Strength through Diversity:
The Integration of Migrants and Refugees in Education and Training Systems
Santa Cruz de Tenerife
15-16 November 2018
Francesca Borgonovi - OECD
Aims and Objectives

• In the first phase the project aimed to:
  – identify a new set of indicators to examine how societies have responded and are responding to the challenges to social cohesion posed by large scale international migration;
  – create improved data infrastructure that supports the development of strong evidence;
  – identify policy responses that have been pursued by countries and their results;
  – collect evidence on the conditions under which such policies achieve or do not achieve their objectives; and
  – stimulate a discussion among key stakeholders to support peer learning and strengthen collaboration.
2nd Thematic Policy Forum

Strength through Diversity
2nd Policy Forum, OECD, 21/22 September 2017

Teachers in Diverse Societies
Proceedings of the Second Policy Forum

Teachers in Diverse Societies
21-22 September 2017 Paris, (France)
3rd Thematic Policy Forum

In Collaboration with the GEM (UNESCO)
Learning from Data
12-13 February 2018 Paris, France
Collaboration with Department of Education and Early Childhood Development (New Brunswick) and CMEC (Canada)

Social Emotional Learning to Foster a Sense of Belonging for Immigrant and Refugee Learners

31 May - 1 June 2018

Fredericton, New Brunswick (Canada)
Sweden is experiencing a substantial increase in the share of newcomer students with different needs

Newcomer students are mostly concentrated in municipal public schools

- Promote lightly controlled school choice
- Provide clear criteria for weighted funding programmes to support schools with high concentrations of disadvantage

Training new and practicing teachers for diverse classrooms in the context of increasing student numbers and teacher shortages is key

- Provide specific diversity training to new and practicing teachers
- Adapt recruitment and teaching programmes for teachers with an immigrant background
- Offer support to teachers through comprehensive mentorships and expert teams to respond to additional needs of newcomer students
Language support for non-native Swedish speakers is an important challenge

- Promote specialised language courses by developing knowledge-based standards in the curriculum
- Expand mother tongue tuition and tutoring, also through greater use of technology
- Offer language camps and access to leisure centres to all levels of students

School communities need to respond to more diverse classrooms and promote inclusive education to all learners

- Implement a diversity-conscious curriculum
- Develop active citizenship education in schools
- Reinforce a whole-school approach to foster an inclusive school climate and culture
Migration flows are changing the composition of classrooms
Trends in the prevalence of students without an immigrant background

On average across OECD countries, 77% of students in 2015 did not have an immigrant background. In 2003 this figure was 83%.
Migration phenomena affect urban centres in particular

Average percentage of students enrolled in urban schools (in communities with more than 100,000 citizens)

- Native students
- Immigrant students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Native Students</th>
<th>Immigrant Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Israel</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD average</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iceland</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greece</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
How many students have an immigrant background?

Percentage of students with an immigrant background, by group

On average across OECD countries:
- 5% of students were first-generation immigrant students
- 7% of students were second-generation immigrant students
- 2% of students were returning foreign-born students
- 9% of students were native students of mixed heritage
Resilience and a whole child perspective

• **Academic** – reaching PISA level 2 in reading, mathematics and science
• **Social** – reporting feelings of belonging at school
• **Emotional** – reporting high satisfaction with life and low school-work related anxiety
• **Motivational** – reporting high motivation to achieve
Academic and well-being outcomes of immigrant students (OECD average)

- Academic under-performance
- Weak sense of belonging at school
- Low satisfaction with life
- High schoolwork-related anxiety
- Poor achievement motivation

Chart showing the percentage of students experiencing these outcomes: Students without an immigrant background, Second-generation immigrant students, First-generation immigrant students, Native students of mixed heritage, Returning foreign-born students.
Academically sound and socially and emotionally well-adapted students, by immigrant background

Percentage of students who attain baseline academic proficiency, report a sense of belonging at school and being satisfied with life
Differences in the percentage of academically sound and socially and emotionally well-adapted students, by immigrant group

Difference between students with an immigrant background and native students in the percentage of students who attain baseline academic proficiency, report a sense of belonging at school and being satisfied with life
Difference in attaining baseline academic proficiency, by age at arrival

Percentage-point difference compared to native students

First-generation immigrant students
Arrived at or after the age of 12
Arrived before the age of 12
Difference in sense of belonging at school, by age at arrival

Difference between native and first-generation immigrant students in the percentage of students who reported a sense of belonging at school.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Arrived at or after the age of 12</th>
<th>Arrived before the age of 12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>-50</td>
<td>-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>-40</td>
<td>-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>-10</td>
<td>-20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>-20</td>
<td>-30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovenia</td>
<td>-30</td>
<td>-40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>France</td>
<td>-40</td>
<td>-50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>-50</td>
<td>-60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>-60</td>
<td>-70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>-70</td>
<td>-80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD average</td>
<td>-80</td>
<td>-90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Italy</td>
<td>-90</td>
<td>-100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>-100</td>
<td>-110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>-110</td>
<td>-120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>-120</td>
<td>-130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>-130</td>
<td>-140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>-140</td>
<td>-150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>-150</td>
<td>-160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>-160</td>
<td>-170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>-170</td>
<td>-180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>-180</td>
<td>-190</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Percentage-point difference

First-generation immigrant students
Arrived at or after the age of 12
Arrived before the age of 12
Individual and household factors that shape vulnerability

- Country of origin (and destination)
- Gender
- Working (paid and unpaid work)
- Enrolment in ECEC
- Language spoken at home
- Family socio-economic condition
- Parental involvement
- School choice
The role of schools and teachers
Immigrant students are more likely to be the victims of frequent bullying.
Immigrant students are more likely to be asked to repeat grades after, nonsig

- Before accounting for socio-economic status and performance in PISA core subjects
Teacher's report needing professional development to deal with multicultural classrooms
Most students with an immigrant background and their parents are highly motivated to achieve and see education as a springboard for social mobility.
The share of migrants varies widely across countries.

The share of migrants in the population is very small (less than 3%) in Indonesia, Japan, Korea, Poland, the Slovak Republic and Turkey.
On average, migrants have lower skills proficiency than natives

Migrants are less proficient in literacy, numeracy and problem solving than native-born adults in all participating countries, except for Chile.

Wide cross-country differences are driven by differences in the composition of the migrant populations between countries.

Literacy proficiency, by place of birth
Migrants are a very heterogeneous group

**Literacy proficiency of migrants, by personal characteristics**

- **All foreign-born**
- **Native-born average**
- **Foreign-born who are native speakers in the host-country language**

Migrant’ skills proficiency vary greatly both within and across countries: they depend strongly on the place where they acquired their qualifications, the age of arrival in the host country, the duration of stay and the languages they speak.

Need for countries to adopt a tailor-made approach in terms of skills, training and integration programmes.
Migrants and host country language: variation across countries

- Share of immigrants who speak the host country language (%)
Language matters!

- Gaps in literacy skills between migrants and natives are on average 25 points...
  ... but are down to only 13 points if migrants are native speakers!

- Language proximity between the migrant’s mother tongue and the host country language also matters

- Language penalty is related to the age at arrival, but not to the length of stay in the host country
Literacy gaps between natives and migrants

- Migrant gap
- Migrant gap adjusted for age, education and gender
- Migrant gap adjusted for age, education, gender and language

Score-point difference

- Sweden
- Finland
- Netherlands
- Norway
- Denmark
- France
- Flanders (Belgium)
- United States
- Germany
- Austria
- Average
- Italy
- Canada
- Estonia
- Spain
- England (UK)
- Israel
- Lithuania
- Australia
- Northern Ireland (UK)
- New Zealand
- Czech Republic
- Greece
- Ireland
- Singapore
- Chile

Score-point difference range from -10 to 60.
Migrants and lifelong learning

• Adult training particularly important for migrants

• Differences in participation rates within-countries are small. What matters are between-country differences

• Migrants do express higher demand for training, and face higher barriers => higher *unmet* demand
Rates of participation in lifelong learning

Light grey bars/diamonds indicate countries for which the unadjusted difference in participation rates between natives and migrants is not statistically significant.
Barriers to participation

- Too expensive
- No employer support
- Too busy at work
- Inconvenient schedule
- Family responsibility

The chart shows the percentage of foreign-born and native-born individuals facing each barrier to participation.
Education for Inclusive Societies

• How education systems can support the learning and well-being outcomes of diverse populations and make systems more inclusive?
• How education systems can support all individuals so that they are able to engage with others in increasingly diverse and complex societies?
• **Dimensions of Diversity:**
  – Migration
  – Cultural/linguistic minorities
  – Special needs
  – Gender
Thank you!

For more information:

Francesca.Borgonovi@oecd.org  Lucie.Cerna@oecd.org  Diana.Tramontano@oecd.org

http://www.oecd.org/edu/school/strength-through-diversity.htm