Working Party on Aid Effectiveness and Donor Practices

DRAFT SUMMARY OF THE SIXTH MEETING OF THE JOINT VENTURE ON PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

Held in Paris on 29-30 June 2006

This draft summary is submitted FOR APPROVAL at the next meeting of the Joint Venture on Public Financial Management on 18-19 December 2006.

Contact: Mr Simon Mizrahi (simon.mizrahi@oecd.org) Tel. +33-1 45 24 78 41
JOINT VENTURE ON PUBLIC FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT

Item 1: Adoption of the agenda

1. The Co-Chairs (Gilles Hervio and Omowunmi Ladipo) welcomed participants to the sixth meeting of the Joint Venture on Public Financial Management and observed a strong participation from partner countries (Afghanistan, Bangladesh, Burkina Faso, Madagascar, Nigeria & South Africa).

2. The Director of the OECD Development Cooperation Directorate (Michael Roeskau) thanked the outgoing chairs (Gilles Hervio and Omowunmi Ladipo) for their outstanding achievements. He also welcomed the two new co-chairs of the Joint Venture; Anthony Hegarty is to replace Omowunmi Ladipo as the co-chair for the World Bank, and Riccardo Maggi is to replace Gilles Hervio as the co-chair for the European Commission. Members adopted the agenda of the current meeting.

Item 2: Adoption of the summary record


Item 3: PEFA performance measurement framework

4. The PEFA Secretariat (Frans Ronsholt) provided information on the training that the PEFA Secretariat had provided to members of the Joint Venture on the previous day (28 June 2006). This was followed by a presentation on the early experience from application of the PFM performance measurement framework in more than 23 countries (an additional 17 countries are currently underway).

5. Members expressed broad support for the on-going process, but they also flagged the following issues:

   • The importance of meeting one of PEFA’s objectives: reducing the volume of duplicative diagnostic work in the area of PFM.

   • The value of greater dissemination, especially with regard to partner country governments, as a way of ensuring a greater impact.

   • The need to have convenient access to the country PFM reports and a list of consultants with appropriate expertise to undertake PFM performance measurements.

6. In concluding this agenda item it was agreed that further attention was needed to making the PEFA framework credible as a tool for measuring performance in PFM and providing a sound basis for country-led reforms.

Item 4: General budget support evaluation

7. Stephen Lister (Consultant) presented members with a summary of the key findings of the OECD-DAC Evaluation of General Budget Support. The main focus of the presentation was on the

---

1 Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability Programme (PEFA).
implications of the evaluation on the Good Practice Paper on budget support that was developed by the Joint Venture. The evaluation broadly endorsed the Good Practice Paper and recommended following its general principles and good practices. However, it also highlighted a number of areas where additional work might be required. This included addressing in more depth the following key issues:

- Long-term predictability of aid flows.
- Effective management of governance issues when providing budget support.
- Potential confusion between modalities for providing budget support at the sector level and the macro level.
- Additional attention to supporting PFM reforms.

8. Members welcomed the broad support of the Good Practice Paper provided by the evaluation. In concluding this agenda item the co-chair also noted that out of the 4 issues flagged by the evaluation only the last one — supporting PFM reforms — fell clearly within the remit of the Joint Venture and is already being addressed (agenda item 6).

Item 5: Benchmarking country procurement systems

9. The World Bank (Pamela Bigart) and the OECD Secretariat (Micheal Lawrance) updated members on work underway in the Joint Venture on Procurement on establishing a framework for benchmarking country procurement systems.

10. Members welcomed the efforts made by the Joint Venture on Procurement in this area and noted the need to ensure consistency between the PFM performance measurement framework and the Procurement benchmarking framework. The following concerns were raised by members with regard to the proposed benchmarking methodology:

- Severity of scoring and complexity of the assessment methodology (55 Indicators).
- Consistency with areas that overlap with financial management.
- Concerns around the validation of scoring and how it could be conciliated with self-assessments.
- Potential confusion around conflicting objectives: setting sound procurement standards on one hand, and measuring performance on the other hand.

11. It was agreed that the JV-PFM and the JV-Proc. would continue actively working together through regular exchanges of information, joint meetings of the chairs and cross participation in meetings. The Joint Venture also asked to be directly involved at the technical level for discussions concerning those procurement indicators which touch upon more general aspects of a PFM system (such as, for instance, internal control). The fundamental aim should be to ensure technical coherence in monitoring frameworks and in the Joint Venture’s contributions to the indicators of progress for the monitoring of the Paris Declaration.
Item 6:  Good Practice in PFM reforms

12. The United Kingdom (Stephen Sharples) introduced this agenda item with a frank presentation of its experience in supporting 5 PFM reform processes undertaken in Ghana since 1993. Key lessons and findings were confronted with the good practices on capacity development in PFM drafted by the Joint Venture. This highlighted the importance but also the difficulties of some basic tenets such as country ownership, proper sequencing, a holistic approach and the need to match solution to country specific circumstances. The presentation also identified the following four areas that might warrant additional attention:

- Integrated Financial Management Information Systems (IFMIS) and more generally the introduction of IT systems.
- Addressing incentives issues at domestic levels (ministries, departments, individual) and within donor agencies.
- Addressing challenges brought about by ‘projectisation’ of PFM reforms (e.g. salary supplements to incentivise staff).
- Need to look at PFM reform more from a business case perspective by making, for example, better use of cost/benefit analyses.

13. In line with the critical and focused spirit of the Ghana presentation, the Joint Venture decided that its ambition would be to foster activities that help to move from good practice papers to good practices. The Joint Venture would therefore: (i) seek to by identify the obstacles that hamper the adoption of good practices and the conditions facilitating their implementation in specific cases, and; (ii) disseminate the lesson learnt through through a variety of channels. To achieve this goal the Joint Venture decided to adopt a three pronged approach:

- Case study analyses of PFM reforms in a small set of operational areas (e.g. IFMIS, VAT reforms, donor incentives etc.)
- Fact-finding country missions designed to probe challenges in implementing PFM reform.
- Organisation of a regional workshop addressing challenges in implementing PFM reforms in specific areas yet to be defined. Lessons learnt might then feed into a publication.

14. In order to take this forward, the Co-Chairs invited members to submit proposals by 1 September 2006. In particular members were asked to identify a small set of operational areas that would help focus discussions at the next meeting of the Joint Venture.

Item 7:  IPSAS accounting standards (ED 24)

15. The Co-Chair (Omowunmi Ladipo) briefed members on IPSAS-Board’s decision to develop a revised Exposure Draft on “Financial Reporting Under the Cash Basis of Accounting — Disclosure Requirements for Recipients of External Assistance” (ED 24). The Chair presented an overview of the main changes made to ED 24 and noted that the IPSAS-Board was seeking guidance on the following key issues:

Q1 Is the suggested list of mandatory disclosure requirements appropriate? Are there any particular items that should be added or removed?
Q2 Should a separate IPSAS be issued or the cash basis IPSAS amended to include the mandatory and recommended disclosures in connection with External Assistance?

Q3 Should mandatory disclosures be made on the face of the statement or by note to the financial statements?

Q4 If the disclosures are to be incorporated into the cash basis IPSAS, should the updated IPSAS be issued now or in 2007 when it is due to be reviewed as part of IPSAS Board’s ongoing programme of work?

Q5 Were the proposals made for field-testing in Namibia appropriate? Or should IPSAS seek to field-test ED 24 in more countries with support from the Joint Venture?

16. Members welcomed the initiative taken by the IPSAS-Board to simplify ED 24 and seek to reduce the cost of compliance for recipients of aid. It was agreed that the Joint Venture would mandate Anthony Hegarty — the new Co-Chair of the Joint Venture — to make the following proposals at the next meeting of the IPSAS-Board on 3 July 2006:

Q1 Disclosure of rescheduled or cancelled external assistance debt should be required rather than encouraged (ED 24 para. 50). Subject to conclusive results of field-testing two other disclosure requirements might also be made mandatory: (i) Disclosure of the details of terms and conditions of external assistance loans and grants (ED 24, paras. 26, 27 & 28); (ii) Disclosure of instances of non-compliance (ED 24 para. 36).

Q2 The Cash basis should be amended to include disclosure requirements and encouragements.

Q3 Mandatory disclosures should be made by note to the financial statements.

Q4 Cash Basis IPSAS should be updated for ED 24 disclosures and issued now rather than in 2007.

Q5 The Joint Venture encourages the IPSAS-Board to field-test the IPSAS in a broader range of countries including francophone countries. Nigeria (Mr. Dankwambe) volunteered for the field-testing and two francophone countries (Burkina Faso & Madagascar) were currently considering the option — both countries agreed to inform the Chairs of their decision by 1 September 2006.

Item 8: Survey on Monitoring the Paris Declaration

17. The OECD Secretariat briefed members on on-going work on the aid effectiveness indicators agreed in Paris. It was decided that the Joint Venture was ready to support the elaboration of the report on the 2006 Baseline Survey on Monitoring the Paris Declaration by providing additional guidance and expertise for the analysis of the Survey results for the relevant indicators.

Item 9: Website on training in PFM

18. The Netherlands (Henk van Trigt) introduced the agenda on joint training and sharing information on training. It was noted that the OECD Secretariat had established a dedicated website for the JV-PFM. Members suggested that additional thought was needed on: (i) what use would be made of the website and (ii) what kind of documents should be posted. In the meantime, it was agreed that best use of this website would made in order to share information on training initiatives and events. To this end,
members of the Joint Venture were invited to send the OECD Secretariat by 1 September 2006 a list of useful hyperlinks that could be included on the current website.

Item 10: Next steps and other business

19. The Co-chairs presented the case for strengthening linkages with three other related processes:

- The Collaborative African Budget Reform Initiative (CABRI) — Members also agreed that there would be considerable value for the Joint Venture in engaging closer relationships with CABRI and that other opportunities for closer exchanges with professional networks such as public sector accountants should be sought out in the future.

- The Development Nations Committee (DNC) of the IPSAS-Board — It was agreed that the DNC would be invited to attend the next meeting in order to better inform members of its activities.

- The Harmonisation of Overseas Audit Practices (HOAP) — Members felt that the activities of HOAP did not fall within the remit of the Joint Venture.

20. It was suggested that the next meeting of the Joint Venture would be held before the end of this year.
# FINAL LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

## CO-CHAIRS OF THE JOINT-VENTURE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Phone</th>
<th>Fax</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mr. Gilles HERVIO</td>
<td>EC</td>
<td>Rue de la loi 200, Brussels 1049, Belgium</td>
<td>+32 2 296 37 00</td>
<td>+32 2 299 28 96</td>
<td><a href="mailto:gilles.hervio@ec.europa.eu">gilles.hervio@ec.europa.eu</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms. Mimi LADIPO</td>
<td>Lead Financial Management Specialist</td>
<td>The World Bank</td>
<td>Washington, DC 20433, United States</td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:oladipo@worldbank.org">oladipo@worldbank.org</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## OECD MEMBER STATES OR PERMANENT DELEGATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Phone</th>
<th>Fax</th>
<th>Email</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Allemagne/Germany</td>
<td>Mr. Matthias WITT</td>
<td>Senior Economist, Public Finance</td>
<td>Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH</td>
<td>+49 6196 79 16 43</td>
<td>+49 6196 79 80 16 43</td>
<td><a href="mailto:matthias.witt@gtz.de">matthias.witt@gtz.de</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ms. Bianca BRETECHE</td>
<td></td>
<td>Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH</td>
<td>+49 6196 79 16 43</td>
<td>+49 6196 79 80 16 43</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Bianca.Breteche@gtz.de">Bianca.Breteche@gtz.de</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mr. Nassir DJAFARI</td>
<td>Principal Economist</td>
<td>Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau (KfW)</td>
<td>+49 69 7431 35 16</td>
<td>+49 69 7431 37 46</td>
<td><a href="mailto:nassir.djafari@kfw.de">nassir.djafari@kfw.de</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgique/Belgium</td>
<td>Mr. Johan DEBAR</td>
<td>Attaché Coopération Internationale - Appui à la Politique</td>
<td>Direction Générale de la Coopération au Développement</td>
<td>+32 2 519 02 11</td>
<td>+32 2 519 05 85</td>
<td><a href="mailto:johan.debar@diplobel.fed.be">johan.debar@diplobel.fed.be</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Belgique/Belgium
Mr. Geert JENNES
Public Finance and Budget Support Advisor
Belgian Technical Cooperation
Hoogstraat 147
1000 Brussels  Belgium
Tel: +32 2 505 3785
Fax: +32 2 502 9862
Email: geert.jennes@btcctb.org

Canada/Canada
M. Gregory GRAHAM
Director General of Finance
Canadian International Development Agency
200 Promenade du Portage
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0G4  Canada
Tel: +1 819 994 1318
Fax: +1 819 994 2601
Email: gregory_graham@acdi-cida.gc.ca

CE/EC
M. Riccardo MAGGI
DG Development
European Commission
Brussels  Belgium
Tel: +32 2 296 3890
Fax: +32 2 299 2896
Email: Riccardo.MAGGI@ec.europa.eu

Danemark/Denmark
Ms. Birthe LARSEN
Technical Adviser, Financial Management
Ministry of Foreign Affairs
2, Asiatisk Plads
DK-1448 Copenhagen K  Denmark
Tel: +45 3392 0350
Email: birela@um.dk

Danemark/Denmark
Ms. Jytte LAURSEN
Senior Economic Advisor
Ministry of Foreign Affairs
2, Asiatisk Plads
DK-1448 Copenhagen K  Denmark
Tel: +45 33 92 0220
Fax: +45 329 207 90
Email: jytlau@um.dk

Etats-Unis/United States
Mr. George CARNER
US Representative to the DAC
Permanent Delegation
12 rue Raphael
75116 Paris  France
Tel: +33-1-4524-7434
Fax: +33-1-4524-7489
Email: carnergx@state.gov

Finlande/Finland
Ms. Outi KORKEALA
Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Finland
Katajanokanlahti 3
00161 Helsinki  Finland
Tel: +358 9 160 56234
Email: outi.korkeala@formin.fi

France/France
M. Jean-François ALMANZA
Ministère des Affaires étrangères
20, rue Monsieur
75700 Paris Cedex 07  France
Tel: +33 1 53 69 42 28
Fax: +33 1 53 69 43 97
Email: jean-francois.almanza@diplomatie.gouv.fr

France/France
Mr. Hugo PIERREL
Chargé de mission
Agence Française de Développement
5, rue Roland Barthes
75012 Paris  France
Tel: +33 1.53.44.32.25.
Email: pierrelh@afd.fr
France/France  Mr. Alain VERNINAS  Em: alain.verninas@diplomatie.gouv.fr
Chef du Bureau
Ministère des Affaires Etrangères
20, rue Monsieur
75700 Paris Cedex 07 France

Irlande/Ireland  Mr. Gerard CONSIDINE  Tel: +353 1 4082942
Senior Development Specialist - Economics
Irish Aid
Department of Foreign Affairs
Bishop’s Square
Redmond’s Hill
2 Dublin Ireland

Italie/Italy  Ms. Elena CRIVELLARO  Email: stagista3.ocse@esteri.it
Stagiaire
Délégation Permanente
Paris France

Japon/Japan  Ms. Momoko TAMURA  Tel: +33(0)1 53 76 61 59
Advisor for Development
Permanent Delegation
11 avenue Hoche
75008 Paris France

Japon/Japan  Mr. Eigo AZUKIZAWA  Tel: +33-(0)1-47-03-61-90
Representative in Paris
Japan Bank for International Cooperation (JBIC)
21, bd de la Madeleine
75001 Paris France

Japon/Japan  Ms. Yoko KAMADA  Tel: +33 (0)1 40 20 04 21
Policy Analyst
Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)
JICA France Office
8, rue Ste. Anne
75001 Paris France

Norvège/Norway  Ms. Tone TINNES  Tel: +47 22 24 38 09
Senior Advisor
Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Oslo Norway

Norvège/Norway  Ms. Marianne HANSEN  Tel: +47 22 24 0378
Senior Adviser
Norwegian Agency for Development Cooperation
Oslo Norway
PARTNER COUNTRIES

Afghanistan/Afghanistan
Mr. Mustafa MASTOOR
Director General Budget
Ministry of Finance
Pashtunistan Watt
Kabul  Afghanistan
Tel: +93 20 210 3154
Fax: +93 75 202 3322
Em: mustafa.mastoor@afghanistangov.org

Afrique du Sud/South Africa
Mr. Neil COLE
Chief Director
National Treasury
40 Church Square
0001 Pretoria  South Africa
Tel: +27 12 315 5949
Fax: +27 12 315 5608
Email: neil.cole@treasury.gov.za

Bangladesh/Bangladesh
Mr. Muhammad Abdul MAZID
Additional Secretary
Ministry of Finance
Finance Division
Ministry of Finance
Bhaban 7, Room 127
Bangladesh Secretariat
Dhaka 1000  Bangladesh
Tel: +880 2 716 9984
Fax: +880 2 7165581
Em: mazidmuhammad@yahoo.co.uk

Burkina Faso/Burkina Faso
Mr. François ZOUNDI
Ministère des Finances et du Budget
Ouagadougou  Burkina Faso
Email: fm.didier@gmail.com
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country/Country</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position/Position</th>
<th>Contact Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Madagascar/Madagascar   | Mr. Ratovo ANDRIAMBAHINY    | Directeur de la Comptabilité Publique                 | Tel: +261 22 32977/  
                                      |                | Madagascar                                           | +261 22 21510      
                                      |                |                                                     | Fax: +261 22 62944 |
|                         |                             |                                                      | Email: dgt_acct@wanadoo.mg |
| Nigeria/Nigeria         | Mr. Ibrahim Hassan DANKWAMBO| Accountant-General of the Federation                  | Tel: +234 9 234 0949  
                                      |                | Ministry of Finance                                   | Fax: +234 9 234 0443|
|                         |                             | Abuja Nigeria                                         | Email: dankwambo@yahoo.com |
| Nigeria/Nigeria         | Mr. Adedayo APATA           | Office of the Accountant General of the Federation    | Email: apatadayo@yahoo.com |
|                         |                             | Ministry of Finance                                   |                     |
|                         |                             | Abuja Nigeria                                         |                     |
| **INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS** |                           |                                                      |                     |
| Banque mondiale/World Bank | Ms. Pamela BIGART          | Lead Procurement Specialist                           | Tel: +1 202 458 41 04|
|                         |                             | The World Bank                                         | Email: pbigart@worldbank.org |
|                         |                             | 1818 H St., NW                                         |                     |
|                         |                             | Washington, DC 20433 United States                    |                     |
| Banque mondiale/World Bank | Mr. Anthony HEGARTY         | Chief Financial Management Officer and Head of the Financial Management Sector Board | Tel: + 1 202 473 5854 |
|                         |                             | The World Bank                                         | Fax: + 1 202 473 5480|
|                         |                             | 1818 H. Street NW                                      | Email: ahegarty@worldbank.org |
|                         |                             | Washington, DC 20433 United States                    |                     |
| Banque mondiale/World Bank | Mr. Marius KOEN            | Senior Financial Management Specialist                | Tel: +1 202 458 4886 |
|                         |                             | The World Bank                                         | Fax: +1 202 522 0823 |
|                         |                             | FM Anchor Office                                       | Email: mkoen@worldbank.org |
|                         |                             | 1818 H Street NW                                       |                     |
|                         |                             | Washington, DC 20433 United States                    |                     |
| Banque mondiale/World Bank | Mr. Soe LIN                | Advisor, Harmonisation                                | Tel: +1 202 458 8101 |
|                         |                             | The World Bank                                         | Fax: +1 202 522 0897 |
|                         |                             | 1818 H Street NW                                       | Email: slin@worldbank.org |
|                         |                             | Washington, DC 20433 United States                    |                     |
| PEFA Secretariat        | Mr. Frans RONSHOLT         | PEFA Secretariat                                       | Tel: +1-202-4737519  
                                      |                             | World Bank                                           | Email: fronsholt@worldbank.org |
|                         |                             | Room MC4-7131                                          |                     |
|                         |                             | 1818 H Street NW                                       |                     |
|                         |                             | Washington DC 20433 United States                    |                     |
PEFA Secretariat
Ms. Debra BEATTIE
PEFA Secretariat
World Bank
1818 H Street NW
Washington DC 20433 United States

Email: dbeattie@worldbank.org
Tel: +1 202 473 1340

PEFA Secretariat
Mr. Franck BESSETTE
PEFA Secretariat
World Bank
1818 H Street NW
Washington DC 20433 United States

Email: fbessette@ccomptes.fr

Fonds monétaire international (FMI)/International Monetary Fund (IMF)
Mr. Elliott HARRIS
Advisor
Policy Development & Review Dept.
IMF
Rm5-7131
700 19th Street NW
Washington D.C. 20431 United States

Email: EHARRIS2@imf.org
Tel: +1 202-623-6621
Fax: +1 202 589 6621

Fonds monétaire international (FMI)/International Monetary Fund (IMF)
Mr. Pierre EWENCZYK
Senior Economist
66 Avenue d’Iena
75116 Paris France

Email: pewenczyk@imf.org
Tel: +33 (1) 40 69 30 82
Fax: +33 (1) 47 23 40 89

Programme des Nations Unies pour le développement/U.N. Development Programme (UNDP)
Mr. Antoine HEUTY
Public Finance Economist
UNDP
304 East 45th Street11th Floor
New York, NY 10017 United States

Email: antoine.heuty@undp.org
Tel: +1 212 906 3665
Fax: +1 212 906 5313

Consultant
Stephen LISTER
Mokoro Limited
87 London Road
Headington
Oxford OX3 9BE
United Kingdom

Email: slister@mokoro.co.uk

OCDE/OECD
2, rue André Pascal  75016 Paris France

Mr. Christian LEHEMBRE
Head, Aid Effectiveness Division (EFF)
Tel: +33 (1) 45 24 83 72
Email: Christian.LEHEMBRE@oecd.org

Mr. Michael LAWRANCE
Advisor
Tel: +33 (1) 45 24 14 25
Email: Micheal.LAWRANCE@oecd.org

Mr. Simon MIZRAHI
Administrator
Tel: +33 (1) 45 24 78 41
Email: Simon.MIZRAHI@oecd.org

Mr. Michael ROESKAU
Director
Development Cooperation Directorate
Tel: +33 (1) 45 24 90 00
Email: Michael.ROESKAU@oecd.org

Mr. Simon MIZRAHI
Administrator
Tel: +33 (1) 45 24 78 41
Email: Simon.MIZRAHI@oecd.org

Mr. Michael ROESKAU
Director
Development Cooperation Directorate
Tel: +33 (1) 45 24 90 00
Email: Michael.ROESKAU@oecd.org