Liquid Traces

Investigating the Deaths of Migrants at the EU’s Maritime Frontier

Charles Heller
Forensic Oceanography, Goldsmiths College, University of London
CARTE RÉALISÉE DANS LE CADRE DU PROJET « FORENSIC OCEANOGRAPHY »
CHARLES HELLER, LORENZO PEZZANI ET STUDIO
DANS LE CADRE DU PROJET ERC « FORENSIC ARCHITECTURE », CENTRE DE RECHERCHES ARCHITECTURALES, UNIVERSITÉ DE GOLDSMITHS, LONDRES.
MODÈLE DE DÉRIVE: RICHARD LIMEBURNER, INSTITUT OCÉANOGRAPHIQUE DE WOODS HOLE.
IOM, Migration Crisis from Libya, 20 October 2011
US & Coalition Maritime Forces Laydown, 24 March 2011

U.S. & Coalition Ships Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Capability</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Partner Ships</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U.S. Ships</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Des centaines de boat people meurent en Méditerranée

Le Gisti va déposer plainte contre l’OTAN, l’Union européenne et les pays de la coalition en opération en Libye

Face aux centaines de naufrages mortels en Méditerranée, peut-on se contenter de dénoncer le silence assourdissant dans lequel des vies disparaissent à nos portes ? Doit-on se résoudre à l’impuissance devant des politiques migratoires auxquelles on ne pourrait rien changer ? Ces noyé-é-s ne sont pas les victimes de catastrophes naturelles, mais de décisions politiques mises en œuvre par des exécutants dont les responsabilités doivent être pointées. Devant ces atteintes au droit le plus fondamental – le droit à la vie – il faut que des procédures soient engagées et que justice soit rendue. Il faut mettre fin à cette hétac tombe.

Le Haut Commissariat des Nations unies pour les réfugiés (HCR) a dénombré à la fin de mai quelque 1 500 victimes de noyade parmi les boat people qui, depuis février dernier, s’efforcent de gagner l’Europe à partir des côtes du Maghreb et du Machrek.

Ces drames ne font que s’ajouter à tous ceux qui se déroulent, dans l’indifférence, depuis plus de vingt ans ; Fortress Europe enregistre 17 317 décès documentés depuis 1988. Mais combien d’autres victimes invisibles de la politique européenne de lutte contre l’immigration qu’elle appelle illégale ?

De ces naufrages, des épaves transformées en cercueils flottants d’hommes, de femmes et d’enfants morts d’épuisement, de faim et de soif après de longues dérives en mer, l’opinion a pris l’habitude. Elle a su croire à leur caractère inéductable. Elle a pu ignorer que les équipements anti-migratoires de l’agence européenne Frontex étaient forçément les témoins de nombre de ces drames, en Méditerranée comme ailleurs…

Mais la donne a changé depuis qu’une coalition internationale et les forces de l’OTAN interviennent en Libye. Aujourd’hui, awacs, drones, avions, hélicoptères, radars et bâtiments de guerre surveillent tout ce qui bouge en Méditerranée. Ils ne peuvent pas ne pas voir les bateaux des exilés originaires d’Afrique subsaharienne qui cherchent à fuir la Libye. Ils ne peuvent pas ne pas voir lorsque, de Tunisie, du Maroc ou d’Algérie, des jeunes sans espoir s’entassent dans une embarcation fragile pour gagner l’Italie ou l’Espagne.

En n’intervenant pas, ils se rendent coupables de non-assistance à personne en danger. Ceci ne peut rester impuni.

Communiqué du GISTI, 9 juin 2011
Dan Haile Gebre, interview December 2011
Inoltre Enhanced Group Call (EGC)

EGC Inoltro: RESP: MSGACCEPT MSG-REF: 381240 Message Accepted 11-04-03/08-34 UTC

Regione: Tutti

Priorità: DISTRESS

Codice del Servizio: S.A.R. per area circolare

Indirizzo: Lat: 34 N Long: 13 E Raggio: 050

Codice di Ripetizione: Ritrasmettere dopo 4 ore (2 trasmissioni)

Testo del EGC:

FROM MRCC ROME - ITALIAN COAST GUARD

TO ALL SHIPS TRANSITING IN SICILY CHANNEL

BT

ON 27 MARCH 2011 SICILY CHANNEL SEA IN POSITION LAT. 33°58.2” N - LONG. 012°55.8” E AT 16:52GMT A BOAT WITH ABOUT 68 POB PROBABLY IN DIFFICULT.

ALL SHIPS TRANSITING IN THE AREA ARE REQUESTED TO KEEP A SHARP LOOKOUT AND REPORTING ANY SIGHTING URGENTLY AT MRCC ROME AT FOLLOWING

Inoltro EGC.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BROADCAST WARNING MESSAGES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>QUERY RESULTS</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CATEGORY:** HYDROLANT

**Warning Number:** 512 / 2011

HYDROLANT 512/2011 (52,53,56)

(Cancelled by HYDROLANT 637/2011)

EASTERN MEDITERRANEAN SEA.

VESSEL, 68 PERSONS ON BOARD, IN NEED OF ASSISTANCE

IN 33-58.8N 012-55.8E AT 2716522 MAR. VESSELS

IN VICINITY REQUESTED TO KEEP A SHARP LOOKOUT,

ASSIST IF POSSIBLE. REPORTS TO MRCC ROME,

INMARSAT-C: 424744220,

PHONE: 390 6592 4145 OR 3906 5908 4409,

FAX: 390 6592 2737 OR 3906 5908 4733,

E-MAIL: UFFICIO3.REPARTO3@MIT.GOV.IT.

(280406Z MAR 2011)

Distress signals
Drift model
Drift model timeline
SAR image analysis, 29 March 2011
CARTE RÉALISÉE DANS LE CADRE DU PROJET « FORENSIC OCEANOGRAPHY »
CHARLES HELLER, LORENZO PEZZANI ET STI STUDIO
DANS LE CADRE DU PROJET ERC « FORENSIC ARCHITECTURE », CENTRE DE RECHERCHES ARCHITECTURALES, UNIVERSITÉ DE GOLDSMITHS, LONDRES.
MODÈLE DE DÉRIVE: RICHARD LIMEBURNER, INSTITUT OCÉANOGRAPHIQUE DE WOODS HOLE.
Death of 63 migrants in the Mediterranean: Complaint in France holds the French military to account

11 April 2012

One year after events that led to the deaths of 63 migrants in a boat in the waters off the coast of Libya, 4 survivors, with the support of a coalition of NGOs, filed a complaint in France concerning the responsibility of the French military for failing to assist persons in danger.

Legal complain France, 11 April 2012
DEATH BY RESCUE
THE LETHAL EFFECTS OF THE EU’S POLICIES OF NON-ASSISTANCE
EC President Barroso and Italian PM Letta visit to Lampedusa, 8th of October 2013
Mare Nostrum Operational zone
FORENSIC OCEANOGRAPHY

Drowned Europe, Fargues et al, 2015.

Mare Nostrum (2014)

- Migrants' boats detected: 1 Jan-31 Oct 2014 (Frontex-Italian Coast Guard data)

Purple: Frontex Hermes 2013/2014
Teal: Mare Nostrum 2013/2014

Search and Rescue (SAR) Zones

Migrants rescued by actor, 2014 (Italian Coast Guard data)

Migrant arrivals (↑) and deaths (→), 2014 (IUNICHR and IOM data)

Migrant mortality at Sea, 2014
Drowned Europe, Fargues et al, 2015.
“We do not support planned search and rescue operations in the Mediterranean. We believe that they create an unintended “pull factor”, encouraging more migrants to attempt the dangerous sea crossing and thereby leading to more tragic and unnecessary deaths.”

UK Foreign Office Minister Lady Anelay, 15 October 2014, UK Parliament

“It’s like saying, let them die because this is a good deterrence. […] To bank on the rise in the number of dead migrants to act as deterrence for future migrants and asylum seekers is appalling.”

François Crépeau, United Nations Rapporteur on the rights of migrants OHCHR, 30 October 2014
Grafico 1: Richieste d'asilo e respingimenti del Questore (1997-2015)

L’Italia e il controllo delle frontiere marittime, Campesi , 2016.
Frontex’s Triton operational area 1st Nov. 2014
“This operation will be closer to EU shores than Mare Nostrum. [...] In any case, the difference between Mare Nostrum and Triton is fundamentally the nature of the two operations. While Mare Nostrum is clearly a search and rescue operation, Triton will be with a main focus on border control, border management, although as it is obvious saving lives is an absolute priority, and in fact very frequently the control operations, the border control operations coordinated by the agency turn into search and rescue operations, and this is how it works in practice.”

Gil Arias, Frontex Interim Executive Director

European Parliament, Hearing of the Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs (LIBE), 4 September 2014,
Figure 3: Boats detected by the assets of operation Mare Nostrum and Joint Operation Hermes (1 Jan – 31 Oct 2014), and percentage of nationalities detected. The coloured dots indicate the last country of departure.
“Now we know that Mare Nostrum is not going to be replaced by Frontex or Frontex Plus, nor by Triton or Hermes, so there is not actually going to be any search and rescue operation. I can draw two conclusions here. Basically Italy is being left on its own, and secondly there is going to be no more Mare Nostrum programme and people are going to be dying in the Mediterranean again. Mr Arias Fernandez, are you aware of those two conclusions?”

Barabra Spinelli, Member of the European Parliament

European Parliament, Hearing of the Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs (LIBE), 4 September 2014,
“People will attempt the crossing, with or without Operation Mare Nostrum in place. But without it, many, many more will die.”


“UNHCR is concerned over the announcement of the ending this month of the Italian operation Mare Nostrum without a similar European search and rescue operation to replace it. This will undoubtedly increase the risk for those trying to find safety in Europe, and could lead to more refugees and migrants perishing at sea.”

*UNHCR concerned over ending of rescue operation in the Mediterranean*, 17 October 2014,
“The shipping industry is therefore very concerned by reports that the new EU Frontex operation ‘Triton’ will have a third of the budget of the current Italian ‘Mare Nostrum’ operation which it replaces, that its primary focus will be border control, and that search and rescue operations may be reduced in international waters. It will clearly be much more difficult for merchant ships to save lives at sea without the adequate provision of search and rescue services by EU Member States.”

“the withdrawal of naval assets from the area, if not properly planned and announced well in advance, would likely result in a higher number of fatalities.”
Frontex concept document for operation Triton

As a result, the following recommendation is formulated concerning the operational area:

“if operation Mare Nostrum discontinues in the future, then Frontex should consider extending the operational area of the JO Hermes 2014 and consider to which extent the objectives of effective border control and contribution to saving lives can be achieved.”
Frontex concept document for operation Triton

After Mare Nostrum (Jan-May 2015)

- Migrants' boats detected: 1 Jan-31 May 2015 (Frontex-Italian Coast Guard data)
- Frontex Triton 2015
- Search and Rescue (SAR) Zones

Migrants rescued by actor, Jan 1st-May 20th 2015 (Italian Coast Guard data)

Migrant arrivals (→) and deaths (↔), 2015 (UNHCR and IOM data)

Migrant mortality at sea, 2015
FORENSIC OCEANOGRAPHY
## MIGRANTS RESCUED AT SEA – YEAR 2015
**FROM 01ST JANUARY TO 20TH MAY 2015**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MIGRANTS RESCUED BY:</th>
<th>Units</th>
<th>Persons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ITALIAN NAVY</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>10.060(2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITALIAN COAST GUARD</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>10.734(1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MERCHANT SHIPS</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>11.954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITALIAN CUSTOM POLICE</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>3.128(3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRONTEX (NOT ITALIAN UNITS)</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2.130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OTHERS (Foreign Military Ships)</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1.244</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>268</strong>*</td>
<td><strong>39.250</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Migrants arrived directly on the Italian shore

954

*Some boats have been rescued by units of the Italian Coast Guard together with other Military/Force of Police.

(1) 3292 of which have been rescued by It C.G. units cofinanced by FRONTEX Agency.

(2) 383 of which have been rescued by It NAVY units cofinanced by FRONTEX Agency.

(3) 1081 of which have been rescued by It Custom Police units cofinanced by FRONTEX Agency.
June 7th 2014, boat capsizes as it approaches Norient Star
June 7th 2014, boat capsizes as it approaches Norient Star.
June 7th 2014, boat capsizes as it approaches Norient Star
“The humanitarian crisis in the Mediterranean Sea is spiralling out of control. [...] There is a terrible risk of further catastrophic loss of life as ever-more desperate people attempt this deadly sea crossing. [...] We believe it is unacceptable that the international community is increasingly relying on merchant ships and seafarers to undertake more and more large-scale rescues [...]. Commercial ships are not equipped to undertake such large-scale rescues [...]. In the short term, we therefore feel that the immediate priority must be for EU and EEA Member States to increase resources and support for Search and Rescue operations in the Mediterranean, in view of the very large number of potentially dangerous rescues now being conducted by merchant ships [...]. In addition to increasing SAR resources, there is also an urgent need for EU and EEA Member States to develop a political solution. [...] The shipping industry believes that the EU and the international community need to provide refugees and migrants with alternative means of finding safety without risking their lives by crossing the Mediterranean in unseaworthy boats.”

DEATH BY RESCUE

THE LETHAL EFFECTS OF THE EU'S POLICIES OF NON-ASSISTANCE
FORENSIC OCEANOGRAPHY

AIS tracks of vessels surrounding the location of the April 19, 2015 shipwreck.
Migrant mortality at Sea, 2014 (-----) and 2015 (——)

Mortality rate in the Central Mediterranean, 2014-2015
“It was a serious mistake to bring the Mare Nostrum operation to an end. It cost human lives.”

Speech by President of the European Commission Jean-Claude Juncker at the debate in the European Parliament on the conclusions of the Special European Council on 23 April: “Tackling the migration crisis”,
EU is ‘killing refugees by neglect’
“It was a serious mistake to bring the Mare Nostrum operation to an end. It cost human lives.”

MSF analysis of mortality, based on IOM data
"It was a serious mistake to bring the Mare Nostrum operation to an end. It cost human lives."

Speech by Jean-Claude Juncker at the debate in the European Parliament on the conclusions of the Special European Council on 23 April: "Tackling the migration crisis".

"It was a serious mistake to bring the Mare Nostrum operation to an end. It cost human lives."

Main nationalities arriving in Italy, 2015-2016 comparison. Frontex, JO EPN Triton, Biweekly Analytical Update, 24 Nov-4 Dec, 4 December 2016, p.3.
Main nationalities arriving in Italy, 2014-2015 comparison. Frontex, JO EPN Triton, Biweekly Analytical Update no. 21, 16-29 November 2015, 4 December 2015, p.3.
“the Central Mediterranean saw the highest number of migrant arrivals ever recorded from sub-Saharan, West Africa and the Horn of Africa (181,459 migrants, increase of 18% compared with 2015). This trend, which is consistent with previous year-on-year increases, shows that the Central Mediterranean has become the main route for African migrants to the EU and it is very likely to remain so for the foreseeable future.”

Frontex, 2017 Annual Risk Analysis report
Figure comparing types of vessels provided by smugglers in 2015 and 2016. Italian Maritime Rescue Coordination Centre, Search And Rescue Activity and Migratory flows in Central Mediterranean Sea (Year 2016), p. 14.
CENTRAL ROUTE DENSITY

Lampedusa

Zuwatah
Sabratah
Tripoli
Qarabulli
Misrata
“Wooden boats are more valuable than rubber dinghies because they can carry more people, hence more profit for smugglers and are more resilient to bad weather and can be re-used if recovered by smugglers. However, following operation SOPHIA entering into Phase 2A (High Seas), smugglers can no longer recover smuggling vessels on the High seas, effectively rendering them a less economic option for the smuggling business and thereby hampering it. Inflatable boats are used in two thirds of the cases and wooden boats in one third of the cases.”

EUNAVFOR MED, Six Monthly Report 2015
Photographs showing the sequence of the events of the 21 October 2016 incident in which the Coast Guard of Zawiya violently interrupted a rescue operation Sea-Watch was conducting, leading to the death of at least 25 people. Photographs by Christian Ditsch.
Figure 5. Monthly comparison between rescue operations performed by NGOs and rescue operations initiated via satellite phone calls of migrants in distress at the Central Mediterranean.
The Life-saving role of Search and Rescue NGOs

"Blaming the Rescuers" report, Forensic Oceanography, 2017

Migrant mortality rate (●) and SAR NGO vessels (■) in central Mediterranean, 2016.

(IOM, UNHCR and SAR NGOs data)
Photographs showing the sequence of the events of the 21 October 2016 incident in which the Coast Guard of Zawiya violently interrupted a rescue operation Sea-Watch was conducting, leading to the death of at least 25 people. Photographs by Christian Ditsch.
"It was a serious mistake to bring the Mare Nostrum operation to an end. It cost human lives."

“It was a serious mistake to bring the Mare Nostrum operation to an end. It cost human lives.”