

**Papua New Guinea
Media Development Initiative 2
AidWorks Initiative No: INF757**

Evaluation Report

FINAL

12 May 2010

Aid Activity Summary

Aid Activity Name	PNG Media Program (Media Development Initiative) - 038K0K
AidWorks initiative number	INF757
Commencement date	4 January 2005 ¹
Completion date	30 June 2010
Total Australian \$	Main activity: \$10.32 million Satellite Distribution System: \$3.78 million <i>Total \$14.1 million</i>
Total other \$	Not applicable ²
Delivery organisation(s)	Australian Broadcasting Corporation
Implementing partner(s)	National Broadcasting Corporation
Country/region	Papua New Guinea
Primary sector	Democratic governance (media)

¹ AidWorks shows the start date as 23 September 2003. There are a number of small contracts in 2003 and 2004, most likely linked to the design process. The 2005 date is the date of commencement of the Record of Understanding between AusAID and the ABC.

² GoPNG committed 21m kena towards the rehabilitation of provincial stations (needed to ensure the full benefits would be gained from MDI 2, particularly the satellite distribution system) but most of those funds were directed elsewhere. As at 12 May 2010 there are indications the GoPNG may provide a further 15m kena for this purpose.

Map of Papua New Guinea

Provincial radio stations are located in the capitals of all Provinces:

Port Moresby (Central), Daru (Western), Kerema (Gulf), Alotau (Milne Bay), Popondetta (Oro), Lae (Morobe), Madang (Madang), Wewak (East Sepik), Vanimo (Sandaun), Wabag (Enga), Mt Hagen (Western Highlands), Kundiawa (Chimbu), Goroka (Eastern Highlands), Mendi (Southern Highlands), Rabaul (East New Britain), Kimbe (West New Britain), Kavieng (New Ireland), Lohrengau (Manus), Buka (Bougainville)



Key Dates

Dates	Event
23 September 2003	Early work on the design
November 2003	Project design team mobilised
November 2004	Project Design Document complete
1 January 2005 – 30 June 2006	Phase 1
1 July 2006 – 31 December 2007	Phase 2
October/November 2007	Independent Review
1 January 2008 – 30 June 2009	Phase 2, first extension
1 July 2009 – 30 June 2010	Phase 2, second extension
8 – 19 February 2010	Evaluation and concept design team in country

Acknowledgments

The team wishes to acknowledge the contribution made by all those who gave their time to provide feedback, particularly the managers and staff of the NBC. They also wish to acknowledge the work carried out by AusAID Post in organising the program.

Author's Details

Robyn Renneberg, Team Leader, Elliott St Consulting Pty Ltd

Yvonne Green, AusAID, PNG Branch, Canberra

Memafu Kapera, NBC, Deputy Managing Director

Jean-Gabriel Manguy, ABC International Projects, Observer

Table of Contents

Aid Activity Summary	2
Executive Summary	6
Acronyms	10
1. Introduction.....	11
1.1 Activity Background.....	11
1.2 Evaluation Objectives and Questions.....	12
1.3 Evaluation Scope and Methods.....	12
1.4 Evaluation Team	13
2. Evaluation Findings	15
2.1 Relevance	15
2.2 Effectiveness	18
2.3 Efficiency	27
2.4 Impact	30
2.5 Sustainability.....	31
2.6 Gender Equality	32
2.7 Monitoring and Evaluation	33
2.8 Analysis and Learning	33
4. Conclusions and Recommendations.....	35
4.1 Conclusions.....	35
4.2 Lessons learned	36
4.3 Recommendations.....	36
Attachment A: Terms of Reference.....	38
Attachment B: Evaluation and design plan questions.....	46
Attachment C: Source documents.....	49
Attachment D: List of people/agencies consulted	50
Attachment E: 2007 review action plan update	52
Attachment F: MDI Advisors	71

Executive Summary

1. Introduction

The Media Development Initiative (MDI) commenced in January 2005. Component One, delivered through Papua New Guinea's Media Council, provided support to media related and non government organisations through a flexible funding mechanism. It ended in January 2009. Component Two (MDI 2) focused on the National Broadcasting Corporation (NBC), strengthening its capacity as the national public broadcaster through its pre existing relationship with the ABC. MDI 2 is the subject of this evaluation.

The goal of MDI is:

To support an open and democratic media that gives voice to all Papua New Guinea citizens, provides nationwide access to information and culture, and delivers development content for the benefit of the people.

Its purpose is:

To increase the provision of quality media services that contribute to Papua New Guinea's stability and prosperity.

The objective of Component Two is:

To strengthen the NBC to enable it to better play its strategic role in nation building.

The focus areas under MDI 2 have varied with each phase as needs and priorities have changed. They have addressed organisational development, program production, program quality, the digital archiving of historical materials and technological improvements.

2. Findings

MDI 2 has been very successful in contributing to the development of the NBC 'to better play its strategic role in nation building'. The project has built on the strengths of the NBC organisation, facilitating improvements in governance, planning, leadership and management and organisational culture. Most importantly, it has had a significant impact on the quality of NBC programming – people in rural and remote areas now have a much greater voice through improvements in the way programs are delivered and the way audiences are able to participate. Through the successful archiving activity, socially and historically valuable materials have been transferred to a medium which will provide better access and use. The satellite system will, when implemented, ensure that every province receives high quality transmission of national radio.

Through the considerable resources of the ABC, the NBC has had access to advisors with extensive experience in public interest broadcasting covering a broad spectrum of technical areas including governance, leadership, archiving, project management, youth radio, talk back and flow programming. The obvious esteem in which the ABC is held in PNG and at the NBC has no doubt contributed to the capacity of those advisors to establish rapport and to achieve good outcomes. There have been some challenges in relation to management and

administration of MDI 2 that highlight the need to ensure all those involved in a partnership model of development are clear about what is expected and required.

(There is a) general feeling the NBC has lifted its game in the recent past:

- Signal quality and consistency is improving (less frequent ‘black spots’)
- New infrastructure is in place, so better sound quality
- Improvements to the quality of the presentation i.e. few mistakes by presenters, better pronunciation, clearer articulation
- The station is definitely moving in the right direction, and the most noticeable improvement is the change from Block to Flow style programming.

2009 Audience Survey p.70

3. Evaluation Criteria Ratings

Evaluation Criteria	Rating (1-6)	Explanation
Relevance	6	Public interest broadcasting can contribute significantly to development, particularly in PNG where 85% of the population live in rural, often very remote, areas. It has the potential to support almost all areas of development including democratic governance, civil engagement, education, health, gender, HIV and AIDs etc. NBC radio reaches significantly more people than any other form of media in PNG and that will be the case for many years to come.
Effectiveness	5	Considerable change has occurred in voice, reach and content. Rural people can now express their views on air, flow programming is providing interesting and informative programs on development issues and talk back is encouraging two way interaction between radio and its audience. The satellite system will significantly improve the quality of the signal to provinces and the digitisation of the archives is ensuring valuable historical cultural and social material is preserved.
Efficiency	4	The cost of ABC advisors is similar to that of other advisors (based on a recent AusAID study) but they bring with them the invaluable resources of the ABC. There have been some issues with program management and administration that have been addressed. The challenge for the program lies in managing a three way partnership rather than a purely contractual relationship.
Sustainability	4	Sustainability is fragile but likely in terms of organisational change, program quality and archiving. In these areas there has been a critical mass of change that should remain if/when the partnership concludes. Technical sustainability is of more concern. More work is needed to ensure that the benefits of the satellite system are realised – this includes the rehabilitation of the provincial network and the establishment of reasonable maintenances and asset replacement practices.

Evaluation Criteria	Rating (1-6)	Explanation
Gender Equality	4	Gender is clearly an issue on the agenda at the NBC. Gender issues were raised regularly with the team and examples provided of programs that tackled gender issues. Additional work is needed to ensure broadcasters provide accurate information on gender related topics and have the capacity to integrate gender into their programs. . For example, gender issues are now often a topic of unprompted discussion in flow programming workshops. Additional work is needed to ensure broadcasters provide accurate information on gender related topics and have the capacity to integrate gender into their programs.
Monitoring & Evaluation	3	There have been problems for all partners with M&E. In the past, AusAID has not been happy with the quality of M&E, the ABC has not been happy with the M&E support they have received from AusAID and NBC has tended to stay outside the M&E process. The Steering Committee should go some way to addressing these issues as will a renegotiation of the partnership.
Analysis & Learning	5	The design was grounded in thorough analysis. The processes adopted by the ABC, particularly in the last two years have encouraged ownership and commitment from the NBC and aimed to build learning within the organisation.

Rating scale: 6 = very high quality; 1 = very low quality. Below 4 is less than satisfactory.

4. Lessons learned

- MDI 2 has worked across many aspects of the NBC. This has been necessary as organisations are complex systems that have numerous interdependencies - without sound planning, management, HR, finance and IT systems - changes to the technology and program quality will not be sustainable. There is a risk, however, that the scope and pace of change is too great. This has been offset by working on activities requested by the NBC that are aligned with their own plans. Future plans will need to maintain the balance between scope and pace of change.
- Partnership implies mutual responsibility and accountability. Future activity plans should include agreed milestones for all partners linked to specific outcomes (such as improvements in signal quality) to ensure that development funding is effectively used. Those milestones may not be funded by the project (for example, placement of personnel into vacant positions needed to sustain changes facilitated by the project) but are those that are integral to long term sustainability.
- The concept of a partnership was new to all when it was proposed in 2004. In hindsight, the project would have benefited greatly if a process had been put in place in the early stages to explore the nature of the partnership, what each party wanted from the relationship and what that meant in terms of how the project was delivered. Some of this has evolved as time has progressed. The lesson learned is that any partnership requires agreement up front about how the relationship will work and a process for reviewing the relationship on a regular basis is needed to ensure that issues are resolved before they become unmanageable.

5. Recommendations

- a) To ensure the work underway by MDI 2 is completed and that the changes are sustainable, it is proposed that the program be extended for a final two years to June 2012 based on annual plans, developed jointly by the ABC and NBC and approved by the Steering Committee:
 - Annual plans should include agreed milestones for all parties including NBC. (Note not all milestones will be funded by MDI 2, for example, provincial station rehabilitation.)
 - The focus should be on consolidating the successes to date, particularly technical improvements, leadership and flow programming with particular attention being paid to service delivery at the provincial level where services to the rural and remote areas are primarily placed.
 - The annual plans should be designed such that the level of support be gradually phased out over the two years, particularly TA support.
 - Where possible, alternatives to TA should be used to build capacity (for example, well structured exchanges or placement of a volunteer at provincial level).
- b) To ensure that the completion of the program in 2012 is well managed, it is proposed that as part of the planning for 2010, the partners develop an exit plan to ensure that the completion of MDI 2 does not impact negatively on the NBC.
- c) In recognition that longer term support to the media may need to continue, it is proposed that over the next six months the ABC and NBC explore, with AusAID, alternate means of providing ongoing support if required by the NBC.
- d) To ensure that partnership issues are properly managed, it is proposed that all three partners participate in a workshop to agree how the partnership should operate in future. The outcome of that workshop to be an agreement signed by all three partners. NBC is encouraged to take a leading role.

ooOoo

Acronyms

ABC	Australian Broadcasting Corporation
AusAID	Australian Agency for International Development
DNPM	Department of National Planning and Monitoring
EHP	Eastern Highlands Province
GoA	Government of Australia
GoPNG	Government of Papua New Guinea
M&E	Monitoring and evaluation
MDI 2	Media Development Initiative, Component Two
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
NBC	National Broadcasting Corporation
NGO	Non government organisation
PACMAS	Pacific Media Assistance Scheme
PDD	Project Design Document
ROU	Record of Understanding
SPSN	Strongim Pipol Strongim Nesen
TA	Technical assistance
TORs	Terms of Reference

1. Introduction

1.1 Activity Background

The Media Development Initiative (MDI) originated from a request for assistance from the head of the National Broadcasting Corporation (NBC) to the Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC) in 2002. After an initial scoping study by the Centre for Democratic Institutions, AusAID initiated a design mission to Papua New Guinea (PNG) in November 2003. ‘The terms of reference proposed that the mission consider a program of assistance, possibly using a contestable funding mechanism, to strengthen the capacity of radio and other media in some or all of the following areas: government-media relations, the regulatory regime, media effectiveness and capacity, public interest campaigning, public service media content, and community radio broadcasting’³.

The design team found that while there was considerable strength in the existing media sector its potential to contribute to PNG’s development was not being fully realised. The challenges identified related to access, voice and content. While the NBC was identified as an essential media provider in its role as PNG’s public broadcaster, its standards of delivery were assessed as below its potential. Guiding principles for the new design were shaped by PNG stakeholders and included ‘celebrating PNG’s many cultures and languages ... and overcoming the information divide by addressing the needs of people living in rural areas, particularly women and youth’⁴. The design was finalised in late 2004.

The MDI initially had two components:

- The first component provided support to media related and non government organisations (NGOs) through a flexible funding mechanism. It was delivered through PNG’s Media Council and ended in January 2009.
- The second component, known as MDI 2, focused on the NBC, strengthening its capacity as the national public broadcaster through its existing relationship with the ABC. This component is the subject of this review.

The goal of MDI is:

To support an open and democratic media that gives voice to all Papua New Guinea citizens, provides nationwide access to information and culture, and delivers development content for the benefit of the people.

The purpose is:

To increase the provision of quality media services that contribute to Papua New Guinea’s stability and prosperity.

The objective of Component Two is:

To strengthen the NBC to enable it to better play its strategic role in nation building.

³ Project Design Document (PDD), Page 6.

⁴ PDD, Page 7.

The purpose and activities under MDI 2 have varied with each phase as needs and priorities have changed. They have addressed organisational development, program production, program quality, the digital archiving of historical materials and technological improvements. They are discussed further in Section 2.2 of this report.

1.2 Evaluation Objectives and Questions

The team was asked to:

- Evaluate the activities of MDI 2 against AusAID's eight evaluation criteria - relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, sustainability, gender equality, monitoring and evaluation and analysis and learning.
- Develop a concept design for future support.

The Terms of Reference (TORs) for the evaluation are at Attachment A. The specific evaluation objective of the assignment was 'to assess the extent to which the agreed recommendations from the MDI's 2007 mid-term review have been incorporated into the initiative; identify issues that need to be addressed in the proposed extension to improve the implementation and management of the MDI through to 2012; and inform future support for media development in PNG beyond 2012'⁵. Suggested evaluation questions were provided to the team with the TORs. They were adapted as part of the planning process and documented in the Evaluation and Concept Design Plan. Those questions are at Attachment B. This report responds to the first two parts of the objective and a Concept Design Document is being prepared for AusAID that outlines proposed support after 2012.

1.3 Evaluation Scope and Methods

Prior to mobilisation the team reviewed relevant documents including:

- AusAID strategy documents and reports
- GoPNG and NBC plans and policies
- the MDI Project Design Document (PDD) and project reports
- the Record of Understanding (ROU) between AusAID and the ABC and its various amendments
- the strategic partnership agreement between the ABC and AusAID
- the November 2007 MDI 2 review and related responses
- the 2008 and 2009 Audience Surveys

The list of documents reviewed is at Attachment C. The team gathered data in Papua New Guinea from 8 to 19 February 2010. This involved the conduct of individual and small group meetings with:

- managers and staff from AusAID in Port Moresby and Eastern Highlands Province (EHP)
- managers and staff from NBC headquarters, the Central Province Radio Station in Port Moresby and EHP Radio Station in Goroka

⁵ TORs. Page 2.

- the two Deputy Provincial Administrators in EHP
- the ABC's project team leader, current in country advisers and the Melbourne based Project Director
- a wide range of government, non-government and media stakeholders including the Department of National Planning and Monitoring (DNPM) and the Media Council

In addition, a one day workshop was conducted with staff from six provincial stations. During the workshop participants were asked to describe the NBC before MDI 2 commenced and today after five years of support. They were asked to describe how the changes had occurred (through support from MDI 2 or other means) and estimate how much they thought the changes could be attributed to MDI 2. Results are recorded in the section on effectiveness. In total the team consulted with eighty nine people – forty eight men and forty one women. The list of people consulted is at Attachment D.

The assumptions that underpinned the evaluation were drawn from the TORs:

- that both AusAID and the Government of PNG (GoPNG) considered that there was value in supporting media for development
- that some progress had been made
- that AusAID has had some concerns about the management of the activity
- that there would be an extension of the current activity to June 2012
- that any support after June 2012 would be subject to a new design process

While not communicating directly with radio listeners in urban and rural areas, the team gathered data from surveys funded by MDI. In 2007, MDI funded the National Media Audience Survey (NMAS), conducted through the Media Council. The quantitative survey gathered data on all aspects of the media, not just public broadcasting. There are plans for its replication in 2010. In 2008 and mid 2009 MDI 2 funded qualitative audience surveys. Data from these surveys is included in this report. A third audience survey is planned, pending funding, for 2010. In the main, the team made its judgements based on feedback provided by NBC staff and other key stakeholders to assess whether or not the activity has resulted in improved services to people in rural and remote areas. The surveys offered some insights that supported the interview data.

1.4 Evaluation Team

The evaluation was not an *independent* evaluation as most team members had some links to the stakeholders or the activity:

- The team leader (Robyn Renneberg) brought a strong background in capacity development, review and evaluation. She has some design and some media experience. She was influenced by positive views of the ABC developed while conducting an evaluation with a similar ABC media program in Vanuatu in 2009⁶.

⁶ The 'Vois Blong Yumi' Program. Refer to the evaluation report dated 26 March 2009 and the 2009/10 annual plan.

- The Deputy Managing Director of the NBC (Memafu Kapera) brought extensive experience and knowledge in public interest media in PNG. He has been a strong advocate of the project since its inception, participated in an study tour in Australia funded by MDI 2 and has been heavily involved in its implementation at the NBC.
- The ABC observer (Jean-Gabriel Manguy) also brought an extensive background in public interest media through his work with Radio Australia. As a past employee of the ABC he was a signatory to the original Memorandum of Understanding between the NBC and the ABC, participated in the MDI design mission, provided several short term advisory services for MDI, has been involved in other AusAID media designs in the Pacific and was an advisor with ABC's Vanuatu media project. He is now employed by ABC International Projects Unit.
- The AusAID team member had no prior involvement with the activity. She brought expertise in AusAID policies, processes and practices to the team.

The team was aware of the risks associated with potential biases arising from their links to the NBC and the ABC and managed them accordingly. Strategies included: an initial discussion about the risks and challenges associated with a non independent evaluation team; a commitment from the team leader to ensure that the final assessments would be made independently by her and the AusAID officer based on the team's discussions; monitoring by the team leader to ensure that biased views were identified, challenged and discussed; and similar monitoring by the AusAID officer. Notwithstanding, there were very few occasions where biases were evident as the ABC and NBC representatives both brought a professional approach to the process, recognising that the NBC, the ABC and MDI 2 would all benefit from an open, honest and unbiased approach. Overall, the inclusion of key stakeholders on the evaluation team was a positive and constructive one:

- they brought established relationships with people in the media sector and credibility to the team which meant it was much easier to establish rapport with interviewees (and thus manage the large size of the team)
- they brought an intimate knowledge of the activity that enriched the team's understanding of the work that had been done and the challenges the activity had faced during implementation
- it helped strengthen the relationship between the NBC, ABC and AusAID by providing the forum to openly and honestly discuss issues
- it demonstrated the strength of a strategic partnership where three agencies have equal value and therefore are equal partners, not only in delivery, but also in evaluation.
- the review process was a learning experience for all and should improve the implementation of MDI 2 and any future support

2. Evaluation Findings

2.1 Relevance

To determine if the activity is contributing to the higher level objectives of the aid program outlined in country and thematic strategies.

2.1.1 Context and rationale

The planning context in which the program was developed was relatively weak:

- GoPNG's main plan at the time (the *Medium Term Development Strategy 2003 – 2007*) did not overtly identify governance or media as a priority.
- AusAID's *PNG Country Program Framework 2002* included objectives relating to enhanced quality of governance, broad based growth in rural areas and addressing the underlying causes of conflict and social stability. Media was not identified as a priority.
- A draft AusAID framework for engaging with civil society did specifically highlight the potential for the media in PNG to contribute towards improved governance.

The PDD records that the design for MDI built on the ideas presented in the draft framework for engaging with civil society. The rationale was⁷:

- A media for development initiative is potentially one of the most cost-effective investments that the aid program can make in helping PNG achieve its development priorities, through its role in strengthening governance, helping to address underlying causes of conflict and social instability, and giving support to service delivery, particularly in health, education and rural development.
- There is extensive international evidence that information and communication technologies can contribute greatly to reducing poverty.
- Specifically, an effective media sector can contribute to improved governance and service delivery, and decreased instability through:
 - Supporting public information and communication
 - Increasing the voice of the poor and marginalised in public policy
 - Supporting civic education and respect for citizenship rights
 - Supporting conflict resolution, peace-building and reconciliation
 - Promoting awareness of national citizenship, identity and culture
 - Delivering basic services to complement government service provision such as agricultural extension radio programs
 - Improving the effectiveness of existing basic service provision such as health information broadcasts on the availability of health clinics.

While media is not a priority in PNG's *Medium Term Development Strategy 2005 – 2010*, over the life of MDI the role of the media has become more explicit in some plans and strategies:

⁷ PDD, Page 12 -15

- Media is situated in *Pillar One: Improved Governance and Nation Building* of the *PNG – Australian Development Cooperation Strategy 2006 – 2010* (improving the capacity, outreach and content of PNG media and civil society organisations to deliver information and facilitate debate on public policy issues).
- AusAID’s 2007 *Building Demand for Better Governance* position statement and program guide outlines the important role the media has to play in development⁸.
- AusAID’s 2007 *Democratic Governance Strategy for PNG* aims to build on the demand for better governance by ‘strengthening the institutions of civil society and the state, and the relations between them’⁹ and cites media as a potential contributor to democratic governance.
- As a public service agency, support to the NBC may be inferred in the 2008 *PNG – Australia Partnership for Development* under *strengthening public sector capacity and improving transparency and accountability*.

In summary, it is evident that in 2004, support to the media was not a stated priority in GoPNG or AusAID plans and its value as a tool to support development was, in the main, inferred rather than explicit. By 2006 the role of media in development was incorporated into AusAID plans and continues to be included in 2010.

2.1.2 Objectives and design logic

The goal of the program throughout the five years of implementation has remained the same. In the first extension to Phase Two the original objective for Component Two became the purpose (it was based on the draft M&E Framework provided by the 2007 review). The focus areas changed at times, to reflect changing priorities. The following table shows the changes.

Goal	Phases	Purpose	Focus areas
To support an open and democratic media that gives voice to all Papua New Guinea citizens, provides nationwide access to information and culture, and delivers development	Phase 1: 4 January 2005 to 30 June 2006	To increase the provision of quality media services that contribute to PNG’s sustainability and prosperity.	1. Organisational development consultancy 2. Delivering quality programs 3. Strengthening the Kundu network 4. Digitising the archive
	Phase 2: 1 July 2006 to 31 December 2007	To increase the provision of quality media services that contribute to PNG’s stability and prosperity in particular to those in rural and remote areas of PNG	1. Organisational development 2. Delivering quality programs 3. Strengthening the Kundu Network 4. Digitising the archive
	Phase 2, first extension: 1 January 2008 to 30	To strengthen the NBC to enable it to improve the quality, distinctiveness, universality and efficiency of its programs.	1. Organisation development 2. Delivering quality programs and strengthening the provincial network 3. Digitisation of the NBC archive preserves national heritage

⁸ *Building Demand for Better Governance*. AusAID, 2007, Section 3.5. Page 9

⁹ *Democratic Governance Strategy for PNG*, AusAID, 2007, Page 4

Goal	Phases	Purpose	Focus areas
content for the benefit of the people	June 2009		4. Program management
	Phase 2, second extension: 1 July 2009 to 30 June 2010	To increase the provision of quality media services that contribute to PNG's stability and prosperity, in particular those in rural and remote areas of PNG.	1. Organisation development 2. Delivering quality programs and strengthening the provincial network 3. Digitisation of the NBC archive preserves the national heritage 4. Develop and maintain a sustainable technological infrastructure for effective content delivery and business processes

In preparing the above matrix it was found:

- The PDD provided a high level goal, purpose and objective and offers broad direction around four focus areas under Component 2. It suggested likely technical assistance (TA) to support each focus area and makes some suggestions about other capacity building strategies such as attachments. There were no objectives or performance indicators for the focus areas. This is reflected in the initial Record of Understanding dated 19 January 2005 that required the ABC to develop a Phase One Activity Plan (and an indicative Phase Two Activity Plan), with performance indicators, for AusAID's approval.
- The first Deed of Amendment to the ROU, dated June 2006, extended the program into Phase 2. The document provided TORs for advisors with specified deliverables/ milestones for each. Again, an activity plan was required.
- The May 2008 Deed of Amendment that extended Phase 2 to June 2009 continued to refer to focus areas. An activity plan for the extension in logframe format was attached to the Deed which appears to have been drawn from the report of the 2007 review.
- Similarly, the second Phase 2 extension includes a log frame that provides some basis on which to evaluate the program.

In terms of design logic, the PDD proposed progressive engagement. The intent was that during Phase One there would be a focus on the development of quality radio programs and a comprehensive organisational assessment of the NBC. The results of the assessment were intended to inform the activities to be pursued in Phase Two¹⁰. The design recognised the important role of the NBC in development.

The NBC is already positioned as THE source for information on social issues... It has the credibility and authority lacking in other stations, and the permission to explore sensitive issues (sensitively and with prior warning) on-air ...

2009 Audience Survey p.80

Conceptually, proposed process was sensible given the need to ensure ongoing support would be based on actual need determined by the NBC and ABC. At a strategic level the focus areas seem relevant given the needs of the NBC at the time. In hindsight they were too broad - a review of the progress reports indicates that the project has worked across many aspects of the

¹⁰ ROU dated 19 January 2005, Section 1.

NBC, sometimes (in the early days) doing the work, sometimes building capacity. MDI 2 has been flexible and responsive. It has also lacked the clarity and direction that could have been provided by more focussed objectives provided at the time of design.

2.1.3 Form of aid

The form of aid is a partnership, based on a long term (and pre existing) relationship between the ABC and the NBC. It is underpinned by strong personal relationships and the considerable experience and expertise of the ABC in public service broadcasting throughout the Pacific. While it is not a twinning program, it does share many of the characteristics, and benefits, of twinning including access to the considerable resources of the ABC. The intent was to establish a new, innovative means of supporting the NBC without the limitations traditional models of design have placed on aid projects. However, as discussed in the previous section, the lack of objectives has most likely disadvantaged both the NBC and the ABC.

It is important to recognise that MDI 2 *has* resulted in many positive changes at the NBC even though the partnership approach has been challenging. It is possible the project could have been even more successful if AusAID, the ABC and the NBC better understood at the beginning how the partnership should function. This discussed further later in this report.

2.2 Effectiveness

To determine whether the activity is on track to achieve its objectives.

2.2.1 Goal, purpose and objective

It is the team's view that MDI 2 has contributed to the overarching goal and purpose of the MDI program¹¹. It has also contributed significantly to the achievement of the objective of Component Two – to strengthen the NBC to enable it to better play its strategic role in nation building. While the degree of contribution to the goal and purpose is difficult to judge, it is reasonable to say that MDI 2 has supported improvements in access, voice and content through its work with PNG's public interest radio network.

Through these improvements (detailed in the following sections) more Papua New Guineans have the opportunity to express their views publicly on issues to do with development including democratic governance, more people in rural and remote areas have access to radio, and better quality programming is providing listeners with more interesting and interactive programs on development issues. In addition, listeners are receiving information on development issues such as health and education which should contribute to an improved quality of life.

In terms of the objective, the NBC is better able to contribute to development in PNG and more able to make contributions to nation building through improvements in many aspects of its operations.

¹¹ Goal: to support an open and democratic media that gives voice to all Papua New Guinea citizens, provides nationwide access to information and culture, and delivers development content for the benefit of the people.

In general, the picture on performance indicators remains positive for NBC, with some key improvements from 2008 to 2009 in the area of:

- Signal reliability and quality - NBC have a slight edge here and are gaining ground
- Information provision - NBC continue to dominate this territory, with further improvement
- Entertainment provision - very positive signs (NBC 'Absolutely Excellent' rating up by 37%)
- PNG traditional culture - NBC still dominant on this indicator, and gaining more ground
- Truth and accuracy - no change in this area and similar ratings for NBC and competitors

2009 Audience Survey p.131

These improvements are also detailed below. The 2004 design document has been used as the main tool to provide the baseline information on which the changes have been assessed and survey data is noted where relevant.

2.2.2 Organisational development

In 2004 the design team found that the NBC was an organisation with strengths to build on¹²: a Managing Director prepared to tackle change; a few well-managed provincial radio stations; some very committed individuals; and relatively good financial resources, with a total budget in 2004 of K8.3million.

It also identified a range of weaknesses including: poor management of resources; poorly structured staffing; a bureaucratic, process-oriented culture; a lack of focus by some on the core business of the NBC; a need for management training; poor legislation; issues with some provincial government interference in editorial content and lack of financial support; decreasing audiences; and increasing competition from new media outlets. The design team also identified a range of technical problems, a lack of basic equipment and a lack of audience research.

Over the five years of the program, work has been carried out on almost all areas of concern and there are signs of positive organisational change. Highlights include:

- The relatively new Board is developing its capacity to fulfil its governance role and responsibilities through training and coaching provided by MDI 2. These improvements are shown in the minutes of Board meetings and are verified by the Chair and Deputy Chair.
- According to managers and staff, a planning culture is developing. A Corporate Plan was developed with MDI 2 support in 2006/2007. While the advent of television impacted on the relevance of the plan's priorities it was a good starting point for building an understanding of the value planning can bring to an organisation. Work commenced this month on a new Corporate Plan and the process should reinforce the lessons learned from the last plan. Participants from the leadership program demonstrated an understanding of the important role planning has to play in achieving outcomes and some have begun to implement planning processes in their own work areas. Operational staff is learning about the importance of planning through flow programming and talk back training – both emphasise the importance of planning to produce quality programs.
- Considerable work has been done to design a new structure for NBC to ensure its resources are aligned with its business priorities¹³. Participatory processes were used to

¹² PDD, Section 5.6, Page 27.

¹³ Administration and Operations Structure Review. Report No. 3. March 2009.

encourage buy-in from managers and staff. This approach was successful in gaining acceptance for change as indicated by the number of staff who wanted to know what was happening with the structure during the team's interviews. Unfortunately little has occurred to implement the changes and staff and management frustrations were evident.

- Feedback from the participants and their staff suggest the leadership and management training has very successfully built the capacity of selected middle managers to be leaders and 'champions for change'. The challenge now lies in translating the learning into long term positive outcomes in the workplace. While there is a cadre of NBC middle managers who are committed and ready for change they are being constrained by some senior managers who do not support change and by some junior staff who do not want to change.

From participants on the leadership program:

- We are not waiting for the Executive to change ... we are doing things anyway
 - We are implementing what we learnt on the program
 - We told our boss we want to make changes ...
 - I've just told myself, I have to take the lead here ... let's just do it ...
 - Our supervisor's job is vacant ... but we have been able to do the work anyway ...
- There have been some improvements in the coordination and operations of the Kundu (provincial) network but there is still a lot of work to be done to ensure that provincial stations have the capacity to provide radio to rural and remote areas. Some of this relates to equipment and falls, primarily, within the responsibility of the NBC; some relates to knowledge and skills which the ABC can help develop.
 - There have been some improvements in financial management, particularly financial reporting, although this has been compromised by the loss of the Executive Director, Finance, the lack of skilled staff and the challenges associated with implementing the current finance system (Attache).

Provincial staff talking about changes to NBC since 2004:

- The MD has a vision and used MDI 2 to implement that vision
- NBC is generally more organised now
- There is better planning for the organisation
- We have a greater sense of direction
- We have better team work and it is emphasised and enforced by some managers
- Leadership has been fostered through the leadership program
- There is more interaction between management and staff
- There are better channels of communication
- The new structure will be good if it is implemented

Percentage of these change attributed to MDI 2: 80 – 100%

There are still many organisational issues that need attention:

- Consolidation of the positive changes detailed above is needed to ensure the changes are sustainable.
- Resolution of the issues to do with powers of the Board either through revised legislation or an agreement between the Board and NBC senior management on their respective roles and responsibilities.

- The development of the new Corporate Plan and the cascading of the plan into divisional and provincial plans.
- The development of human resource policies and systems particularly: a workforce plan (the NBC has an aging workforce and will soon lose many of its trained staff); the introduction of a performance management system (poor performance continues to be a major issue); and the implementation of the new structure (to ensure an alignment of plans and resources).
- The development of a strategy and processes to support training across the NBC. Currently virtually no structured training is provided to staff by NBC – on or off the job – other than that provided through MDI 2. This is particularly important for those involved in the production and delivery of programs and for technical staff. This should include finding a ‘home’ for the leadership training program (talks have been underway with Divine Word University).
- NBC needs support to facilitate its transformation into a corporation that is required to generate a considerable amount of its own income.
- There is a need for effective management of assets, particularly transmission and broadcasting infrastructure, information technology and buildings. (The team received very mixed stories about what equipment was, and was not, working. A full and accurate stock take is required to establish the current situation.)

2.2.3 Program production/program quality

In 2004 the design team found¹⁴:

- A major strength of the NBC was that it had programs dedicated to popular health, education, agriculture and governance issues. The national network, Radio Karai, broadcast news and current affairs, sport and music and national development programs.
- This strength was also reflected in the programs of the provincial radio stations. The six stations visited by the design team showed a strong focus on health, education, agriculture, women, youth, politics and church issues.
- However, at the NBC, production quality was poor – for example, interviews with government ministers could deteriorate into extended monologues. Few programs reflected life in PNG’s villages or had interviews with people talking about their life concerns and aspirations. At worst, much of the programming relied on ‘spinning discs’ – popular songs from the 1970s that reflected an aging record library rather than public interest.

In the early phases, MDI 2 supported the production of two high quality programs that addressed social and cultural issues (*Maus Blong Ples* and *Kunai Strit*). This function was novated to NBC in 2008 and, unfortunately, little has been done since then. The *Maus Blong Ples* program ceased because its national coordinator and producer, an experienced and professional broadcaster, was moved out of NBC Radio to help establish Kundu TV. The program was simple in its concept and cheap to produce. It is planned to produce a bimedia radio - television version of it in the future.

¹⁴ PDD, Section 5.4.2, Page 25

The *Kunai Street* drama series remains very popular across PNG as its episodes continue to be replayed on national and provincial radio. Its production appears to have ceased because it is costly and relatively complex to deliver as evidenced by the problems the NBC suffered with scripts, actors and budget. While program development remains a priority it needs to be in a more sustainable format and enjoy the required commitment from NBC management.

Support has also been provided for the establishment of a youth radio station (The Tribe) to provide a forum for the 50% of the PNG population who are under the age of twenty. The arguments that youth comprises a significant target audience for the NBC, that they are more likely to respond to new ideas and new ways of doing things (and thus are more likely to respond to governance and development issues) and that they are the future of PNG are compelling. MDI has provided support for the development of The Tribe strategy and provided training for Tribe staff members through a study tour in Australia and a program in Port Moresby.

Feedback from provinces suggests that where program changes have been made they have 'opened up the airwaves' as the format encourages and supports audience involvement. There is some indication that government is listening (for example, a senior bureaucrat rang to respond to issues raised on a recent talk back show). There are stories of success. NBC staff talked of programs that have covered domestic violence, same sex relationships, HIV and AIDS, health and education. The role of radio in democratic governance cannot be underestimated. According to the 2009 survey *'people are sick of hearing from parliament and want to hear political commentary. They see the radio as a potential platform through which to be educated and hold those in power accountable. Importantly, people are increasingly distrustful of big men controlled institutions'*.¹⁵

One station manager talked about the potential for talk back and flow programming to bring *emotion* to radio and gave the example of a day where children who had been abused were invited to tell their stories on air - the audience response was overwhelming. In one province the administration began using NBC radio to keep people informed about provincial services such as health and education - provincial administrators talked about the considerable reduction in people coming in from the villages seeking information and they envisage even greater benefits with the introduction of talk back radio to work with their communities. The World Health Organisation told of their positive experience with NBC during the cholera epidemic in Morobe. NBC (with support from MDI 2 advisors) participated in the joint task force established to tackle the issue. It was the main means of getting accurate messages out to the rural areas through news stories, talkback programs and short dramas. It is likely that lives were saved.

Provincial staff talking about changes to NBC since 2004:

- Programs are largely improved – they are now far more attractive - this is a result of the training and our change to flow programming
- Our programs have better content and are more audience focussed
- We now address issues for women and youth (we didn't before)
- We have better program planning and better teamwork around our programs
- There is a lot more listener interaction
- More issues are covered and we have different stories every day instead of replaying the same ones over

¹⁵ 2009 Audience Survey presentation. p.12.

and over

- Sponsors are more interested
- We are more professional

Percentage of these change attributed to MDI 2: 100%

Flow programming training has been delivered in all but one province (where there is currently no station building). Feedback from the advisor conducting the training and from staff interviewed during the evaluation indicates that the majority of NBC staff is very enthusiastic about the change. Rather, in a few cases, it is the lack of local management support for the change that is impacting on implementation. Work is still needed to:

- Build provincial radio station management commitment to implementing the changes where resistance remains
- Continue to build on the capacity of national and provincial staff to implement quality flow programming and talkback radio.
- Build a program bank of content to be used as needed, using a process that is cost effective and sustainable.
- Support the establishment of The Tribe.

2.2.4 Archiving

In 2004, the design team found that NBC archives that recorded the songs and dances of village people and significant historical events (such as speeches made during the Second World War and at Independence) were not in a useable format and were slowly perishing. Storage facilities were unsound and, due to the lack of resources, tapes of significant cultural and historical recordings were being erased and reused. There was little appreciation of the importance and potential use of archives.

Under MDI 2:

- The archives at NBC headquarters have been culled and reorganised in preparation for digitisation.
- The library has been refurbished to ensure the materials are safely stored.
- Computers and archiving equipment has been purchased for all sites.
- Staff at headquarters and from each province has been trained in the digitisation process.

Considerable progress has been made in archiving historical materials at head quarters - archives staff estimate 50% of materials at NBC head quarters have now been transferred onto compact disks (CDs). Progress in provinces is variable – some have been committed to the process, others have not and in some cases, the lack of basic materials such as ink for the labels is hindering progress.

Importantly, NBC staff now understands the importance of archiving and the valuable role historical materials have to play in maintaining the culture of PNG.

Provincial staff talking about changes to NBC since 2004:

- More attention is now being paid to archiving
- Officers are trained in archiving
- There is slow progress in the provinces in archiving
- People now understand importance of archiving
- Student can now use our materials for research into our culture

Percentage of these change attributed to MDI 2: 100%

Work is needed to:

- Complete the archiving process at headquarters and in the provinces.
- Ensure the systems are in place to guarantee that all relevant new programs are digitised for future use.
- Develop the capacity of NBC staff to integrate the archived materials into their programs.

It is noted that NBC will need to meet its commitment to appoint a permanent supervisor for the archives so that it is in a position to take full responsibility for the function in July 2010 as proposed.

2.2.5 Provincial content and quality

In 2004, the design team found that the media failed to adequately cover the views, concerns, aspirations and culture of the vast majority of the population who lived outside the urban centres. Reasons they identified included¹⁶: NBC journalists lacked basic equipment like portable recorders with which to record the views of people; NBC provincial radio journalists used to accompany government patrols to villages but were no longer able to do so due to lack of resources; NBC provincial radio stations did not generally share content with NBC nationally because the network was defunct; talk back radio relied on telephone calls which, at that time, excluded the overwhelming majority of the population from participation; and few forums were held where the voice of people could be pre-recorded, commenting on issues of public interest. The 2007 NMAS survey confirmed that there were significant reach issues for those in rural areas – while audiences in urban areas were well catered for by commercial radio and by the national broadcaster, audiences in rural areas were very poorly serviced.

With support from MDI 2:

- There is increased provincial content being distributed through national radio. In particular, the national news has been restructured to ensure that provincial news is integrated into its broadcasts. Provinces are using the internet to send audio files through to the central news desk.
- More and more, due to flow programming, talkback, the expansion of the mobile phone network and the accessibility and reduced cost of mobile phones, callers are accessing national and provincial radio programs from all over the country to have their voices heard.

¹⁶ PDD, Section 5.4.2, Page 24

- Provinces have received some equipment to support better gathering of information and content from rural communities including Marantz recorders and computer equipment for production.
- For the first time ever, many NBC provincial journalists and broadcasters have had the opportunity to meet face to face, through shared training opportunities, and build the personal contacts essential to sustain a viable national network.
- NBC managers, in particular the Executive Director of the under resourced provincial Kundu network, have been provided with the opportunity to gain first hand knowledge of issues in the provincial stations and to provide much needed encouragement to isolated teams of broadcasters.
- Many provincial stations have developed a new sense of professional pride and commitment to the values of public interest broadcasting such as: the provision of essential health, agricultural and development information, the credible coverage of political issues, culturally appropriate programming, the opportunity for public debate and public scrutiny.

The 2009 audience survey confirmed that MDI 2's support to provincial stations was appropriately targeted: rural audiences considered reliable radio reception as a social right as important as access to health and education (confirming MDI 2's attention to reception); news was identified as high priority (confirming MDI 2's attention to improvements in news and current affairs); young people confirmed that their listening needs were not being met by the national broadcaster (confirming the support for The Tribe); the flow format was appreciated as it made information more interesting and accessible; and talkback radio was strongly supported. The 2009 survey also showed that the needs and interests of rural and urban audiences were very different confirming the need to support both national radio and the Provincial network.

There is still much to be done to improve rural access to radio:

- The infrastructure and equipment issues that constrain provincial stations must be addressed, ideally through the roll out of the already planned infrastructure rehabilitation project which involved a thorough needs assessment in every province.
- Provincial staff continues to need support to develop their capacity to produce quality programs that can be fed into the national network.
- The staffing structure of provincial stations needs to better reflect the role of NBC as a public broadcaster rather than a bureaucratic arm of the public service.
- Structural issues regarding the funding model for provincial radio stations, and their reliance on unsupportive provincial administrations, need to be addressed.
- A rationalisation of the provincial radio network needs to be considered in order to insure its sustainability.

2.2.6 Technical improvements

In 2004, many remote and rural populations were not able to access NBC radio. Provincial stations were often off air and the mountainous terrain and atmospheric conditions often

disrupted radio signals¹⁷. In addition, NBC was utilising telecommunication lines that were very costly and often unreliable. Under MDI 2, AusAID has provided \$AUD3.8 million in funding to implement a satellite system that is designed to ensure reliable, high quality national radio transmission to all provincial stations. The new system should also result in considerable savings for NBC by reducing the current high cost of transmission through landlines. The rollout for the system has only just commenced after considerable delays. Feedback is very encouraging¹⁸:

NBC Western Highlands became the first provincial station to start using the new satellite distribution system on Monday 22 February. Technicians switched on the newly installed down link in Mt Hagen to allow the audience to listen to high quality digital sound after years of poor quality Telikom lines. NBC Western Highlands Station Manager Anna Pundia says they are taking hourly news bulletins, the current affairs program "Current Issues" and the weekly government talkback program from National Radio using the new satellite system. A second station, NBC Northern was switched onto the new network on Friday 26 February. NBC Northern station manager Elijah Naisorua says reception is loud and very clear and his listeners are delighted. He says the station has received very strong feedback from its audience. Mr Naisorua says he used the new system to relay the three hour National Radio broadcast of "The Tribe" on Saturday night. He is looking at taking a range of other programs from Port Moresby apart from the "must-takes" like news and "Current Issues".

MDI 2 has also provided computers and production equipment to provincial stations.

Provincial staff talking about changes to NBC since 2004:

- There has been some improvements in our production capacity because of new equipment and training
- We received 4 new computers but because of problems with viruses most aren't working anymore
- We have holes in our roof and the rain comes in
- Our transmitters need attention
- We have recording machines for interviewing people outside the station
- The studio network has improved

Percentage of these change attributed to MDI 2: 90 - 100%

There are still considerable concerns relating to technology. According to ABC advisors, NBC technicians and the radio Rehabilitation Plan, the equipment in the provinces is, in the main, unreliable and obsolete – where it is still operating it is due to the ingenuity of staff in doing repairs, including sourcing spare parts from all over the world. In addition, the station buildings are often sub standard and do not protect staff or equipment. While the new satellite system will direct a high quality signal to each province there is no guarantee that provincial equipment will be able to relay the signal to rural and remote areas.

In 2008 GoPNG provided NBC with funds for the rehabilitation of provincial offices. While NBC was supported by MDI 2 to plan the rehabilitation process little progress has been made and the funds are no longer available. A considerable amount of the funds were redirected to support the implementation of television. Funds were also used for other operational purposes. In 2010, reach and quality of the signal remains a significant issue for NBC radio. Encouragingly, indications are that GoPNG plans to release K15million to NBC for implementation of the first phase of the provincial office rehabilitation in the near future.

¹⁷ PDD, Section 5.4.1, Page 23

¹⁸ From Sue Ahearn, MDI 2 Advisor currently based in Port Moresby.

New forms of media

A further challenge for NBC lies in emerging technologies – it cannot ignore television, the internet and mobile phones. In 2008, NBC was directed by the Prime Minister to establish a television station. NBC was given a very short time frame and, to its credit, succeeded in setting up the station as directed. The station provides a limited television service to the Port Moresby area and nine provinces with plans to expand to the other ten provinces. Given the limited reach of television primarily to urbane areas AusAID has been reluctant to provide support for its implementation preferring to focus AusAID resources on radio as the primary media for development. However, AusAID does recognise that television is a priority for NBC.

At this stage it is not recommended that MDI 2 refocus its attention from radio but strategic support is needed to ensure that NBC is best able to manage the implementation of television as well as that of other new media platforms. As well as planning, support to television could be provided through learning activities shared with radio (for example, production, journalism, presenter training, news and current affairs training).

Across the media sector there is a move to multi media modes of delivery where one story is delivered through several different formats including mobile phones – this is the future of the media and cannot be ignored by the NBC or MDI 2. It also offers the potential to access those in the remotest parts of PNG.

2.3 Efficiency

To determine whether the activity is being managed to get the most out of the inputs of funds, staff and other resources, including continual management of risks.

2.3.1 Relationships/Agreements

The relationship between the ABC, AusAID and the NBC has been defined through two way agreements. There is an ROU between AusAID and the ABC that specifies the nature of the business arrangement, the scope of service and the basis for payment. There have been a series of Deeds of Amendment, primarily for extensions to the project. A Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the ABC and NBC was signed in 2005 that outlines the nature of the partnership between the ABC and NBC in relation to MDI 2. Importantly, it places overall responsibility for the project with the NBC as well as the ABC. For example:

3.2 Final responsibility for putting project plans into action will rest with the NBC

3.4 The ABC and NBC will jointly prepare milestone reports for Component 2.

It is evident that this shared responsibility has diminished during the life of the project as evidenced by the attention that is paid to ABC management of the project. The Deputy Managing Director confirmed that all activities delivered through MDI 2 were based on requests from the NBC. Importantly, there is no three way agreement that clearly specifies how the partnership will function, where responsibilities lie and how issues will be resolved between the partners.

The ABC was selected to deliver MDI 2 because of its long term, on-going relationship with the NBC (and other Pacific counterparts) and the unique skills and experience it would bring to the program as the leading national broadcaster in the Pacific. This places it in a very different

position to that of a managing contractor i.e. it is a valued partner. This partnership role is reflected in the 2008 *ABC and AusAID Strategic Partnership Agreement* which documents partnership principles including ‘valuing the contribution each agency can make’, ‘mutual respect’ and ‘working collaboratively’ and identifies the different skills and strengths each brings to the partnership¹⁹.

In 2003 when AusAID approached the ABC to become partners in development there was a great deal of discussion around new modes of delivery – the partnership was not intended to be a classic managing contractor model. This is reflected in the unstructured design for MDI 2 and the low level monitoring processes put in place (see Section 2.7). This lack of structure has, no doubt, contributed to some of the challenges that have faced the project.

As AusAID is under considerable pressure to be accountable for its funded programs it needs to be able to access quality information in a timely manner. The PNG Post has expressed some disappointment with MDI 2’s planning, administration and management and a review of plans and reports suggest that the standards of planning and reporting have not always been of a high standard. The 2007 review identified issues of concern to AusAID and recommendations were made to address those issues. This is discussed further below.

Late last year, the ABC responded to more recent Post concerns about management and administration. At an ABC workshop in November 2009 the parties agreed that both AusAID and ABC processes needed improving and strategies have been put in place that should ensure that both AusAID and ABC needs are met. It is important to note that this process did not include the NBC who should also play a role in the management of the project.

The role of the NBC in the MDI 2 partnership and the degree of ownership of the program by the NBC Executive is not clear²⁰. The plans and reports indicate that MDI 2 activities have reflected NBC plans and priorities (the team noted the reports to the Board on how MDI 2 is contributing to the achievement of the Corporate Plan). The imperative to implement television appears to have diverted attention, personnel and resources from radio and the work of the project which is of concern. However NBC clearly values its long term relationship with the ABC and expressed its desire to continue to access ABC resources and support.

It is timely that all three partners revisit the relationship and agree how they plan to work together. The GoPNG and GoA *Partnership for Development* provides a sound basis on which any agreement should be based:

Reflecting the agreement of the GoPNG and the GoA to the Port Moresby Declaration on closer cooperation and engagement in the Pacific Region this partnership for development is founded on mutual understanding and on the principles of mutual respect and mutual responsibility for improved development outcomes²¹.

The challenge lies in translating this into how the three partners work together on a day to day basis. The Steering Committee provides a forum, and the earlier ROU and MOU provide a foundation, for further discussion. *Importantly, partnership discussions will provide an*

¹⁹ *ABC and AusAID Strategic Partnership Agreement*. 2008.

²⁰ At the time of finalizing this report the NBC representative on this evaluation had become the NBC's acting Managing Director. He is already commencing to implement changes through MDI 2.

²¹ Go PNG -GoA Partnership for Development, Clause 1.2.

opportunity for discussions to be lifted above the level of project administration and focus on strategic direction, achievements and risk management.

2.3.2 2007 review

The review in 2007 aimed to improve the quality of the project. At that time both the ABC and AusAID had concerns about MDI 2's relatively unfocussed nature. The TORs for the review asked for guidance in relation to planning, governance, management and priorities for the proposed extension to Phase Two. Feedback suggests that the review process, although necessary, was not useful – the process it adopted was described as 'aggressive' and 'unhelpful' and did little to resolve issues between AusAID and the ABC. In some instances, the recommendations of the review moved into inappropriate territory such as making recommendations on NBC business.

Notwithstanding the above, the review report did raise a range of concerns that needed to be addressed and provided guidance to both AusAID and the ABC on a way forward. Major changes included the appointment of a team leader in PNG and a much greater focus on planning and monitoring and evaluation (M&E).

One of the objectives of this evaluation was to assess the extent to which the agreed recommendations from the MDI's 2007 mid-term review have been incorporated into the initiative. The matrix at Attachment E provides the answer to this question in detail – in summary, almost all recommendations have been implemented but more work is needed in a few areas as discussed in this report.

2.3.3 Steering Committee

The recently established Steering Committee is still developing as a management body. As well as making decisions on the project, the committee provides the ideal forum for partnership discussions and for 'health checks' of the partnership over time. It would benefit from the more regular involvement of the ABC's Project Director to ensure that the ABC has a strategic voice on the committee. It also provides a forum for the NBC to take greater leadership and ownership of MDI 2.

2.3.3 Technical assistance

Over the life of the project there have been eleven long term advisors (postings of six months or greater), four medium team advisors (postings of between three and six months) and fourteen short term advisors (refer to Attachment F for a list of TA). This is a sizeable number to work with a relatively small organisation of approximately 500 staff but reflects the broad scope of work carried out under the project. NBC confirms that advisors were based on NBC requests and needs identified in the Corporate Plan – that they were not initiated by the ABC. This is supported by the recent speech by the Managing Director who referred to his recent requests for the financial and human resource advisors and for a strategic advisor for the technical and engineering division.

Given the degree of change that has resulted from the work of MDI 2 it is evident that the TA has been well used. It should be noted that the advisers brought skills that did not exist within the NBC. In the main, advisors worked closely with local staff imparting their knowledge and experience with the ultimate aim of creating a skills base so that their presence was no longer

required. In the early days of the project, in a small number of cases, reports suggest that the TA ‘did the work’. This was identified during the 2007 review and addressed through revised TORs, improved selection, use of the same advisors where possible for repeat assignments to build relationships and trust, improved induction processes and participation in AusAID’s *Making a Difference* capacity development training.

Some comment was made about the ‘separateness’ of TA, given its location in its own office. Feedback and AusAID research into the effective use of TA suggest that the project would benefit from closer integration of TA with NBC staff, including co-location of advisors with their counterpart teams. Alternatives to TA (such as mentoring and exchanges) are being planned for the next phase. This is timely as the program winds down over the next phase - a planned reduction in the number of TA will support a graduated and sensible exit.

2.3.3 Risk management

The PDD’s Risk Management Matrix identified a range of risk that remain relevant today including those relating to ownership, planning, quality of service delivery and M&E. Risk management plans were developed for each phase and extension and the 2007 review provided an opportunity to revisit risks and reassess mitigation strategies. The Steering Committee provides the ideal forum to monitor risks on a regular, ongoing basis.

2.3.4 Cost benefit analysis/value for money

A cost benefit analysis was not conducted as part of the program design and the value of the long term relationship between the partners cannot be quantified. It is noted that long before the program commenced, the ABC provided support to the NBC, and it is anticipated that long after the program ends, the relationship will continue. Based on a recent AusAID review of the cost of TA, the cost per unit of TA for MDI 2 is similar to that of other aid programs being delivered in PNG through managing contractors. This cost does not, and cannot, include the ‘added value’ that a twinning partnership brings including access to ABC’s resources (for example, advice, expertise, training programs and human resource policies). The ABC is exploring alternate modes of capacity building which may reduce the cost of the project. They include supporting internal NBC capacity building by funding attachments and mentoring between headquarters and provinces and across provinces and more targeted attachments in Australia with return support to assist with the implementation of change

2.4 Impact

To determine whether the activity has produced positive or negative changes (directly or indirectly, intended or unintended).

While it is difficult to attribute development impact directly to the changes at NBC, anecdotal evidence and the 2009 survey suggests that the new flow formatting and the introduction of talkback is giving people in the rural areas a voice.

Talk Back injects the station with dynamism and modernity which it was found to be lacking in the previous round of research. NBC’s brand associations and ability to deliver locally focused programs mean that there is a much greater potential for listeners to actively engage with NBC Talk Back programs than programs from any other network.

2009 Audience Survey p.84

People now have the vehicle to express their views, raise issues of concern and demand feedback from their elected members. People are talking about issues that have rarely been discussed publicly before such as domestic violence, child abuse and HIV and AIDS.

One example of the likely impact on the lives of people is referred to previously in this report – the reduction in people visiting the EHP administration has had a positive effect on people’s livelihoods - not only are provincial administration staff freed up to do their work, villagers are saved the cost of a PMV fare and do not lose a days work in their gardens. The coordinated response to cholera is also likely to have resulted in a reduced number of cases. A challenge for the next phase of MDI 2 is to better capture the stories of impact. Conduct of further NMAS and audience surveys in 2010 should also provide impact information.

2.5 Sustainability

To determine whether the activity is appropriately addressing sustainability so that the benefits of the activity will continue after funding has ceased, with due account of partner government systems, stakeholder ownership and the phase-out strategy.)

Sustainability is likely, but fragile:

- While there has been considerable organisational change much is still needed to ensure those changes are sustainable. Importantly, there is a need to continue to support improvements in leadership and management – it is the leaders of the organisation who will ensure that new ways of doing things are embedded in the NBC. Sustainability is also threatened by the lack of sound human resource, information technology and finance systems and processes.
- Changes in program quality, particularly through flow programming, are likely to be sustained in those provinces where there has been significant buy-in to the changes and the equipment allows them to do so. In some provinces, there has been little training and equipment is a major concern.
- Improvements in the management and coordination of the provincial network are also fragile and require further support particularly given the importance of the provincial stations to those in the rural areas. The corporate structure to support the provinces is weak and will benefit from better resourcing.
- Archiving should be sustainable if NBC appoints a capable archives manager (the position has been advertised and the current MDI 2 Archives Advisor has applied). Support to archiving by MDI 2 should be discontinued from July 2010.
- Technical sustainability is of concern. NBC does not have a technical master plan and there is currently no strategy in place to holistically manage NBC’s technical assets. Much of the equipment in provinces is obsolete and accessing parts is a challenge due to unavailability and lack of funds. Offices are poorly maintained – one was off air during this evaluation because of air conditioning problems which could not be fixed quickly. According to one participant at the evaluation workshop

‘the medium wave transmitter responsible for the karai national program in the province was out of order since 2001 ... we are now using FM band transmitter of 500 watt power ...the

reception coverage is roughly over 100 kilometres radius and that may not cover those living in (the remote areas of the province).’ The person also stressed the importance of communication to both the technical and content areas - ‘if we continue to ignore dialogue then there will be no work plan money will be misused and Flow Program will be affected.’²²

- The team was concerned about the NBC’s capacity to maintain the new satellite links. Many of the computers funded through MDI 2 are so badly affected by viruses that they are unusable and the expertise is not available at NBC to resolve this problem. Overall, the development of NBC’s capacity to plan and effectively manage their technical resources should be a priority for the next phase.
- In terms of overall sustainability - a focus group of provincial staff suggested that approximately 30% of NBC are committed to the new way of working; about 10% to 20% will probably never change and the rest are waiting to be convinced. This is reflected at the senior management level. These statistics suggest that more work is needed to ensure that the changes under MDI 2 are sustained.

2.6 Gender Equality

To assess whether the activity advances gender equality and promotes women (considering the four dimensions of gender equality: access, decision-making, women’s rights, capacity building).

The analysis of gender and the media in the PDD is weak. The document touches on the likely benefits for women from a more effective media (better access to the media, being able to have their views heard, being able to raise issues and likely exposure of misconduct) and advises that ‘women make up a significant proportion of the media workforce and women have tended to outnumber men in tertiary journalism courses’²³.

The audience surveys provide some gender aggregated data and show that women have less access to radio and quite different interests to men in terms of content. The challenge for the NBC is to ensure that the interests of both men and women are met. MDI 2 gender strategies have included: above average inclusion of women on all workshops and development courses; gender issues raised in all training; all recruitment for short and long-term staff and advisers follow ABC employment opportunity policies which includes wide advertising to encourage women applicants²⁴; gender issues are raised with NBC counterparts whenever possible; and conscious emphasis on supporting women in more senior positions of the NBC. The recent ‘Gender Stocktake’ by AusAID provides evidence of recent progress in this area.

Anecdotal evidence suggests that radio is starting to tackle some of the hard issues, including gender based violence and violence against children. There is, however, a great deal of work still required to ensure that NBC staff understand the issues and have the knowledge to present programs that provide accurate and appropriate information. The Knowledge Management and Communications Advisor from Sanap Wantaim offered a model that could be used for gender that involved working with NBC program producers to help them think through interesting ways to cover the topic. They helped producers think of angles, identified potential talent and

²² From a report provided to the evaluation team.

²³ PDD, Section 10.4, Page 65.

²⁴ 36% of long term TA has been women; 50% of medium term and 29% of short term TA has been women; 80% of locally engaged staff have been women.

encouraged integration (in that case of HIV and AIDS) in all programs as well as through specific programs.

Given the potential power the media has in addressing gender issues, NBC staff would benefit from a greater understanding of gender and how a gender positive approach can be undertaken in management of the NBC and in the programs it delivers. Consequently, the NBC would benefit from assistance in the development of a gender policy, underpinned by gender awareness training.

2.7 Monitoring and Evaluation

To determine whether the activity's monitoring and evaluation system is effectively measuring progress towards meeting objectives.

While there has been considerable improvement in monitoring and evaluation (M&E), this is an area that would benefit from further work. Some baseline data is available to track progress - apart from the thorough analysis provided in the 2004 PDD, as already noted, audience surveys were carried out in 2008 and 2009 and another is planned for 2010. The Media Council plans to replicate the 2007 reach survey using through the 2010 census process. More information is needed on the quality and focus of programs and talkback (a program content analysis would be useful). In addition, there is a need to collect the stories that show the development impact of radio.

From a project management perspective, the Phase 2 Extension 2 M&E framework provides a good starting point for M&E, to be carried out by the Steering Committee. It provides outcome and output level indicators that can be used to track progress. Many are linked to TA. The Steering Committee needs to focus on the broader achievements of outputs and outcomes and encourage the use of various strategies by MDI 2 and the NBC to achieve those, rather than focussing on what each specific advisor does. Given that reporting is to be carried out using a template to be developed by AusAID, the opportunity should be there to focus on high level achievements and the management of risks at a strategic level. .

2.8 Analysis and Learning

To determine whether the activity is based on sound technical analysis and continuous learning.

The original design was based on sound analysis. The PDD thoroughly assessed the media context in PNG including its strengths and weaknesses, clearly outlined the challenges to media in voice, reach and content and described the benefits in development that can result from an effective media. The analysis of the challenges facing the NBC was reasonable but acknowledged the need for further in-depth analysis during Phase 1.

The PDD draws on lessons from previous work with the NBC through the *NBC Radio Development Project* and *Communications Sector Support Program* which achieved limited success. Key lessons included²⁵:

- Commitment from the Board and senior management is critical to success.
- Partnerships are very important for pro poor media for development initiatives.

²⁵ PDD, Section 6.6, Page 37

- Equipment fixes have been tried before and failed; financial and personnel issues are generally far more significant causes of poor performances.

Since 2004 AusAID’s support to the media, through the ABC, has grown. It funds bilateral projects in Cambodia, Solomon Islands, Vanuatu and PNG and has a regional program of support for the Pacific (PACMAS). These programs have had varying degrees of success and offer lessons for any future phases of MDI 2. As the ABC is involved with all of those projects, they are able to draw together the lessons learned for the benefit of MDI 2. The next phase should benefit from the findings of this review and the considerable body of work on capacity building that has been generated by AusAID in recent years.

3. Evaluation Criteria Ratings

Evaluation Criteria	Rating (1-6)	Explanation
Relevance	6	Public interest broadcasting can contribute significantly to development, particularly in PNG where 85% of the population live in rural, often very remote, areas. It has the potential to support almost all areas of development including democratic governance, civil engagement, education, health, gender, HIV and AIDs etc. NBC radio reaches significantly more people than any other form of media in PNG and that will be the case for many years to come.
Effectiveness	5	Considerable change has occurred in voice, reach and content. Rural people can now express their views on air, flow programming is providing interesting and informative programs on development issues and talk back is encouraging two way interaction between radio and its audience. The satellite system will significantly improve the quality of the signal to provinces and the digitisation of the archives is ensuring valuable historical cultural and social material is preserved.
Efficiency	4	The cost of ABC advisors is similar to that of other advisors (based on a recent AusAID study) but they bring with them the invaluable resources of the ABC. There have been some issues with program management and administration that have been addressed. The challenge for the program lies in managing a three way partnership rather than a purely contractual relationship.
Sustainability	4	Sustainability is fragile but likely in terms of organisational change, program quality and archiving. In these areas there has been a critical mass of change that should remain if/when the partnership concludes. Technical sustainability is of more concern. More work is needed to ensure that the benefits of the satellite system are realised – this includes the rehabilitation of the provincial network and the establishment of reasonable maintenances and asset replacement practices.

Evaluation Criteria	Rating (1-6)	Explanation
Gender Equality	4	Gender is clearly an issue on the agenda at the NBC. Gender issues were raised regularly with the team and examples provided of programs that tackled gender issues. Additional work is needed to ensure broadcasters provide accurate information on gender related topics and have the capacity to integrate gender into their programs. . For example, gender issues are now often a topic of unprompted discussion in flow programming workshops. Additional work is needed to ensure broadcasters provide accurate information on gender related topics and have the capacity to integrate gender into their programs.
Monitoring & Evaluation	3	There have been problems for all partners with M&E. In the past, AusAID has not been happy with the quality of M&E, the ABC has not been happy with the M&E support they have received from AusAID and NBC has tended to stay outside the M&E process. The Steering Committee should go some way to addressing these issues as will a renegotiation of the partnership.
Analysis & Learning	5	The design was grounded in thorough analysis. The processes adopted by the ABC, particularly in the last two years have encouraged ownership and commitment from the NBC and aimed to build learning within the organisation.

Rating scale:

Satisfactory		Less than satisfactory	
6	Very high quality	3	Less than adequate quality
5	Good quality	2	Poor quality
4	Adequate quality	1	Very poor quality

4. Conclusions and Recommendations

4.1 Conclusions

To date, MDI 2 has been very successful in contributing to the development of the NBC ‘to better play its strategic role in nation building’. The project has built on the strengths of the NBC organisation, facilitating improvements in governance, planning, leadership and management and organisational culture. Most importantly, it has had a significant impact on the quality of NBC programming – people in rural and remote areas now have a much greater voice through improvements in the way programs are delivered and the way audiences are able to participate. Through the successful archiving activity, socially and historically valuable materials have been transferred to a medium which will provide better access and use. The satellite system will, when implemented, ensure that every province receives high quality transmission of national radio.

Through the considerable resources of the ABC, the NBC has had access to advisors with extensive experience in public interest broadcasting covering a broad spectrum of technical areas including governance, leadership, archiving, project management, youth radio, talk back

and flow programming. The obvious esteem in which the ABC is held in PNG and at the NBC has no doubt contributed to the capacity of those advisors to establish rapport and to achieve good outcomes.

While the partnership between AusAID, ABC and NBC has, to some extent, lost its way the opportunity is there to revisit and renegotiate what a partnership means and how it should work, given the experiences of the last five years. There is also a need to review mutual accountability and responsibility with the NBC.

4.2 Lessons learned

There are several key lessons to be learned from MDI 2:

- a) MDI 2 has worked across many aspects of the NBC. This is necessary as organisations are complex systems that have many interdependencies - without sound planning, management, HR, finance and IT systems changes to the technology and program quality will not be sustainable. There is a risk, however, that the scope and pace of change will be too great for the NBC to absorb. This is offset, to some extent, by working on activities requested by the NBC that are aligned with their own plans. Future plans will need to maintain the balance between scope and pace of change.
- b) Partnership implies mutual responsibility and accountability. AusAID has funded a satellite distribution system to provinces – it is NBC’s responsibility to ensure that the satellite systems is properly utilised. The ABC has assisted with archiving - it is NBC’s responsibility to ensure the function is resourced so that the work continues. Future activity plans should include agreed milestones for all partners linked to specific outcomes (such as improvements in signal quality) to ensure that development funding is effectively used. Those milestones may not be funded by the project but are those that are integral to long term sustainability.
- c) The concept of a partnership was new to all when it was proposed in 2004. In hindsight, the project would have benefited greatly if a process has been put in place in the early stages to explore the nature of the partnership, what each party wanted from the relationship and what that meant in terms of how the project was delivered. For AusAID, it is likely that there would have been some non negotiables that had to do with planning and reporting; for the ABC there may have been non negotiables that had to do with respecting the unique relationship it has with the media in the Pacific; and for the NBC it may have been around respecting their right to shape the nature and focus of support. Some of this has evolved as time has progressed. The 2008 *AusAID ABC Strategic Partnership Agreement* touches on many of the issues for those partners and subsequent workshops have addressed specifics. For the NBC it is not so clear if their issues have been addressed. The lesson learned is that any partnership requires agreement up front about how the relationship will work and a process is needed to review the relationship on a regular basis to ensure that issues are resolved before they become unmanageable.

4.3 Recommendations

- e) To ensure the work underway by MDI 2 is completed and that the changes are sustainable, it is proposed that the program be extended for a final two years to June

2012 based on annual plans, developed jointly by the ABC and NBC and approved by the Steering Committee:

- Annual plans should include agreed milestones for all parties including NBC. (Note not all milestones will be funded by MDI 2, for example, provincial station rehabilitation.)
 - The focus should be on consolidating the successes to date, particularly technical improvements, leadership and flow programming with particular attention being paid to service delivery at the provincial level where services to the rural and remote areas are primarily placed.
 - The annual plans should be designed such that the level of support be gradually phased out over the two years, particularly TA support.
 - Where possible, alternatives to TA should be used to build capacity (for example, well structured exchanges or placement of a volunteer at provincial level).
- f) To ensure that the completion of the program in 2012 is well managed, it is proposed that as part of the planning for 2010, the partners develop an exit plan to ensure that the completion of MDI 2 does not impact negatively on the NBC.
- g) In recognition that longer term support to the media may need to continue, it is proposed that over the next six months the ABC and NBC explore, with AusAID, alternate means of providing ongoing support if required by the NBC.
- h) To ensure that partnership issues are properly managed, it is proposed that all three partners participate in a workshop to agree how the partnership should operate in future. The outcome of that workshop to be an agreement signed by all three partners. NBC is encouraged to take a leading role.

ooOoo

Attachment A: Terms of Reference

PNG Media for Development Initiative

Terms of Reference: Independent Evaluation and Concept Design

Purpose

To undertake an independent evaluation of the Media for Development Initiative (MDI) and develop a concept design for future support. This will inform a proposed two year extension of the initiative from July 2010 to June 2012; and future support to the MDI beyond 2012.

Background

AusAID maintains a strong governance program in PNG and is finalising its democratic governance strategy for PNG. This strategy is being developed within a robust policy framework in response to changing social and economic conditions in PNG, key lessons from the democratic governance program of support in PNG and emerging policy directions of both governments. Information is seen as a critical component of improving governance by building demand for democratic processes and institutions. Media plays a crucial role in the sourcing, development and dissemination of information.

Project description

The goal of the of the Media Development Initiative (MDI) is to support an open and democratic media that gives voice to all Papua New Guinea citizens, provides nationwide access to information and culture, and delivers development content for the benefit of the people.

The MDI initially included two components. The first component, which has been completed, supported media related organisations and NGOs through a flexible funding mechanism to manage and implement target area projects. The second component is focused on strengthening the National Broadcasting Corporation's (NBC) capacity as the national public broadcaster by building upon an existing partnership with the Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC). This arrangement is managed through a Record of Understanding (ROU) between AusAID and the ABC. Phase 1 of MDI Component 2 was completed in June 2006 and demonstrated capacity for deeper engagement between the NBC and the ABC. Phase 2 began in July 2006 and has recently been extended to June 2010. It is proposed that MDI will be extended to June 2012, informed by the outcomes of the independent evaluation, during which time a redesign will take place.

The purpose of NBC/ABC Partnership Project (Component 2 of the MDI, \$10.32m January 2005 – June 2010) is: to strengthen the National Broadcasting Corporation to enable it to improve the quality, distinctiveness, universality and efficiency of its programs to inform, educate and entertain the people of PNG. The overall objective is: to contribute to strengthening of the NBC's organisational capacity as the national broadcaster.

Four other major objectives, which complement the goal and purpose, are:

- To improve the organisational capacity of the NBC management team.
- To assist the NBC to produce radio programs that address a range of development and governance issues. To encourage the sourcing of program content from the provinces.
- To assist in the further digitalising of sound archives of significant historical and cultural value at NBC.

The NBC's first Corporate Plan, 2007 – 2010 was developed with MDI assistance and has strong local ownership. The Plan has helped provide the NBC with a clear direction and plan to take the agency forward into the future.

A separate ROU between AusAID and the ABC supported the installation of a satellite distribution system for the NBC to improve the reach, reliability and quality of the radio signal in PNG (funded at \$3.8 million from May 2008 - June 2010). Ownership of the satellite distribution system will be transferred to the NBC by June 2010. The ABC has noted there may be need for ongoing support to the NBC for the maintenance of the satellite. The review will consider whether additional support should be included in future activity plans for MDI.

Project performance

In late 2007 AusAID commissioned a mid-term review of the MDI. The April 2008 review report provided recommendations to improve the management and impact of MDI. Key recommendations included the need for the project to support further organisational development, to establish a Project Steering Committee/Board of Management, and to develop and implement a monitoring and evaluation framework.

The 2008 MDI review noted the strong commitment of project partners (AusAID, NBC and the ABC) and cautioned that sustainability of project gains remained fragile. AusAID, the NBC, and the ABC are committed to continuing to support the MDI, taking into account the lessons learned from assistance to date, and with consideration to sustainability.

The ABC reports to AusAID on a six monthly basis against output level progress indicators in the monitoring and evaluation framework, and overall MDI is achieving its stated objectives for the current stage of implementation. Achievements can be demonstrated through continued development of the media sector, digitising of archives, NBC program review, and support to organisational development focussing on implementation of the Corporate Plan. The quality of the monitoring and evaluation framework, and reporting against it, could be considered by the review.

Objective

The objective of the evaluation and concept design is to assess the extent to which the agreed recommendations from the MDI's 2007 mid-term review have been incorporated into the initiative; identify issues that need to be addressed in the proposed extension to improve the implementation and management of the MDI through to 2012; and inform future support for media development in PNG beyond 2012.

Scope of the assignment

The scope of the assignment for the team includes an independent evaluation and the development of a design concept note.

Evaluation and Concept Design

Independent evaluations of aid program activities provide information for AusAID's assessment of aid program effectiveness, lessons to AusAID and implementation partners on aid program management, inform design of new activities, and inform management of existing activities.

The objective of the concept design is to provide AusAID and project stakeholders with sufficient information to make a decision on the merits of proceeding with a design for future support to media for development; and to provide sufficient guidance for a design team to commence a design process.

The evaluation and concept design team will:

1. Conduct consultations including:
 - 1.1. With AusAID in Canberra and Port Moresby;
 - 1.2. With key stakeholders in Australia and PNG including the ABC, NBC, the PNG Media Council and PNG Government. This should include at least one provincial radio station, to be determined in consultation with the NBC; and
 - 1.3. With AusAID at the completion of the evaluation.
2. Undertake a desk study of all (but not limited to) documents listed in the Reference Documents in Section 8 of these ToRs.
3. Develop an Evaluation and Design Plan for AusAID approval. The Plan will:
 - 3.1. Be in accordance with the ToRs;
 - 3.2. Specify the evaluation and design approach;
 - 3.3. Detail the proposed evaluation and design questions and audience;
 - 3.4. Include a feasible timeline for undertaking the evaluation and design; and
 - 3.5. Specify team member roles and responsibilities.
4. Evaluate the activities of the MDI and develop a concept design for future support. The evaluation can draw on the evaluation questions at Attachment 1 as appropriate. The evaluation will:
 - 4.1. Be undertaken in accordance with the AusAID approved Evaluation Plan in 3 (above).
 - 4.2. Assess the MDI against the eight evaluation criteria defined in *AusAID's Guideline: Manage the Independent Evaluation of an Aid Activity*, which includes the five OECD/DAC criteria of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability, and the three additional AusAID criteria of monitoring and evaluation, gender equality and analysis and learning.
 - 4.3. Assess the ABC's level of achievement of activity outcomes, as described in the current MDI Design Document and ROU with AusAID, the nature and effectiveness of engagement between the ABC and NBC, and progress in capacity building (including the balance of 'in line technical assistance' and capacity building through MDI advisory support).
 - 4.4. Assess effectiveness and efficiency of the project management arrangements, including the recently established Project Steering Committee.

- 4.5. Assess the effectiveness of the project's reporting, including six monthly reports, monitoring and evaluation frameworks and risk management matrixes and if appropriate, make recommendations for improvement
 - 4.6. In relation to the forward-looking aspect of this exercise, consider:
 - a) the appropriateness of media choice and the opportunities and risks of supporting the NBC to use a broader range of media technologies, including television, through the MDI;
 - b) the relationships between the ABC/NBC and AusAID, and the capacity of the ABC to implement the program
 - c) recommendations for greater integration or alignment of the MDI into the NBC systems and processes, including the NBC corporate plan and audience research surveys;
 - d) whether additional support to the satellite distribution system should be included in future plans for MDI2;
 - e) recommendations for better integration of gender equality into the program (for example, options for gender specific activities or incentives); and
 - f) the training provided under MDI, and whether there is scope for greater engagement between ABC and NBC on training and/or re-establishing an internal training function in NBC.
 5. Develop an aide memoire that will:
 - 5.1. Be in accordance with the AusAID template for an aide memoire; and
 - 5.2. Be presented at the in-country debrief on the final day of the evaluation mission.
 6. Draw on 1-5 (above) to produce a draft evaluation report for the MDI. The report will:
 - 6.1. Be in accordance with the reporting requirements outlined in Section 7 of these ToRs;
 - 6.2. Synthesize and discuss the results of the evaluation of the MDI and associated outreach activities;
 - 6.3. Provide specific strategic recommendations to development of a 2 year activity plan for the proposed extension to MDI2
 7. Participate in AusAID's evaluation peer review, if required.
 8. Produce a final evaluation report for acceptance by AusAID. The final report will revise the draft report in 6 (above) to include comments from AusAID and other relevant stakeholders.
- In relation to the concept design, the team leader will:
9. Draw on the evaluation to develop a draft concept document for future support to media. The concept design document will:
 - 9.1. Follow *AusAID's Guideline: Managing the Development of a Concept*;

- 9.2. Be written in accordance with the reporting requirements outlined in Section 7 of these ToRs;
 - 9.3. Build from the Stage 1 evaluation to provide a brief and strategic analysis of the role of and rationale for media in building democratic governance in PNG;
 - 9.4. Demonstrate how the media would contribute to Australia meeting its commitments under the Accra Agenda for Action. The concept document should cover the questions at Attachment 2;
 - 9.5. Describe project management arrangements;
 - 9.6. Detail the design process required, including timeframes, resourcing, and any cross-cutting issues requiring further analysis during design (an exploration of gender issues and an initial determination on whether the activity will involve any personnel working with children are required, and it may be necessary to consider environment policy and legal compliance issues); and
 - 9.7. Provide an initial risk assessment to identify any critical risks that must be considered prior to proceeding to design or that must be assessed during design.
10. Participate in AusAID's concept peer review if required.
 11. Produce a final concept document for acceptance by AusAID. The final concept document will revise the draft in 8 (above) to include comments from the peer review.

Duration

	Team leader		Local consultant	
	Days Australia	Days PNG	Days Australia	Days PNG
Evaluation task				
Document review	2			2
Draft evaluation plan	1			
Briefing in Canberra	2			
Evaluation mission in PNG		10		10
Draft evaluation report	4			2
Participate and present at evaluation peer review in Canberra	1			1
Final evaluation report	3			2
TOTAL DAYS	13	10	0	17
Stage 2 – Concept development				
	Team Leader		Local Consultant	
Draft concept document	3			1
Redrafting after feedback from AusAID and other stakeholders	1			1
Participate and present at concept peer review	1			1
Final concept document	2			
TOTAL DAYS	7			3

Team members

The team will consist of:

- Team Leader: with evaluation and design expertise preferably in media and democratic governance;
- Local consultant with media, capacity building or civil society engagement expertise;
- GoPNG representative from DNPM (subject to availability); and
- AusAID (Canberra and/or Post).

The team skills will include:

- an in-depth knowledge of the media's role and issues in development in PNG;
- experience in program evaluation ;
- broad knowledge of working in PNG and with the PNG civil society and governments;

- excellent interpersonal and communication skills including a proven ability to liaise and communicate effectively with Papua New Guineans (including GoPNG officials);
- fluency in Tok Pisin in at least one member of the team;
- knowledge of and experience in AusAID program evaluation and design; and
- ability to provide timely delivery of high-quality written reports.

The team leader will be responsible for managing and directing all aspects of the evaluation including:

- coordinating with AusAID;
- coordination of other team members inputs to ensure the quality of all products;
- representing the team; and
- leading consultations with government officials and other donor agencies.

Other team members will work under the overall direction of the team leader and undertake and deliver the agreed in the tasks and products.

Reporting

All reports will be submitted in Word format using AusAID’s templates by email to the Evaluation Manager and according to the timeline in the agreed Evaluation Plan.

Reports	Format	Length	Due
Evaluation Plan	As advised by AusAID evaluation manager	No more than 5 pages	At the completion of the desk review and prior to the evaluation mission
Evaluation aide memoire	In accordance with AusAID Aide Memoire template	No more than 5 pages	At the end of the in-country evaluation mission
Draft evaluation report	In accordance with AusAID Independent Completion Report template	No more than 25 pages plus appendices	Within 5 working days of completion of the evaluation mission. Feedback from AusAID will be provided within three weeks of receiving the draft report.
Final evaluation report	In accordance with AusAID Independent Completion Report template	No more than 25 pages plus annexes	Within 5 working days of receiving peer review feedback from AusAID
Draft design concept document	In accordance with AusAID advice on preparing a design concept document	Approximately 10 pages	Within 10 working days of the evaluation and concept development mission
Final design concept document	In accordance with AusAID advice on preparing a design concept document	Approximately 10 pages	Within 8 working days of receiving comments from the evaluation/ concept document peer review

Reference Documents

The Team will need to read the following reference documents:

- AusAID-ABC ROUs and amendments
- ABC/AusAID strategic partnership agreement
- MDI Project Design Document
- November 2007 MDI Phase 2 Review
- Agreed NBC-ABC-AusAID response to the review, August 2008
- Relevant QAI reports
- Relevant GoPNG media and broadcasting documents
- NBC’s corporate plan, business plans and other corporate documents indicating programs, priority and governance arrangements
- AusAID’s Guidelines: *Managing an independent evaluation*
- AusAID Guidelines on developing a design concept document
- NBC Audience Survey 2009
- MDI project documents: six monthly reports, satellite reports, monitoring and evaluation frameworks, risk management matrixes.

Attachment B: Evaluation and design plan questions

Criteria	Possible questions	Stakeholders to be targeted
A. Relevance	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Were the objectives relevant to Australian Government and GoPNG given the context at the time of design? 2. Has this changed? 3. Was support for the media specifically acknowledged in GoA and GoPNG policies and plans at the time of design? Is it specified now? Where? 4. Were the objectives relevant to the context/needs of the NBC and the media sector in PNG? If not, what changes should have been made to the activity or its objectives to ensure continued relevance? 5. What should be the objectives/areas of support for the next 2 years? Why? 6. What are your views about the long term? Where does the future of the media lie in PNG? 7. Where should we focus of ongoing support (i.e. what are the priorities given that resources are limited) 8. Should support for television be provided? Other technologies? 9. Should there be additional support for the satellite distribution system? 	<p>AusAID GoPNG Media Council ABC NBC Project Steering Committee</p>
B. Effectiveness	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 10. Were the objectives achieved? What was particularly successful? What made it successful? (Ensure the goal, purpose and objectives are covered all off) 11. How successful was the training provided under the MDI? 12. What needs to happen next with training for NBC? An internal training function? 13. What were the areas where there was less success? Why? 14. What could be done to make ongoing support more effective? 15. How well has a capacity building approach been built into the work of the project? 16. Has there been any issues/tensions around in line vs advisory roles? How is this managed? 	<p>NBC ABC Project Steering Committee</p>
C. Efficiency	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 17. Did the implementation of the activity make effective use of time and resources to achieve the outcomes? 18. How would you describe the relationships between AusAID, the ABC and the NBC? Did these relationships support or hinder the success of the program? 19. How effective has the ABC been in delivering the program? 20. Have NBC/GoPNG systems been used (eg planning, payments, monitoring, data collection)? 21. What else should/should be used in future? 22. Was the activity designed for optimal value for money? 23. What changes need to be made to make it more cost effective (if relevant) in the future? 24. Have there been any financial variations to the activity? If so, was 	<p>ABC (including advisors) NBC Project Steering Committee AusAID</p>

Criteria	Possible questions	Stakeholders to be targeted
	<p>value for money considered in making these amendments?</p> <p>25. Has management of the activity been responsive to changing needs?</p> <p>26. Did the activity suffer from delays in implementation? If so, why and what was done about it?</p> <p>27. Did the activity have sufficient and appropriate staffing resources?</p> <p>28. Was a risk management approach applied to management of the activity (including anti-corruption)?</p> <p>29. What were the risks to achievement of objectives? Were the risks managed appropriately?</p> <p>30. What do you see as the current and future risks that might impede ongoing support?</p>	
D. Impact	<p>31. What evidence can you provide us of likely development impacts of the project? How has it changed people's lives? Do you have any stories?</p> <p>32. Did the activity produce any unintended changes in the lives of beneficiaries (the NBC, the media sector, the population) and their environment, directly or indirectly?</p> <p>33. Were there positive and/or negative impacts from external factors?</p>	All
E Sustainability	<p>34. Does the NBC and GoPNG have sufficient ownership, capacity and resources to maintain the activity outcomes after Australian Government funding has ceased?</p> <p>35. Are there any areas of the activity that are clearly not sustainable? What lessons can be learned from this?</p>	NBC GoPNG ABC AusAID
F. Gender Equality	<p>36. What were the outcomes of the activity for women and men, boys and girls?</p> <p>37. Did the activity promote equal participation and benefits for women and men, boys and girls? Did the activity promote more equal access by women and men to the benefits of the activity, and more broadly to resources, services and skills?</p> <p>38. Did the activity promote equality of decision-making between women and men?</p> <p>39. Did it help to promote women's rights?</p> <p>40. Did it help to develop capacity (donors, partner government, civil society, etc) to understand and promote gender equality?</p> <p>41. Any ideas on how to integrate gender equality into the program (eg gender specific activities)?</p> <p>42. Are there any activities you think should be incorporated into the next phase of the program?</p>	All
G. Monitoring and Evaluation	<p>43. Did the project have a sensible M&E system in place that was aligned with NBC/GoPNG systems?</p> <p>44. Has evidence been collected to show that objectives have been achieved?</p> <p>45. Were there features of the M&E system that represented good practice and improved the quality of the evidence available?</p> <p>46. Was data gender-disaggregated to measure the outcomes of the</p>	NBC ABC AusAID Steering Committee

Criteria	Possible questions	Stakeholders to be targeted
	<p>activity on men, women, boys and girls?</p> <p>47. Did the M&E system collect useful information on cross-cutting issues?</p>	
H. Analysis & Learning	<p>48. How well has the current design addressed previous learning and analysis?</p> <p>49. How well was learning from implementation and previous reviews (self-assessment and independent) integrated into the activity?</p>	NBC ABC AusAID
I. Lessons	50. What lessons from the activity can be applied to (select as appropriate: subsequent activities / programs [i.e. working in partner systems/environment/fragile stages].	NBC ABC AusAID
J. Concept design (not covered above)	<p>51. What should be setting out to do over the next two years? Why? What will success look like?</p> <p>52. What are AusAID's preliminary thoughts on partnerships? What roles and responsibilities might each partner take during design and implementation of the activity?</p> <p>53. What is our analysis of any partnership(s) involved in an existing activity? How has the partnership contributed to the outcomes of the activity? Have the objectives, roles and responsibilities of the partnership been met, and do they require renegotiation?</p> <p>54. What are AusAID's initial views on potential implementation options and delivery modalities? What are the likely resourcing implications of these?</p>	NBC ABC AusAID

Attachment C: Source documents

Date	Author	Title
2004	AusAID	Project Design Document
2005	ABC - NBC	Memorandum of Understanding on MDI 2
2006 - 2009	AusAID	Quality at Implementation reports (various)
2006 - 2009	AusAID, ABC	Record of Understanding and various Deeds of Amendment in relation to the Media for Development Initiative
2007	ABC	Proposal For Revision of Phase 2 May - December 2007
2007	NBC	Corporate Plan
2007	NBC	Editorial Guidelines
2007	AusAID	Building Demand for Better Governance.
2007 - 2009	MDI2	Progress reports (various)
2007, updated 2009	AusAID	Democratic Governance Strategy In Papua New Guinea
2008	AusAID review team	2007 Review of the MDI ABC NDC Project Phase 2 (revised draft).
2008	ABC	ABC response to 2007 MDI review
2008	AusAID, ABC, NBC	Agreed actions from the November 2007 review.
2008	AusAID, ABC	Strategic Partnership Agreement
2008	MDI 2	Audience Survey
2009	ABC	Activity Plan January to June 2009
2009	ABC	Risk Management Matrix - July 2009 – June 2010
2009	ABC	Cholera information
2009	AusAID, ABC	Correspondence on issues of concern (various)
2009	MDI 2	MDI2 Project Briefing Note for Incoming Board Members
2009	MDI 2	MDI2 Reports to NBC Board (various)
2009	MDI 2	Audience Survey
2009	MDI 2	Administration and Operations Structure Review. Report No. 3.

Attachment D: List of people/agencies consulted

Organisation	Name	Position
ABC/MDI	Chris Greene	Team Leader
ABC/MDI	Garry Suprain	The Tribe Advisor
ABC/MDI	Geoff Heriot	Governance and Strategic Management Advisor
ABC/MDI	Jenny Ferber	Leadership and management advisor
ABC/MDI	Peter Secomb	Organisational development Advisor
ABC/MDI	Richard Greenfield	Finance Advisor
ABC/MDI	Ron Erhke	Rehabilitation Project Advisor
ABC/MDI	Sonny Karubaba	Archivist
ABC/MDI	Sue Ahearn	Content Advisor
ABC/MDI	Wendy Highett	Project Director
AusAID	Cathy Amos	Senior Program Officer, Democratic Governance
AusAID	David Chick	Counsellor, Governance
AusAID	Ea Tobi	Program Officer, Democratic Governance
AusAID	Kath Taplin	First Secretary, Democratic Governance
AusAID	Leonie Whyte	Department of Community Development Co-located Officer
AusAID	Sarah MacCana	Second Secretary, Democratic Governance Unit
AusAID	Sophie Temby	Second Secretary, Democratic Governance
AusAID	Stephanie Copus-Campbell	Minister Counsellor
AusAID	Dr Fiona Crockford	Demand for Better Governance, Canberra
AusAid	Louisa Cass	Ex demand for Better Governance, Canberra
AusAID, SNS, EHP	Alison Deluise	Development Program Specialist
AusAID, SNS, EHP	Moale Vagikapi	Principle Program Officer
DNPM	Caspar Aumtari	Senior Program Officer
DNPM	Joelson Anere	Senior Aid Coordinator
DNPM	Martin Korokan	Senior Aid Coordinator
DNPM	Mollars Winzo	Program Officer
DNPM	Ruby Zeriga	Deputy Secretary
EHP	Agnes Inape	Station Manager
EHP	Downey Fova and team	Provincial Radio Station, Goroka
EHP	John Gimiseve	Deputy Provincial Administrator
EHP	Solomon Tato	Deputy Provincial Administrator
Hitron	Lindsey Jorgenson	Managing Director
Hitron	Ricky Mateo	Project Manager
Madang	Michael Samuga	Provincial Radio Station

Organisation	Name	Position
Media Council	Nimo Kama	Executive Director
Milne Bay Province	David Mati	Provincial Radio Station
NBC	Allan Arifiae	Director of Programming, National Radio
NBC	David Siraba	A/g Director, Network Operations
NBC	Douglas Dimage	Broadcast Officer
NBC	Dylan Mallar	Presenter, The Tribe
NBC	Francisca Maradei	Senior Planner, Engineering
NBC	Isaac Marinjembi	ED, Engineering
NBC	Janey Kualahu	A/Executive Producer, Provincial
NBC	Joe Wafewa	ED, TV
NBC	Joseph Ealedona	Managing Director
NBC	Josephine Oberleuter	Executive Producer, The Tribe
NBC	Lillian Yaruso	Personnel Officer
NBC	Mary Kokoha	Executive Producer, Current issues
NBC	Matilda Gaveva	Broadcast officer
NBC	Memafu Kapera	Deputy Managing Director
NBC	Muli Kera	ED, HR
NBC	Nunea Koffen	Systems Analyst, Finance
NBC	Participants	Leadership Training Program
NBC	Paul Reptario	Chair
NBC	Peter Sinclair	Acting ED, National Radio
NBC	Rex Tuaradossi	Acting ED, Finance
NBC	Timothy Masiu	Deputy Chair
NBC	Vena Wingro	Producer/presenter, The Tribe
Sanap Wantaim	Anna Awasi	Communication Officer
Sanap Wantaim	Nidia Reyes-Martines	Knowledge Management and Communications Advisor
UNICEF	Noreen Chambers	Program Officer
Vanimo	Celina Korei	Provincial Radio Station
Wabag	Jacob Kaka	Provincial Radio Station
Wewak	Anna Klawe	Provincial Radio Station
WHO	Cathy Williams	Information Officer

Total: 89 people consulted – 48 males and 41 females.

Attachment E: 2007 review action plan update

The following table is based on the matrix agreed by ABC, AusAID and NBC dated August 2008.

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
<p>OD R1 (a) The NBC Management team should review its core functions; redevelop its organisational structure, position descriptions, and related activity in line with GoPNG Guidelines, so it is in the best position to address implementation of the Corporate Plan.</p> <p>(b) The Project should provide best practice organisational development and mentoring support to the NBC Management as it undertakes this activity.</p>	Addressed	Already being implemented.	<p>MD established a Structure Review Committee. MDI 2 facilitated the establishment of a working group to support this work. Also conducted a workshop with Directors to talk about senior management structure – result was very sensible in terms of organisational function. MDI 2 documented all agreements in relation to the structure. A paper went to the Board in mid 2009 to get endorsement for major structural change in the organisation over several years. The Board approved this. ED, HR was directed to implement the new structure. Seven mission critical positions were advertised in October 2009 but the recruitments have not been actioned. The new Organisational Development Advisor will continue to progress this work.</p>
<p>OD R2 So that successful implementation of the Corporate Plan can occur, it is essential that the Project supports the NBC Board and Management in putting in place best practice strategic management policies, practices and procedures, including robust annual corporate planning processes, tied to GoPNG's annual budget cycle and in line with Government</p>	Addressed	Already being implemented.	<p>There was no Board until February 2009. Since then MDI 2 has been supporting the Board to develop appropriate practices. As well as coaching, Board members and senior managers of the NBC received training in the role of Boards and their Directors. MDI 2 brought in the Australian Institute of Company Directors to conduct the training which was very successful in raising Board awareness and helping them focus on their responsibilities in relation to strategy and risk management.</p> <p>There has had less success with planning and budgeting. While MDI 2 has supported the development of the Corporate Plan it became obsolete when TV became the focus. CP has not been used to drive NBC strategy. MDI did aim to have the CP revised in the light of TV. Now a review of commencing in Feb 2010.</p>

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
requirements			MDI 2 did some work with managers on the planning and budget cycle but efforts to get involved in the budgeting have been rejected. This year NBC did not receive any development funds due, possibly, to a poor budget proposal and the inability to explain what had happened to the previous allocation of K21m for technical rehabilitation. MDI has commenced a new financial advisor who will endeavour to work with NBC on this.
OD R3 Consideration should be given to assisting the NBC to review its mandate, including its legislative base, to ensure the direction now set can be achieved.	Noted	NBC/ABC/Au sAID to consider development of TORs for Strategic Advisor (including through ASF)	The Board is aware of legislative issues – the major one being that the Board, MD and DMD are appointed by NEC. The accountability of the MD is thus blurry. At the Chair’s request, MDI 2 is preparing a paper on the issue for the Board who plan to take the matter further.
OD R4 The Project ensures all of its inputs show a direct and measurable link to NBC’s Corporate Plan.	Addressed	Already being implemented.	All MDI activities are aligned with the CP. Each quarter a report is provided to the Board showing how MDI has supported the plan. All TA TORs refer to and link to the CP. Deliverables are clearly drawn from the CP.
OD R5 The Project and NBC management should work together to create a realistic mentored program of attachments for NBC managers. The program should be designed to expose managers to a wide range of related broadcasting systems, management styles, and operating environments across varying levels of development in the Asia Pacific region. This should assist them, as members of the NBC management team, to make	Noted	Design phase to link with mentoring/training/networking opportunities available via regional programs (including Pacific Media Assistance Scheme, and Pacific Governance	There has been a series of study tours and attachments: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • MD (1 week – ABC, Sydney) • Chair and Secretary of Board (1 week – Sydney and Melbourne ABC; National Indigenous Television) • The Tribe (4 weeks – ABC, Triple J, stations in rural areas, commercial, non commercial etc) • Finance Director (2 weeks – ABC, commercial media, commercial companies) • One is planned for the Provincial Director • 2 are being set up for journalists to spend 2 months in Cairns and Darwin newsrooms.

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
<p>informed decisions in taking their own agency forward in line with its corporate directions. Timing of placements should be in line with NBC's timetable set by the Corporate Plan and designed to minimise disruption to the NBC's strategic management annual cycle.</p>		<p>Support Program).</p>	<p>Note that funding in each phase has been for 2 attachments/study tours. The project has had mixed success with these activities. Some participants have been genuinely interested in learning, others saw it as a junket. They have been valuable in terms of opening people's eyes on how things are happening elsewhere (i.e. they learn about what is possible). The problem is that when an individual is sent, when they come back they get reabsorbed. This is the reason why two journalists will be sent with the aim of ensuring each has some peer support to implement new ideas. Ideally funding will increase for this type of activity in the next phase. There are also some good lessons in Vanuatu where the ABC minder comes back and helps integrate the learning.</p>
<p>OD R6 The Project ensures that relevant NBC personnel drive development of sales and marketing strategies, through appropriate skills mentoring. If Short Term Advisers are deemed appropriate in introducing concepts etc, the Project also needs a longer-term adviser with well developed non-directive consulting skills and sound, demonstrated capacity building competencies to assist in addressing sustainability.</p>	<p>Deferred</p>	<p>Development of Sales and Marketing strategies is not an immediate priority due to focus of NBC on ensuring FM and satellite infrastructure is upgraded and NBC is able to deliver to sponsors. Commercial strategy is currently being incorporated</p>	<p>This was not funded in Extension 2.1. It was part of Extension 2.2 to support the mission critical position of Director Marketing and Commercial but the role has not yet been appointed. MD has requested that MDI 2 wait until the position is filled.</p>

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
		into Tribe FM radio strategy.	
<p>OD R7 Careful attention to appropriateness of content of outputs, in terms of Papua New Guinean culture and on-going NBC resource base, needs to underpin the development of sales and marketing strategies. Priorities outlined in the Corporate Plan need to be addressed, so that expectations raised can be fulfilled and continuing production can be maintained.</p>	Addressed.	Already being implemented.	MDI 2 understands that cultural appropriateness must underpin everything that is done with NBC and by NBC. MDI 2 is, appropriately, pushing the boundaries by encouraging broadcasters to challenge some aspects of the PNG culture that are of concern eg. gender, domestic violence, rape etc.
<p>QP R1 The Project should assist the NBC to put in place a programs committee to monitor program quality and plan new programs, as well as consider ways of improving the current ones. It is important that staff producing programs get constructive feedback from the programs committee or the responsible Executive Directors after the broadcast of each program. Executive Directors need to consider making a post-mortem of every program that is broadcast on NBC a part of their managerial responsibilities.</p>	Not accepted	Not viable.	<p>This is about program quality. While it was not viable to monitor every program, MDI has facilitated the establishment of a weekly Output ED meeting which brings together the head of those sections responsible for content. This is resulting in better coordination and better understanding of each others needs. At this stage it is not possible to see any measurable improvements in program quality resulting from this initiative, but, as well as others thing, it should help.</p> <p>Air checks were implemented but have since stopped with a change in management of national radio.</p>

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
<p>QP R2 The Project should conduct audience survey training and assist the NBC to run the first survey, so that skilled NBC personnel can collect the necessary feedback from the listeners, clients and other stakeholders on all aspects of NBC output.</p>	Accepted	<p>Survey training to be included in all HQ and provincial training. Design phase to consider appropriate qualitative listener feedback mechanisms.</p>	<p>Conducting a survey is not good use of NBC staff. Note that ABC staff is not trained to do audience research – it is a specialist areas and considered best done by a company. However under the leadership program 2-3 of the projects involved audience research on a local basis</p> <p>Two audience surveys, funded by MDI 2, were conducted by a media research company. An NBC committee drew up the specifications and made the decision based on the tenders. They were conducted in mid 2008 and 2009. Another is planned for 2010.</p>
<p>QP R3 The Project should conduct intensive training on the Editorial Guidelines for all staff including those in the provincial stations, with senior NBC officers trained in delivery to ensure on-going training is available, and sustainable.</p>	Accepted	<p>Editorial guidelines training to be included in all HQ and provincial training</p>	<p>Every time there is work in a province and every time a workshop is conducted there is a session on the Editorial Guidelines, usually conducted by NBC staff. There are some indications that staff are starting to understand and apply the editorial policies (eg. Kapris story –a person rang in claiming to be Kapris, the announcer was not sure if it was him, staff realised they needed to get guidance, MD said no...)</p>
<p>QP R4 The Project should conduct training in the use of the new equipment and program software for both journalists and broadcast officers, and specialist training for journalists in investigative reporting and other specialist areas including developmental journalism and environmental reporting.</p>	Accepted	<p>NBC provincial directors to identify local providers. Design phase to consider links to training offered through Media Council of</p>	<p>Training is constantly provided on the job and off the job.</p> <p>Training in investigative reporting has not yet been conducted as there is still a need to focus on the fundamentals of reporting. There are also issues around the role of the national broadcaster in investigative journalism, the role of government and the risk they take.</p> <p>The training will be carried out when considered appropriate by NBC senior management.</p>

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
		PNG, PACMAS, and others, and re-introduction of NBC cadetship program.	
<p>QP R5 Provide Training of Trainers (ToT) for a pool of journalists and program producers to equip them to run basic news program production training for new recruits and provincial staff, either by a skilled project adviser or through institutions within PNG who offer ToT courses.</p>	Accepted	Design phase to consider delivery of ToT in more systematic way.	<p>The Presentation Trainer worked closely with a targeted group so that they could work with their colleagues. This has been reasonably successful, particularly in the provinces.</p> <p>The issue of skills development an important one – the new structure has a person nominated to properly oversight training. Induction is being introduced.</p> <p>MDI 2 is trying to get NBC to think about how it is going to build skills. It is also about building a culture where people are willing to ask for help and others are happy to share what they know.</p>
<p>QP R6 More training on the production of dramas as this is a program format that is easily understood by rural dwellers.</p>	Accepted	Survey data indicates that Kunai St has low reach and is not hitting target audiences. Design phase to consider provincial training opportunities.	<p>The second audience survey indicated an interest in Kunai St but NBC stopped producing the program some time ago. While it is not being produced it is still being played. A local NGO has funding to do a two language drama on health and NBC does not appear to be too interested in being involved in spite of MDI encouragement.</p> <p>Drama is not seen as a strategic priority by NBC management. This may change with the new strategic plan. During the cholera response NBC produced one minute dramas to get messages across. The WHO person on the response team advises this was very successful</p>
<p>QP R7 The establishment of a satellite system to deliver the programs to the rural radio stations is urgent to ensure these programs</p>	Addressed	Ensure sustainability of satellite system beyond MDI,	<p>Underway.</p> <p>There appears to be limited ownership by the NBC of the system. Initially it was driven by the ABC and the initial training from the installers was very poor. MDI 2 advises that it is now determined to get installation done with the NBC to gain</p>

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
and others produced by the Karai service are heard by provincial listeners.		including through development of Handover Plan	traction/ownership.
QP R8 Consider assisting NBC to establish a formal mechanism to gauge feedback for the programs.	See R2 above	n/a	n/a
QP R9 Assistance to Management in streamlining operations is now essential to ensure: daily contact with the provincial newsrooms; Twice daily editorial meetings; improved communication and assignment of journalists	Principle accepted	NBC to determine.	MDI has helped NBC institute one daily editorial meeting which is still developing as an effective mechanism. There is now an executive producer in the news room whose job is to coordinate the input from the provinces. There are more provincial stories being heard on the news –people in the provinces are hearing their stories in a national context (important as the audience research highlighted a risk that NBC is seen as POM).
QP R10 More training should be provided to the sub-editors and executive producers of current affairs, business, and sports programs, on the use of all the new technology being introduced in the newsroom. They will in turn travel around the provincial stations to train the provincial journalists.	Addressed	Already implemented.	A considerable amount of training has been provided. Unfortunately records have not been kept. This is an area requiring improvements. Anecdotal evidence suggests that there have been improvements in production – now quite slick, broadcasters are better at dealing with technical glitches, there is better use of sound clips in news bulletins, etc. This is reflected in the 2009 survey results. While not consistent, NBC staff now make better use of program outputs and better use of archived materials.
QP R11 Assistance to the NBC to explore possibilities for instituting an award in various categories in the work of the NBC journalists. The	NBC to determine	n/a	NBC conducted its own awards night in late 2008. Feedback suggests it was not a constructive exercise and will not to be repeated. In 2009, NBC nominated for media council awards and won 13 of the broadcasting awards.

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
awards could include a scholarship to work in any ABC radio station in Australia, etc.			
QP R12 The Project should assist the NBC to establish a formal mechanism to get feedback on the effect of the news and current programs being produced on both the NBC's national Karai service and the provincial Kundu service, and audience reaction to improvements for use in developing options for Phase 3	See R2 above	n/a	This is being done through the audience survey. Ideally a third should be conducted but funding will be required. NBC needs to see this as a key strategy BUT given its financial position unlikely to be able to fund it soon. In 2007, a quantitative survey was conducted under MDI 1 (who, gender, age, what media, etc) which now needs redoing. The Media Council is planning to do this in line with the census.
QP R13 The Project should consider identifying and delivering relevant training to improve the current radio programs on the Karai Service and the provincial Kundu service. A new talkback radio program should be considered as one of the new programs under Phase 3. With the advent of mobile phones throughout PNG, this could be the right time to introduce such an interactive program. The talkback program must be owned by the NBC in all aspects as the editorial independence must be maintained to ensure its integrity	Noted	Design phase to consider in context of sequencing of NBC priorities.	Ongoing. Talkback training is conducted on an ongoing basis and talkback has been into integrated into flow programming.
QP R14 The Project should assist	Noted	AusAID to	This has not happened. A proposal has been put in to ESP to have a joint planning

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
the NBC to undertake a lessons learned study into the role it played in the National Elections, as a baseline for further development in similar activities and for use in improving services, allocating resources, selling sponsorships etc.		facilitate NBC/ABC engagement with PNG Electoral Commission and the Electoral Support Program to progress review of 2007 and planning for future support.	exercise in preparation for the next elections. NBC is awaiting a response. That would provide a good opportunity to review the lessons from last time.
QP R15 The Project, together with the relevant NBC personnel, propose a strategy through which the NBC becomes engaged with the necessary government departments and other stakeholders for the production of programs for both the national Karai service and the provincial Kundu service that address such social problems as HIV and AIDS, family and sexual violence, etc.	Unclear	Design phase to consider support for NBC's engagement with GoPNG partners and other stakeholders.	This is the daily business of NBC. All activities under MDI aim to support their capacity to work with stakeholders. Every time training is conducted in a province stakeholders are involved.
QP R16 The Project, together with the necessary NBC departments, work out a formula whereby the government could subsidise the programs of such stakeholders as the	Unclear	Design phase to consider support for NBC's engagement	This has not progressed. NBC struggles with commerciality vs their public interest responsibilities.

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
Family & Sexual Violence Action Committee. This would enable them to have full time programs on the NBC network of radio stations, as the current rates charged by the Corporation are considered too expensive.		with GoPNG partners and other stakeholders.	
QP R17 More training for broadcast officers and program producers on how to make programs covering sensitive social issues, which are considered as taboo issues especially in the PNG cultural context.	Partly addressed	Design phase to consider continued support	Ongoing.
QP R18 The proposed Youth station should consider using some of its airtime for programs addressing the social issues impacting PNG communities	Addressed	Already implemented. Design phase to consider continued support	This is an important part of the design for the youth station. Small attempts are being made to touch on youth issues during the Saturday night show.
QP R19 The planning for any changes to the provincial Kundu service must involve all the provincial directors to ensure: ownership of the activities in the plan; that program formats take into consideration the uniqueness of each of the provinces that the Kundu Service serves, from their different languages and cultures and	Accepted	Design phase to consider continued support.	This approach is underpinning all of the work being done with the provinces. Unfortunately there is mixed receptiveness to change in the provincial radio stations. MDI needs to take a step by step approach to assist capacity building in provinces. It is noted that the ED, Provincial is currently not treated as a full member of the NBC executive management team. Nor does she have a vehicle or office resources.

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
traditions.			
QP R20 The satellite service should be given priority during the transitional period of the project; provincial stations must be adequately prepared before the service comes on line.	Addressed	NBC/ABC to continue to ensure provincial stations are prepared for the new satellite service.	Little preparation is needed for the signal. Considerable work is needed to ensure the signal goes out from the provinces but this has been hampered by the Rehab Trust fund problems and the lack of progress in improving provincial stations. Indications are that the Rehab program may receive new funding in 2010.
QP R21 Everything in the studios, whether it is a production or broadcast studio, must be digital, thus it is important that the upgrading take into consideration the other necessary equipment that is present in the provincial stations which might not be compatible with the new equipment after the upgrades take place.	Not accepted	Not viable immediately – transferring all equipment and procedures to digital is a longer term goal.	MDI 2 advises that it is agreed that everything must be compatible however the goal of full digitisation is long term (records are still played!).
K R1 A review of the Kundu service should be completed in a holistic manner taking into consideration all the aspects of running a provincial station including management issues, finance, training, staffing, technical equipment and programming. This should feed into development of the Project's Phase 3 as a priority.	Accepted	NBC/ABC/Au sAID to consider undertaking a review in early 2009 to inform the upcoming design phase.	NBC not yet ready or able to conduct this review and MDI 2 has not been resourced to do it. This should be a priority in the next phase.

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
<p>A R1 The NBC and the Project should collaboratively review the resourcing of this activity and draw up and implement a realistic plan of action for Phase 3.</p>	<p>Accepted</p>	<p>NBC/ABC/AusAID to commence concept and design planning in November 2008</p>	<p>A Phase Three concept note was developed as required. MDI 2 has received no feedback on the note.</p>
<p>M R1 Provision is made to extend the ROU to cover the transition period from the end of Phase 2 to the commencement of Phase 3</p>	<p>Partially accepted pending Phase 3 design recommendations</p>	<p>To be determined during Phase 3 Design process.</p>	<p>Done.</p>
<p>M R2 A Project Steering Committee/Board of Management should be set up, as a matter of urgency, during the transition period with representatives from DNPRD, NBC Board, DCI, the NBC MD, DSE, AusAID, ABC, the Media Council, a client, and a listener. Initially, this body should guide the development of the scope of services etc. for Phase 3</p>	<p>Establishment of Management Body accepted; composition requires further discussion</p>	<p>AusAID, NBC and ABC to negotiate establishment and membership of project Steering Committee.</p>	<p>MDI 2 put a proposal to the MD in mid 2008 proposing two groups – one to provide strategic direction to MDI 2 overall and one to provide guidance on the flexible support fund. However the MD did not want people external to the partnership to be involved.</p> <p>It has been proposed that the flexible support fund group be a sub committee of the Board and thus tied into NBC’s governance structure.</p> <p>AusAID drove the creation of the Steering Committee comprising the three partners – it is still developing.</p>
<p>M R3 (a) The strategic partnership arrangement established through the ROU mechanism should continue into Phase 3. (b) ABC International Projects should continue to manage</p>	<p>(a) partially accepted pending Phase 3 Design</p>	<p>(a) To be determined during Phase 3 Design process.</p>	<p>There is a need to review the Strategic Partnership in light of recent concerns. Any partnership agreement for PNG needs to include all three partners.</p> <p>ABC has endeavoured to improve its administration. They have contracted consultants to ensure systems and processes meet best practice standards. Staff</p>

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
the Project with the requirement that the ABC employs best practice project management practices, including adviser recruiting practices to AusAID requirements, with the NBC MD actively involved as an equal partner in the management and recruiting processes	recommendations. (b) noted.	(b) to be implemented during tendering of Phase 3	have received training in project design and M&E. The ABC now advertises internationally for advisors, the NBC sits on the panel and are partners in the decision making. An action learning approach is being adopted to teach good practice in recruitment.
M R4 The ABC should consider recruiting and appointing (by February/March 2008) an in-country Team Leader for Phase 3 who has, amongst other attributes, strong and proven high level competencies in: Managing in-country AusAID projects/programs, preferably in Melanesia; Public sector organisational capacity building; The successful use of non-directive consulting skills within the development assistance context; Preparing plans and reports to AusAID requirements.	Accepted	Already being implemented	Done
M R5 The Phase 3 Team Leader should be responsible for in-country management of the Project in partnership with the NBC MD, including project planning, report	Accepted	Already being implemented.	Done

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
preparation, day-to-day management of the Project, and design development and related documentation for Phase 3			
M R6 The Project and NBC should collaboratively prepare and monitor implementation of a Project Activity Plan covering the transition period, January to June 2008, to AusAID guidelines	Accepted	NBC/ABC/Au sAID to confirm revised M&E framework. Partners to undertake ongoing monitoring as per responsibilities set out in revised framework.	Activity plans were developed for each extension based on NBC plans and needs. The plans were approved by AusAID and incorporated into the Deeds of Amendment to the ROU. An M&E framework was developed. Efforts have been made to ensure NBC involvement in the process. This is an area requiring further work.
M R7 AusAID should explore possible training options for key ABC personnel in AusAID requirements	Accepted	AusAID to facilitate specific training pending advice from ABC.	ABC has undertaken this.
M R8 Capacity Development should become the Project focus and be monitored closely and reported on in Project documentation.	Accepted	NBC/ABC/Au sAID to consider options for continued support through Phase 3 Design	It is evident that MDI 2 has integrated a capacity development approach into all its work. The consequence is that things don't always happen on time as planned in activity plans. Recent reports discuss capacity building.

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
<p>M&E R1 For the remaining period of Phase 2 and the necessary transition period to the planned Phase 3, a simple logframe is developed (the Review M&E consultant will undertake this as part of the review input). M&E to include: (a) KPIs and targets at output and purpose levels for the planning period (as the structure of the logframe, particularly the focus areas/components, will be modified to align with the NBC corporate plan) indicators at component outcome level will not be developed; and (b) Means of verifying the targets.</p>	<p>Superseded</p>	<p>Revised M&E framework to be agreed by NBC/ABC/AusAID in November 2008</p>	<p>The Deeds to both the extensions include log frames based on the review's log frame. There is a need for refinement.</p>
<p>M&E R2 The M&E framework developed as part of this review for the period up to the start of Phase 3 should be implemented by the Team Leader and an NBC Counterpart. Funding for implementing the framework will be provided from the Project budget</p>	<p>Partially accepted</p>	<p>Revised M&E framework to be implemented by Team Leader, NBC to advise on appropriate involvement of NBC personnel.</p>	<p>See above. This is an area that requires further attention.</p>
<p>M&E R3 The NMAS should be updated, as a priority, to include Port Moresby so that the NMAS</p>	<p>Noted</p>	<p>NBC, Media Council and AusAID to</p>	<p>The Media Council is currently planning to conduct the survey with AusAID support.</p>

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
data can be used to provide a nationwide baseline for the MDI. The NMAS would be undertaken again at the end of Phase 3 to assess the impact of three phases of the ABC NBC Project		confirm scope and timing for future surveys.	
M&E R4 missing			
M&E R5 When the NMAS is updated to include Port Moresby data, the contractor should be requested to convert all data reported as percentage into estimated audience numbers in each audience group within the surveyed regions and also across PNG. This is to provide baseline data.	Noted	NBC, Media Council and AusAID to confirm scope and timing for future surveys.	Agreed. This is important data needed to track NBC's audience numbers.
M&E R6 If not already provided, the NMAS contractor should be requested to provide the ABC NBC Project with details on all sampling locations and methodologies used to collect the NMAS data so that the team undertaking the completion survey can return to the same neighbourhoods to collect the follow-up data.	Noted	NBC, Media Council and AusAID to confirm scope and timing for future surveys.	Agreed.
M&E R7 The future M&E framework (and project design) should complement the Corporate	Accepted	To be implemented during Phase 3 Design	Agreed.

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
Plan and, where possible, use KPIs with targets set to suit the implementation period		process.	
M&E R8 An M&E consultant with experience in AusAID and corporate M&E approaches should be part of the team finalising the Phase 3 design. The consultant would be responsible for preparing the M&E framework and costing the activities. After final agreement on the Phase 3 design, the consultant could assist in development of the M&E Implementation Plan for Phase 3 and, if required, assist with implementation	Accepted	To be implemented during Phase 3 Design process.	It is essential that expert support is provided to ensure that Phase Three M&E is sound.
M&E R9 Training in basic project management and AusAID M&E approaches and systems should be provided to the local project manager and NBC counterpart(s) with ongoing responsibility in the corporate planning and/or audience monitoring areas. These people would report to the Team Leader and would implement the M&E system. Depending on the combination of capacity and skills, any additional specialised M&E skills required should be secured	Accepted	ABC provided M&E training to Project personnel. NBC to confirm whether additional M&E training for NBC counterparts should be provided.	Project management training has been provided to key NBC and ABC staff. ABC staff are developing their understanding of AusAID approaches and systems.

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
through consultants			
<p>S R1 The ABC should recruit advisers skilled in non-directive consulting skills and/or provides suitable training to all advisers fielded</p>	Accepted	AusAID to facilitate capacity building training for ABC/NBC staff (eg. Making a Difference Course)	Based on interviews during this evaluation it is evident that advisors currently working with MDI 2 have a very good understanding of non-directive consulting skills and approaches to capacity building. Where possible advisors have participated in AusAID's Making a Difference program. It is noted that a current advisor has recently been selected and trained by AusAID to be a facilitator for the MaD program.
<p>S R2 All advisers should: (a) Work as counterparts to designated NBC personnel, using non-directive consulting techniques; (b)Identify and build upon existing organisational and human resource competencies; (c)Contribute to building a learning culture in the NBC; (d) ensure all project input is within the Corporate Plan and matched to NBC targets and timetables; (e) Ensure interventions are within NBC's ability to maintain financially and technically; (f) Ensure all Papua New Guinean cultural values, laws, regulations and administrative requirements are adhered to; (g)Respect the strong desire of Papua New Guineans to learn from others, make decisions</p>	Accepted	Project personnel to continue using these approaches, and strengthen where necessary.	This appears to be happening. One concern is the physical location of advisers – good practice would suggest that they should be physically co-located with their counterpart/s rather than separately housed in a team room. This would ensure that they are on hand at all times to provide support and coaching.

Review recommendations	Joint response	Comments	As at February 2010
based upon options put forward, and manage implementation the PNG way, with access to further advice when needed; (h) Plan for and directly address sustainability of outputs delivered by short term specialists			
G R1 The ABC should attempt to improve the gender balance on its team.	Principle of gender balance accepted	Attaining an even gender balance will inform the recruitment process for Phase 3.	The gender balance of the team is reported in the 6 monthly report. Currently the long term team's gender balance is 50/50. A recent gender audit shows progress is being made in this regard. MDI 2 seeks to raise/integrate gender into all aspects of their work. It encourages the NBC to produce programs that specifically progress gender issue especially through talkback and flow programming. There is still a long way to go.

Attachment F: MDI Advisors

Long Term Advisors (postings of 6 months or greater)

Name	Position	Term
Marilynne Smith	Project Director and Team Leader	2006-2008
Chris Greene	Team Leader	2008 -2010
Pearson Vetuna	General Programs Advisor	2006-2008
Jordie Kilby	General Programs Advisor	2008-2009
Ken Orr	News Advisor	2006-2009
Sue Ahearn	Content Adviser	2009-2010
Jenny Ferber	Leadership and Management Development Partner	2008-2009
Ann Sapias	Archive Manager (locally engaged)	2007-2009
Sonny Karubaba	Archive Assistant/Manager (locally engaged)	2008 -2010
Andrew Watson	Finance Adviser	2008-2009
Terry Griffiths	Satellite Project Coordinator	2008-2009

Medium Term Advisors (postings of between 3 and 6 months)

Name	Position	Term
Susan Hayes	HR Review Specialist	August 2008 – January 2009
Richard Greenfield	Finance Advisor	November 2009 to June 2010
Peter Secomb	Organisational Development Advisor	January to June 2010
Samantha Barry	Content Adviser	February-June 2010

Short Term Advisors (postings of less than 3 consecutive months)

Name	Position	Term
Rob Batten	Scoping Study for Resources Management	January 2007
Ron Ehrke	Project Delivery Advisor	Various terms 2007-2010

Andrew Fisher	Election Broadcasting Specialist	2 terms in 2007 and 2008
Michael Bazan	Resource Management Advisor	September 2007
Garry Suprain	Advertising Specialist /Youth Radio Advisor	Various contracts from 2007-2009
Margot Foster	Flow Programming Specialist	2 terms in 2008
Mike McCluskey	Station Sound Advisor	March 2008
Rowan Reid	Talkback Specialist	February 2008
Ben Whitten	Archiving Specialist	October 2008, Jan 2009
Rita Mlasuela Gordon	SPSS, Attaché Advisor	Various terms 2008 and 2009
Cath Dwyer	Youth Radio Trainer	February 2009
Helen Tzarimas	Presentation Advisor	2 terms in 2009
Des Guilfoyle	Development Advisor and Assessor Leadership Program	May 2009
Geoff Heriot	Corporate Governance Advisor	Various terms 2009-10

Locally Engaged Administrative Staff

Name	Position	Term
Rachel Miria	Office Manager	2006-2008
Henunu Solien	Office Manager	2008
Isabel Popal	Office Manager	2008 – 2010.
Ben Takas	Archive Assistant (Casual)	2007-2009
Daule Tau	Logistics Assistant	Feb-June 2010