WTO Rules and Disciplines
(Subsidies, local content requirements, IP rights, Government procurement)

Jorge Castro / World Trade Organization
OECD, November 2018
WTO: Trade Rules and Disciplines

1A Multilateral agreements on trade in goods
1B GATS
1C TRIPS
2 Dispute Settlement Understanding
3 Trade Policy Review Mechanism
4 Plurilateral trade agreements

Marrakech Agreement establishing the WTO
### WTO: Trade Rules and Disciplines

**Annex 1A**

Multilateral agreements on trade in *Goods*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>1A</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multilateral trade agreement on trade in goods</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Goods</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>GATT 1994</strong> (General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Understandings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marrakech Protocol</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Agreements on:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Agriculture</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Antidumping</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Sanitary and phytosanitary measures</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Customs valuation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preshipment inspection</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Safeguards</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rules of origin</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Technical barriers to trade</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Import licensing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Trade-related investment measures (TRIMS)</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subsidies and countervailing measures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
WTO Rules on Subsidies

- GATT 1994
- Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
- Agreement on Agriculture
Subsidies in the WTO

- What is a Subsidy?
- What effects may a subsidy have on international trade?
- Disciplines and actions with respect to subsidies
Agreement on Subsidies and Countervailing Measures

- Rules on Subsidies
  - Definition
  - Disciplines

- Disciplines on Countervailing Measures

- Dispute Settlement

Avoid Unfair Competition

Allow public policy objectives
What is a Subsidy?

- A financial contribution
- By a government or public body
- That confers a benefit
  - That is specific
A Financial Contribution

• Direct transfer of funds (Grants, Loans, Equity infusions)
• Potential direct transfer of funds (Loan guarantees)
• Foregone or uncollected Government revenue (Tax credits, Taxes/duties exemptions)
• Provision of goods or services, other than general infrastructure / Purchase of goods
• Income or price support
Government or Public Body

- Financial Contribution granted by a **government** (for example, federal, regional or local) **Or** by a **public body** (for example, a national bank, a national power company, etc.)

- **Or** the government **entrusts or directs** a private body to make the financial contribution

- Within the territory of a Member
Is there a benefit?

Benefit to the recipient

Benefit = advantage (to the recipient), no need for cost to the government

Basis for comparison = the market

Is the financial contribution provided in better terms than those available to the recipient on the market?

Guidelines: Article 14 of the ASCM
“Specific” Subsidies

- Only specific subsidies are subject to disciplines in parts II, III and IV of the ASCM
- Limited to an enterprise or industry or to a group of enterprises or industries
- Enterprises located within a designated geographical región
- De facto / de jure specificity
- Prohibited subsidies
Types of Subsidies

- Prohibited — Red light
- Actionable — Yellow light
- Non-Actionable — Green light (expired)
Which subsidies are prohibited?

Export subsidies

- Contingent
- In law or in fact
- Whether solely or as one of several conditions
- On export performance

Import substitution subsidies

- Contingent
- Whether solely or as one of several conditions
- On the use of domestic over imported goods
Export Subsidies

Illustrative list of export subsidies - Annex I, ASCM, for example:

- Direct subsidies contingent upon export performance
- Internal transport and freight charges, provided or mandated by governments, more favourable for export shipments than for domestic shipments
Prohibited Subsidies

- Deemed to be specific
- Multilateral action
  - WTO Dispute Settlement Mechanism (panels and the Appellate Body)
    - Withdrawal of the subsidy
    - Countermeasures (suspension of concessions)
- National Action
  - Countervailing measures
Actionable subsidies

• Subsidies that are not red light
• Not prohibited, but...
• Should not cause adverse effects to another Member:
  - Injury to its domestic industry
  - Nullification or impairment of benefits
  - Serious prejudice
Remedies under the ASCM

**Multilateral**
- Establishment of WTO Panel
- Adoption of Panel/AB Report
  - **Prohibited** Subsidy: Withdraw
  - **Actionable** Subsidy: Withdraw subsidy or remove effect

**National**
- Initiate anti-subsidy (CVD) investigation
- Existence of subsidy, injury, causal link
- Impose countervailing measures to offset subsidy
Countervailing Measures

• In the case of prohibited or actionable subsidies

• That cause injury to the domestic industry that produces like products

• In accordance with the rules in the ASCM (including on SDT / de minimis subsidies / negligible volume of imports)
Countervailing Measures at the WTO

- Substantive aspects
  - Determining the subsidy
  - Determining the injury and causal relationship
  - Imposition of duties
- Procedural aspects
Existence of a Subsidy

• Determined in accordance with Part I of the ASCM agreement: (1) Financial Contribution; (2) Benefit; (3) Specificity

• Calculating the amount of the subsidy / Guidelines in Article 14 ASCM: (1) Equity infusions; (2) Loans; (3) Loan guarantees; (4) Provision of goods or services or purchase of goods
Calculation of Countervailing Duties

- Calculations must be done program by program / subsidy by subsidy
- **Determine** the amount of the subsidy / received by the firm in question
- **Analyze** the subsidy to:
  - **Allocate** to specific companies, products or markets
  - **Allocate Benefits over time**
- **Calculate** the amount of the subsidy in the period of investigation / relevant sales (volume o value)
Injury

- Material injury to a domestic industry (current injury)
- Threat of material injury to a domestic industry (future injury)
- Material retardation of the establishment of a domestic industry
Domestic industry

• Who can file an application
• What information is relevant for the injury analysis
Domestic industry

• Domestic industry*
  • Domestic producers of the like product as a whole
  • Domestic producers whose collective output is a major proportion of the total domestic production of the like product

* Domestic in the importing country
Domestic industry

• What is a major proportion of the total domestic production?
  • An “Important, serious, significant” proportion
  • A major proportion of the total domestic production
  • Fragmented industries / Concentrated industries
Domestic industry

- Excluded producers
  - Producers related to the exporters or importers
  - Producers that are importers of the allegedly subsidized product
  - Excluded producers may not be considered for the purpose of the injury analysis
Domestic industry

- Effect of the subsidized imports shall be assessed in relation to the domestic production of like products.

- If separate identification of that production is not possible, the effects shall be assessed examining the production of the narrowest group or range of products which includes the like product.
Injury determination

- An objective examination based on positive evidence
  - Volume of the subsidized imports
  - Effect of the subsidized imports on prices for like products in the domestic market
  - Impact of imports on domestic producers of like products
Injury determination

- Volume of subsidized imports
  - Significant increase in imports, in absolute terms or relative to production or consumption in the importing Member
Injury determination

- Effect of imports on the prices of like products in the domestic market
  - Significant price undercutting
  - Significant price depression
  - Significant price suppression
Injury determination

• Impact of subsidized imports on the domestic industry
  • Evaluation of all relevant economic factors having a bearing on the state of the industry
Injury determination

• Actual and potential decline in output, sales, market share, profits, productivity, return on investments, or utilization of capacity

• Factors affecting domestic prices

• Actual and potential negative effects on cash flow, inventories, employment, wages, growth, ability to raise capital or investments and, in the case of agriculture, whether there has been an increased burden on government support programmes
Injury determination

- Non exhaustive list / At least the factors in the list / Other relevant factors

- No isolated factor is decisive
Threat of injury

• Based on fact and not merely on allegation, conjecture or remote possibility

• The application of countervailing measures must be considered and decided with special care
Causal relationship

• No specific test
• Evidence that the subsidized imports are, through the effect of the subsidies, causing injury
• Injury caused by other factors must not be attributed to the subsidized imports
Rules on local content
The TRIMs Agreement establishes disciplines on certain types of investment measures applied to enterprises.

It prohibits the use of TRIMs that are inconsistent with:

- **Article III** of GATT 1994 (National Treatment), or
- **Article XI** of GATT 1994 (General Elimination of Quantitative Restrictions)
Article III:4 of GATT 1994

- Imported products
- Shall be afforded treatment no less favourable that that accorded to ....
- Like products of national origin...
- In respect of all laws, regulations and requirements...
- Affecting their internal sale, offering for sale, purchase, transportation, distribution and use
TRIMs Agreement: main features

• Applies only to investment measures related to trade in goods (not trade in services)

• Focuses on the discriminatory treatment of products (imported/exported), not producers

• Does not regulate the entry of foreign investment or investors

• Concerns measures applied to both foreign and local firms
TRIMs Agreement: Coverage (Art. 1)

• “Investment Measures”
  - *Indonesia-Autos*: Measures were “aimed at encouraging the development of a local manufacturing capacity” for cars and components
  - Need not be explicitly adopted as investment regulations
  - See Canada - Renewable Energy / Feed-in Tariff (FIT) Program

• “Trade-Related”
  - *Indonesia-Autos*: Local content requirements “necessarily trade-related” because they favour domestic over imported products
Prohibitions

• National Treatment and Quantitative Restrictions (Article 2)
  - Prohibition on the application of any TRIM that is inconsistent with the GATT 1994 provisions:
    - Article III (National treatment), or
    - Article XI (General elimination of quantitative restrictions)
• TRIMs Annex contains an Illustrative List of measures that are inconsistent with Articles III:4 and XI:1 of GATT 1994

• Mandatory measures and measures compliance with which is necessary to obtain an “advantage”

• The term “advantage” is not defined, but it is understood to encompass a wide range of benefits, including subsidies

• Non-exhaustive list
Illustrative List: paras. 1(a) and 1(b)

• TRIMs inconsistent with Article III.4 of GATT

  1(a): Measures that require the purchase or use of goods of domestic origin or from any domestic source
  • Local content requirements

  1(b): Measures that limit the purchase or use of imported products to an amount related to the volume or value of products exported by an enterprise
  • Trade-balancing requirements
TRIMs inconsistent with Article XI:1 of GATT

- 2(a): Measures that restrict the importation of products used in or related to local production, generally or to an amount related to the volume or value of the local production exported by the enterprise
  - Trade-balancing requirements

- 2(b): Measures that restrict the importation of products used in or related to local production, by restricting access to foreign exchange to an amount related to the foreign exchange inflows to the enterprise
  - Exchange-balancing requirements
TRIMs inconsistent with Article XI.1 of GATT

- 2(c): Measures that restrict the exportation or sale for export of products, whether in terms of particular products, volume or value of products, or proportion of the volume or value of the local production of the enterprise
  - Export restrictions

Note: export performance requirements are not affected, as they are not covered by Article XI.1 of the GATT
The provisions of this Article (incl. III:4) shall not apply to laws, regulations or requirements governing the procurement by governmental agencies of products purchased for governmental purposes and not with a view to commercial resale or with a view to use in the production of goods for commercial sale.
Subsidies to Domestic Producers
Article III:8(b)

- The provisions of this Article shall not prevent the payment of subsidies exclusively to domestic producers, including payments to domestic producers derived from the proceeds of internal taxes or charges applied consistently with the provisions of this Article and subsidies effected through governmental purchases of domestic products.
• Any “advantage” provided on the condition of satisfying LCRs is inconsistent with Art. III:4 GATT
  (para. 1(a) Illustrative List)

• “subsidies contingent, whether solely or as one of several conditions, upon the use of domestic over imported goods” shall not be maintained
  (Art. 3.1(b) ASCM)
Exceptions

• Exceptions (Article 3)

  Exceptions under GATT 1994 apply to the TRIMs Agreement
Notification and transitional arrangements (Article 5)

- Notification of inconsistent TRIMs within 90 days of the entry into force of the WTO

- Transition period for elimination of notified TRIMs
  - 2 years (developed countries)
  - 5 years (developing countries)
  - 7 years (least-developed countries)

- 27 Members notified TRIMs under Article 5.1
  - All but one measure included local content aspects
Notification and transitional arrangements (Article 5)

• Possible extension of the transition period for developing countries demonstrating particular difficulties in implementing the Agreement

➤ Extensions until end-2003 were granted to 7 Members:

➤ Argentina, Colombia, Malaysia, Mexico, Pakistan, Philippines, Romania
S&D Decision on TRIMs Agreement

LDCs allowed to maintain existing TRIMs until the end of a new transition period lasting 7 years:

- Notify the CTG within 2 years, starting on 17 January 2006
- Transition period may be extended by CTG, taking into account the individual financial, trade and development needs of Member in question
LDCs also allowed to introduce **new TRIMs**:
- Notify to the CTG such measures within 6 months of their adoption
- CTG to give positive consideration to such notifications
- Duration of new measures not to exceed 5 years, renewable subject to review and decision by CTG

All measures adopted under this decision shall be phased out by 2020

No measures notified
Of the TRIMs discussed in the Committee:

- Overwhelming majority principally involved local content issues (33/34)

- Measures related principally to developing and emerging economies:
  - Indonesia (7); Russia (6); India (4); Brazil and China (3); Argentina, Nigeria, Turkey and United States (2); Korea, Ukraine and Uruguay (1)
Summary

• TRIMs Agreement applies to trade in goods
• Prohibits measures that are inconsistent with Articles III and XI of GATT 1994: local content; trade balancing, export restrictions
• Extensions of transition periods expired at the end of 2003
• 2005 HK Declaration: Decision in favour of LDCs
Government Procurement
The provisions of this Article (incl. III:4) shall not apply to laws, regulations or requirements governing the procurement by governmental agencies of products purchased for governmental purposes and not with a view to commercial resale or with a view to use in the production of goods for commercial sale.
WTO Agreement on Government Procurement

- Plurilateral agreement
- Currently, 19 parties comprising 47 WTO Members
- 32 Members are observers
- 10 Members are acceding
Agreement applies only to: (1) entities covered in Schedules; (2) for listed goods, services or construction services; (3) exceeding threshold values; and (4) subject to any exceptions.