

Anti Corruption Reform under the Action Plan's 2nd Implementation Cycle (2005-2006):  
Reform projects and implementation assessment

## Pakistan

### Project 1: NACS Linkages with the Education System

#### 1 Project Summary

Project Title:

NACS Linkages with the Education System

Priority Area for Reform:

Supporting Active Public Involvement

Implementing Institution:

National Accountability Bureau/Ministry of Education

Contact Person:

Col. (retd.) Aftab Haseeb, Expert NACS

Beginning and End of the Project:

**Starting date: 1<sup>st</sup> July 2004**

Stage 1: (8 weeks) Diagnosis of the weaknesses of the existing systems

Stage 2: (2 weeks) Presentation of findings to curriculum developers in Ministry of Education and two leading private sector school system

Stage 3: (8 weeks) Changes in the curriculum to include anti-corruption themes

Stage 4: (8 weeks) Approval of the curriculum by the Ministry of Education

Stage 5: (24 months) Inclusion of the approved changes in the curriculum

#### 2 Project Contexts

Which deficiencies and/or problems that allow corruption to proliferate does the project address and aim to resolve? Please outline the related current legal or institutional framework and its weaknesses or the exact circumstances that require improvement:

In the last few years Pakistan has been faced with corruption as a major hurdle on its path to progress. There are a number of reasons for the increase in the incidence in the last few years but probably the most sinister has been rising levels of indifference and acceptance in society. The problem has been identified in the awareness campaign designed by the National Accountability Bureau and various interventions to rectify the situation have been designed and some of these are under implementation. Students have been identified as the key component for a change in the ethos as they not only are in a formative phase but can also affect the behaviour of the parents. There are two broad methodologies to address the issue: direct interaction with the students and changes in curriculum. In view of the large size of the country the latter will have a larger outreach. However completion of the task will require some effort. Current curriculum does include morality

based content but there is a need for more objective based inclusion of themes. The deficiencies exist not only in the public sector education system, that follows the curriculum prescribed by the Ministry of Education, but also the private school systems that have their own modified versions. The other major deficiency is training of teachers for the purpose. Teachers' training will be included as a follow up of the curriculum development.

### 3 Expected Outcome of the Project

In relation to the above mentioned deficiencies and/or problems, which concrete improvements are expected to be achieved through the project? In which way does the project help to curb corruption?

Society in Pakistan is well aware of the problem of corruption and there is genuine concern at all levels. This awareness provides both an opportunity and a challenge. It can be guided and enhanced to obtain results in the fight against corruption through a partnership of society with NAB and the government. The enhanced awareness may have utility in terms of a sustained commitment of the present and future governments towards combating corruption. (It is also a challenge to the government because it has the potential of very quickly converting to cynicism and apathy if expectations are not met)

Any effort to effectively reduce corruption in a country that faces high levels will have long gestation periods. Provided the efforts do not wane an approximate time period is one generation. In view of this it is pertinent to target the young boys and girls who will become a part of practical life in a few years time and hopefully take over a society that is on the path of progress. In the period in between the increased awareness and comprehension of issues by students will add to society's stock of knowledge and consciousness.

Within the context of curriculum changes itself there may be a need to add more content for improvement of the child's understanding of the relationship between state and society and the role of government. There are weaknesses that will be identified during the course of the project.

### 4 Components – Main Activities – Method

What are the project's components, implementation steps, main activities and/or methods to achieve the above-mentioned outcome and objectives?

The methodology of the project will be primarily interactive. There will be 4 Provincial workshops – one at each provincial headquarters followed by a National Workshop at the Federal level. The workshops will involve students, teachers, parents and non government organisations in the education sector. This will be followed by more focussed interaction with students through visits to about twenty schools. Group mix in both cases will consist of public/ private sector as well as the rural and urban.

Concurrent study of some of the more developed international models will also be undertaken.

On completion of the diagnosis meetings will be held with specialised curriculum developers of the Ministry of Education and the larger private school systems to explain the findings. These experts will then accordingly make the relevant changes and present them for approval to the Ministry of Education.

### 5 Involvement of non-governmental actors

In which way does the project involve civil society actors or other stakeholders and have they been consulted during the project development phase?

The Project does envisage involvement of private sector schools as well as NGOs working in the field. Even at the preparation stage two of the largest school systems in the country have been involved along with some NGOs.

### 6 Related Projects under the 1<sup>st</sup> Implementation Cycle

Is the project linked to reforms accomplished under the Action Plan's 1st Implementation Cycle? In which way does this project follow up previous activities?

The Project is linked to the previous project taken up by Pakistan, i.e. the 'Initiation of Public Awareness Campaign at Different Levels'. In fact it is a component of this project. The Awareness campaign has identified various sub groups for focussed work, these include Civil Servants, Legislators and Students. The present project takes on a more focussed approach towards students. The project will be supplemented by sustained work of the proposed Awareness Wing of the National Accountability Bureau, presently being undertaken under the auspices of the National Anti-corruption Strategy.

### 7 Project Financing and Budget

Approved or estimated overall project budget:	US\$ 60,000*
Is external funding required?	No
If external funding is required, have donor organisations been approached yet, and have any commitments been made?	No
If external funding is required, what percentage of the total project costs requires external funding?	NA

### 8 Technical Assistance

Is external technical assistance required? Have relevant agencies been approached and have they made any commitments?

There might be need of some input for familiarization with international practices and models.

\* Implementation costs i.e. for stage 5 are expected to be substantially higher and have not been included in this estimate

## Implementation Assessment

---

### 9 Output Evaluation

Has the impact of the project on the identified deficiency (cf. item 2 above) been measured or evaluated? Please describe the evaluation method and the outcome.

The project has not reached fruition therefore the impact can not be evaluated.

### 10 Overall Project Assessment

Did the project meet the defined goal (cf. item 3 above)? Did the project remedy the deficiency identified (cf. item 2 above)? Has the project been fully implemented in the foreseen timeframe (cf. item 1 above)?

First two goals of the project have been achieved. The diagnosis process has been completed and outcomes presented to the Ministry of Education. The Ministry has agreed with the selected themes identified for inclusion in the curriculum.

The third goal of the project i.e inclusion of the themes in the National Curriculum is held up because the Ministry has not yet started the review of the curriculum which was scheduled in end 2005,

### 11 Project Design Changes (if any)

Have any modifications to the project been made in the course of its implementation compared to the initial design of the project (cf. item 4 above)? What circumstances made these changes advisable or necessary?

No change is required at present.

### 12 Major Lessons Learned

Given the assessment of the project above, what experience can be drawn from the implementation of this project for future reform projects under the Anti-Corruption Action Plan?

Can be intimated after completion of the project.

### 13 Follow-Up

Is it planned to continue or extend this project or to continue a linked reform project? Which measures have been taken to ensure the sustainability of the outcome and the future assessment of the project's impact?

NIL

## Project 2: Monitoring of Asset Declarations of Government Servants

### 1 Project Summary

Project Title:

Monitoring of Asset Declarations of Government Servants

---

Priority Area for Reform:

Developing Effective and Transparent Systems for Public Service

---

Implementing Institution:

National Accountability Bureau/Establishment Division

---

Contact Person:

Mr. Hassan Saqib Shiekh, Deputy Director NACS

---

Beginning and End of the Project:

**Starting date: 1<sup>st</sup> July 2004**

Stage 1: (4 weeks)	Development of Software for Computerisation of the New Profoma
Stage 2: (6 weeks)	Development of Monitoring Criteria and Mechanism
Stage 3: (2 weeks)	Approval of the Software by NACS Implementation Committee
Stage 4: (2 weeks)	Development and circulation of guidelines for filling up and filing of the declarations
Stage 5: (16 weeks)	Training of key Officials in the use of the Software and the mechanism

---

### 2 Project Context

Which deficiencies and/or problems that allow corruption to proliferate does the project address and aim to resolve? Please outline the related current legal or institutional framework and its weaknesses or the exact circumstances that require improvement:

Accumulation of Assets beyond known means is a crime under the National Accountability Ordinance and the Prevention of Corruption Act 1947. It also entails disciplinary proceedings under Government Servants Conduct Rules 1964. Over the years the process has become a superfluous exercise as the declarations were never opened over entire careers. In some cases they were not even submitted. As the National Accountability Bureau came into existence in 1999 the problems were manifested as cases of assets beyond known means were investigated. Resultantly the issue was added to the National Anti-corruption Strategy and a new computer compatible form has been designed and approved by the Implementation Committee of the National Anti-corruption Strategy. However, redesigning the form will be of little use without a software to computerise the data and development of a monitoring mechanism.

### 3 Expected Outcome of the Project

In relation to the above mentioned deficiencies and/or problems, which concrete improvements are expected to be achieved through the project? In which way does the project help to curb corruption?

The process of monitoring of the declarations by itself will not dent corruption but in an overall environmental change produce a salutary effect as it does add to the culture of accountability of the government servant.

In combination with the efforts to curb 'benami practices' and overall documentation monitoring of asset declarations would facilitate the culture of avoiding conflict of interest situations while strengthening the increased consciousness of accountability. It will also assist the work of the anti-corruption agencies like NAB and the internal disciplinary processes.

The application of the new system would be prospective so that it does not remain entangled with the existing one. A number of cumbersome processes will be deleted to allow the government servant some breathing space, these include removal of permission for purchase of property and bringing the period in line with the financial year – as per the income tax law.

### 4 Components – Main Activities – Method

What are the project's components, implementation steps, main activities and/or methods to achieve the above mentioned outcome and objectives?

As the first step the new form has already been designed and approved by the Implementation Committee of the National Anti-corruption Strategy and has been sent to the Establishment Division for implementation.

To develop the monitoring mechanism the first step is the development of a computer software that can create a database that will not only help in monitoring of the individual declarations but also be useful for policy decisions. The Secretariat to the National Anti-corruption Strategy that has designed the new form will outsource the computerization. This is the first stage. It is envisaged that triggers would be introduced into the software to identify unusual changes. The monitoring process itself would remain in the control of the head of the organization and not an external agency. However the detailed monitoring mechanism would include more than just the use of the software and would be developed in parallel with it.

The next step would be the approval of the mechanism by the Implementation Committee of the National Anti-corruption Strategy and eventual implementation by the Establishment Division in the Federal government and the corresponding departments in the provincial governments.

After the approval the most important aspect would be the training of the users of the system, the heads of organizations and other people in the organization who would use it. This exercise will take some time in view of the size of the bureaucracy.

### 5 Involvement of non-governmental actors

In which way does the project involve civil society actors or other stakeholders and have they been consulted during the project development phase?

The project does not involve non-governmental actors.

## 6 Related Projects under the 1<sup>st</sup> Implementation Cycle

Is the project linked to reforms accomplished under the Action Plan's 1st Implementation Cycle? In which way does this project follow up previous activities?

No it is not linked to the previous projects taken up by Pakistan

## 7 Project Financing and Budget

Approved or estimated overall project budget: To be prepared

Is external funding required? No

If external funding is required, have donor organisations been approached yet, and have any commitments been made? No

If external funding is required, what percentage of the total project costs requires external funding? NA

## 8 Technical Assistance

Is external technical assistance required? Have relevant agencies been approached and have they made any commitments?

There is technical expertise available within the country to achieve this task.

## Implementation Assessment

## 9 Output Evaluation

Has the impact of the project on the identified deficiency (cf. item 2 above) been measured or evaluated? Please describe the evaluation method and the outcome.

Impact of the project can be evaluated in year 2007 when base year filing are compared with the filing for the year 2006 which is due in September 2006

## 10 Overall Project Assessment

Did the project meet the defined goal (cf. item 3 above)? Did the project remedy the deficiency identified (cf. item 2 above)? Has the project been fully implemented in the foreseen timeframe (cf. item 1 above)?

The project has been completed. It has met all its goals. The new system of asset declaration and monitoring has been notified by the Establishment Division of the Government of Pakistan for all the public official. All the public officials have declared their assets in year 2005 on the new

proforma. A software has been developed and supplied to all the stake-holders and training has been carried out for the key personnel down to the provincial capitals.

### 11 Project Design Changes (if any)

Have any modifications to the project been made in the course of its implementation compared to the initial design of the project (cf. item 4 above)? What circumstances made these changes advisable or necessary?

Nil

### 12 Major Lessons Learned

Given the assessment of the project above, what experience can be drawn from the implementation of this project for future reform projects under the Anti-Corruption Action Plan?

- 1) The computer programme developed for the system needs to be debugged for some shortcomings that have been noticed.
- 2) An extensive programme of continuous training would be required for the operating personnel and organizational leaders for effective utilization of the system.

### 13 Follow-Up

Is it planned to continue or extend this project or to continue a linked reform project? Which measures have been taken to ensure the sustainability of the outcome and the future assessment of the project's impact?

NAB will have remain involved in the implementation of the project till the computer programme is debugged and training for the operators and organizational leaders is completed.