

DIRECTORATE FOR EDUCATION

Global Forum on Education

THE CHALLENGES FOR EDUCATION IN A GLOBAL ECONOMY

Conference Report

24-25 October 2005
Santiago, Chile

The following report is a synthesis of six reports submitted for each session of the Global Forum on Education. The rapporteurs for the following sessions were:

*Session 1: Maria Slowey
Session 2: Madlen Serban
Session 3: Kari Brustad
Session 4: Adewahap Hechiche
Session 5: Elsa Hackl
Session 6: Linda Beijlsmit*

Copies of papers are available from the OECD or Ministry of Education in Chile. Presentations are also available on the website of the Global Forum, www.oecd.org/eduforum2005

A.D. Tillen, General Rapporteur

Ian Whitman (Email: Ian.Whitman@oecd.org; Tel: +33 (0) 1 45 24 92 99)

JT00196380

Introduction

1. The opening session contained presentations from Mr. Sergio Bitar, Minister of Education of Chile; Mr. Donald J. Johnston, Secretary General of the OECD and Mr. Bertel Haarder, Minister for Education and for Ecclesiastical Affairs of Denmark.
2. Minister Bitar welcomed delegates and participants and thanked the OECD for choosing Santiago as the location of the First Global Forum on Education. He pointed out that globalisation and education were strongly linked but should be part of a multilateral world order that respected different political, social and economic voices.
3. The education policies in Chile promote both quality and equity. The current government has developed policies to overcome its education and economic deficits to ensure that all young citizens participate in a 12-year education cycle. Policy-making depends on consensus, which requires openness and political intelligence. As illustrations, the Minister discussed Chile's approach to lifelong learning and teacher education. The former is targeted at adults who have not completed their 12-year cycle and provides continuous opportunities for upgrading and qualification catch-up as well as ensuring that education will begin early (pre-school). These activities have the support of business groups in Chile.
4. Teachers are essential to the ambitious curriculum reforms. The government has improved terms, support and facilities while the teachers' union, together with the municipalities has embraced assessments. These changes, together with the election of school principals and a renewed link between schools, education faculties and universities will enhance quality.
5. Chile values international links, such as the OECD, as a way of comparing and improving its education system. This should be a two-way street as developing countries have their own policy lessons and provide a useful perspective for international agencies. Chile, for example, has taken a number of international initiatives in the fields of curriculum reform, education portals and civic education.
6. Mr. Donald J. Johnston (OECD) reminded participants that while the OECD consisted of 30 member countries it now has over 70 programmes which involve non-member countries. Education, in the context of "globalisation", was the priority of priorities. Both the pace of change and market integration, which was far from complete, created new occupational opportunities but required greater employment flexibility. The success in Ireland shows that education can provide an adaptable base to take advantage of new opportunities. However, education institutions are under pressure to ensure continuous learning while at the same time coping with new demographic patterns such as immigration. Education and public schools have the task of integrating populations.
7. Globalisation has also brought about income disparities and concerns about job insecurity, as a result of the growing pace of technological change and displacement. A satisfactory national policy might not answer the needs of individual communities and politicians are then faced with difficult choices as the speaker's experience of textile towns in Quebec demonstrated.
8. While the main outlines of globalisation and the demands placed on education are increasingly apparent, there are gaps that must be filled. Firstly, better education in terms of personal responsibilities for health, the environment and finances. While there is a growing recognition that lifestyles lead to health problems such as obesity and so require better education that leads to behavioural change, there should be a similar concern for planning lifetime finances. A recent OECD report, *Improving Financial Literacy*, showed that only four out of 10 of the cross-national sample could be described as financially literate. This comes at a time when individuals and families are being asked to take greater responsibility for their financial future. Secondly, while welcoming greater mobility (there are over two million non-resident

students in Europe) and new delivery modes in higher education, there are risks from unscrupulous providers and false qualifications. The OECD, together with UNESCO, has recently published Guidelines on Quality Provision of Cross Border Education that establishes a code for greater transparency regarding cross border qualifications and institutions. These are examples about how education and globalisation are linked and present challenges that require international responses.

9. Minister Haarder (Denmark) had no doubt about the positive gains and advantages that came from globalisation. For the large majority of the world's population, it brings substantial growth and prosperity. Yet one could not underestimate the fears globalisation engenders, as illustrated by the recent vote against the European constitution in Holland and France as well as Denmark's refusal to join the Euro zone.

10. For a country like Denmark, globalisation creates new jobs and replaces older jobs with better jobs. While the state must offer a degree of security, job markets require a flexible labour force, a trade-off which he called flexi-security. Job flexibility should be accompanied by public "safety nets" that provide protection for those out of work. This economic transition must avoid segments of the labour force falling behind, possibly resulting in economic ghettos which may become a civic and social threat.

11. The Danish government has set up a globalisation council that, together with the government, promoted a globalisation commission. Their consensus after four years work was that there was no alternative to a competitive workforce, which had to be based on lifelong learning.

12. Lifelong learning will require greater quality and institutional flexibility. First, the Commission was surprised to discover that even after several years of schooling (pre-school and primary school), some students were unable to read. There has to be a renewed commitment to learning. Companies concerned about adult literacy are supporting on and off-job literacy and training schemes. Lifelong learning should become a focus of employer/employee negotiations. Second, there should be a renewal of vocational education and training as a path to advanced technical skills. Practical experiences of the real world motivate some students more than academic studies and this should not preclude them from acquiring greater skills. Two recently appointed senior Danish government officials are vocational graduates. There should be no dead ends in lifelong learning.

13. These demands require changes in education based on up-to-date research such as the recent OECD report on literacy, which identifies reading as a fundamental skill for globalisation. Feedback and reflection should help build an evaluation and knowledge culture, which cannot be isolated from globalisation. While higher education must provide safeguards, cross border students are an opportunity rather than a problem. The Bologna and Copenhagen processes encourage common understandings. A division within Europe would be as damaging as any attempt by Europe to isolate itself from the world.

Session 1 – Assuring Access to Lifelong Learning for All. Chaired by Ms. Susan Sclafani, former Assistant Secretary of State for Education, United States.

The concept of lifelong learning

14. Lifelong learning is a complex policy concept which is subject to different, sometimes competing, interpretations. Three main approaches can be discerned. First, some interpretations of lifelong learning focus on areas of education that are largely post-school and often outside the formal education system – such as work based and community learning. Second, lifelong learning is sometimes used as an analytic tool to look across the entire life-course of the individual – from pre-school education through to the learning of older adults. The third approach focuses on the development of the learning skills that

individuals need to acquire to adapt to changing social, economic and personal circumstances – lifelong learning as “learning to learn”.

15. In one way or another all of these dimensions featured in the discussions in Session 1 and also in the opening session of the forum. In the latter, Minister Bitar highlighted both the importance of lifelong learning and the challenging nature of ensuring its delivery. In Chile, this has led to the establishment of a senior level inter-departmental group comprising of three different ministries to develop integrated policies in this area.

16. The contributions in Session 1 provided an opportunity for these matters to be explored in more detail.

Developing an analytic framework

17. In reporting on the work undertaken under the auspices of the Working Group on Lifelong Learning of the Asia-Europe Meeting (ASEM), Mr. Jørn Skovsgaard (Denmark) provided a comparative analysis of the different approaches and traditions which underpin education in different countries. Building on this comparative approach, so important in the context of globalisation, the ASEM Working Group then developed a framework for the analysis of the progression through different forms of social organisation from agriculture to the knowledge society. This in turn led to the development of an overarching conceptual framework for the identification of key competencies associated with the knowledge society.

18. The Asia-Europe meeting is not an organisation but an inter-governmental forum which identifies projects on which joint work might be undertaken. With the support of the Europe-Asia Foundation, the outcomes of the Working Group on Lifelong Learning are being taken forward through the establishment of an education research hub in May 2005.

19. Part of the initial ground clearing work which needed to be undertaken related to differences in vocabulary and educational approach. In broad terms, two clusters were identified. The dominant educational approach in most of the Asian countries tended to focus on the curriculum. For example, there was an emphasis on results, capacities and skills, summative testing and conceptualisation. In the European countries, the focus tended to be more on didactics. Hence, the emphasis placed on process, capabilities and competencies, formative assessment and contextualisation. In practice, examples were found which fell outside these broad clusters and overall some suggestion of movement towards greater synergy and an adaptive approach in response to common global forces.

20. In helping prepare learners not only to survive but thrive in the knowledge society, Mr. Skovsgaard drew on sociological analysis of the shift between four major forms of economic and social organisation – agricultural, industrial, service and knowledge. Each of these provide different contexts and orientation as the perspective shifts along a continuum from the local through the national to the global, and changes according to factors such as the regulation of production, the key drivers of growth, the nature of who constitutes the “progressive producers”, the ideals for outputs and the implicit ideological goals for education.

21. Thus, in relation to education, he argued that, in agricultural economies the dominant focus of education tends to be on subservience and the development of useful subjects. In industrial economies, the dominant emphasis in education is on the development of disciplined workers and the assertion of rights and duties. In service based economies, education focuses on the development of motivated and self-reliant citizens, while in knowledge based economies the dominant emphasis is on the development of “risk-taking entrepreneurs, focused on the global context and technological advance”.

22. Importantly, he pointed to the fact that there can be overlap and co-existence of different forms of society at any one time – in other words, moving from one form of social organisation to another is not like the linear progress between stations on a railway line. “We are all part of a process of globalisation, but the patterns of how this occurs will differ between different societies.”

23. In addressing the key competencies required for the knowledge society and economy, a prior question relates to why governments and individuals should invest scarce resources in education and training? The ASEM Working Group on Lifelong Learning identified three main reasons why individuals should invest in education associated with (a) increased employability opportunities, (b) greater chances of engaging as active citizens and (c) for personal fulfilment. For governments, investment in education and training is associated with (a) the development of human capital, (b) the promotion of social cohesion and (c) the development of the benefits of cultural diversity.

24. Working with the three key competencies developed by the OECD, the working group developed an overarching conceptual framework for key competencies for the knowledge society. This framework provides:

- Justification (employability, active citizenship and personal fulfilment).
- Key competencies (to act autonomously, using tools interactively, interact in heterogeneous groups).
- Foundations – knowledge, skills and attitudes (communicative, analytical, personal).

25. Mr. Skovsgaard pointed out that, unusually for this type of discussion, no reference had been made to computer literacy. The reason for this was anticipation that IT developments over coming decades would render training for non-specialist users as redundant as the notion of training in the use of a ballpoint pen would appear to us at present.

26. The work of the ASEM group will now move on to a new phase with a major focus on comparative research. The initial base for the education research hub is in Denmark but it is envisaged that it will rotate between an Asian country and a European country on a regular basis.

27. He concluded:

In a period in which global integration of economy, production schemes, cultures, enhanced competition, etc. are challenging the traditional values in local communities and the role of the national state, education must create a platform for the good life here and now and yet shape a portal to the future and the wide world.

Case Study I: Thailand

28. In outlining the first case study of lifelong learning in practice, Ms. Areeya Rojvithee focused in particular on the link between education and training in the world of work. Under the *National Education Act of 1999*, lifelong learning in Thailand is defined as “education resulting from integration of formal, non-formal and informal education so as to create ability for continuous lifelong development of quality of life”.

29. Educational policies in Thailand are shaped by three main factors – the constitution, the national economic and development plan and the policies of the current government. As in most countries, lifelong

learning straddles at least two ministries – education and labour (in particular through the Department of Skill and Development).

30. A member of the ILO since 1919, it is fitting that a key focus of current attention is on skill development of the workforce. Through training centres distributed throughout the country, a major training programme has been initiated combining both practical (80%) and theoretical elements alongside a new scheme to facilitate credit accumulation and transfer. Significant tax incentives have also been introduced to encourage employers to support employees in retraining and upgrading their skills.

31. Ms. Rojvithee emphasised the important role which the ASEM working group had played in promoting exchange of information and ideas. Given the fact that it is difficult for any individual country to maintain its knowledge and skill base, international exchange of information and ideas is crucial to keep abreast of the impact of the forces of globalisation. It is only through co-operation and sharing of responsibility and information on skills development at the national and regional levels that we can be fully aware of the changing needs of the workplace.

Case Study II: Malaysia

32. In his description of developments in Malaysia, Mr. Ruslan Abdul Shukor emphasised the importance of adopting a multi-dimensional approach to lifelong learning. The pressures of globalisation and rapid technological and demographic changes all point to the need for the involvement of other government departments in addition to the key roles of the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Human Resources. These include the Ministry of Youth and Sports, the Ministry of Entrepreneurship and Co-operative Development, the Ministry of Agriculture and the Ministry of Health.

33. Five major target groups have been identified for lifelong learning policy: the employed, the unemployed, people with special needs, older adults and potential entrepreneurs. A wide range of providers of education and training is involved in catering for the very different needs of these groups.

34. Here, ambitious goals have been set for e-learning initiatives and also for tertiary education which has a particular role to play in three main ways:

- As a catalyst in generating a knowledgeable, skilled and competent human resource to fulfil the needs and vision of the nation.
- To assist in the development of critical, creative and innovative minds.
- As a principal agent for developing a more equitable socio-economic and moral society.

35. Tax relief is available to individuals and corporations and a joint effort is encouraged by the public and private sectors which appear to have embraced the culture of lifelong learning. In Malaysia, and also elsewhere, “the collective mindset towards learning must be changed if the vision of creating a learning society is to be realized”.

Case Study III: Dominican Republic

36. The third case study was presented by Ms. Matilde Chavez and based on a major project initiated under the auspices of the First Lady of the Dominican Republic, Ms. Margarita Cedeno de Ferdande. This initiative aims not only to improve literacy rates but also to build communities of learning in areas of social and economic disadvantage. While the overall levels of illiteracy in the population aged 14 or over is estimated as being in the region of 13%, this rises to 30% in disadvantaged areas.

37. In response to these needs and as a strategy to help meet the U.N. Millennium Goals, a new approach through community technology centres has been developed. At present (October 2005) 24 such centres are in operation, mainly in the most remote and most disadvantaged areas, with the aim of reaching 135 spread throughout the country.

38. Key to the success of the concept is the idea that these centres should be self-managed by the local community, thereby assisting in the promotion of civil engagement in addition to skill development. Four stages are involved:

Stage 1: Local people are involved in the plans for development and management of the community technology centres.

Stage 2: All the necessary equipment and tools are provided under the scheme.

Stage 3: Basic services are made available, including internet access, e-mail, e-government and e-commerce.

Stage 4: Integrated training opportunities are provided.

39. There is a major emphasis on non-formal learning, particularly targeted at the marginalised in urban and rural areas, under the overall campaign slogan “Prepare [in order] to compete”.

Discussion

40. In the wide-ranging discussion following the presentations, four main themes emerged.

(i) Guidance

41. The importance of providing independent educational and vocational guidance at various stages of the individual’s lifecycle was emphasised as being central to delivery of lifelong learning strategies.

(ii) Motivation

42. The pace of social and occupational change (there will be few “jobs for life”) means that there is a need to develop an active learning culture for all – school may be finished but learning is not.

(iii) Innovative approaches to education and training

43. New approaches to education need to be found to re-engage learners who may have had negative experiences and also for adults through, for example, work based learning. The importance of raising the standards of teacher training in general in this regard was emphasised. Also, particular skills were highlighted such as those working with learners with special needs and, given the research evidence of the crucial importance on brain formation of early years, of training people to work with the pre-school age groups

(iv) Research

44. More and better quality comparative research is required to help inform policy decisions and to assist in making the best choices for the investment of scarce resources. As one commentator observed, education research is at the state where medical research was approximately a century ago. Here, OECD has an important role to play in stimulating both research and associated innovation – for many years

educationalists have been talking about learner-centred approaches, but do we really know what works best in what particular contexts?

Session 2 – Quality and equity: challenges for education and training in a global perspective. Chaired by Mr. Pavel Zgaga, Professor at the University of Ljubljana, Slovenia and former Minister of Education and Sports.

45. The session theme was examined from the perspective of two developing countries (Chile and Romania), that of a developed country, Belgium, and a regional overview based on the work of the Inter-American Development Bank.

46. Mr. Cristián Cox (Chile) considered that the global challenges of quality and equity had to be part of a comprehensive education policy. He noted six key issues:

1. The policy balance between quality and equity that typically favours quality – equity needs to be equally addressed.
2. The tension between global and national pressures over the curriculum which require a balance between global influences and national realities. This was particularly important for developing and transition countries which are not necessarily knowledge driven economies.
3. Accountability and capacity building or the balance between assessment systems run in favour of improved accountability and effective support programmes for teachers' capacity building.
4. The importance of quality teachers which underlines the crucial contribution of teacher training and development for both quality and equity. However equity priorities are not always followed by equivalent actions.
5. Equity-oriented policies: the need to go against inertia, particularly in Latin American countries where inequality is much more pronounced than in OECD countries. Equity has a long-term return but the disadvantaged do not always have a voice in our societies. There should be a strong commitment to discovering and implementing specific and targeted actions. These include pedagogical challenges such as the expansion of pre-school education and recognising and improving its compensatory effects amongst the poorer groups, together with explicit and coherent teacher education and professional development for socially diverse groups.
6. Policy making for quality-equity agendas in Latin America: what type of political requirements? The question focuses on how to produce high quality education at a systemic level.

47. Mr. Cox underlined the need to balance globalisation with national needs for development. International solutions should be adapted and adjusted to local conditions. Education policies should be long-term and create a national consensus about the main goals. The last statement is crucial and represents the backbone to Chile's achievements.

48. Ms. Paloma Cecilia Petrescu, Secretary of State for Education (Romania) introduced her country's experience with equity-related policies and strategies. Beginning with the assumption that individuals are not alone in learning failure, the presenter underlined the systemic approach Romania has adopted in preventing marginalisation and social exclusion, as well as in alleviating the effects of inequity. Equity in education refers to both access to education and to differentiated treatment applied to achieve comparable learning results; and so equity is connected to quality.

49. The standards of equity in education adopted in Romania can be illustrated with programmes currently being implemented. Standards refer to: (i) political framework; (ii) education environment; (iii) pre- and in-service teacher education; (iv) teaching and assessment processes; (v) education personnel and curricular materials; (vi) individualised education planning; (vii) allocation of financial resources and (viii) standard-based educational reform.

50. Ms. Petrescu emphasised the importance of partnerships among the main social actors to diagnose problems and find appropriate solutions for inclusive education. When decisions are closer to the education services provider, there is a presumption that more accurate and timely responses will be forthcoming so education management decentralisation must be involved. Equity associated responsibilities are being reallocated to national and regional decision making institutions. School based management efficiency and effectiveness is assessed according to Romania's recently adopted quality assurance procedures.

51. Mr. Gaby Hostens (Belgium) discussed the Flemish case within the context of OECD education mandates stemming from ministerial meetings which have taken place since 1991. He mentioned the socio-economic context for the mandates and their impact on education policies. The author offered the equity and quality conceptual approach. The three main components of education quality are:

- Accessibility: access, enrolment.
- Effectiveness: teacher quality, instructional materials, learning environment, supervision, relevance.
- Efficiency: school management, appropriate mix of input, allocation and use of physical and teaching facilities, supply services, use of new technology.¹

52. Equity, frequently used as a synonym for "equality", can also be viewed as less compelling because it is a more open concept and hence politically more acceptable. The concept of equity also includes ideas such as the spirit of justice and fairness.

53. The author discussed equity by using the PISA 2000 and 2003 mathematical literacy scores achieved by Flemish students, from the perspective of their socio-economic background, school performances and study programmes. In analysing the main reasons for students' low achievement, the author highlighted the social background, the impact of ethnicity and the weak mastery of the language of instruction. In the case of schools, the socio-economic composition of the student body has a strong impact, but there are also differences between schools with the same socio-economic background. These factors explain the large gap between high and low performers in the system, hence the broad range in performance found in the Flemish system.

54. Equitable policies ("governance for equity") have to focus on raising the performance of all students by overcoming the barriers of socio-economic background, gender, geographic conditions and schools. The overarching policy objective of the minister of education is to dramatically raise the performance of students with a low socio-economic status (mainly immigrant students), and at the same time have a high percentage of excellent performers. For the speaker, the true quality of an education and training system reveals itself in the achievements and performances of the weakest students, especially

¹ Rameckers, Frans J.M.A. 'Effective Monitoring of the Quality of Education' *Secondary Education in Africa: Strategies for Renewal, Africa Region Human Development Working Paper Series* (World Bank, May 2002).

those with a low socio-economic background. There is a need to challenge inertia and this must be a policy priority.

55. The strategic goal of future actions can be summarised as “From today’s champions in mathematics to tomorrow’s champions in equal opportunities” in view of raising the performance of underachievers (both students and schools).

56. Mr. Hostens mentioned the following as examples:

1. Governance for quality and equity emphasising the need both for stronger leadership at central and school levels focusing on core responsibilities (quality, equity, relevancy, effective use of resources, democratic and efficient management) and also the need to enhance steering capacity at the institutional level by improving the stakeholders involvement in order to facilitate school improvement. School self-evaluation was one potential mechanism, but without performance tables or school rankings.
2. Mastering the language of instruction.
3. Allocation of additional resources for schools with students from low socio-economic background. Choices and freedom of education are regarded as quality drivers and a culture of high expectations is equally important.

57. Mr. Juan Carlos Navarro (Inter-American Development Bank) provided an overview of Latin-American education from the perspective of the challenges of the global economy.

58. The key determinants for education policy were the global knowledge economy, the impact on the labour market (work organisation and skills) and the need for human resources profiling. Education policy must recognise that these are global and not just regional trends.

59. The analysis was presented by examining the following: a growing skill bias; a growing gap in education attainment of the population aged over 25; problems with the growth equation – mainly highlighted by the total factor productivity (TFP) regressions; persistent low quality of education as illustrated by the PISA performances of countries in the region; unproductive education spending; the average years of education by income level; large regional differences of education attainment of youngsters in the group age 15 to 19; trends in schooling among the adult population.

60. The speaker set out the achievements and the deficits faced by the region. The priorities, while taking into account the financial, institutional and political constraints, should be to:

1. Close the gap in education attainment and learning.
2. Expand and reform tertiary education.
3. Accelerate the development of science and technology.
4. Ensure that training is flexible, market driven, and continuous.

Discussion

61. In their interventions, the Global Education Forum participants asked either for clarifications or simply emphasised key aspects presented by speakers.

- Sustaining consensus on policy development of main stakeholders and building trust were discussed as conditions for improving equity and quality that have long term return. Synchronisation of education timing with political timing is the main challenge when political support is needed.
- Effective and efficient school management and governance are prerequisites for equity and quality improvement. Support programmes for leadership enhancement have to be designed and implemented to empower the social actors to achieve their responsibilities. The statement is also valid for teacher training which has to remain an education priority focused on creating knowledge-rich schooling systems.
- Social capital, as with human capital, makes a crucial contribution to sustainable development.
- The role of government, at central or regional level, was also mentioned in relation to securing access to education for all those students who failed the entrance exams to a particular school – chosen either for its reputation or its proximity from the student’s residence (the latter labelled “parents and students voting with their feet”). At the same time, positive pro-active reaction is expected from parents in favour of ensuring participation for their children. The engagement of students as owners of learning is crucial and therefore education policy should contribute to a learning environment and an organisation of schools which makes learning attractive and stimulates the predisposition of students to learn effectively.
- Devolving responsibility to local authorities and schools could increase the responsiveness to local needs. However, concerns have been expressed about the role of government in providing a framework by which poorer performing schools receive necessary support for improvement in view of securing student access to equivalent learning opportunities.
- Funding allocations based on normative approaches, *e.g.* the per capita formula could motivate schools to market themselves better and attract and motivate more students to continue their education. The per capita formula should allow for additional resource allocations for students from disadvantaged backgrounds.
- Spending on education is necessary for the provision of high-quality schooling for individualised programmes, but spending alone does not guarantee better outcomes. Therefore, accountability mechanisms should take this into account.
- Early childhood education has been mentioned as contributing to long-lasting learning outcomes, but was intended to be a panacea for solving equity and quality of compulsory and post-compulsory schooling. There is a need for a pro-active stance from governments to ensure adequate access and quality of early education programmes.
- It was acknowledged that education and knowledge capital are the keys to sustainable development and for enhancing the knowledge economy. Although it is not possible to generalise with regard to the “recipe” for successful policies given the broad domain of equity and quality, the participants at the forum underlined the need for a common vision on priorities to be achieved on a national level. Each country should decide which education level has to be expanded and where quality should be improved – observing the national needs and considering global trends. Political commitment is needed in support of improvement in education. Equity and quality are both national and international issues so that events like the OECD Global Education Forum facilitate the sharing of experiences in the pursuit of achieving greater equity and access for all to quality education.

Session 3 – Special education needs: towards inclusive education. Chaired by Mr. Robert Prouty, World Bank.

62. Mr. Peter Evans (OECD) provided an overview of the major trends. The UN Charter, the Millennium Goals, Education for All (EFA) and other international agreements stress the importance of the right to education. Why include children with special needs in education? Everybody should have opportunities, the right to contribute to the development of society, pay their taxes and decrease benefit costs. School reforms are needed to reduce the rate of failure, educate more students to be able to function in the knowledge economy and to tackle child and family poverty. Inclusion means improved social cohesion, decreased prejudice and more effective and efficient use of resources. Almost all children are included within the education system in OECD countries. There are also strong legal and policy frameworks for inclusion of all children. However, the picture is nebulous regarding inclusion of children with special needs in regular schools. A lot of countries have a large percentage of children in special classes and special schools.

63. Inclusive schools are different. They plan, *inter alia*, for diversity, have professional development, external support services work in a more cohesive way with the schools, parental and community involvement is especially strong, curriculum development allows schools to personalise the curriculum and classroom organisation allows for the development of for instance team teaching, and the creation of small groups.

64. Many students with disabilities who may be thought unable to benefit do rather well. There are a number of students with disabilities who are often excluded from education because of their disability who are performing better than many who attend school and are not discriminated against. As a result, legal and policy frameworks are needed so that students with disabilities can be effectively included. Evidence from the PISA 2003 report shows that these students can perform rather well, contribute to economy and society and not be a financial burden. However for inclusion in mainstream schools to work, they have to be organised differently.

65. Ms. Zonia de Smith (Deputy Minister of Education, Panama) considered inclusive education as essential in order to build a democratic society. Knowledge is essential. We need to create quality as well as equal opportunities.

66. In Panama, the National Secretariat for Social Inclusion of Persons with Disabilities was established in 2004. This secretariat has introduced the *Strategic Plan of Education of Panama 2005-2009* in order to create equal opportunities for disabled persons and their families. This is linked to the national anti-poverty plan which also includes a national policy of access for all. Today the strategic plan is in phase one – including 200 children in 67 regular schools. There are 2 700 teachers incorporated into this programme. In 2006, the programme will increase to 92 education centres, including those in regions with the highest poverty rates.

67. The plan also calls for the development of a national information network of schools in both urban and rural districts, efforts to include and systemise good practice in schools, the teaching of the 10% of children who are indigenous in both native and national languages, and pre-school opportunities.

68. Panama's history involves segregation. The 40-year history of education for disabled students began with parents asking for educational care for their children in special institutions, continued with special rehabilitation institutes and then progressed to special classes in regular schools – the latter with specialised teachers and support. Equity for people with disabilities means development of public policies to end marginalisation. Present policies are to give access to regular schools and adequate education related

to needs. A national assessment system is then required in order to transform the education system to become inclusive. The transformation must begin with analysis.

69. Exclusion is a threat to the development of Panama. In order to progress, the schools have to offer a common curriculum, avoid discrimination, focus on the needs of the individual and ratify the international obligations which Panama has signed.

70. Ms Charlotte Vuyiswa McLain Nhlapo (Commissioner for Human Rights, South Africa) explained that barriers in education were part of greater inequalities in South Africa that, like the lack of access to basic services and poverty, contribute to learning breakdown and exclusion. Economic deprivation, together with the provision and distribution of resources, reflect the inequalities of apartheid. There are children who have never attended school. There is inappropriate education for learners categorised as having “special needs”. There is no support for learners outside the system and inadequate provision to meet their needs after primary school. These inadequacies and inequalities are most evident in areas that have the lowest level of basic service provision and the highest levels of unemployment and sustained poverty. Violence, abuse and HIV/AIDS continue to place large numbers of learners at risk.

71. Negative attitudes are barriers to learning and the curriculum has been unable to meet the needs of a wide range of different learners. We see fragmented training and a dearth of capacity building opportunities. A centralised education system and high-level responsibility has left a legacy of restrictive controls that inhibit change, initiative and quality service delivery. Language and communication barriers occur because teaching and learning often takes place through a language that is not the first language of the child.

72. South Africa has subscribed to several international legal conventions while national legislation has brought new developments such as the South African constitution of 1996, the *South African Schools Act of 1996*, the *Integrated National Disability Strategy of 1997* and a relatively new piece of legislation prohibiting discrimination because of disability. The *South African report of the National Commission on Special Needs in Education and Training (DOE 1997)* challenged the concept of special needs, highlighted limitations and introduced the concept of barriers to learning and development. The report was the result of an extensive consultation with key stakeholders.

73. The report has formed the basis of a new national policy on special needs education which is directly in line with the initiative for the transformation of general education set out in the *White Paper No. 6 2001*. The government in South Africa acknowledges that all children can learn and need support. It accepts and respects that all learners are different in some way and have different but equally valued learning needs. It states the need to enable education structures, systems and learning methodologies to meet the needs of all learners. Furthermore, it acknowledges and respects differences amongst learners regardless of age, gender, ethnicity, language, class, disability or HIV status. The government also acknowledges learning in both formal and informal settings and structures as well as the factors of changing attitudes, behaviour, teaching methods, curricula and the environment in order to meet the needs of all learners.

74. There is now a paradigm shift as inclusive education incorporates the principle of access for all disadvantaged learners, focuses on the education system and encourages a more child-centred approach. Governments, international agencies, local authorities, non-governmental and community-based organisations, the private sector, parents and care-workers, children, teachers and the media are all part of this ongoing process.

75. The development of knowledge about inclusive education is essential for educators. There is a need to ensure capacity building and the development and training of resources within communities. South

Africa also needs reliable data collection systems, the political will to transform education and people to champion education. The key messages to take from the example of South Africa are:

- There is no one size that fits all.
- There are good practices which need to be valued.
- Inclusive education will not happen overnight – it is an approach.
- All learners must be valued.
- EFA goals will not be met unless changes are introduced.

76. Ms. Diane Richler, (Canada) began by explaining the role of *Inclusion International*, a family-based organisation of 200 national member organisations in over 115 countries, advocating the human rights of people with intellectual disabilities and their families. Parents want inclusive education because students with disabilities are more likely to be involved in the paid labour force and be participants in a range of community activities when included in the regular education system.

77. The World Bank states that around 600 million people or 10% of the world's population have a disability. Over 70% of people and their families live in a developing country and approximately one third of children out of school have a disability. In Latin America and the Caribbean, at least 50 million people are disabled. Disability is both a cause and consequence of poverty. Disability is especially high in post-conflict countries and in natural disaster areas. Between 20-30% of children do not attend school due to a lack of transportation, teacher training, equipment, furniture and learning materials. Other factors include bad school infrastructure and attitudinal barriers. In Honduras, the illiteracy rate of people with disabilities is 51% compared to 19% in the general population. In Brazil, 20% of regular schools are accessible. In Mexico, less than 10% of the schools are accessible. In Surinam, 90% of disabled children in the school system are in special segregated schools.

78. By 2015, all boys and girls should complete primary school, in accordance with the UN Millennium goals. However, 98% of children with disabilities do not participate in formal education and 99% of girls with disabilities are believed to be illiterate. A commitment to adequate basic education for all children requires a re-examination of who can access education and an understanding of the conditions which create exclusion. The goal of education for all depends on the development of policy, curriculum and practice that promotes and supports inclusion.

79. The international community has accepted a wide range of declarations, conventions and commitments. It is impossible to meet the UN Millennium goals if children with a disability do not enter and remain within the education system. There is too little attention paid to good investment strategies.

80. Research shows that inclusive education builds social capital between disabled and non-disabled students, that diversity in the classroom improves academic results and recognises that all students have individual learning styles. Classroom strategies to support inclusive education are multi-level instruction, co-operative learning, individualised learning modules, activity-based learning and peer tutoring.

81. UNESCO defines inclusive education as a development approach in education that “seeks to address the learning needs of all children and adults with a specific focus on those who are vulnerable to marginalisation and exclusion”. This means that one ministry should be responsible for the education of all children. One school system should be responsible for all children in their region. There should be a

diverse mix of students in classes. Teachers' use of classroom strategies should respond to diversity and collaboration between teachers and the administration.

Discussion:

- Thailand referred to their good experience of tailor-made adult training courses which bring disabled persons into the labour force.
- Kenya pointed out that a major challenge is that when one need is addressed it can create a multitude of new needs. An example of this was access to sign language for deaf students. Both teachers and students use sign language as a resource. Inclusion of sign language students should be followed by teacher training tailored to meet the needs of these students and the opportunity for parents to learn sign language.
- Chile drew attention to the lack of opportunities for especially skilled students. The inclusive education approach is also suitable for gifted students.
- Inclusive education is important for equity and parents can play an important role.
- It is important to provide teacher training and value the role of the universities.
- Eastern Europe has traditionally had a *de facto* logical approach. We must all try to work toward models which give the students knowledge and skills that are needed. Teachers must know of various strategies to reach individual learners and collaborate with each other.
- HIV/AIDS effects how children learn as well as how teachers teach.
- There is a need for a set of guidelines for inclusive education.

Session 4 – Quality in Education in an open society: What can we learn from PISA? Chaired by José Pablo Arellano, President of *Fundación Chile* and former Minister of Education.

82. Mr. Andreas Schleicher (OECD) explained that the Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) was aimed at throwing light on education by making it more transparent. It helps to answer questions like such as: What do parents expect from education? What do teachers want to achieve? What do schools have to do to become more effective? PISA has shown by examining the learning environment that better results are achieved by positive learning, high expectations, making learning enjoyable and good teacher-student interaction.

83. PISA provides an accurate and helpful analysis of the pace of educational change. In the 1960s, the United States was ranked first in secondary education. Between 1970 and 1990, there was a major and rapid change. In two generations, South Korea and Japan were ranked first. Now the United States is a mere average performer, while forty years ago Korea was less wealthy than Afghanistan. Chile has achieved a lot of progress but not enough.

84. PISA shows that the quality of education is linked to distribution. Comparative achievements are not only about international league tables, but also about dynamic comparisons for the future. They do not just define where we are, but also what we could be. It is worth recalling that PISA is an ambitious undertaking, dealing with nine-tenths of the world economy. Today, in an open society, quality of education is vital. One particularly important aspect of education assessment is how students translate knowledge into problem solving.

85. The PISA survey illuminates the debate about maximising quality or maximising quantity. Hong Kong, Finland and Japan could be used as examples as they are all above the average. However, it is clear that countries with large inequalities do not do well. Is student performance the result of innate abilities, student capabilities or the education system? PISA distinguishes between within and without system influences, although overall the data show that the keys to success in education are consistency and predictability. School systems may reinforce disparities – which appears to be the case of Brazil and possibly Germany. While Brazil has advanced because of general reforms, it is disturbing that many schools do poorly without having disadvantaged students. In contrast, Finland stands out as an example of the combination of equity and opportunity.

86. The PISA tests also expound on other issues such as gender and finance. In a test administered by PISA to evaluate analytical skills, girls were found to do better than boys. Although finance is important, it must be combined with higher aspirations and strong support. High expectations with low support affect teachers and students alike.

87. The governance of an education system depends on goals and instruments. The United Kingdom, for example, sets precise education goals in contrast to other countries which set far broader goals. Schools and teachers are central to improvement of education. In some countries, emphasis is placed on supporting co-operation between teachers while in others the school is the centre of action and accountability, thus reducing central intervention. Finland demonstrates the value of long-term coherence where teachers and schools are responsible for student performance and do not leave student problems to third parties.

88. There are greater opportunities when practice is more integrated and individual and collective learning is balanced. Individualised learning leads to greater ambition. Students learn together and from each other.

89. Mr. Simon Schwartzman (Brazil) stated that, while he was pleased that Brazilian education appeared to be doing well, it is not clear why. He suspected that it was a general rather than education trend, with more opportunities due to economic growth and modernisation. Brazilian children at the age of 15 are already behind or have left school. Children at school, including children in good private schools with a good family background, are still poor performers. Something is seriously wrong within the school system. There is too much emphasis on cramming information to pass exams and he thinks that this kind of education is deforming the nature of education. The national examination for secondary education used to be voluntary but now it is used to measure students' capacity for fulfilling different careers.

90. It is often argued that the secondary system would improve if it was divided into vocational and academic streams. But this has educational and social disadvantages – not least because there is no guarantee that vocational students will get better jobs. Half of the students in Brazilian secondary education are over 18 years of age and over half of these students never complete secondary education. These students should be provided with feasible opportunities such as a special training/education equivalent to the normal diploma that marks the completion of secondary education. There are 11 years of mandatory education in Brazil and yet it is highly inflexible. There must be more imagination in setting policy priorities and the practice of education should become more innovative.

Discussion

91. The questions and discussion were grouped into two clusters. The first group was concerned with the following topics:

- The issue of competency against quality in education and, in particular, how quality is best measured in education.

- Marginalised children who have no access to the system.
- The value and weight of examination results and school evaluations.

92. Mr. Schleicher posited that the biggest challenge was that of how to reproduce success. There are many examples of students doing well under structured instruction. However, other resources are necessary as the PISA 2001 results showed. Marginalisation is a challenge to OECD countries particularly when associated with migration and, while there are failures, there are also successes such as Hungary and Canada. The essence of these successful experiments is in limiting the disparity in performance. Mr. Schwartzman reiterated the importance of flexibility, stating that it was better to get some level of education instead of remaining totally deprived.

93. The second group of questions/comments dealt with:

- Access to universities and the declining standards of secondary schools. Was it possible to persuade parents that access depended on results?
- The limitations for public policy of the PISA results and the importance of expanding it to include skills and social dimensions.
- The importance of parent-teacher-pupil interactions for teacher education and performance at the school level.
- How relevant PISA was to policies in developing countries.
- What has been learned over the last ten years and how the presenters have changed their views.

94. Mr. Schleicher considered access to universities in OECD countries as depending on standards and if these standards are artificially reduced, the relevant value of education will decline. In terms of policy, PISA offers transparency and the opportunity for the media and governments to address issues and face reality. There is cause for optimism because the quality of public debate has improved, not least because openness and responsibility contribute to confidence building for all stakeholders. This is as true for developing countries as OECD member countries and the PISA sample shows that wealth does not guarantee success and equity. The policy value of PISA is that it offers governments and countries a realistic measurement instrument over time by which to set and assess the progress of their education system. Empirical evidence is far more valuable than ministerial declarations and offers the public and stakeholders a reliable perspective on educational achievements and challenges. Mr. Schwartzman reiterated the importance of decentralisation. While not denying the importance of assessments, the Brazilian case illustrates that expectations should not be linear. Rather it may be more important to develop a better supervision or monitoring system rather than moving immediately into drastic change.

95. The Chair closed the session by recommending that the lessons drawn from PISA be integrated into national planning and assessment.

Session 5 – Responding to challenges posed to higher education in a globalised world. Chaired by Ms. Ligia Melo, Secretary of State for Higher Education, Science and Technology of the Dominican Republic.

96. The Chair introduced the session by reminding the audience that higher education, more than any other education sector, is exposed to and affected by globalisation. Higher education has a long history of international co-operation and is of high importance to developments in the labour markets.

97. Mr. Bernard Hugonnier (OECD) referred to different definitions of globalisation. It is an objective of the OECD to limit the costs and maximise the advantages of globalisation. Globalisation should be shaped so that it is an advantage for all. Mr. Hugonnier underlined the roles of international organisations in the process and the fact that globalisation was first approached through financial and trade policies, *e.g.* the introduction of the Euro zone and the World Trade Organisation.

98. There are five major challenges for education that call for policy action:

1. Globalisation enhances competition amongst countries and modifies the world distribution of labour. As a consequence, people increasingly need to acquire and update their knowledge and skills. Education attainments have to be raised and lifelong learning must become a reality. Graduate numbers and proficiency levels on the mathematics scale in different countries illustrate this development. Policy objectives need to be set if the standard of education is not sufficient.
2. The focus on the economic side of globalisation neglects the cultural aspect. Migration leads to highly heterogeneous societies. So the challenge is to facilitate integration and enhance social capital. The PISA study shows that today non-native and first-generation students achieve the same school performance as native students in only a few countries.
3. Globalisation increases social and income disparities at the expense of social cohesion. As a consequence, there must be a focus on equity. Again, PISA data shows that it is possible to reconcile equity and quality as the education systems of some countries show both high performance and high social equity. Most countries, however, do not meet this objective.
4. Globalisation also means that issues and problems are not restricted by borders, but become global, like environmental protection or terrorism. This implies that we are no longer citizens of a county but citizens of the world. However, whether or not education sufficiently equips us for this challenge is questionable. The PISA data on proficiency levels in problem solving suggests a need for improvement.
5. OECD data on foreign students in tertiary education show that their numbers have increased massively within four years (1998 - 2002). Internationalising higher education entails risks for students and for developing countries. There is the risk of low quality, brain drain and an increasing education gap. The OECD, together with UNESCO, has taken up this issue and has developed and published quality assurance guidelines.

99. Mr. Ronald Perkinson presented an overview of the International Finance Corporation (IFC) and its role within the World Bank Group as a funder of private projects. Why is there a need for the private sector in higher education? Higher education is still expanding worldwide. There are massive increases in current and capital costs. On a per student basis, World Bank lending for higher education over the last decades has declined. In the 40 biggest developing countries, funding could not keep up with the increase in student numbers and fell to USD 618 per student.

100. A sample of 32 developing countries shows that within a decade (1991 - 2001) enrolments in higher education have more than doubled. In the eight countries of developing Asia their number rose by 50% and spending per student there amounts to just USD 405.

101. In developing countries, where enrolment in private higher education institutions has increased, the World Bank had to decide how to provide these countries with funds which their governments could not afford. Could there be a partnership of state and private sector funding in order to supplement traditional non-state financing of education institutions (loans, equity and grants)?

102. The IFC has started several initiatives with private education providers using different methods of financing: YUCE Inc, in Turkey is a family owned business providing mainly IT education. Here IFC financed a project with the first education loan on the local swap market. The purchasing power parity of Shanghai Second Medical University (SSMU) & Shanghai Aerospace Corporation (SAC) was the result of a project to upgrade nursing education to BA level. The IFC financed the SAC platform operations, plus a curriculum initiative for credit transfers and career pathways. For the private Institute of Business-Trinidad & Tobago, the IFC financed the construction of new facilities. The IFC also participate in financing the joint venture of the public Shanghai University of Finance & Economics and the private German Bankakademie. In South Africa, the IFC made the initial investment in a project called *Eduloan* which privately finances students attending public institutions. To develop the Universidad Diego Portales in Chile, the IFC partially guarantees a local Chilean bond. From the experience gained in this project, risk-sharing scenarios have been developed to optimise funds by leveraging private sector financing. Mr. Perkinson provided data illustrating the mechanisms.

103. Sir Howard Newby, Higher Education Funding Council of England, began his presentation by referring to the fact that higher education, more than any other sector, is subject to globalisation. There is a competitive market for students and staff, particularly in research. For two decades individual researchers have increasingly been participants in global networks. Research is assessed and ranked on a worldwide scale.

104. In these rankings, universities in the United States, more so than European universities, are highly positioned. This is in contrast to school performance tests, such as PISA, where schools in the United States do not perform as well as most of their European counterparts. The United States superiority in higher education is due to a high level of private investment and its ability to attract the best talents in the world. However, as higher education is at the heart of the modern economy and society, the terms of trade need to be fair.

105. Today many stakeholders make claims on higher education. Universities are no longer ivory towers but need to engage with society. They are central for civil society in mediating between the individual and the state and in sensitising students in civic and fundamental values. They also have a role in economic competitiveness, in linking it to social inclusion through increasing and widening participation based on the principle of lifelong learning. Universities exist to produce, to transfer and to share knowledge.

106. The dilemma that universities are facing today is that no university in the world is financed sufficiently to perform all the mentioned functions simultaneously. They have to sharpen their focus. That is a question for the individual university as well as for the government and higher education systems. As nation-building and nation-positioning institutions, universities and higher education institutions have to establish themselves on international, national, regional and sub-regional bases.

107. Universities are responding to government pressure to increase participation and to improve quality. However, public budgets are not increasing but decreasing. Universities in the United Kingdom responded to this tension by introducing fees. Evidence shows that fees do not necessarily decrease but can increase participation as more funds mean that economically deprived students can be supported. The private-public-partnership is the future. The question that remains is that of how to organise it in order to secure and protect the public interest.

108. Every university cannot provide all disciplines and services. Therefore, selective funding of research is more efficient than funding all universities poorly. However, this leads to the establishment of a hierarchy of institutions. In a globalised world there will be a division of labour between universities and hence a need for networks of universities in order to raise the quality of the entire system.

Discussion

109. The Chair asked for clusters or groups of questions or comments. The first group:

- How does the OECD convince its partners to support its action lines?
- What will be the role of the teaching profession?
- What power has the OECD to interfere with states that discriminate against minorities?
- How should cultural exchange and multilingual teaching be enhanced?

110. Regarding the question on OECD instruments, Mr. Hugonnier referred to the UNESCO/OECD quality guidelines and other comparable “soft” law measures. As to the role of teachers, he recalled the outcome of a recent meeting of the chief executives of education at OECD. There is a general consensus that teachers have to be actively involved in the design and process of education reform in order to ensure successful implementation. Concerning the integration of minorities, governments could certainly do more. However, there is the problem that certain minorities are not keen on integration. Language teaching is a key instrument in globalisation and should not be restricted to one foreign language.

111. The second group:

- The quality of university education cannot be defined by a one dimensional definition of quality in higher education.
- What is the implication of the output of a highly qualified labour force in China, India and Russia on a worldwide division of labour?
- What initiatives have been taken for social inclusion in the United Kingdom?
- How important is the regional context for the difference between profit and non-profit or between state and non-state higher education?
- How important are the cost of living levels for students when discussing fees and loans?

112. Sir Howard Newby responded by referring to the greater value that the academic community attributes to research, partly due to the difficulties of measuring the quality of university teaching. Concerning social inclusion, he referred to premium funding for disabled students in the United Kingdom. Fees and loans need transparent repayment schemes which take into account the difficulty in designing genuinely progressive schemes. Mr. Hugonnier added that the OECD is examining the impact of work transfer from one country to another within the education system.

113. The Chair concluded the session by calling upon the OECD to dedicate an entire conference to these issues.

Session 6 – Teaching Matter: Attracting, Developing and Retaining Teachers. Chaired by Mr. Ibrahim Almusnad, Assistant Deputy Minister, Saudi Arabia.

114. Mr. Abrar Hasan (OECD) based his presentation on the outcomes of a major OECD study on policy for teachers which involved all stakeholders and different models of teaching. These outcomes, including 25 recommendations, are described in the OECD report: *Teachers Matter: Attracting,*

Developing and Retaining Teachers. The fact that 25 countries (including Chile) participated in the project underlines the high level of interest in this issue. This is not a surprise as teachers are crucial to student performance and their salaries constitute a large part of the school budget. The problems being faced by the OECD member states also hold true for developing countries, although one should not forget how diverse these countries are. The evolution of the knowledge-based society, globalisation and other major socio-economic trends (e.g., migration) are placing new demands on teachers. Countries are faced with major challenges regarding the supply of adroit and effective teachers. Teachers will have to be increasingly flexible to meet the demands of individual students and adopt a student-centred approach.

115. The speaker focused on six themes.

1. *General features of a policy framework:* The need for a systematic but differentiated approach in view of the country differences.
2. *Making teaching an attractive career choice:* There is an overall shortage of quality teachers, although this shortage is sometimes masked. This shortage will only increase as the workforce ages and a large percentage of teachers will retire in the next decade. For many, teaching was not their first professional choice and in some countries there are serious concerns about teacher morale and enthusiasm. It is vital that the profession be made more attractive to retain effective teachers and attract newcomers
3. *Developing teachers' knowledge and skills:* Attention must be paid to the development of teachers' knowledge and skills and their recruitment, selection and employment. Clear teacher profiles should be embedded in a professional career development system with teacher development seen as a continuum linking standards to teachers' profiles. Teacher training institutes should co-operate with schools to develop flexible initial teacher training programmes. These training programmes should be accredited and certification of new teachers introduced. Mid-career changes and alternative routes to the teaching profession should be facilitated so that the education system can draw from a wider pool of committed and experienced people who have previously worked outside education.
4. *Recruiting, selecting and employing teachers:* The overarching emphasis in the report is on the quality of teachers, effective ways of teaching to meet students' requirements and the needs of the economy and society in general. Terms of employment should be flexible. Teachers need more support staff in order for them to be able to focus on their primary task: teaching. Greater responsibility should be given to schools where needs are best understood.
5. *Retaining effective teachers:* Evaluation is crucial. Good working conditions are necessary to retain the best teachers. Good leadership with human resource management skills are essential.
6. *Developing and implementing teacher training policy:* Teachers should be involved in reforming education and play an active role in the development of teacher training policy.

116. The present is an ideal moment for dealing with all these issues as a large number of teachers will be leaving the workforce within the next decade, making the training of a new cohort of teachers according to the newly defined profiles possible and essential.

117. Ms. Elena Lenskaya (British Council in Moscow) described the outcomes of a number of successful pilot projects focusing on the recruitment, retention and development of new teachers in the Russian Federation. Since the 1998 OECD review of education in Russia praising the commitment of the Russian teachers especially in view of the circumstances under which they work, very little has been done to change the situation. Many teachers have left the system of their own accord because of the lack of

support. Others were made redundant as a result of demographic trends. The increase in salaries barely compensates for inflation. Now that the population is once again increasing, the demand for well-trained teachers is growing. In order to meet this demand a number of issues will have to be dealt with.

118. Both pre-service and in-service teacher training was reformed, leading to a more integrated system of teacher training. There are two paths leading to the teaching profession in Russia: through pedagogical universities and through junior colleges. In the past, too many people were following teacher training programmes at universities but then not entering the profession. As a result, the quality of those graduating from the colleges was very poor.

119. Now the training programmes of universities and colleges have been linked. The duration of the university teacher training programmes has been reduced from five to four years with less theory and more fieldwork. All new teachers receive support from a mentor. Internships form an obligatory part of the programmes, enabling the recruitment of new teachers. Only motivated people apply for the programmes. These measures have led to a 30% increase in the number of graduates taking up a teaching career. The colleges, also focusing less on theory and more on skills, have developed a fast track training model. This enables graduates from the colleges to enter university and earn a degree without having to follow the complete university programme. A large network of schoolteachers associations has been created.

120. In order to retain more and better-qualified teachers, a number of policies were developed related to in-service training and career path development. In the past, very few teachers actually participated in the obligatory in-service training (legally once every five years). New models were developed for school based in-service training focusing on the teachers needs – involving practicing teachers as trainers and providing opportunities to exchange best practices. An outcome oriented competence-based curriculum was developed together with the teachers. Teachers are involved in project work, which motivates them to do both field and desk research. They are also involved in the development of tests and teaching materials.

121. A number of management issues have been tackled. The student-teacher ratio was reduced and new ways of calculating the workload were developed. Salaries are based on performance. In-service training is now a common practice in the regions involved.

122. These measures have led to strong competition to enter the new training programmes. The quality of teaching has increased as shown by the results of the national exams. Less people are leaving the teaching profession now that teaching careers and professional development have become possible.

123. Mr. John Coolahan, Ireland, stressed the significance and timeliness of the OECD report on teaching. In his view, Ireland has managed to adapt to the changing demands on teachers caused by globalisation as described in the report. Education investments have been given high priority, while teachers traditionally have a high status in Irish society and have always had a lot of power. This was initially achieved through the Registration Council (1918) and more recently by the Teaching Council (2005). The teacher unions have become mature organisations with a consultative role regarding education policy. Education policy is very lively with three white papers over the last 15 years. On average there is no age imbalance amongst teachers. Good quality students are competing to enter teacher training programmes. Support staff has been made available to assist teachers in the classrooms. In order to continue to guarantee high quality teachers a pro-active, holistic and interconnected policy for teaching is essential. There is a clear understanding of the connection between education, the workforce and the global economy.

124. A number of issues however need to be dealt with in Ireland, amongst which is the development of a comprehensive data base on teachers for planning purposes. Teacher contracts need to be revised to allow for extra-curricular activities. A competence-based teacher profile needs to be studied as does the

increasing feminisation of the profession and the fact that 25% of the more experienced students are seeking other careers. Teachers will need to adjust even more to the individual student's needs and the mode of teacher selection needs to be reconsidered as nowadays other qualities besides academic success are becoming relevant.

125. Structured partnerships between schools, training institutes, education centres and support services are becoming increasingly important. This network approach enables key actors to exchange good practices. A five-year plan should be developed to address the issues in the OECD report involving all stakeholders.

Discussion

126. A variety of questions and issues were raised from the floor:

- How to increase the status of teachers – an issue in many countries.
- How to divide time between contact hours and other duties.
- Whether education was knowledge-based or not.
- What non-economic incentives can be used.
- Teachers are not trained to deal with increasing migration.
- Salaries for young teachers are often too low making the profession less attractive.
- The importance of dealing with the OECD report on teaching matters at a national level.

127. The panel agreed that to improve the status of teachers it is crucial that governments not only provide teachers with good salaries, but also publicly acknowledge the significance of the work done by teachers. Teachers need support to continue to increase the quality of their work. The fact that meaningful results are being shown in international surveys will also stimulate teachers to continue their development in a structured and systematic way.

128. Time for learning should be incorporated into teacher contracts. On the other hand, teachers should also be prepared to use time during school holidays for their own development. There is no denying that teaching is knowledge-based. However it is important to share best practices in teaching to allow teachers to continue to develop their own knowledge and skills. There are various ways of giving non-economic incentives, such as time-out for courses, good working circumstances, computers etc. The salaries for young teachers especially need improvement in order to retain them in the system.

129. All panel members stressed the importance of dealing with the issues raised by the OECD report at the national and international levels. Increasing the exchange of best practices is essential. Politicians should recognise the importance of supporting teachers in their demanding profession if they wish them to cope with all aspects of globalisation.

Final Session

130. Minister Bitar chaired the session and proposed that it be divided into two parts. Firstly, he invited each of the session chairs to reflect on the most important lessons from their session and to propose

new topics for the next global forum. Secondly, he invited ministers and senior officials to comment on their experience of the forum.

1. Session Chair comments

131. Ms. Sclafani (Session 1) considered this to have been a successful conference. In her view lifelong learning must begin early and encourage the motivation to learn. Secondary school should teach not just hard skills but also “soft” skills like communication which will be helpful for future education. She recognised that university examinations, for example, tend to alter the way that subjects are taught at secondary school but even for those not attending university, greater learning opportunities should be created so that secondary school is not considered an end but rather the beginning of a process. Vocational and further education should be a partnership between employers, employees and states as well as the ministries of education and labour. Education must be for a career and not just a job. A future forum should look at changes in secondary education (including finance), the curriculum, demands on teaching practice and furthermore within these changes, how schools and teachers discriminate to allow for special needs.

132. Mr. Zgaga (Session 2) believed that equality and quality had been wisely chosen themes. They spanned all forum discussions. These two dimensions always had key roles. Access and equality dominated education agendas in the 1960s and 1970s, to be replaced by quality in the 1980s and 1990s. Now it is the turn of equity again. This experience – involving so many contexts – should be used to discuss the new paradigm “the quality of life” as a goal in education. A new paradigm will be built in and it will need champions to tackle inertia and maintain and enhance school performance.

133. Mr. Prouty (Session 3) had learnt a great deal from the conference that was helpful to World Bank work. The overwhelming message for special education was that it must be considered as a non-linear, inclusive process which must emphasise “belongingness”. Barriers to entry are barriers to entry for all. The experience of special education should be shared in our own self interest for policies must be made on human as well as economic grounds.

134. Mr. Arellano (Session 4) was not present at the closing session.

135. Ms. Melo, (Session 5) reiterated the importance of higher education, which required more investment and needs to become a greater priority for international agencies. Her concern was illustrated by the decline in per-student funding at a time of growing demand and increasing student numbers, together with the need for greater research. Organisations such as the OECD could play an important role by calling the attention of governments to the growing funding gap and to the role of higher education in general. She proposed that higher education become the theme of a future global forum.

2. Ministerial and Senior Officials’ statements

136. Mr. Jorge Pedreira (Deputy Secretary of State for Education, Portugal) had found the Forum, which involved several continents, a valuable way to examine globalisation. Some of the issues were common (special needs education, lifelong learning, resource management, the balance between central authority and local autonomy), while others, such as the role of minorities in Flemish speaking Belgium, pointed to the different dimensions and scale of change in education. These lessons showed the importance of understanding global citizenship, but it was also clear that one size did not fit all. All education is context based. Wealthier countries had a special responsibility to provide resources and promote research to build this sense of citizenship and allow comparisons in education.

137. Mr. Simon Mayende Kiriba-Bonsu (Minister of State for Higher Education, Uganda) pointed to the many problems common to all countries. Too often governments regard these problems as intrinsic. There is value in seeing how different initiatives, such as Uganda’s pioneering Universal Primary

Education (UPE), influence other countries. He believes that there are common solutions as well as problems, not least education financing. Overcoming these issues requires political commitment and the forum would both provide lessons and influence political leadership if it met, as a high level meeting, in Africa. Uganda would be pleased to host the next Forum.

138. Ms. Petrescu (Secretary of State, Romania) believed that the Forum had been a valuable platform for understanding good practices in education. Globalisation had both direct and indirect effects. These links, such as that between key competencies and sustainable development, should be explored while understanding that globalisation is a process of integration through differentiation.

139. Mr. Karega Mutahi (Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Education, Science and Technology of Kenya) left the Forum with a new perspective on equality, which was important as his government was currently in the middle of a reform process. He appreciated the session on special needs education and the various references to financing education. It would have been valuable to have had more discussion about school empowerment which is an issue facing Kenya. Research findings played an important part in this meeting with the issues being defined by developed countries. More attention should be paid to developing countries, including an African research agenda. Kenya has serious budget limitations and is unsure where to use this budget first.

140. Ms. Zonia de Smith, (Deputy Minister of Education, Panama) stated that away two key findings – that education must be put in context and that, for continuity, it is the state and not the government that is responsible for education. Globalisation affects all society, as does education. It is important to find different paths and to increase international communication. The next forum should concentrate on the student both nationally and globally. Their future will be assured with faith, hope and optimism.

3. Closing Remarks

141. Minister Bitar believed that the forum was particularly important for Chile and developing countries. Education policies have to be designed with an international perspective in mind and this occasion was a valuable way of learning from one another. He noted the enthusiasm of delegates and participants.

142. The minister found it both striking and comforting that the main criteria for action were shared by developed and developing countries. There were general lessons to be learned from this meeting:

1. The importance of policy coherence (which goes beyond education) and a long-term vision of the role of education. Coherence means matching the timing of politics to the timing of education while avoiding zigzags.
2. The necessity of a common framework, with competitiveness and social cohesion as goals and accountability and support as driving mechanisms.
3. The imperativeness of striking a balance between equity and quality and the importance of consensus.

143. The minister's preferences for the next forum would be:

- Institutions and policy design and their relation to education, in the context of coherence and effectiveness.
- Teacher selection, training and professional development.

- Expanding coverage and reducing desertion in secondary education.
- Financing higher education and exploring new mechanisms and partnerships between public and private funding.
- Adult and vocational education; building opportunities for low income adults.
- Centralised and decentralised mechanisms for education management and how to combine quality and equity.

144. The forum acted as an effective bridge between developing countries and the OECD that was, in his view, the best institutional network in the world for learning about and discussing education policies.

145. Mr. Hugonnier felt that this forum had been a very dynamic meeting which was a good sign for the future. He divided his remarks into OECD objectives, the forum model and organisation.

Benchmarks

146. The OECD had a number of benchmarks:

1. The meeting should meet shared expectations – and the forum had achieved this in his view and the view of the participants he had talked to – if not as lifelong learning then as education for all.
2. The OECD wanted to take stock of what was known and what was not known. PISA proved to be a valuable prism and will become more so at its next 2006 cycle when over 30 non-OECD member countries will participate.
3. To gain a sense of what should be done as a result of the meeting. The list would include:
 - To value all learners in all countries.
 - To find ways by which equity and quality could be achieved without one being sacrificed.
 - To identify and lift all barriers to learning in order to encourage personal development.
 - To look at the PISA results less in terms of international ranking and more in terms of contexts and lessons.
 - Greater concentration on teacher education and training.
 - Greater research and research diffusion – while this may be a knowledge sector, there are practices based on knowledge.
4. A commitment to joint work and so joint lessons. Amongst these topics would be,
 - How to meet the joint claims of equity and quality?
 - How to increase efficiency with limited resources and growing demand?
 - How to show value for money as a condition for greater resources?

- How to build an assessment/learning education culture?

Questions

147. The following questions were put to participants with future fora on education in mind:

- Was there an even balance between OECD (22) member countries and non-member countries (17)?
- Was the forum at the right level? The OECD had not expected so many ministers and senior officials who may have felt constrained which prevented them from participating fully.
- Were six plenary sessions too many or too few or would it be more helpful to split into working groups?