



Switzerland-OECD-China Programme

POLICY DIALOGUE ON "FINANCING HIGHER EDUCATION AND  
SUSTAINING QUALITY OF EDUCATION FOR LIFE LONG LEARNING"

## Minutes

### High Level Consultation Meeting

3<sup>rd</sup> of April 2006

Geneva, Switzerland

## Meeting objective

The objective of this meeting was to agree on the broader themes of the joint research project and on the specific inputs (background papers) needed for the Search Conference in late 2006.

## Attendants

A total number of 14 participants attend this meeting on the 3<sup>rd</sup>, representing the OECD, the National Centre for Education Development & Research (NCEDR), Chinese Ministry of Education, the Swiss State Secretariat for Education and Research (SER), the Federal Office for Professional Education and Technology (BBT) and other Swiss institutions and universities. A complete list of the participants for this High Level Policy Consultation Meeting is presented in Annex 2.

## INTRODUCTORY CONSIDERATIONS

### I. General Introduction of Representatives and Invited Experts and Partners

Dr. Lichia Saner Yiu (CSEND) welcomes the participants.

### II. Welcome and Official Opening of the Meeting

*Dr. Marino Ostini*, Scientific advisor for Multilateral Cooperation in Education, State Secretariat for Education and Research (SER)

Dr. Marino Ostini welcome the participants and opened the meeting. He recalled the fact that the project was multilateral OECD project and not a bilateral one.

The agenda is approved. Because of time pressure, participants agree to keep flexibility concerning the schedule.

## MAIN MEETING REPORT

### Topic 1: OECD Cooperation with China on Higher Education (Including Interpretation into Chinese)

*Mr. Ian Whitman*, Head, Programme for Co-operation with Non Member Economies, Directorate for Education, OECD

A PowerPoint presentation is attached.

*"Details of the development of the Sino-OECD-Swiss collaborative research Project"* *Mr. Gerhard Kowar*, Consultant, Unit for co-operation with non-member Economies, Directorate for Education, OECD

A PowerPoint presentation is attached.

### Discussion on Topic 1

- Dr Marino Ostini (SER) raised the question how the OECD was going to include Belgium and Norway into the project. The key substantial issue should be governance & management in addition to quality and finance. The "lead house" of the project was OECD.
- Mr. Ian Whitman (OECD) reminded the participants that a meeting run by the British Council on the same topic would take place in the UK in May 2006. Norway, Belgium and also the UK were, according to recent talks, ready to join the OECD-Switzerland-China project. In substance, one could expect participation at the Search Conference in autumn 2006. What remained to be done was to collect papers on the issues, found all relevant institutions in charge in the new potential partner countries.

- Dr. Marino Ostini underlined the diversity of the partner countries: “Norway was a non EU country, Switzerland was a unique federal state, Belgium was a bilingual country, and the UK showed in turn different characteristics also. The various institutional set-ups would impact on how HE would be governed and managed.

## Topic 2: Structures and Governance of Higher Education in China and Switzerland

### *“Governance Structure of Higher Education in China & The Trend”*

Mr. Fan Wenyao, Deputy Director General, National Centre for Educational Development & Research (NCEDR), Chinese Ministry of Education

Mr. Fan Wenyao (NCEDR) thanked Switzerland for its support at the OECD and particularly for sending experts to China.

A PowerPoint presentation is attached.

### Discussion on Topic 2 - Chinese issues

The following questions and issues were raised:

- Dr. Haijing Wang (ETH Zurich) raised the question whether student fees really covered 29 % of HEI costs.
- Dr. Lichia Saner Yiu (CSEND) asked what proportion private universities would take in the future.
- Mr. Gerhard Kowar (OECD) asked for clarification of the term “social funds” in the Chinese vocabulary.
- Dr. Nivardo Ischi (CUS) asked whether non-state universities also carried out research and the funding of these research activities.
- Dr Marino Ostini asked for a clarification of terms: what should the term HEI include? What did we exactly mean by governance and management. Concerning the relevant Chinese legislation, was it possible to have an English summary?

Mr Fan Wenyao (NCEDR) answered the following:

- Concerning terminology: “HEI” in China meant tertiary education. “Universities” cover all post-secondary education including four-year specialised colleges.
- Regarding the access to post-secondary education, the applied principle was that no student should be refused for financial reasons. Students might apply for student loans or take part time jobs to finance their studies. Government and society wanted to help students from poor families.
- Non-state universities were not at the same level as state universities: students with lower academic record entered non-state universities while students with high grades entered state universities. The law, however, did not always differentiate between the two. Non-state universities received no state funding but they were allowed to charge higher fees than state universities.
- “Social funds” in China were (i) research grants coming from the private sector or (ii) private donations (iii) multinational companies’ grants. The tuition fees remained however the main funding to finance non-state universities.
- Bank loans for studying were considered as a short-term phenomenon.
- The structure of the legislation comprised a basic law acting as an umbrella under which the new laws were issued.

### *“Governance Structure of Higher Education in Switzerland & The Challenges”*

Dr. Nivardo Ischi, Secretary General, Swiss Universities Conference (CUS)

A presentation paper (made on overhead projector) is attached in a scanned version.

## Discussion on Topic 2 - Swiss issues

Prof. Peter Suter (University of Geneva) pointed out that term "costly areas" in the Swiss legislation needed clarification. This term was not well defined. The following issues were raised:

- Cost per student was extremely variable depending on the number of students per faculty or per the subject department
- How would the Confederation (the Swiss government) define *costly areas*
- Would Switzerland be able to cover small faculties / institutes since their cost often amount to ten times more than the cost of the larger ones. The larger faculties served as reference to define the so called "standard costs"

Dr. Nivardo Ischi (CUS) made the comments that high costs were bearable if they occurred only once with expenses for fixed assets, for instance for computer labs, IT centres, as in CERN. It became difficult when costs permanently exceeded the "standard costs".

Dr. Marion Ostini reminded the participants that Switzerland had no organ or department for research on education in Switzerland. There existed only a coordination body in an "embryo" state. There were no funds allocated for research on education either.

## Topic 3: Financing Higher Education in China and Switzerland

### *"Financial restructuring of Higher Education in China"*

Prof. Wang Yingjie, International and Comparative Education Research Institute, Beijing Normal University

Prof. Wang Yingjie reminded the participants that "China is in fact a market economy" even if this reality has not been fully recognised. Concerning the use of terminology, the term "university" in the Chinese context covered all HEIs including community colleges and specialised professional institutes. At the moment, the expansion of enrolment has also brought unanticipated financial risks to many HEIs through financial loans for infrastructure development.

A PowerPoint presentation is attached.

## Discussion on Topic 3 - Chinese issues

Dr. Marino Ostini raised the questions: (i) in how far the central government (in China) has power in the provinces and (ii) where do the Chinese education experts look for models?

Prof. Wang Yingjie (Beijing Normal University) answered that the government gave special grants for autonomous regions with minorities in virtue of "special policies" for this type of regions.

### *"Main issues in the financing of Swiss HEIs"*

Dr. Andri Gieré, Federal Office for Professional Education and Technology (OPET)

A PowerPoint presentation is attached.

## Discussion on Topic 3- Swiss issues

Dr. Marino Ostini pointed out that

- Universities of Applied Sciences (UAS) were less expensive for the government also because there is no PHD programme in the UAS.

- Collaboration occurred between universities, UAS and ETH/EPF; for instance between Geneva and Lausanne.
- The federal budget for the years 2008-2011 for higher education would be submitted to the federal parliament in 2007. An annual increase of 6 to 10% in total education expenditure would be discussed at the federal parliament.

Mr. Fan Wenyao raised the following questions

- Where did the impulse come from for students to study in an UAS in Switzerland? Were the UASs business-oriented?
- Did students studying in UASs perform poorly compared to those at University? Was this the reason to study in a UAS?
- Was it possible to obtain a PHD at a UAS?

Dr Andri Gieré (OPET) answered that

- The UASs were practice oriented and carry out applied research. To be admitted one needed at least a VET "maturité professionnelle" and one year experience in the field of the target UAS.
- It took 10 years to build up the seven UASs in Switzerland. The federal government managed these projects with a top-down approach.
- Some UASs were results of merger of different professional high schools; others modified their structures in the last decade.
- The compatibility of graduate (BA) and post-graduate degree (MA) granted by either universities or UASs has been discussed between these two institutions.

Prof. Peter Abplanalp (UAS - FHNW) pointed out that it was not possible to run PHD programmes at UAS -at least for the moment- as opposed to the practice abroad.

Dr. Marino Ostini commented on the financing issue. In Switzerland this subject had not been addressed sufficiently, not even in the latest OECD report on Swiss Higher Education (see distributed CD ROM).

Dr. André Gieré reminded all participants that a national report focusing on financing matters would be issued in the autumn of 2006.

Prof. Wang Yingjie raised the question emerging the dilemma of equity vs. competition.

Dr. André Gieré commented that competition came from increased enrolment. The interest of universities today was (i) to attract more students (ii) to obtain projects mandates from other institutions including the private sector. By the same token, the tendency of universities and UASs was to merge in order to remain or to become more competitive. This ambition however tended to be undermined by powerful local interest politics, often on a cantonal level.

#### Topic 4: Quality Assurance of Higher Education in China and Switzerland

*"Quality Assurance in Higher Education in China"*

*Prof. Wang Yingjie*, International and Comparative Education Research Institute, Beijing Normal University

A PowerPoint presentation is attached.

*"Quality Assurance in Higher Education in Switzerland and Challenges"*

*Dr. Rolf Heusser*, Centre of Accreditation and Quality Assurance of the Swiss Universities (OAQ)

1. *Quality assurance and the Bologna process*
2. *Goals and activities of OAQ*
3. *The Swiss accreditation system*
4. *Audits of the quality assurance systems of the Swiss universities*

A PowerPoint presentation is attached.

*"The Question of Quality in Higher Education"*

*Dr. Lichia Saner-Yiu*, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND)

This presentation was made on 4<sup>th</sup> April during the second session of the Meeting. A PowerPoint presentation is attached.

### Discussion on Topic 3 & 4 Chinese & Swiss issues

Prof. Wang Yingjie wanted to know how did one meet the minimum standard of accreditation?

Dr. Rolf Heusser (OAQ) pointed out that accreditation was crucial for students in order to access further higher education and the labour market on an international level. OAQ wanted the Swiss students to benefit directly from access to Master and PHD programmes and the labour markets inside and outside the European Union.

Dr. Andri Gieré pointed out that quality was the corollary of competition. Private schools constituted a problem since they did not always deliver quality. Swiss Hotel management schools suffered from a poor image in China due to the lack of quality.

Dr. Rolf Heusser pointed out that in practice one needed accreditation at the institution (HEI) and the education programme level.

Dr. Marino Ostini asked how to teach university professors and who did it in China?

Prof. Wang Yingjie answered that there existed (i) courses at university by senior faculty members for new faculty members and (ii) Nation-wide training centres.

### General Discussion on Policy Research Interests (75')

Chaired by *Dr. Marino Ostini*, Scientific advisor for Multilateral Cooperation in Education, State Secretariat for Education and Research (SER)

Dr. Marino Ostini suggested how to solidify all these research interests:

- Further discussion in the next meeting on the 4<sup>th</sup> of April
- Draw out issues for discussion from the available reports and background documents provided by different delegations
- Finalise the decision by May 2006.

A three tier schedule should be followed:

- 1) Identification of basic topics for commissions by May 2006;
- 2) The Search Conference in the autumn of 2006, concept to be defined, perhaps "fish bowl".
- 3) Joint researches should be carried out on topics agreed upon between November 2006 and November 2007.
- 4) Output: Two commission papers on governance, two on quality assurance, and two on finance (6).

Dr Lichia Saner-Yiu suggested that the goal of the joint projects was to build linkages between countries, and if possible, to facilitate further dialogues between individual researchers in long term.

Please refer to the Agenda's Appendix 2 for the original various suggestions. The details of this discussion extended into the debriefing session next day on the 4<sup>th</sup> of April. A consolidated report on the technical content and preliminary agreement on the potential research agenda for this OECD-China-Swiss project is presented in a separate document, namely, "*Technical Report on Discussions during the High Level Policy Consultation Meeting, 3-4 April 2006*".

#### POST-MEETING FOLLOW-UP

A follow-up meeting with the Swiss monitoring Group (previously known as the expert Group) will be organised in May/June 2006. It was also suggested that the Search Conference could be jointly organised by ETH Zurich and the University of Zurich to give it a greater profile.

#### PROLOGUE - INSTITUTIONAL VISITS

After the closing of this High Level Policy Consultation Meeting, the Chinese delegation, accompanied by Dr. Lichia Saner-Yiu and other CSEND staff went on a 3-day institutional visit at 1) University of Geneva, Geneva, 2) Northwest University of Applied Sciences, Olten, and 3) ETH-Zurich, Zurich.

A series of questions (see Annex 4) put forward by the Chinese delegation laid the base for discussions at these three higher education institutions. They represent the microcosm of the Swiss HE sector.

The programme of these institutional visits is presented in the Annex 5.

#### ANNEXES (hard copy if sent by ordinary mail, soft copy if sent by e-mail)

Annex 1: Final Agenda (see as separate document)

Annex 2: Participants lists for the Meeting

Annex 3: List of All participants' PowerPoint or overhead projector presentations

(The actual presentation is accessible at the following site:

[http://www.oecd.org/document/57/0,2340,en\\_2649\\_34723\\_36099641\\_1\\_1\\_1\\_1,00.html](http://www.oecd.org/document/57/0,2340,en_2649_34723_36099641_1_1_1_1,00.html))

Annex 4: Discussion Topics to be discussed with Swiss Universities

Annex 5: The visit programmes at the University of Geneva, Northwest University of Applied Sciences, and ETH Zurich

## **Annex 2: Final Agenda**

(presented as a separate document)

## Annex 2: Lists of Participants During the Meeting

### List One: Participants during the meeting held on 3<sup>rd</sup> April, 2005

1. OECD Representatives
  - Mr. Ian Whitman, Head Programme for Co-operation with Non Member Economies Directorate for Education, OECD
  - Mr. Gerhard Kowar, Consultant, Programme for Co-operation with Non Member Economies, Directorate for Education, OECD
2. Chinese Delegation
  - Mr. Fan Wenyao, Deputy Director General, National Centre for Educational Development & Research (NCEDR), Chinese Ministry of Education
  - Prof. Wang Yingjie, International and Comparative Education Research Institute, Beijing Normal University
  - Mr. SHEN Yubiao, Programme Officer, Department of International Cooperation & Exchanges, Ministry of Education (MOE), China
3. Swiss Delegation
  - Dr. Marino Ostini, Scientific advisor Multilateral Cooperation in Education, State Secretariat for Education and Research (SER)
  - Mrs. Isabella Brunelli, Scientific advisor, State Secretariat for Education and Research (SER)
  - *Mr. Andri Gieré*, Federal Office for Professional Education and Technology (BBT)
  - Dr. Lichia Saner-Yiu, President, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND) and Project Adviser
4. Invited Swiss Experts and Partners
  - *Dr. Nivardo Ischi*, Secretary General, Swiss Universities Conference (CUS)
  - *Dr. Rolf Heusser*, Centre of Accreditation and Quality Assurance of the Swiss Universities (OAQ)
  - *Dr. Haijing Wang*, China coordinator, President's staff, ETH Zurich
  - *Prof. Peter A. Abplanalp*, Former Rector, Profession of Strategic Management, Business School, Northwestern University of Applied Sciences, Olten; also representing CHINET
  - *Prof. Peter Suter*, Vice-Rector, University of Geneva
5. Member of Secretariat
  - Mr. Olivier Naray, *Project Administrator, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND)*
  - Ms. Sally T.K. Ko, *Intern, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND)*

**List Two: Participants during the meeting held on 4<sup>th</sup> April, 2005**

1. OECD Representatives
  - Mr. Ian Whitman, Head Programme for Co-operation with Non Member Economies Directorate for Education, OECD
  - Mr. Gerhard Kowar, Consultant, Programme for Co-operation with Non Member Economies, Directorate for Education, OECD
2. Chinese Delegation
  - Mr. Fan Wenyao, Deputy Director General, National Centre for Educational Development & Research (NCEDR), Chinese Ministry of Education
  - Prof. Wang Yingjie, International and Comparative Education Research Institute, Beijing Normal University
  - Mr. SHEN Yubiao, Programme Officer, Department of International Cooperation & Exchanges, Ministry of Education (MOE), China
3. Swiss Delegation
  - Dr. Lichia Saner-Yiu, President, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND) and Project Adviser
4. Member of Secretariat
  - Mr. Olivier Naray, *Project Administrator, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND)*
  - Ms. Sally T.K. Ko, *Intern, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND)*

## Annex 4: Topics for Discussions at Swiss Universities

Topics for discussions as requested by the Chinese delegation are:

- How do the "administration body" and the "decision-making body (university council, or what?...)" function in Swiss Universities?
- What are the roles played by professors in the management of universities [also concerning the relation between "administrative authority (like university Rectors)" and what are the "academic influences" (by professors) on the decision-making process].
- How do the Swiss HEIs respond to the market needs in light of globalised competition for higher education? What are they doing for multi-channel fund-raising? and how do they avoid financial risks?
- China is now emphasising "innovation" as a key for future social and economic development, and is making efforts towards building an "innovation-oriented society", for which HEIs and research institutes will have a great role to play. What's the role of Swiss HEIs in training innovative talents for the society?



## Annex 5A

### Swiss OECD China research project

#### Visit of the University of Geneva by the Chinese delegation 4<sup>th</sup> April 2006

##### List of Participants

###### Chinese Delegation

Mr. Fan Wenyao, Deputy Director General, National Centre for Educational Development & Research (NCEDR), Chinese Ministry of Education

Prof. Wang Yingjie, International and Comparative Education Research Institute, Beijing Normal University

Mr. Shen Yubiao, Programme Officer, Department of International Cooperation & Exchanges, Ministry of Education (MOE), China

###### OECD Representatives

Mr. Ian Whitman, Head Programme for Co-operation with Non Member Economies Directorate for Education, OECD

Mr. Gerhard Kowar, Consultant, Programme for Co-operation with Non Member Economies, Directorate for Education, OECD

###### CSEND Project Staff

Dr. Lichia Saner-Yiu, President, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND) and Project Adviser

Miss Sally Ko, Intern

Mr. Olivier Naray, project administrator (tbc)

###### University of Geneva

Professor Peter Suter, Vice-rector

Dr Stéphane Berthet, General Secretary

Dr Claus Haessig, Head Research Coordination Office

##### Programme

14.00 - 14.15	Opening and Introduction
14.15 - 14.45	Overview of the University (background information, management and governance structures)
14.45 - 15.15	University financing and restructuring
15.15 - 15.45	Trends and initiatives of Research Institutes and university in general in fostering innovations and developing talents
15.45 - 16.00	Final comments and closure

## Swiss OECD China research project

### Visit of the University of Geneva by the Chinese delegation

#### Time Schedule 5<sup>th</sup> of April 2006

11.00-11.15	Opening Introduction	Prof. Nuetzi
11.15-11.35	UAS Northwestern Switzerland: Management and governance structures	Prof. Abplanalp
11.35-11.45	Role of Professors; academic influence on Decision making process	Prof. Sprenger
11.45-12.00	Quality management	Prof. Stalder
12.00-12.20	Q&A I	
12.20-12.40	University Financing	Prof. Schneider
12.40-13.00	Q&A II Final comments and closure	



Eidgenössische Technische Hochschule Zürich  
Swiss Federal Institute of Technology Zurich

## Annex 5C

# OECD Switzerland-China

**April 6, 2006**

Mr. Fan Wenyao, Deputy Director General, National Centre for Educational Development & Research (NCEDR), Chinese Ministry of Education

Prof. Wang Yingjie, International and Comparative Education Research Institute, Beijing Normal University

Mr. SHEN Yubiao, Programme Officer, Department of International Cooperation & Exchanges, Ministry of Education (MOE), China

## Draft Program

**Thursday, April 6, 2006**

09:00	Arrival at ETH Zurich, ETH Zentrum <a href="http://www.ethz.ch/about/location/ethzentrum/index_EN">http://www.ethz.ch/about/location/ethzentrum/index_EN</a>	Rämistrasse 101
09:10	Introduction and Overview of ETH Zurich Professor Hans Thierstein, Prorektor International Relations ETH Zurich	CLA J1
09:45	Governance and Financing ETH Zurich Professor Gerhard Schmitt, Vice President Planning & Logistics ETH Zurich <a href="#">Website VP Planning &amp; Logistics</a>	CLA J1
10:15	Coffee	CLA J1
10:30	Quality Control Dr. Robert Perich, Head Finance & Controlling Dr. Urs Huggentobler, Institutional Research, Team Controlling	CLA J1
11:30	Sino-Swiss Research Collaboration Dr. Haijing Wang, Responsible ETH China relations	CLA J1
12:00	Lunch	Dozentenfoyer
13:30	End of visit	