OECD Health Policy Studies

The Looming Crisis in the Health Workforce
HOW CAN OECD COUNTRIES RESPOND?

OECD countries face a challenge in responding to the growing demand for doctors and nurses over the next 20 years. This arises in a world which is already characterised by significant international migration of health workers, both across OECD countries and between some developing countries and the OECD area.

What combination of human-resource management policies and migration policies have OECD countries adopted? How do migration and other health-workforce policies interact with each other? How can destination countries build a sustainable health workforce? What are the consequences of emigration of doctors and nurses for origin countries?

This book provides new evidence on each of these questions and identifies possible ways forward. It is the main outcome of a joint OECD-WHO project on the management of health-related human resources and international migration.

www.oecd.org/health/workforce

The full text of this book is available online via this link:
www.sourceoecd.org/socialissues/9789264050433

Those with access to all OECD books online should use this link:
www.sourceoecd.org/9789264050433

SourceOECD is the OECD online library of books, periodicals and statistical databases.
For more information about this award-winning service and free trials ask your librarian, or write to us at SourceOECD@oecd.org.
The Looming Crisis
In the Health Workforce

HOW CAN OECD COUNTRIES RESPOND?
The OECD is a unique forum where the governments of 30 democracies work together to address the economic, social and environmental challenges of globalisation. The OECD is also at the forefront of efforts to understand and to help governments respond to new developments and concerns, such as corporate governance, the information economy and the challenges of an ageing population. The Organisation provides a setting where governments can compare policy experiences, seek answers to common problems, identify good practice and work to co-ordinate domestic and international policies.

The OECD member countries are: Australia, Austria, Belgium, Canada, the Czech Republic, Denmark, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Iceland, Ireland, Italy, Japan, Korea, Luxembourg, Mexico, the Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Poland, Portugal, the Slovak Republic, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey, the United Kingdom and the United States. The Commission of the European Communities takes part in the work of the OECD.

OECD Publishing disseminates widely the results of the Organisation’s statistics gathering and research on economic, social and environmental issues, as well as the conventions, guidelines and standards agreed by its members.

This work is published on the responsibility of the Secretary-General of the OECD. The opinions expressed and arguments employed herein do not necessarily reflect the official views of the Organisation or of the governments of its member countries.

Also available in French under the title:
Études de l’OCDE sur les politiques de santé
Les personnels de santé dans les pays de l’OCDE
COMMENT RÉPONDRE À LA CRISE IMMINENTE ?

Corrigenda to OECD publications may be found on line at: www.oecd.org/publishing/corrigenda.

© OECD 2008

You can copy, download or print OECD content for your own use, and you can include excerpts from OECD publications, databases and multimedia products in your own documents, presentations, blogs, websites and teaching materials, provided that suitable acknowledgment of OECD as source and copyright owner is given. All requests for public or commercial use and translation rights should be submitted to rights@oecd.org. Requests for permission to photocopy portions of this material for public or commercial use shall be addressed directly to the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) at info@copyright.com or the Centre français d’exploitation du droit de copie (CFC) contact@scopies.com.
Foreword

This publication examines the relationship between the international migration of health workers – both within the OECD area and between the rest of the world and the OECD area – and health workforce policies in OECD countries. It assesses how the supply of health workers, particularly that of doctors and nurses, has adjusted to demand in different countries, taking account of migration among other inflows and outflows of health professionals.

The report is one of the main outputs of a project on health workforce policies and international migration, which was undertaken by the OECD in co-operation with the WHO between 2005 and 2008. This publication draws from and is the synthesis of various OECD analyses. First, it uses the findings of a chapter in the 2007 Edition of the International Migration Outlook on “Immigrant Health Workers in OECD Countries in the Broader Context of Highly-skilled Migration”, which had reviewed recent migration flows and policies for health workers in OECD countries, based on data on the stock of doctors and nurses by country of training/birth. Second, the report builds from case studies on workforce policies and international migration in Canada, France, Italy, New Zealand, the United Kingdom, the United States. Third, it reviews previous OECD analysis on the supply of physician services in OECD countries, ways to tackle nurse shortages, and the health workforce skill mix, as well as relevant policy studies and academic literature.

Within the OECD, the work has been undertaken jointly by the Health Division and by the International Migration and Non-member Economies Division, of the Directorate for Employment, Labour and Social Affairs. The main authors of the report are, in alphabetical order, Francesca Colombo, Jean-Christophe Dumont, Jeremy Hurst and Pascal Zurn. Christine Le Thi provided statistical assistance, and Gabrielle Luthy provided secretarial support. The team is grateful for the support and advice received from Elizabeth Docteur, Martine Durand, Jean-Pierre Garson, John Martin and Peter Scherer.
Acknowledgements

The OECD project on International Migration and Health Workforce Policies has been funded partly by regular contributions from member countries of the OECD. Additional voluntary contributions to the project were made by the following member countries: Australia, Canada, New Zealand and Switzerland.

The project was undertaken jointly by the OECD and the World Health Organization: one of the authors of this report, Pascal Zurn, is a WHO official who was seconded to the OECD to work on the project. We are grateful to the Swiss authorities for the financial contribution which supported this secondment.

The project has also been co-financed by a grant provided by the Directorate General for Health and Consumer Protection of the European Commission. Nonetheless, the views expressed in this report should not be taken to reflect the official position of the European Union.
# Table of Contents

**Introduction and Main Findings** .................................................. 9

**Chapter 1. Health Workforce Demographics: An Overview** ................. 13
  1. Cross-country variations and evolution of physician and nurse densities ... 14
  2. Projections of the demand for supply of doctors and nurses ............... 19
  Notes ............................................................................................. 21

**Chapter 2. International Recruitment and Domestic Education Policies for Human Resources for Health: Better Understanding the Interactions** .............. 23
  1. Education of the health workforce: fluctuating training rates under control .................................................. 25
  2. International migration of doctors and nurses .......................... 29
  Notes ............................................................................................. 37

**Chapter 3. Better Use and Mobilisation of Workforce Skills** ............... 39
  1. Retaining the health workforce .................................................. 40
  2. Enhancing integration in the health workforce .......................... 45
  3. Adapting skill-mix ..................................................................... 48
  4. Enhancing health workforce productivity ................................. 50
  5. Examples of useful practices ..................................................... 54
  Notes ............................................................................................. 55

**Chapter 4. International Mobility of Health Workers: Interdependency and Ethical Challenges** .................................................. 57
  1. Cross-national impact of the international recruitment of health workers .... 58
  2. International recruitment of health workers: ethical concerns ............. 63
  Notes ............................................................................................. 73

**Chapter 5. Conclusion: The Way Forward** .................................... 75
  1. Additional training ................................................................. 76
  2. Encouraging retention and delaying retirement .......................... 76
  3. Raising productivity ............................................................... 77
  4. Recruiting internationally ....................................................... 77

**References** .................................................................................... 79

**Annex A. Age Distribution of Physician and Nurse Workforce in Selected OECD Countries, 1995, 2000 and 2005** ............................................. 85
Annex B. Changes in the Numbers of Medical and Nursing Graduates and Numbers of Immigrant Physicians and Nurses in Selected OECD Countries, 1995-2005

Annex C. Medical and Nursing Education Systems in Selected OECD Countries

Boxes

1.1. Decreasing pool of young cohorts

2.1. Changes in intakes into medical education: the not-so-contrasting examples of Australia and France

2.2. Policies on the migration of health workers

2.3. Absolute numbers also matter

2.4. Modelling the determinants of the contribution of foreign-trained doctors to the health workforce

3.1. Approaches to the recognition of foreign qualifications

3.2. Retention of foreign-born health professionals

3.3. Factors and practices influencing professionals’ productivity

4.1. The consequence of recent EU enlargement on health worker migration flows

Table

2.1. The importance of migration of health professionals (except nurses) relative to all tertiary educated people, circa 2000

Figures

1.1. Practicing physicians per 1 000 population, 2005 or latest year available

1.2. Practicing nurses per 1 000 population, 2005 or latest year available

1.3. Change in practicing physician density, 1975-1990 and 1990-2005

1.4. Change in nurses density, 1975-1990 and 1990-2005

1.5. Real GDP per capita and practicing physicians density, 1975 to 2005 in selected OECD countries

1.6. Women physicians as a percentage of total physicians, OECD countries, 1990 and 2004

2.1. In- and out- flows into the health workforce

2.2. Number of medical graduates per 1 000 physicians, selected OECD countries, 1985 to 2005

2.3. Number of nursing graduates per 1 000 nurses, selected countries, 1985 to 2005

2.4. Immigration and expatriation rates of health professionals (except nurses) in selected OECD countries, circa 2000

2.5. Immigration and expatriation rates of nurses in selected OECD countries, circa 2000

2.6. Contribution of the foreign-trained doctors to the net increase in the number of practicing doctors in selected OECD countries

3.1. Regional variations in physician density

3.2. Change in skill mix between 1990 and 2005 or nearest year available
### TABLE OF CONTENTS

3.3. The relationship between general practitioner density and the annual number of visits per general practitioners ........................................... 52  
4.1. Share of foreign-born doctors and nurses originating from within the OECD area, circa 2000 ................................................................. 59  
4.2. Intra-OECD migration of nurses: a cascade-type pattern .................... 60  
4.3. Remuneration of GPs, selected OECD countries, 2004 or closest year available ... 61  
Map 4.1. Expatriation rates for doctors by country of origin ...................... 65  
Map 4.2. Expatriation rates for nurses by country of origin ...................... 66

---

**This book has...**

**StatLinks**

A service that delivers Excel® files from the printed page!

Look for the StatLinks at the bottom right-hand corner of the tables or graphs in this book. To download the matching Excel® spreadsheet, just type the link into your Internet browser, starting with the http://dx.doi.org prefix.

If you’re reading the PDF e-book edition, and your PC is connected to the Internet, simply click on the link. You’ll find StatLinks appearing in more OECD books.
The Looming Crisis in the Health Workforce

HOW CAN OECD COUNTRIES RESPOND?

OECD countries face a challenge in responding to the growing demand for doctors and nurses over the next 20 years. This arises in a world which is already characterised by significant international migration of health workers, both across OECD countries and between some developing countries and the OECD area.

What combination of human-resource management policies and migration policies have OECD countries adopted? How do migration and other health-workforce policies interact with each other? How can destination countries build a sustainable health workforce? What are the consequences of emigration of doctors and nurses for origin countries?

This book provides new evidence on each of these questions and identifies possible ways forward. It is the main outcome of a joint OECD-WHO project on the management of health-related human resources and international migration.

www.oecd.org/health/workforce

The full text of this book is available on line via this link:
www.sourceoecd.org/socialissues/9789264050433

Those with access to all OECD books on line should use this link:
www.sourceoecd.org/9789264050433

SourceOECD is the OECD online library of books, periodicals and statistical databases. For more information about this award-winning service and free trials ask your librarian, or write to us at SourceOECD@oecd.org.