism* (‘red flags’) Order 2011 affected in increasing the quality and quantity of the of STRs sent for examination. In 2011 7 STRs, in 2012 10, in 2013 64 and in 2014 41 STRs were sent to law-enforcement agencies.

In 2011 the FMS developed with the support from UNODC a new and improved analytical and reporting IT system called “goAML”. The “goAML” became functional in July 2012. This system has data transmission, processing, destination search, statistical reports, tactical and strategic analysis capabilities, work flow management, visual imagery, as well as an analysis module settings functions. Every year representatives of the user states of the system attend the annual meeting and training programmes. In 2014 the FMS received 167 reports concerning transactions operated by PEPs on the basis of that legislation. In accordance with Article 193-1 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Azerbaijan, criminal liability for the legalization of criminally obtained funds or other property is not related to specific criminal offence. Moreover, in case of committing of legalization acts within Azerbaijan’s jurisdiction those acts can be classified by article 193-1, regardless of whether criminal proceedings have been initiated or whether predicate crime had been committed out of the border of the Republic of Azerbaijan in any other country.

In addition, Article 193-1 of the Criminal Code does not make a difference between self-laundering and legalization committed by the 3rd party. In any case, it is considered to comply with Article 193-1. In accordance with the Code of Criminal Procedure, during the investigation of all crimes the subjective aspect of the crime should be identified basing on the objective factual circumstances. In order to achieve the correct application of mentioned issues by investigators, prosecutors and judges, FMS in joint cooperation law enforcement agencies or on own initiative carry out trainings and working meetings. On 22 May 2014 with the organisation of the Judicial-legal Council was held training by the FMS for judges on the theme on investigation of money laundering financing of terrorism.

Also on 2-3 July 2014 was held seminar jointly organized by World Bank and FMS in the framework of the project *National Money Laundering and Terrorist Financing Risk Assessment* with the participation of the representatives or FMS, Supreme Court, National Security Ministry and General Prosecutor’s Office. Co-operation in this field between FMS and ACD was developed over the last years, 12 reports relating to suspicious transactions were sent for reviewing to the ACD during 2012, 21 reports in 2013 and 31 for the 8 months of 2014. Based on this reports 10 criminal cases were launched in 2013 and 6 in 2014.

#### Assessment of Progress

Statistics are provided showing that the number of STRs sent to law-enforcement agencies is increasing. Meanwhile, the recommendation was to increase the number of STRs sent to prosecution services by the Financial Monitoring Service (FMS). It is stated that the FMS continues with the organization of joint trainings with law enforcement officials, but not judges. No information is provided on new draft
legislation and guidelines to implement FATF Recommendation 12 or new measures to clarify the criminal liability for money laundering offences, as recommended. Therefore it can be concluded that there is lack of progress in this area.


Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)

Improvement of the system on receiving information and analysing it according to the Fight against Legalization of Money and other Property and Financing of Terrorism Act 2009 and renewal of the Criteria (Special Indicators) for Detection of Suspicious Cases or the Cases Creating Sufficient Grounds for Such Suspicions Concerning Criminally Obtained Funds or Other Property or Financing of Terrorism (‘red flags’) Order 2011 affected in increasing the quality and quantity of the of cases sent for examination. In 2011 7 cases, in 2012 10, in 2013 64 and in 2014 43 cases were sent to law-enforcement agencies.

In 2011 the FMS developed with the support from UNODC a new and improved analytical and reporting IT system called “goAML”. The “goAML” became functional in July 2012. This system has data transmission, processing, destination search, statistical reports, tactical and strategic analysis capabilities, work flow management, visual imagery, as well as an analysis module settings functions. Every year representatives of the user states of the system attend the annual meeting and training programmes.

The AML/CFT Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan comprehensively regulates international PEPs as well as their family members and close associates. Hence, according to Article 9-1.1 of AML/CFT Law, the reporting entities should take measures in order to determine the customer and beneficial owner is international PEPs as well as their family members and close associates within the internal control system. Article 9-1.2 says that all business relations with international PEPs should be established and continued under the permission of top management of reporting entities. Furthermore, the reporting entities should request information about source of funds from PEPs (Article 9-1.3).

Article 7.2.3 of the AML/CFT Law sets up mechanism for making STR of each transaction with international PEPs. Moreover under the provisions of Article 9 of AML/CFT Law, enhanced CDD measures and on-going monitoring should be applied to PEPs.

In 2014 the FMS received 289 reports concerning transactions operated by PEPs on the basis of that legislation.

The legislation of the Republic of Azerbaijan does not cover domestic PEPs.

In accordance with Article 193-1 of the Criminal Code of the Republic of Azerbaijan, criminal liability for the legalization of criminally obtained funds or other property is not related to specific criminal offence. Moreover, in case of committing of legalization acts within Azerbaijan’s jurisdiction those acts can be classified by article 193-1, regardless of whether criminal proceedings have been initiated or whether predicate crime had been committed out of the border of the Republic of Azerbaijan in any other country.

In addition, Article 193-1 of the Criminal Code does not make a difference between self-laundering and legalization committed by the 3rd party. In any case, it is considered to comply with Article 193-1. In accordance with the Code of Criminal Procedure, during the investigation of all crimes the subjective aspect of the crime should be identified basing on the objective factual circumstances.

In order to achieve the correct application of mentioned issues by investigators, prosecutors and judges, FMS in joint cooperation law enforcement agencies or on own initiative carry out trainings and working meetings.

On 22 May 2014 with the organisation of the Judicial-legal Council was held training by the FMS for judges on the theme on investigation of money laundering financing of terrorism.

Also on 2-3 July 2014 was held seminar jointly organized by World Bank and FMS in the framework of
the project National Money Laundering and Terrorist Financing Risk Assessment with the participation of the representatives of FMS, Supreme Court, National Security Ministry and General Prosecutor’s Office. Co-operation in this field between FMS and ACD was developed over the last years, 12 reports relating to suspicious transactions were sent for reviewing to the ACD during 2012, 21 reports in 2013 and 31 for the 8 months of 2014. Based on this reports 10 criminal cases were launched in 2013 and 6 in 2014.

Assessment of Progress
No information is provided with regards to strengthening staff or increasing other resources of the FMS or evaluating the need to further develop its IT analytical software. There is partially progress on amendment to the AML law to cover international PEPs. Unfortunately no amendments occurred in relation to domestic PEPs. Relating to investigation of money-laundering and awareness of this offence among prosecutors and judges, Azerbaijan reports that the law encompasses all the highlighted by the report. However, there is no information on how often these provisions are applied by prosecutors and judges. In future, it could be worthwhile providing examples of jurisprudence. The meeting agreed that there is PROGRESS in implementing this recommendation.

16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on October, 2015

Measures taken to implement this recommendation (provided by national coordinator)
On May 27, 2015 a conference “On legalization of criminally obtained funds” was held by the Anticorruption Directorate in cooperation with Financial Monitoring Service under the Central Bank of the Republic of Azerbaijan. The event was participated by 20 officers representing relevant departments of the General Prosecutor’s Office, Military Prosecutor’s and Baku metropolitan prosecutor’s Office and the Directorate.

Financial Monitoring Service prepared several drafts aimed at developing system of combat against money laundering offences:
- Draft law on amendments to Code of Administrative Offences excluding liability in case of Purchase or selling of the property extracted obviously in the criminal way for amount less than 1000 manat
- Draft law on amendments to Criminal Code which envisages criminalization in case of minor damage (less than 1000 manat) and improvement of disposition given for Article 194.1 (Purchase or selling of the property extracted obviously in the criminal way)

On June 30-July 2, 2015 workshop organized by Financial Monitoring Service in cooperation with World Bank on “Assessment of national risks in the field of” was held in Baku. In the framework of the event needs for information regarding national risk assessment were discussed, as well as draft of National Action Plan for 2016-2018 on fight against criminalization of criminally obtained funds and financing terrorism was discussed.

Assessment process was implemented by 5 sub- groups consisting of representatives of 16 state agencies.

Final report on assessment of national risks is to be submitted to World Bank in September 2015.

Alongside with this, Rules on submitting information to Financing Monitoring Service by subjects of monitoring and other parties of monitoring were amended. Amendments envisage enhancement of analysing capacity of the information submitted to FMS.

FMS has submitted 30 STR to law enforcement bodies within reporting period (9 month). 20 STR of this number were received by ACD.
1 criminal case under article 193-1 (money laundering) of Criminal Code was launched by ACD basing on received STRs, furthermore 3 STRs were sent according to jurisdiction to the investigation bodies of Ministry of Taxes for attaching to on-going criminal cases for legal evaluation. Investigation of these cases were kept under supervision of the Prosecutor General’s Office.

Moreover, the remaining 16 STR are being reviewed currently in ACD.

In the framework of the project on modernization of analytical information system of FMS, the structure of IT software was prepared, statistics and analytics modules of new software are currently being tested by analytics.

Moreover, 7 trainings with participation of 88 representatives from bank and non-bank credit entities as well as university students were conducted within the reporting period. The trainings covered issued of criminal typology of ML/FT offences as well as national legislation in this field.

**Assessment of Progress**

Some developments regarding the money laundering legislation and the relation between the reporting entities and the FIU were reported. Meanwhile, no tangible progress is noted in relation to the specific elements concerned by this recommendation.

One case was launched by the anticorruption prosecutors based on STRs from the FIU in the reporting period and other 16 STRs are under review. However, we cannot evaluate how qualitative and relevant for the prosecution these reports were, if any of these cases regard the instances highlighted by the recommendation. In the future, some elements of jurisprudence could be worth being provided to us.

No information was either provided with relation to developing legislation and bylaws covering the domestic PEPs.

Therefore there is PROGRESS under this recommendation.
Pillar 3. Prevention of Corruption

Recommendation 12

- Develop rules and implement transparent and merit-based recruitment of senior and high level civil servants as part of the new Civil Service Code and enhancing the capacities of the Civil Service Commission to enforce it.
- Develop rules or common principles for transparent appointments to political positions.
- Ensure a more transparent, adequate and equal salary system in the public administration, comparable between administrative bodies and competitive in relation to comparable enterprises/organisations.
- Develop a network of ethics commissioners in public administration institutions.
- Compose a practical public service ethics training course offered regularly and mandatory to public officials.
- Ensure clear and comprehensive conflict of interest and ethics rules for civil servants and other public officials and a meaningful mechanism for their implementation are in place and vigorously implemented and enforced in practice.
- Ensure the necessary legal, regulatory and institutional basis to implement a system requiring public officials to submit asset declarations and to verify them is completed and implement the asset declarations system in practice without further delay.

13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014

Measures taken to implement this recommendation

Monthly salaries of state employees determined by an ordinance of the President of 9 July 2008. In accordance with this decree between the official salaries of civil servants working in similar positions in various government agencies do not have significant difference.

In order to oversee compliance with the standards of ethical conduct established by the Law of Azerbaijan Republic " On the rules of ethical conduct for civil servants", as well as coordination of issues related to the application of the law on the initiative of the Civil Service Commission (CSC) in 2013 was formed institute providing supervision over the rules of ethical conduct for public employees in some public bodies the rules of ethical conduct under the law , as well as carrying out the analysis in this area - Institute of ethics Commissioner .

To create opportunities for direct access to authorized information about the ethics of these individuals (name, surname, first name, position and phone number) has been posted on the official website of the CSC (http://csc.gov.az/aze/downloads/diger/EtikMuvekiller.htm) and was also formed a network of authorized ethics . In connection with the transition to e-government system to facilitate the possibility of recourse to the authorized Ethics on the websites of state agencies were created ethical sections and was created to access them through the website of the CSC.

According to paragraph 10.1 of the National Anti-corruption Plan 2012-2015 in order to ensure the regularity of ethics training, the Action Plan for 2012-2015 was adopted by the CSC.

September 7, 2013 by the Commission for public servants serving in the Office of the State Migration Service courses were held on the topic "Rules of Ethical Conduct ", on October 23 for the Staff of the State Committee on Statistics on "Prevention of conflicts of interest" and "Studying the legal mechanisms relating to compliance principles and rules of ethical conduct."

December 17 and 18 during the course conducted for young workers in administrative positions in the central offices of public bodies and Departments in Baku - "Rules of ethical conduct of public servants".

Were also taken appropriate measures of overseeing the implementation of the rules of ethical conduct
established by the Law of Azerbaijan Republic on the “Rules of ethical conduct for civil servants” and coordination issues related to the application of the law.

The first work was done on the ethical education of persons responsible for overseeing the compliance of laws rules of ethical behaviour in every single public body, as well as carrying out the analysis on this issue - CSC ethics. Thus, on 21 October 22 for Commissioners of Government Ethics courses were held on the theme "Education for teaching".

The aim of these courses was to improve the learning abilities of Commissioners ethics operating in state bodies, enforcement of the rules of ethical conduct on the part of officials, as well as increase the participants' knowledge in the application of ethical legislation. The training was attended by 35 civil servants

16-17 December by the Commission was held a seminar on "Ethics in the Public Service" for authorized Ethics central government bodies.

Draft Law on conflict of interests had been prepared.

Assessment of Progress

PROGRESS

Several steps taken to address this recommendation. Some training for civil servants on ethics was provided. Conflict of interest and ethics rules could be clarified if the reported draft law on conflict of interests is adopted. No information if there is progress with draft Civil Service Code, where it was planned to merge various norms regarding ethics, conflict of interest and integrity. In 2013, an institute of ethics training was established, which is in charge to monitor the application of the Law on the Rules of Ethical Code for Civil Servants. Work to create a network of ethical commissioners seems to have started. No progress in implementing the assess declarations requirements.

14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014

Measures taken to implement this recommendation

Civil Service Commission (CSC) is preparing Civil Service Code and it will envisage the rules and terms for high level civil servants (3rd and 4th degree). It is also planned to adopt the law on Political Posts in the near future.

Monthly salaries of state employees determined by an ordinance of the President of 9 July 2008. In accordance with this decree between the official salaries of civil servants working in similar positions in various government agencies do not have significant difference.

In order to oversee compliance with the standards of ethical conduct established by the Law of The Republic of Azerbaijan " On the rules of ethical conduct for civil servants" , as well as coordination of issues related to the application of the law on the initiative of the Civil Service Commission (CSC) in 2013 was formed institute providing supervision over the rules of ethical conduct for public employees in some public bodies the rules of ethical conduct under the law , as well as carrying out the analysis in this area - Institute of ethics Commissioner.

To create opportunities for direct access to authorized information about the ethics of these individuals (name, surname, first name , position and phone number) has been posted on the official website of the CSC (http://csc.gov.az/aze/downloads/diger/EtikMuvekiller.htm) and was also formed a network of authorized ethics . In connection with the transition to e-government system to facilitate the possibility of recourse to the authorized Ethics on the websites of state agencies were created ethical sections and
was created to access them through the website of the CSC. According to paragraph 10.1 of the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan 2012-2015 in order to ensure the regularity of ethics training, the Action Plan for 2012-2015 was adopted by the CSC. For this purpose letters were sent to central and local executive authorities in order to provide with the annual information the CSC about the ethics trainings, complaints about ethics violations and the results of disciplinary measures by 1st December of each year. The information gathered are summarized and sent to the Commission on Combating Corruption. According to the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan 2012-2015 it is planned to establish Training Center within CSC and for this purpose proposals were sent in December 2013 to relevant ministries for agreement, also draft law on amendment to Civil Service Act was prepared by the CSC. Amendment implies rules and aims of conducting trainings. To improve the professional training system of the civil servants draft law on Amendments to the Charter of the CSC has been prepared and according to the amendments trainings will be hold for civil servants on ethics, fight against corruption an conflict of interests and etc. Practice of UK, Turkey and other countries about investigation of ethics violations were studied and for the effective investigation amendments to the Law on Ethics of Civil Servants are being prepared by the CSC.

Were also taken appropriate measures of overseeing the implementation of the rules of ethical conduct established by the Law of The Republic of Azerbaijan on the “Rules of ethical conduct for civil servants” and coordination issues related to the application of the law.

**Assessment of Progress**

The envisaged legislation on Civil Service and on Political Posts could be positive developments in this area. If they are adopted, it would be important to assess if they meet the recommendation 12 asking to adopt rules on merit-based recruitment for senior level officials and to adopt common principles for transparent appointments to political positions.

The meeting welcomed the creation of the Institute of Ethics Commissioner in 2013 and the creation of a network of authorised ethics officials (also mentioned in April progress report). However, at this stage **no additional progress** is made under this recommendation.

**15th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on March, 2015**

*Measures taken to implement this recommendation (provided by national coordinator)*

The State Commission on Civil Service continued its efforts to develop civil service code. According to the draft, the Civil Service Commission is entitled to announce competition and run exams for the candidates of senior and high-level.

Regarding the rules of appointment to political positions, in line with the presidential degree of 8 July 2014, special law on political positions shall be elaborated. According to this degree the commission has elaborated draft law, which will later be submitted to other state institutions for review.

According to the National Action Plan against Corruption the State Commission on Civil Service has prepared a directive on preparation and running of training courses and seminars on such issues as fight against corruption, upholding of ethical behaviour, preventing of conflict of interests and other issues. The directive was sent to all public institutions. The answers were received from state institutions and analysed, pulled into a special report. This way the Commission provides for continuity of training. The priority of the commission is that each state institution continues to run seminars and training on regular bases. Additionally it made sure that throughout the year public institutions organize big events in the
specified areas.

On 20th September 2014, the State Migration Service in cooperation with civil service commission ran a training seminar dedicated to the topic of correct behaviour for civil servants. Around 80 employees of the state migration service participated in these training. Among the topics of this training were the definition of ethics, understanding of importance of ethics in civil service, prevention of corruption and conflict of interest, supervision of adherence to ethical rules and other issues.

In order to continue the efforts to train ethical instructors in civil service area, the State Civil Service Commission in cooperation with State Administration Academy, State Agency for Service to Citizens and Social Innovations, Ministry of Transport and Ministry of Economy and Industry organized a special course “Training-of-trainers” on 6-8 September 2014.

On 9-10 September 2014, the State Commission on Civil Service in cooperation with German International Cooperation Organization (GIZ) organised a special training for civil servants dedicated to the topic of ‘Ethics in civil service and resolution of ethical dilemmas’. The training covers such areas as prevention of corruption, conflicts of interest, tools for ethical changes, application of ethical rules and difficulties arising during this application, tools used to overcome these difficulties. Notably, the trainers for this course were the ones trained previously at the event organized on 6-8 September 2014. These were the trainers from the State Commission on Civil Service, State Administration Academy, Ministry of Transport, Ministry of Economy and Industry, State Agency for Service to Citizens and Social Innovation. And naturally the German experts were also involved. As a result of the training, the participants received ISO certificates.

On 18 November 2014, the Commission run a special event dedicated to the issue on ethical dilemmas and the ways to resolve them in the Nizami district executive Power Office of Baku.

On November 21, 2013 the Commission has a topic of rules of ethical behaviour for civil servants in the Surakhani district Executive Power Office of Baku. Both trainings cover such important issues as ethical behaviour of civil servants, winning the public confidence, treating with respect of peoples’ rights and freedoms and legal interests, as well as their dignity and honour. Also the training covered such issues as inadmissibility of receiving of privileges and concessions for civil service, as well as the limitation rules for gifts. Prevention of conflict of interests, limitation on the use of state property and information were also included in the topics covered by this training.

On 25-27 November 2014, the State Commission on Civil Service ran a wide training for the representatives of all executive power offices in districts of Baku, including the employees of Baku Executive Power Office, dedicated to the topic of rules of ethical behaviour.

On the 3 December 2014, the State Commission on Civil Service in cooperation with the State Committee on Family, Woman And Children Problems run training dedicated to the topic of ethics in the civil service. The training started with a presentation on the regulatory framework of ethical behaviour for civil servants. Then it continued with the presentation of possible dilemmas and way to overcome them, as well as description of procedures to be followed in the case of facing such problems. In the course of the training of the civil servants were presented with specific cases and they made efforts to resolve these problems in groups.

Concerning the measures on introducing clear and comprehensive conflict of interest and ethics rules for
civil servants, the Commission continued its efforts in accordance with the state action plan on fight against corruption. In addition to the law on ethical behaviour of civil servants, State institutions developed the internal normative acts to describe the ways of implementation of this law.

**Assessment of Progress**

Azerbaijan reported steps taken by the Civil Service Commission (CSC), namely guidelines developed on providing training and several training courses it has actually provided on ethics issues, in particular, for migration officials, in administrations present in Baku city and in a region. “Training-of-trainers” held in September 2014 is another positive development, showing efforts to invest in long-term development of ethics training capacity in the civil service. As a result there are now trainers in the CSC and several other public institutions and they have already been used as trainers.

However, no progress is reported on a number of other points of the recommendation: civil service code is still a draft; no rules for appointment to political positions are adopted; no steps are taken concerning asset declarations.

Kazakhstan highlighted progress in the area of recruitment in the public service in Azerbaijan, active work in automatisation of public service provision, as well as anti-corruption education and information events.

The plenary concludes that there is LITTLE PROGRESS regarding this recommendation.

---

**16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting 7-9 October 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

**Government information:**

Several measures aimed to increase transparency and avoid conflict of interests were taken by the General Prosecutor’s Office. Thus, draft law on amendments to Law on Prosecutor’s Office was prepared, the relevant provision on inadmissibility of interference in professional activities of prosecutors (article 46) was attached to the text of the draft.

Moreover, a new draft law on amendment to the Law on Service in prosecutorial bodies, envisages the provision of information on vacant positions in the prosecutorial bodies through media and web-site of the General Prosecutor’s Office (Article 11.3).

By the Orders of the Prosecutor General of the Republic of Azerbaijan, the Regulations on secondary employment of prosecutors involved into scientific, pedagogical and creative activity were endorsed. Another Order of Prosecutor General envisages regulation on recruitment procedure of prosecutorial workers from other law enforcement agencies.

The draft law on political positions was prepared by the Commission. The draft law envisages common principles and regulation for appointment to political positions.

Relevant measures were taken in order to develop training system of public officials:

On May 25-27, 2015 trainings aimed at enhancement of work skills of young public officials successfully passed competitions for recruitment in public service, were held. These event were attended by 90 public officials. In the framework of the trainings, presentations on “management of human resources”, “Motivation”, “Rules of ethical conduct for public servants” were delivered to the audience, implementation of legislation on public service was discussed as well.

The main objectives of the trainings conducted were to provide awareness raising in the field of management in order to grow up young leaders, to prevent conflicts of interests, corruption, to instill compliance to the ethical principles, subordination and discipline in the framework of work activity of public servants.

On May 11-16 and May 19-23 trainings on “Time-management and effective work distribution”
“Presentation, rhetoric and moderation of the events”, “Conflict management and negotiations”, “Organization and holding of meetings” “Management of human resources” “Motivation and teambuilding” were conducted for the public servants working at the Commission. On June 17-18, 2015 trainings on “Leadership skills” were organized for 6 public servants representing 3 state agencies and on June 29-30 trainings on “Team building and motivation” were organized for 9 public servants representing 4 state agencies. The main objective of these trainings was to improve management skills of public servants.

On January 14-16, 2015 training on “Rules of assessment of professional activities of public servants” was conducted in the Ministry of Energetics. The event was attended by 30 employee of the mentioned ministry.

On February 27, 2015 training on the same topic was conducted in the Justice Academy of the Ministry of Justice. The event was attended by 19 senior officials of court execution department. In the framework of the trainings, the issues of objects of performance assessment, management of evaluation system, organization of assessment, stages of assessment, criteria of assessment, problems and obstacles as well as way to solve them were discussed and training module on performance assessment was prepared.

On June 8, 2015 training on “Working mechanisms of Public Servants registry information system” for public servants responsible for running of public servants registries, representing 41 state agencies was conducted.

9 young persons graduated from universities in foreign countries in the framework of stae program on abroad education of young people were provided with a chance to gain a fellowship in 4 state agencies.

On September 22-23, 2015 trainings on “Ethical conduct and anticorruption” were organized for employees of state agencies engaged in preparation of training programs on ethical conduct, and organizing relevant trainings. The trainings were attended by 22 public servants representing 4 local governances and 15 central executive powers.

In the draft of Code of Public Service special section dedicated to ethical conduct was envisaged. The experience of foreign countries (Kazakhstan and Turkey) was used in preparation of this section. The code envisages procedures for review of complaints on ethical misconduct, as well as establishing principles and objectives of ethical conduct.

Also, the Code envisages time limits for consideration of appeals on ethical misconduct, decision making and hearings on this issue.

**NGO information:**

Civil Service Commission has conducted numerous trainings within reporting period aimed at increasing public servants capacity in the field of administration and leadership, as well as some significant number of trainings were dedicated to anticorruption and ethical conduct. Rules for appointment to political positions are not implemented yet, but draft law on this issue is prepared by the Commission and being under consideration.

**Assessment of Progress**

Various training seminars for civil servants are conducted in Azerbaijan recently, including on topics of anti-corruption and ethical conduct. Nevertheless, the recommendation 12 is quite specific in the area of training, asking to compose a practical public service ethics training course offered regularly and mandatory to public officials.

Another important initiative is the draft law on political positions prepared by the Commission combating corruption. The draft law envisages common principles and regulation for appointment to political positions, as recommended to Azerbaijan. However, this remains a draft law.

Information on most of the parts of the recommendation -- merit-based recruitment, salaries system,
| Ethics commissioner’s network, conflict of interest rules, asset declarations -- is not provided. Hence, NO PROGRESS can be recorded under this recommendation at this stage. |

**Recommendation 13**

Expand efforts to simplify administrative procedures and render more transparent and efficient delivery of public services towards conduct of business in Azerbaijan and in the most corruption-prone sectors.

**13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

New services have been added to the ASAN service centres at the Presidential Decree of 11 February 2014. If up to now the ASAN service centres provided 25 legal services, at the president’s instruction, the scope of these services has expanded even more. In accordance with President Ilham Aliyev’s decree signed on 11 February 2014, the centres of ASAN service will perform the following services:

- primary and re-state registration of ownership of the apartment and the issuance of statements and technical certificates;
- re-state registration of ownership of individual houses and issuance of statements and technical certificates;
- acceptance of conscripts and reservist citizens on the military registration and removal from military registry in cases of registration or removal from a residence;
- acceptance of documents for the issue of an apostille for documents provided for use abroad.

The decree of the Azerbaijani president also expanded the scope of electronic services. Thus, the ASAN payment, a system provided at the decree, as an electronic service, will promote the implementation of non-cash payments, as well as online payment of all administrative penalties, and funds that must be paid by the court decision. System ASAN payment will enable citizens to be informed of his fining and enjoy certain benefits in an immediate payment of the fine. The ASAN payment will enable to pay administrative fines applied by all public authorities. The implementation of institutional and practical measures to create this system has already launched.

The population included in the scope of activities of ASAN service is up to 3,500 million people, representing nearly 37 percent of the population. Since the beginning up to the present day, more than 1, 100 million people applied for various services of the ASAN service centres. In particular, in areas not covered by the centres, using buses, equipped with special technical means, about 60,000 citizens were provided with mobile services. Simultaneously, from 1 February, mobile services were applied so that citizens, according to their desires, without going to the centres, use the services anywhere.

**Assessment of Progress**

**PROGRESS**

Expanding the services provided by the ASAN centers in February 2014 is an effort that can be welcomed. However, it is not possible to assess at this stage how relevant it is for business sector and service delivery in corruption-prone sectors.
**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

New services have been added to the ASAN service centres at the Presidential Decree of 11 February 2014. If up to now the ASAN service centres provided 25 legal services, at the president's instruction, the scope of these services has expanded even more. In accordance with President Ilham Aliyev's decree signed on 11 February 2014, the centres of ASAN service will perform the following services:

- primary and re-state registration of ownership of the apartment and the issuance of statements and technical certificates;
- re - state registration of ownership of individual houses and issuance of statements and technical certificates;
- acceptance of conscripts and reservist citizens on the military registration and removal from military registry in cases of registration or removal from a residence;
- acceptance of documents for the issue of an apostille for documents provided for use abroad.

The decree of the Azerbaijani president also expanded the scope of electronic services. Thus, the ASAN payment, a system provided at the decree, as an electronic service, will promote the implementation of non-cash payments, as well as online payment of all administrative penalties, and funds that must be paid by the court decision. System ASAN payment will enable citizens to be informed of his fining and enjoy certain benefits in an immediate payment of the fine. The ASAN payment will enable to pay administrative fines applied by all public authorities. The implementation of institutional and practical measures to create this system has already launched.

The population included in the scope of activities of ASAN service is up to 3,500 million people, representing nearly 37 percent of the population. Since the beginning up to the present day, more than 1, 100 million people applied for various services of the ASAN service centres. In particular, in areas not covered by the centres, using buses, equipped with special technical means, about 60,000 citizens were provided with mobile services. Simultaneously, from 1 February, mobile services were applied so that citizens, according to their desires, without going to the centres, use the services anywhere.

**Assessment of Progress**

The Presidential Decree of 11 February 2014 expanding the services of ASAN centres was already described in April 2014 and this development received a positive assessment. No additional progress reported in October 2014.

---

**ASAN service centres offer more than 240 services by 9 state entities and number of functional subsidiary services by private companies:**


1. Birth registration;
2. Death registration;
3. Marriage registration;
4. Registration of divorce;
5. Registration of child adoption;
6. Registration of determination of paternity;
7. Registration of changes to the given name, patronymic and family name;
8. Issuance of certificates (renewed certificates) on state registration of civil status;
9. Notary service;
10. Issuance and renewal of identity cards;
11. Issuance and renewal of passport of citizen;
12. Renewal of driving licenses;
13. Reference note about the conviction;
14. Extracts of registration of property rights over the living houses (apartments);
15. Reference note of state registration about restriction (encumbrance) of rights over the real estate;
16. Issuance of certificates from state register about the description of the real estate;
17. Issuance of extracts about initial registration of property rights on apartments;
18. Registration of commercial legal persons and tax payers;
19. Archive references to legal and physical persons;
20. Receipt of customs declaration and documents for customs clearance;
21. Granting temporary residence permission to foreigners and stateless persons in the Republic of Azerbaijan;
22. Granting permanent residence permission (immigrant status) to foreigners and stateless persons in the Republic of Azerbaijan;
23. Granting work permit to carry out paid labor activity in the territory of the Republic of Azerbaijan to foreigners and stateless persons;
24. Reference note on information about land cadaster;
25. Determining occupational pensions;
26. Providing information on all services rendered by the state entities;
27. Issuance of extracts and technical passports of initial and repeated registration of ownership rights on apartments;
28. Issuance of extracts, technical passports of repeated registration of ownership rights on private houses;
29. Military registration and removal of military registration of conscripts and citizens with military duty in cases of the registration and removal of registration of residence.

“Functional subsidiary services”
Given the success of the ASAN service offering public services and the positive image it gained for the last years a lot of private companies are being attracted to be represented at ASAN service centers.

- Bank services
- Insurance services
- Legal subsidiary services
- Services for translating all kinds of documents into/from state language from/to different languages
- Medical services
- Services rendered via official internet information resources
- Services rendered via special terminal installed at the centers
- AZERIGAZ customer services
- AZERSU customer services
AZERENERGY customer services
NAR mobile services
Bakcell services
Azercell services
Central Bank services
Centralized ticket sale kiosks

“ASAN Imza” enables citizens to get an easy access to the electronic public services. It is easily handled by all groups of ages and simple to use by all type of mobile phones. You can use the “ASAN Imza” without any card-reader. It does not recognize boundaries and could be used both in and out of the country. Actually, “ASAN Imza” matches the principle of ASAN service the most – easiness!

**Assessment of Progress**

While Azerbaijan provided extensive information on ASAN Service centres, it is difficult to assess what is new in the provided information in comparison to what has already been made available in April and October 2014 and how it demonstrates progress in implementing this specific recommendation. Moreover, the recommendation is broader and also called on expanding efforts to simplify administrative procedures and render more transparent and efficient delivery of public services towards conduct of business in Azerbaijan and in the most corruption-prone sectors. As a result, the meeting concluded that there is **LACK OF PROGRESS** regarding this recommendation.

**16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting 7-9 October 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

**Government information:**

New services have been added to the ASAN service centers through making amendments by Presidential Decree dated August 31, 2015 “On measures Increasing transparency in provision of public services, e-government of residence registration system and licensing procedures” to the Presidential Decree on the provision of the activity of the State Agency for services to citizens and social innovation at the President of the Azerbaijan Republic dated September 5,2012:

- Reference note on residence registration
- Accepting and answering requests on Azerbaijani citizenship
- Licensing of passenger transportation by taxi vehicles, and issuance of “Mark of distinction” for taxpayers who perform passenger transportation by taxi vehicles

Now, ASAN service provides 300 services by 10 state entities and number of functional subsidiary services by private companies

Alongside with this, the coverage area of Asan services was expanded:

- On January 5, 2015 ASAN service center was opened in Sabirabad district. This interregional center provides access to public services for the habitants of Sabirabad, Saatli, Imshli, Kurdamir, Hajigabul, Shirvan, Salyan and Beylagan districts which have total population of 900 000 people;
- On March 30, 2015 another ASAN service center was opened in Barda district. This center, being interregional, provides access to public services for the habitants of Barda, Agdam, Agjabadi, Lachin, Yevlakh and Tartar districts with total population of 800 000 citizens;
- In July 14, 2015 Baku “ASAN service” center No.5 under the State Agency for Public Service and Social Innovations under the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan has been launched in Nizami district
of Baku city;
Baku “ASAN service” center No.5 will be serving to the residents registered in city Baku being placed in Nizami district which has high density of population

**NGO Information:**

We welcome further expanding of coverage area of ASAN service. New branches of ASAN were established in Baku, Barda and Sabirabad. Within reporting period significant steps were taken in order to enlarge list of public services provided by ASAN which contributed to prevention of corruption in corruption-prone areas. Delegation of issuing of taxi driver licences and residence references to ASAN definitely reduce level of corruption in relevant sectors.

**Assessment of Progress**

The plenary welcomed Azerbaijan’s efforts to expand the ASAN service centers, an initiative Azerbaijan is known for in the area for prevention of corruption. New services were added, partly related to doing business, and also new service centers were opened.

Therefore, the plenary concluded that there is PROGRESS under this recommendation.

**Previous Recommendation 3.4.**

- Provide long-term capacity building and training in the field of corruption and fraud detection to the auditors of CoA.
- Introduce anti-fraud and anti-corruption audits in the activity portfolio of the CoA, as well as strict performance-based audits, especially in line ministries facing high corruption risk.
- Ensure that the CoA develops detailed yearly statistics on the number and types of audits carried out, the source of audit (how it was initiated), and the outcomes and impact of those audits on the decisions taken by the Parliament.
- Consider introducing ex-ante control of budget execution by the CoA.
- Ensure that regularly published information on public accounts and budget includes clear explanations on discrepancies.
- Consider introducing a requirement to the PFCS to review agencies not according to the periodical plan (e.g. each agency to be reviewed not more than once every 2 years), but on the basis of risk-prone financial misconduct.
- Enhance the power of the IA units in order to allow them to proactively launch anti-fraud and anti-corruption audits, especially in government spending entities, and not only on the basis of a received complaint or suspicious information.
- Assess the usefulness and the effectiveness of the IA units and propose further improvements; to this end, ensure that all IA unit in different entities should submit yearly statistics on the number of audits carried out, the types of audits, the source of audit (how it was initiated), and the outcomes and impact of those audits (fines, lawsuits, dismissal, financial and organisational reforms done on the basis of audit results, etc.).
- Organize joint trainings including personnel from Internal Audit and ACD on how to submit material to law enforcement bodies.

13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Recently, by the service of the State Financial Control Service of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Azerbaijan had performed a number of legal and methodological reforms in ensuring state financial oversight. In these activities, by the order of the Ministry of Finance of Azerbaijan Republic "Rules
planning, conducting and recording the results of supervisory activities by the State Financial Control Service of the Ministry of Finance of Azerbaijan Republic”, a number of regulations and methodological books, including for use in the preparation of work plans of the State Financial Control, "Guidelines for risk assessment in order to conduct surveillance activities by the State Financial control Service of the Ministry of organizations funded by the state budget ” which provides as methodical, guide and guidance document for the risk assessment activities in controlled facilities. Within the twinning project Support Service of the State Financial Control in improving public financial control of Azerbaijan ended in April of 2013 has been studied best European experience, as well as according to the standards of the International auditing (ISA) has been applied a number of innovations in the conduct of the activities of supervisory measures, including the abolition of the rules of periodicity in conducting oversight inspections in facilities oversight audit missions oriented risks. Also, the drawing up of plans of work life and its regional units, in accordance with the results of risk assessments were reflected in these regulations.

Domestic financial control in the Azerbaijan Republic is implemented by the State Financial Control of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Azerbaijan. In some specialized state bodies there are structural units implementing internal financial control or the person responsible for supervision of efficient management. According to the recommendations given in the framework of twinning project in the service of the State Financial Control of the Ministry of Finance was established and began its activity sector of Preliminary Financial Control. According to the National Action Plan on Open Government it is envisaged from the current year for the granting of a broader and comprehensive information from the Service concerning the State Financial Control conducted surveillance activities and their results. Validation Services of the State Financial Control of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Azerbaijan are regularly engaged in trainings on various topics in the scientific and educational center of the Ministry of Finance, including the presentation of results on the topics of financial oversight activities and inputs for transmission to the prosecuting authorities in the case of discovery of the facts of corruption or other criminal character. However, joint training with the participation of representatives of the Office for Combating Corruption under the General Prosecutor of the Republic of Azerbaijan was conducted.

Assessment of Progress

PROGRESS
There seems to be some progress in organizing joint trainings including personnel from Internal Audit and ACD.

14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014

Measures taken to implement this recommendation
According to the National Anti-corruption Action Plan 2012-2015 Draft Law on Amendment to the Law on Internal Audit has been prepared and sent to relevant ministries. To improve the capacity and effectiveness of internal audits according to the Action Plan of the Chamber of Audits for 2014-2016 from 7 April to 7 May and was held training where several agencies and private companies had been represented. Next training took place on 1 September. Chamber of Accounts employees took part at the following training:
- international Conference on Fight against Corruption: international standards and national experiences on the 30 June – 1 July;
- 27/03/2014 Bucharest, EU training within ENP;
- 14-16/05/2014 – EUROSAI Audit of Emergence Funds;
- 05-07/06/2014 – EUROSAI I Target Group session
- 02-07/06/2014 – Conference organized by the Turkish Chamber of Accounts
- 15-19/06/2014 – IX EUROSAI Congress
- 18/06/2014 – EU Funded ENP framework, Joint Programme for Black Sea Countries;
- 28/07 – 02/08/2014 – Joint Training by the IMF and Austrian Institute Means of Fiscal sustainability
- 31/09-10/09/2014 – Study Tour to the UK Chamber of Accounts

Recently, by the service of the State Financial Control Service of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Azerbaijan had performed a number of legal and methodological reforms to ensure state financial oversight. In these activities, by the order of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Azerbaijan "Rules planning, conducting and recording the results of supervisory activities by the State Financial Control Service of the Ministry of Finance of The Republic of Azerbaijan", a number of regulations and methodological books, including for use in the preparation of work plans of the State Financial Control, "Guidelines for risk assessment in order to conduct surveillance activities by the State Financial control Service of the Ministry of organizations funded by the state budget " which provides as methodical, guide and guidance document for the risk assessment activities in controlled facilities. Within the twinning project Support Service of the State Financial Control in improving public financial control of Azerbaijan ended in April of 2013 has been studied best European experience, as well as according to the standards of the International auditing (İSA) has been applied a number of innovations in the conduct of the activities of supervisory measures, including the abolition of the rules of periodicity in conducting oversight inspections in facilities oversight audit missions oriented risks. Also, the drawing up of plans of work life and its regional units, in accordance with the results of risk assessments were reflected in these regulations.

Domestic financial control in the Republic of Azerbaijan is implemented by the State Financial Control of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

In some specialized state bodies there are structural units implementing internal financial control or the person responsible for supervision of efficient management.

According to the recommendations given in the framework of twinning project in the service of the State Financial Control of the Ministry of Finance was established and began its activity sector of Preliminary Financial Control.

According to the National Action Plan on Open Government it is envisaged from the current year for the granting of a broader and comprehensive information from the Service concerning the State Financial Control conducted surveillance activities and their results.

Validation Services of the State Financial Control of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Azerbaijan are regularly engaged in trainings on various topics in the scientific and educational center of the Ministry of Finance, including the presentation of results on the topics of financial oversight activities and inputs for transmission to the prosecuting authorities in the case of discovery of the facts of corruption or other criminal character.

However joint training with the participation of representatives of the Office for Combating Corruption under the General Prosecutor of the Republic of Azerbaijan was conducted.

On the 28th March 2014, the Chamber of Accounts established Ad Hoc Group to deal with installation of the automated system of Accounting Reports for Budgetary Organizations. This system secures adherence to accounting rules according to the international standards, install automatic process. The system was elaborated as a joint project of the World Bank and Ministry of Finances.

Assessment of Progress
As previously, joint trainings of personnel from Internal Audit and ACD were reported. No additional progress relevant to recommendations was reported.


**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)**

Chamber of Accounts, PFCS and internal audit units, have conducted a review of its training capacities in the light of the IAP recommendations in the first quarter of 2014. During this period, the experts reviewing the training capacity of the CoA, PFCS and internal audit units held several consultations with the State Commission on Civil Service and the Anticorruption Directorate with the Prosecutor General of the Republic of Azerbaijan. The new education and training efforts include a new approach, which combines theoretical and practical training. According to the understanding reached between between the Chambers, Service and Directorate, the CoA, PFCS and internal audit units officers will be trained with the participation of the ACD prosecutors and investigators regarding the elements of corruption and economic offences. The ACD prosecutors and investigators will also elaborate an analytical summary of shortcomings and problems encountered during investigation of materials submitted by the CoA and other corruption detection units, such as internal audits of ministries, and present their findings. Also, the ACD officers will elaborate study cases, based on the investigation and prosecution of materials submitted to it by the Chamber or Service or other state institution, in order to use it as education tool. Anti-fraud and anti-corruption audits have been included in the activity portfolio of the CoA and PFCS, through internal regulations in both institutions.

As recommended, the CoA maintains yearly statistics on the number and types of audits carried out, the source of audit, and the outcomes. However, CoA found it difficult to develop criteria to find out and demonstrate (!!!) the impact of its audits on the decisions taken by the Parliament. It therefore seeks guidance on the ways to implement this recommendation.

The ACD collected the charters and thorough information on the powers of the IA units in all central executive authorities with a purpose of review of their ability to proactively launch anti-fraud and anti-corruption audits, especially in government spending entities. As a result of this review and following consultations, the appropriate recommendations will be issues.

In order to improve the system of supervision up on Treasury, the Treasury Administration Information System was set up in the Ministry of Finance. This system has been specially designed to digitalise the documentation related to the Bank transactions, reporting on the spending of budgetary resources, and other movement of financial resources within the budgetary spending in real time. Within the system with budgetary organisations can exchange information with the Ministry of finance. The project is under development and foresees the introduction of many Progressive tools. Using this mechanism the ministry of finance managed to install a system of online monitoring over budgetary spending, incomes, as well as transactions run by budgetary organizations using the budgetary accounts. In order to reduce paper-based reporting and registration, the Ministry of finance invested substantial resources into for the development of its Internet portal. Within the first quarter of the year 2015 please feel finance is planning to complete installment of the new system which provides for online submission off all spending reports.

Also the Ministry of finance introduced a system whereby all periodic reports and implementation of budget I was submitted electronically via its website.

**Assessment of Progress**

A number of positive steps on audit are reported by Azerbaijan. An assessment of training by Chamber of Accounts, PFCS and internal audit units was done. Were reviewed training capacities and, as a result, a new approach to training is developed, with focus on corruption, more practical training, involving ACD prosecutors and investigators.
It is also reported that anti-fraud and anti-corruption audits have been included in activity portfolio of the CoA and PFCS, through internal regulations in both institutions. The plenary encourages implementing these new audits in practice too. This recommendation also calls for an assessment of internal audit units. In this regard it is reported that the ACD is looking into powers of internal audit units and their capacities to proactively uncover corruption. The plenary concludes that progress is made under this recommendation.

16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting, 7-9 October 2015

Measures taken to implement this recommendation

Government information:

As a body responsible for financial-budget supervision Chamber of Accounts conducted supervision measures over state agencies in the field of usage, collecting, expenditure and forecasting of budget assets. Motions issued as a result of this supervision measures were aimed at solving existing problems, reduce of redundant expenditures and brining to liability of public officials committed infringements according to the law.

In case of detection of corruption crime, the collected documents were sent to the General Prosecutor’s Office for launching criminal prosecution.

According to provision of the Law on Chamber of Accounts, report on supervisory actions were presented to the Parliament.

Chamber of Accounts continued its efforts in implementing electron communication with citizens through web-site, publishing relevant material on activities of Chamber, broadening international cooperation, complying methodology of Chamber to the standards of ISSAI.

Moreover, several steps were taken in direction of implementation of modern specialized software (CAAT).

Proposals prepared by CoA with regard to improving of supervision for publishing of financial reports by state agencies in compliance with International Standards of financial reporting and National Accounting standards were presented to the Cabinet of Ministers.

Moreover, respective opinions from state agencies were received for the draft law on amendments to the law on Financing of Municipalities, law on Accounting and Code of administrative offences. Amendments were aimed at improving supervisory mechanisms for compliance of expenditure of state agencies and municipalities to the approved budgets, and improving procedures in this field.

Within the 2015, CoA reviewed 149 appeals received from citizens.

Employees of CoA participated at 14 international events within reporting period, including trainings, symposiums, courses and etc.

On June 24, 2015 the previous Agreement of Mutual cooperation between Chamber of Accounts of Russia and Azerbaijan was revised and the heads of both SAIs signed the new Mutual Cooperation Agreement.

Another step aimed at improvement of international activities of CoA was acceptance of CoA to sub-committee of compliance of INTOSAI and working group on state debt of this organization on September 9, 2015.

Moreover, the employees of CoA attended at courses on Fiscal and Tax legislation hosted in Washington, USA.

The project “Support to the Chamber of Accounts of the Republic of Azerbaijan in preparation for Future Twinning Project” commenced on 19 May 2015 and will be executed by ACE, International Consultants S.L. as a Spain’s company providing technical assistance project management and consulting.
and advisory services for economic and social cooperation for development, finance and public management.

**NGO Information:**

Employees of Chamber of Accounts participated at numerous international events within the reporting period. We should especially emphasize the launching of twinning project for support of Chamber of Accounts of the Republic of Azerbaijan. As it’s clearly seen from the past experience twinning projects implemented in our country proved their efficiency in complying national intuitions to the international standards.

**Assessment of Progress**

Reported developments relate to the Chamber of Accounts only and are beyond the scope of this recommendation. Information on internal audit units is not provided. Hence, the plenary recorded NO progress in relation to this recommendation.

**Recommendation 14**

- Improve the monitoring of the public procurement process and ensure effective and independent complaints mechanism.

- Streamline the role and the rights of the State Procurement Agency, in the areas of control, monitoring, collection and publication of information on public procurement and e-procurement.

- Ensure procurement and investments are timely and in a transparent manner planned by state and local institutions and increase transparency in this regards; ensure that state and local institutions develop comprehensive, annual procurement plans and define the information on public procurement they need to mandatory provide to the State Procurement Agency and publish.

- Ensure methodological materials, standard documents and templates related to public procurement are adopted by Cabinet of Ministers decisions, or that the State Procuring Agency itself receives the right to issue corresponding, mandatory regulations as a matter of routine, and enforce them in practice.

**13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014**

No measures reported.

**Assessment of Progress**

NO PROGRESS

**14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Improvements of the monitoring in public procurement are foreseen in the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan for 2012-2015. According to that Draft law on Amendments to Public Procurement Act which includes improvement of the monitoring in public procurement process was sent for reviewing to Presidential Administration on 21.02.2014 and to the Cabinet of Ministers on 12.03.2014.

To increase the role of the State Procurement Agency in the monitoring and e-procurement draft law on Amendments to Public Procurement Act as mentioned was sent to relevant authorities. Also draft guidelines of Unreliable Suppliers (Contractors) Register which includes improvement of the monitoring and e-procurement was sent for reviewing to Ministry of Justice on 30.05.2014.
At the website of State Procurement Agency www.tender.gov.az has a section of e-services where all services and documents needed for this are displayed. Applications and all other documents regarding the applications, also complaints of Suppliers (Contractors) can be uploaded at the site. All applicants are informed about their applications. There is also section named Contracts register where Ads about the tenders held by procurement organizations is displayed.

The letter was sent on 16.12.2013 to the ministries and other agencies for providing the State Procurement Agency with necessary information about procurements which is planned to hold in 2014. This information is displayed at the website of SPA.

Methodological materials, standard documents and templates related to public procurement are adopted according to the legislation on the legal acts and it is compliant with the above mentioned recommendation.

**Assessment of Progress**

The draft law with amendments to the Public Procurement Act reflect possible positive developments. There is also intention to create Unreliable Suppliers (Contractors) Register. These developments can be monitored in the future. No substantive progress can be recorder at this stage.

### 15th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on March, 2015

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)**

According to the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan for 2012-2015, The State Agency on Public Procurement continued measures to improve monitoring in public procurement. The Cabinet of Ministers received the proposals and comments on the Draft law on Amendments to Public Procurement Act, which includes improvement of the monitoring in public procurement process. The formulation of the draft law containing all the proposals is expected in the first quarter of 2015.

**Assessment of Progress**

Information is provided only regarding one part of the recommendation, which requires improving the monitoring of the public procurement process. Besides, the information is general that measures are taken by the State Agency on Public Procurement to monitor public procurement and that further improvements are envisaged in a new public procurement regulation expected in first quarter of 2015. The meeting concluded that there is no tangible progress made under this recommendation.

### 16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting, 7-9 October 2015

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

**Government information:**

In order to improve system of public procurement in Azerbaijan, new proposals were prepared and submitted for consideration to the Cabinet of Ministers on February 20, 2015.

The names of services rendered electronically, the list of necessary documents for usage of these services was posted on the web-site of public procurement agency. Alongside with this the conditions ensuring free and unrestricted access to these services were created for site visitors.

The appropriate conditions for receipt of complaints from bidders participating at the procurement process were created as well.

The appropriate section of the web site provides opportunity to issue tenders online for the buyers as
well as to post concluded contracts on procurement. Services rendered electronically through the web site are toll-free. Moreover, measures ensuring security of private information and operations conducted electronically were taken.

In order to increase transparency and effectively deliver information about procurement, Agency sent appropriate letters requesting information on procurement plans to 604 organizations and posted obtained information on web site www.tender.gov.az. The issues regarding procurement plans were envisaged in the draft law on “Amendments to Public Procurement Act”.

NGO Information:
The draft Law “On Making Changes to the Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan “On Public Procurement” prepared by the Public Procurement Agency included provision on improvement of the control over implementation of public procurement contracts. The Ministry of Finances provided its feedback to the revised version of the mentioned law.


The State Treasury Agency strengthened its financial oversight on purposeful spending of the budget funds. Respective documents of the State-funded organizations required for undertaking budgetary and extra-budgetary expenditure operations have been analyzed, their compliance to the existing normative documents has been identified and then the expenditure operations have been carried out. Alongside with this we welcome PPA strive to enlarge list of electronic services available on the PPA web site. To summarize efficiency of provided e-services comprehensive statistics is needed.

Assessment of Progress
A positive step is that the Azerbaijani Public Procurement Agency has collected procurement plans from 604 organizations and posted on the website www.tender.gov.az. Other information provided is beyond the scope of the recommendation or too general to assess its relevance.

Therefore, the plenary recorded NO PROGRESS in implementing the recommendation.

Recommendation 15
- Establish, under the authority of the Ombudsman, a working group involving non-governmental organisations and media, for monitoring, on a permanent basis, of the implementation of the Law on Access to Information. Conduct and publish periodical surveys to identify deficiencies in the Law or its improper implementation.
- Provide the Ombudsman with necessary resources in order to effectively perform its functions in the area of access to information.
- Organize a nation-wide awareness rising campaign aimed at dissemination of information on the right of access to information among different social groups.
- Take appropriate measures to decriminalise defamation and insult; introduce mechanisms avoiding improper use of civil law instruments for restricting activity of media.

13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 16-18 April 2014

Measures taken to implement this recommendation:

Over the past period by the Ombudsman held a series of consultations to discuss the responsibilities emanating from the requirements of the Law on “Access to information,” as well as the
prospects for their performance with the authorized state bodies, non-governmental organizations and media representatives. During these consultations were discussed ombudsman powers to oversee the requirements of the Law and the cooperation of government agencies, NGOs and the media and were also encouraged to join efforts aimed at the fulfillment of the National Action Plan on Open Government.

Government representatives according to the requirements of the Law of Azerbaijan Republic on “Access to Information” noted the creation of links of their press services with government agencies and the media, as well as the general public, also highlighted the importance of improving information structures, including electronic resources public authorities holding information. Information was provided on the work to ensure reliable operation of sites, their updates according to the State Program “Electronic Azerbaijan”, placing new and relevant information about easy and fast access to information of a public nature, facilitate use of the website on the work done in this direction is of public authorities and review of information requests.

It was noted that all of the information received from government agencies have been analyzed and summarized.

Also noted the importance of the study and exchange of international experience in the field of access to information.

The monitoring showed that, along with gaining experience in the relevant field activities carried out in connection with this issue reflected in the Annual Report of the Ombudsman.

In order to comply with the relevant provisions of the Constitutional Act on the Ombudsman, as well as approving and funding staff units to create new structural units in the unit in connection with the execution of delegated powers Ombusman of Azerbaijan appealed to the Cabinet of Ministers and the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

President Order of 27 December 2011 approved the National Action Program on improvement of the efficiency in the protection of human rights and freedoms.

The National Action Programme provided significant responsibilities in the implementation of educational activities to clarify the legislation of the Azerbaijan Republic on the information received and effective enforcement of the right to information.

For the last period the relevant government authorities in the implementation of the provisions contained in the National Action Programme conducted complex arrangements and worked closely with civil society in this direction.

In order to promote and discuss the most effective performance of the various items on the National Action Plan were held joint conferences, workshops and seminars.

At the same time, to promote the study and application of state of the National Action Plan, in each area of country public hearings were held with the participation of local authorities, law enforcement agencies, NGOs, the media and district election commissions.

In order to discuss the duties arising out of the National Action Plan on Open Government was held a round table with the participation of international organizations, experts, as well as local NGOs.

**Assessment of Progress**

**NO PROGRESS**

Information provided is not relevant or sufficient to assess the implementation of this recommendation.

**14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation**

Over the past period by the Ombudsman held a series of consultations to discuss the responsibilities emanating from the requirements of the Law on “Access to information”, as well as the
prospects for their performance with the authorized state bodies, non-governmental organizations and media representatives. During these consultations were discussed ombudsman powers to oversee the requirements of the Law and the cooperation of government agencies, NGOs and the media and were also encouraged to join efforts aimed at the fulfillment of the National Action Plan on Open Government 2012-2015.

Government representatives according to the requirements of the Law of The Republic of Azerbaijan on "Access to information" noted the creation of links of their press services with government agencies and the media, as well as the general public, also highlighted the importance of improving information structures, including electronic resources public authorities holding information. Information was provided on the work to ensure reliable operation of sites, their updates according to the State Program "Electronic Azerbaijan", placing new and relevant information about easy and fast access to information of a public nature, facilitate use of the website on the work done in this direction is of public authorities and review of information requests.

It was noted that all of the information received from government agencies have been analyzed and summarized.

Also noted the importance of the study and exchange of international experience in the field of access to information. The monitoring showed that, along with gaining experience in the relevant field activities carried out in connection with this issue reflected in the Annual Report of the Ombudsman.

In order to comply with the relevant provisions of the Constitutional Act on the Ombudsman, as well as approving and funding staff units to create new structural units in the unit in connection with the execution of delegated powers Ombudsman of Azerbaijan appealed to the Cabinet of Ministers and the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Azerbaijan. Also improvement of the structure of Ombudsman is foreseen according to the National Action Plan on Open Government 2012-2015.

Presidential Order of 27 December 2011 approved the National Action Program on improvement of the efficiency in the protection of human rights and freedoms.

The National Action Programme provided significant responsibilities in the implementation of educational activities to clarify the legislation of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the information received and effective enforcement of the right to information.

For the last period the relevant government authorities in the implementation of the provisions contained in the National Action Programme conducted complex arrangements and worked closely with civil society in this direction.

In order to promote and discuss the most effective performance of the various items on the National Action Plan were held joint conferences, workshops and seminars.

At the same time, to promote the study and application of state of the National Action Plan, in each area of country public hearings were held with the participation of local authorities, law enforcement agencies, NGOs, the media and district election commissions.

In order to discuss the duties arising out of the National Action Plan on Open Government was held a round table with the participation of international organizations, experts, as well as local NGOs.

**Assessment of Progress**

No new information was provided. **NO PROGRESS.**

**15th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on March, 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)**

In line with the recommendation of Istanbul action plan, the anticorruption directorate conducted survey of access to information in major central executive authorities. The majority of ministries, including Ministry of finance, Ministry of health, Ministry of education and others have designated
persons and units in charge of providing information to requesting citizens and organisations. In line with the requirements of electronic Azerbaijan project, the rules of filing requests for information as well as procedure requirements have been reflected on the website of the ministries. Ombudsman, which is in charge of coordination of access to information issues, works in close contact with the designated persons and units. According to the results of the survey, the ministries and other agencies of central executive authority are expected to compile the first statistics on the semi-annual basis in summer 2015.

**Assessment of Progress**
The ACD has conducted an assessment of institutional capacity in the area of access to information what to some extent covers aspects of this recommendation as regards to the monitoring on a permanent basis of the implementation of the Law on Access to Information. However, altogether there is no tangible progress in implementing this recommendation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting, 7-9 October 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Measures taken to implement this recommendation</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Government information:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>During reporting period, numerous consultations with regard of implementation of provisions envisaged in the law on Obtaining Information were held with participation of representatives of state agencies, civil society institutions and media. Ombudsman addressed the Cabinet of Minister for endorsing new staff number for establishing new structural division within its apparatus in order to execute the relevant provisions envisaged in the Constitution. Numerous trainings, seminars and conferences were organized by Ombudsman in cooperation with state agencies in order to promote relevant provision of National Action Plan 2012-2015. Public hearings with participation of representatives of local governances, law enforcement agencies, municipalities, NGOs, media and chairmen of district election committees were organized in all districts of the country in order to monitor and assess implementation of relevant provisions of National Action Plan. Numerous awareness raising events were organized in respect of promoting of national legislation on obtaining information.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Assessment of Progress**
Information on the part of the Recommendation 15 relating to establishing of a WG for monitoring implementation of the Law on Access to Information and relevant surveys was not provided. No progress is reported on providing the Ombudsman with necessary resources. Ombudsman is still not equipped with relevant team to cover issues of access to information. Information is not provided on the recommended nation-wide awareness raising campaign. Authorities informed on a range of activities such as public hearings, awareness raising events, trainings, seminars and conferences were organized by Ombudsman in cooperation with state agencies, CSO, media. On the other hand, it is difficult to assess at this point whether it was an awareness raising campaign or rather a set of ad hoc events. Number of activities that took place contribute positively to implementation of this part of the recommendation.

No information in connection with decriminalising defamation and insult has been provided by the authorities.

**Overall NO SUBSTANTIVE PROGRESS was made to implement this recommendation.**

**Recommendation 16**
• Amend the legislation to ensure that financial reports of political parties are published simultaneously on the official website of the authority responsible for their collection and in the official printed media and enforce this.
• Ensure substantial and independent monitoring of election campaign funding and monitoring of political parties financing by an independent authority, with adequate staff, material resources and powers to investigate and impose sanctions.
• Ensure clear conflict of interest prevention and ethical behaviour rules for elected and other political officials, promote their vigorous application and enforce them.

14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014

Assessment of Progress
During the meeting and after it Azerbaijan informed about amendments to the Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on “Political parties” which were passed by the Parliament on 30 September 2014. The basis amendments introduce the following novelties:
• definition of membership fees is provided by law;
• the upper limit of donation is prescribed by law (the limit of 10000 manat was defined as the upper limit); and
• collection of financial reports is transferred from the Ministry of Finance to the Central Election Commission (CEC). The CEC is empowered with extra authority to request additional instruments and information about activity of political parties. CEC is bound to publish annual financial reports of political parties.

Thus some progress is made in ensuring more substantial and independent monitoring of election campaign funding and political parties financing by an independent authority. However, the practical application of these requirements will need to be assessed in the future.

The plenary meeting agreed that there is progress in implementing this recommendation.


Measures taken to implement this recommendation (to be provided by national coordinator)
According to the amendments to the Law on Political Parties the supervision over the financing of political parties and of election campaigns were reassigned exclusively to the CEC. It is thus the CEC which receives the financial statements. The new centralised competence of the CEC is to facilitate overall coordination and the monitoring of campaign financing (including all income and expenditure) more effective since the CEC have information on the general state of the parties’ financial activities. In addition, the CEC has the power to request from political parties any additional information and documentation on their financial activities.

Assessment of Progress
Information is provided by Azerbaijan in relation to monitoring of political parties financing by the CEC, but it was already reflected in previous progress update and was taken into account in assessing progress under this recommendation. No new information is provided this time as regards this or other aspects of this recommendation. Hence, there is no progress made under this recommendation.
**16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting, 7-9 October 2015**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation (provided by national coordinator)**

Law on “Amendments to the Law on Political Parties” was adopted on 30 September 2014 and took effect with the decree of the President of 4 November 2014. The amendments were made to the law on Political parties and the Rules on forms, content and presentation by the ordinance of Cabinet of Ministers dated February 2, 2015. According to the new amendments, annual financial reports of political parties are to be submitted not later than April 1 annually, and the information about political parties which have not submitted relevant reports is to be delivered to the Ministry of Justice.

Alongside with this, new articles 18-1 and 19.7 regulating membership fees and defining ceilings on donations were introduced. Article 19.7 was introduced with the aim of aligning transparency provisions between Electoral Code and Law on Political Parties.

“Article 18-1. Membership fees

18-1.1. Membership is a regularly paid resource in the form of money paid by party members according to the statute of the party. Payments which exceed the defined membership fee shall be considered as a donation.”

“Article 19.7. The amount of donations given by a person to one or several parties in a year shall not exceed ten thousand manats (9 850 Euro).”

In the first part of the recommendation donations and membership fees are clearly defined and regulated. Concerning second part of the recommendation cap on donations which was one of requirements to bring the standards in line with Election Code was introduced. Mandatory requirement for transfers to be made via banks for all donations and State Budget transfers were also introduced. Considering all these it can be concluded that more than 75% of recommendation was implemented. In light of this the conclusion of recommendation is proposed to be improved to be implemented in a satisfactory manner. As carried out activities address most of the concerns raised in the recommendation.

As noted in second compliance report draft amendment to the law envisaged the requirement to publish all reports on the webpage of CEC. Law on “Amendments to the Law on Political Parties” of 30 September 2014 which took effect with the decree of the President of 4 November 2014 has new article 21.6 which defines that

“Annual financial reports of political parties are placed on the webpage of the Central Election Commission.”

Along with this another existing article defines that “Political Parties publish annual financial reports together with auditor opinion in mass media”.

In CEC webpage separate section in home page named political parties were created for publishing reports and other relevant information of political parties. Currently all submitted reports are placed on the webpage and everyone can easily get an access to them.

http://www.msk.gov.az/uploads/partiyalar/Partiyalar.php. **Under this link users can get an access to list of political parties registered in Azerbaijan**

of annual reports by political parties

This mechanism provides for an easy access and at the same time eliminates any potential impediment for the political party to publish its report.

On July 9, 2015 CEC organized special seminar on the theme of “preparing, collecting, monitoring and publication of financial reports of political parties and discussed all practical issues. Event was attended by media representatives, made public and relevant information placed on the webpage of CEC.
http://www.msk.gov.az/az/newsmsk/761/

On August 13, 2015 seminar on presenting, composing, reviewing and publishing financial reports by political parties took place.
The event was organized by CEC and attended by representatives of 37 political parties, international organizations, and employees of CEC.

All reports are placed on the webpage of CEC and practical easiness for political party to make their report public it’s proposed to improve the conclusion to implemented in a satisfactory manner.
The law provides that CEC took the role of central authority for supervision both for party finances and election funds. As noted two structural units dealing with supervision of party financing were established in CEC’s Secretariat’s structure and staffed with skilled personal. New personal attended specialised training provided by specialists of Ministry of Finance and Chamber of Accounts. Further international trainings are planned and organization is underway. These developments ensure that CEC has necessary authority and technical and human resources capacity to carry out effectively supervision of party/election fund financing. Along with that experience of carrying out trainings and involving specialists, civil society via working groups is being applied continuously. Information on this was provided under the same recommendation in second compliance report.

According to the Law CEC was defined as central authority for supervision over general financing and it was granted a power to request additional information from Parties concerning their financing (article 21.2; 21.4-1;).

“Article 21.4-1. On the request of the Central Election Commission of the Republic of Azerbaijan political parties submit extra information and documents on their financial activities”.

“Article 21.6. Political parties submit annual financial reports together with auditor opinion to Central Election Commission of the Republic of Azerbaijan not later than 1 April”.

CEC is an independent body, which has necessary resources for substantial monitoring and authority to carry out supervision and granting it with these powers, ensures well-coordinated supervision between party financing and election funds. Considering that these draft amendments become effective, all information made public and carried our measures noted under previous recommendations it’s proposed to upgrade the conclusion to “implemented in a satisfactory manner”.

On September 21, 2015 meeting for the chairmen of local election committees was organized on Baku.
One of the main objectives of this event was to ensure transparency and integrity in usage of assets contributed to election funds of political parties, to improve capacity of employees of supervisory agencies implementing supervision over financing of political campaigns as well as to ensure supervision over financing on higher level.

This event was organized in the framework of the National Action Program on Improve the protection of human rights and freedoms in the Republic of Azerbaijan. The event was followed by special courses for chairmen and members of local election committees, attended also by officials of prosecutorial bodies, police, and judiciary.

At present, the preparation for the upcoming elections to the Parliament is underway. Candidates for MP are presenting information of their assets to the district election committee. This information will be reviewed and checked by the working group under district election committees. Along with other experts, experts from the experience and special knowledge in financial, tax and estate issues were also involved to working groups. The process of verification of the documents submitted by candidates, observers, authorized representatives of political parties, the media and, in general, as always, is completely open to the public, the candidate registration process, as well as checking the information contained in the documents submitted signature sheets and financial transparency one of the steps aimed at.

**Assessment of Progress**

More detailed information is provided this time by Azerbaijan on September 2014 amendments, which strengthen the role of the CEC in collection of financial reports from political parties, as well as introduce an obligation to the CEC to publish those reports on its website. Azerbaijan confirms that on the website of the CEC financial reports submitted by political parties are indeed systematically uploaded (experts verified that). In the future, it is necessary to assess improving of political parties’ publication of their financial statements in the mass media. Also CEC training relating to preparation and dissemination of financial reports attended by political parties was a positive step.

Report describes briefly intention to strengthen the role of the CEC in monitoring in view of upcoming elections, but the part of recommendation on monitoring needs to be analysed more attentively. No new information is provided as regards conflict of interest rules for political officials.

Hence, there is SOME PROGRESS made under this recommendation.

**Recommendation 17**

- Prepare and adopt the proposals on limiting the scope of immunity of judges from criminal prosecution in the context of combating corruption.
- Take any appropriate measures, such as internal regulations, guidelines, operational methodologies for the anticorruption investigators and prosecutors and use the special investigation means allowed by the legislation in order to detect and investigate corruption allegations in the judicial sector.

**13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on April 2014**

**Measures taken to implement this recommendation:**

Draft Laws on limiting the scope of immunity of judges from criminal prosecution in the context of combating corruption had been prepared by the ACD and sent for reviewing to the relevant Ministries.
Assessment of Progress
NO PROGRESS.

14\textsuperscript{th} ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014

No measures reported to implement this recommendation

Assessment of Progress
NO PROGRESS.

15\textsuperscript{th} ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on March, 2015

No measures reported to implement this recommendation

Assessment of Progress
NO PROGRESS.

16\textsuperscript{th} ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on October, 2015

No measures reported to implement this recommendation

Assessment of Progress
NO PROGRESS

We are concerned that no action has been taken in order to implement this rec. Although the perception in the society of corruption among members of judiciary is high, still no judge was ever investigated, tried and convicted for corruption offences and still there is no strategy to tackle this sector.

Recommendation 18

- Ensure that objective and transparent criteria apply for the selection and appointment of the Supreme Court and appellate court judges to avoid potential undue political interference.
- Conduct an analysis on the internal causes of the perception of corruption and lack of independence of the judiciary and carry out a risk assessment and identify the needs for an anticorruption policy within the judicial system. Ensure, for that purpose, the co-operation of the Judicial Legal Council with the Commission on Combating Corruption, Anti-Corruption Department, and other relevant state institutions, as well as with representatives of the relevant civil society organizations.
- Develop systematic training on ethical conduct and anticorruption standards for judges, paying special attention to the methodology of the training activities. Topics like conflicts of interests, incompatibilities, requirement of financial disclosure, reactions to gifts, reporting corruption, etc. should be included in the training of judges.
- Develop further the capacity of the Judicial Legal Council to consider, as a disciplinary body, allegations of misconduct of judges that can denote lack of integrity (such as interventions to other judge in relation with the decision in a case, infringement of the rules on incompatibilities of the judge’s position with commercial or political activity etc.).
| 13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on April 2014 |
| No measures reported to implement this recommendation |
| Assessment of Progress |
| NO PROGRESS. |

| 14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014 |
| No measures reported to implement this recommendation |
| Assessment of Progress |
| NO PROGRESS. |

| Measures taken to implement this recommendation |
| The Justice Academy has developed curricula and plan for systematic training on ethical conduct and anticorruption standards for judges, which include topics like conflicts of interests, incompatibilities, requirement of financial disclosure, reactions to gifts, reporting corruption, etc. should be included in the training of judges |
| Assessment of Progress |
| No new information on tangible progress in addressing the recommendation since the monitoring report was provided. During the plenary meeting Azerbaijan informed the experts about amendments in the law regulating the appointment of judges that apparently increased the role of the Judicial Legal Council and the involvement of the association of judges. However, more information is needed in order to assess the effectiveness of these measures, namely with regard to the objectivity and transparency of the selection and appointment criteria for high level judges and if these measures contribute to improve the perception of lack of independence of the judiciary. No new information on implementation of other parts of the recommendation was provided. In sum, there is lack of progress under this recommendation. Hence, there is only minor progress. This matter will deserve more thorough analysis during the next monitoring round. |

| 16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 7-9 October 2015 |
| JLC has recently conducted inquiry onto the corruption allegations in respect of 2 judges, one judge – in the city of Baku and the other judge in the regional court of Mingachevir. As a result of inquiry judges were made subject to disciplinary measures and reprimanded for creating conditions for corruption and major violations of law. Moreover, a disciplinary proceeding launched against another judge is currently being conducted. |
| In order to improve independence of the judiciary, Association of Judges was vested with a power to give proposals on appointment of judges of representing first and appellation instances courts to JLC. This power was formerly a mandate of the Ministry of Justice and Supreme Court. |
| According to the amendment made to the Law on Judicial Legal Council, the Council obtained right to give opinion about proposals of relevant executive power agency on financial supply of first instance courts. |
| Another amendment to the mentioned law, envisages proposal on appointment of chairmen of |
We should note that, chairmen of Baku Appellation Court and Shaki Appellation Court were appointed to the office under new provisions mentioned. Thus, exception on this matter doesn’t exist anymore and the role of JLC has increased. Alongside with this, the amendment envisages decrease of probation period for judges from 5 to 3 years.

The matters of ethical conduct were included on regular basis to the curricula of the trainings organized for judges. For instance, on April 24, 2015 special training courses on “Deontology issues and Code of Ethic Conduct for judges” took place. In the framework of the course, judges were trained on issues regarding national and international aspects of ethical conduct, ethic aspects of communication with parties in court proceedings and media etc. In compliance with training curricula the organization of similar courses are envisaged in the future.

**Assessment of Progress**

Some new information was given with regard to the amendments of the procedure for appointing judges of the first and appellate jurisdictions as well as the presidents of appellate courts, amendments that give an increased role of the JLC and the Association of Judges in proposing the candidates for these positions and thus it is envisaged to increase the independence of the judiciary. This is to be commended, however, in order to properly assess the effects of this change in insuring a real independence of the judges (remember that lack of independence of judges was heavily criticized during the country visit), the entire appointments procedure as well as the composition and appointment of the JLC members needs to be kept under further scrutiny.

Some progress was also recorded in relation with the capacity of the JLC to consider allegations of disciplinary infringements related to integrity and corruption issues. 2 cases were reported and 1 ongoing. However, it’s worth further exploring how dissuasive the sanctions were in these cases, if these cases were used to prevent similar behavior in the future. Still, no progress with regard to developing an analysis on the causes of the perception of corruption regarding members of judiciary, nor a systematic training on ethics was developed for judges.

The plenary concluded there is PROGRESS under Recommendation 19.

**Previous Recommendation 3.9.**

Develop and launch awareness raising programmes about risks of corruption and solutions for private sector.

Together with private sector organisations, promote the development self-regulation within the private sector (code of conduct, anti-corruption compliance policies).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>13th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting, April 2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Measures taken to implement this recommendation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment of Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO PROGRESS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>14th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 8-10 October 2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Measures taken to implement this recommendation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment of Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NO PROGRESS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Measures taken to implement this recommendation:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Ministry of Economic Development continued efforts to raise public awareness in private sector among entrepreneurs. It widely used interactive methods and new innovative teaching methodologies based on the curricula drawn as a result of analysis of information collected by its units in the process of work with private sector in the regions and in capital. In line with the teaching program at the Ministry held a number of training is in the fourth quarter of year 2014. The trainings were held in seven regional capitals and Capital Baku period the trainings were contacted in the format of roundtables, conferences and seminars and covered such issues as using electronic services avoid personal contact, Learning the procedures and methods of application to state institutions, Making most of tools and mechanisms established in order to foster transparency, prevention of corruption and other issues.

As the major agent of the state in dealing with business sector, the Ministry of Economy and Industry continued its efforts in Increasing transparency in the course of issuing concessive credits to entrepreneurs by running number of events in the fourth quarter of year 2014. The appropriate unit of Ministry organised events to explain to businessmen the rules of the application, Procedure, functions and powers of designated bodies. Overall 10 events were organised into regions and two events were organised in the capital. 1150 businessmen were trained with the participation of 12 trainers. Also the Ministry paid great attention to explaining the private sector actors the rules of examination of their activity by state institutions. That’s in October 8-9, 2014 the Ministry organised in the city of Shaky conference dedicated to the topic of regulation of examinations of entrepreneurs and means of protection of their legal interests. On 13 October a regional conference was organised in the other part of the country in Jalilabad. On the 19 December the conference was organized in Shabran and on the 17 November in the city of Mingachevir.

**Assessment of Progress**

Information is provided that different events have been organised by the Ministry of Economy and apparently covered prevention of corruption. However, more details are needed to assess if and how this work has allowed implementing the specific recommendation. The meeting concluded that there is lack of PROGRESS in this area.

**16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting on 7-9 October 2015**

**Measures to implement this recommendation:**

Ministry of Economy and Industry continued to implement measures aimed to raise awareness of employees of its structures and its subordinated agencies in the fields of restrictions in public service, organization of procurement, managing of state funds and property. In pursuing these objectives, trainings “on application of legislation on assessment of public servants’ activity” (05/04/2015) and “On Principles, regulations , essence and implementation of Ethic conduct, “(15.05.2015) were organized by the ministry.

Moreover, basing on innovative methodology, 42 trainings, round tables and workshops on 76 topics including launching of own business, insurance of entrepreneurial activity in agriculture, Access to the present and new export markets, marketing, creating of innovative business ideas, development of ecologically pure agriculture products etc. were organized by Baku Business Training Center in capital and regions of the country (9 and 33 respectively). The educational events were attended by 500 listeners.

In the framework of the event, electronic services rendered by the ministry such as electronic portals “icazeler.gov.az” and b2b.az, electronic system for regulation of investment Project funding were introduced to the listeners. Information on efficient development and risk management in business, increasing transparency and etc was delivered as well.

In order to increase transparency in loan deliver to subjects of entrepreneurship and efficiency of this process, business-forums “on favorable crediting of entrepreneurs” were organized by the Foundation for support of entrepreneurship in 11 districts of Azerbaijan and 1 in its capital Baku (totally -12).
events were dedicated to the issues of mechanisms of favorable crediting, preparation of investment projects, regulation of monitoring of entrepreneurial subjects, criteria for assessing of investment projects.

Alongside, the Conference on results of the first of implementation of State Program on social-economic Development of Regions was organized on April 7, 2015 in Salyan district, the Conferences on “Regulation of inspections in the sphere of entrepreneurship and protection entrepreneurs” interests” was organized on May 14, 2015, the conference on protection of rights of consumers were organized in Goychay district on April 16-17, 2015, in Zagatala district on May 21-22 and in Dashkesan district on June 18-19, 2015.

On May 12, 2015 B20 consulting forum was hosted in Baku. The event was organized by National Confederation of entrepreneurs.

**Assessment of Progress**

Information provided only partly relates to the recommendation. The plenary concluded that NO PROGRESS was made under this recommendation at this stage.

---

**PART II: OTHER MAJOR ANTI-CORRUPTION DEVELOPMENTS**

**16th ACN Istanbul Action Plan Meeting, 7-9 October 2015**

Two joint press-conferences in cooperation with Commission on Combating Corruption were conducted by Anticorruption Directorate with participation of NGOs and media representatives. For the last 6 months many methodological means, pamphlets, newsletters, journal and other means were prepared and published by Anti-corruption Directorate with the Prosecutor General of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

Moreover, officers of ACD regularly appear on television participating at television programs dedicated to anticorruption awareness raising.

Commission on Combating Corruption published journal “10 Years of Achievements in Fight Against Corruption”. This journal has been prepared by Commission of the Republic of Azerbaijan in order to enlighten public and international stakeholders on carried out anticorruption reforms in last 10 years. Journal is designed in infographic style and covers the measures on legislative and institutional reforms, international cooperation and awareness-raising programs in this field.

The Anticorruption Directorate of the Republic of Azerbaijan presented anticorruption section of the International Association of Prosecutor’s web-site.

Successful cooperation between the Republic of Azerbaijan and International Anticorruption Academy continues. Within the framework of presidency of Prosecutor General of the Republic of Azerbaijan Mr. Zakir Garalov to the third assembly of parties of IACA (International Anticorruption Academy), the delegation of the Republic of Azerbaijan headed by him participated at Extended Meeting of Assembly Bureau held in Vienna, Austria on September 10, 2015 and Mr.Zakir Garalov has chaired the mentioned event.

Moreover, an officer of ACD participated at Summer Academy of IACA (IACSA) and two officers of ACD continued their studies within Master in Anticorruption Science program (MACS) of IACA.

The Azerbaijan Project “Strengthening capacities to fight and prevent corruption in Azerbaijan” was launched on January 1, 2015.

This project is one of the four National Components of the CoE/EU Eastern Partnership Programmatic Cooperation Framework (PCF) Programme “Fight against corruption and fostering good governance/ Fight against money-laundering” specifically tailored to respond to the needs of Azerbaijan in the area of fight against corruption. The Project looks to assist Azerbaijani prevention and repression entities with building up their internal capacities, as well as to support the Azerbaijani Government in
setting future priorities in the field.