Conference on
PENSION REFORM IN RUSSIA:
From legislation to implementation

Supported by
The Government of the Russian Federation

Co-sponsored by:
US Department of Commerce
International Network of Pensions Regulators and Supervisors (INPRS)
Russian and US industry partners
Institute for Social Insurance Development

SUMMARY RECORD

Moscow, Russia
24-26 September, 2003

Marriott Tverskaya Hotel
34, 1-st Tverskaya-Yamskaya street, Moscow, 125 047
SUMMARY RECORD OF THE OECD CONFERENCE ON PENSION REFORM IN RUSSIA: FROM LEGISLATION TO IMPLEMENTATION

Moscow, 24-26 September 2003

1. This OECD Conference on Pension Reform in Russia was organised in Moscow on 24-26 September 2003. The conference was held under the aegis of the OECD Centre for Co-operation with Non-Members Countries with the support of the Government of the Russian Federation. The event was co-sponsored by the United States Department of Commerce, the International Network of Pension Regulators and Supervisors, the Institute for Social Insurance Development, and Russian and American industry partners.

2. Conference participants included senior governmental officials, pension industry representatives and leading pension policy experts from nine OECD countries (Germany, Hungary, Ireland, Italy, the Netherlands, Poland, Turkey, the United Kingdom, and the United States), five non-OECD economies (Brazil, Hong Kong, Kazakhstan, Russia, and Ukraine), and various international organisations, including the World Bank, the International Labour Organisation and the European Commission. A list of conference registrants is appended.

3. The key objective of the conference was to provide an international forum for the discussion of the key policy issues related to the implementation of the new, privately funded pension system in Russia and to introduce “best practice” regulatory and supervisory standards and mechanisms used in the OECD countries to ensure effective and efficient pension provision. The topics covered included: overview of Russian pension reform; OECD/INPRS principles and guidelines for pension funds; asset management regulation; impact of guarantees on pension plan funding and investment; investment opportunities in Russia; supervisory structures, perspectives and techniques; explaining reform to the public, educating the consumer and protecting pension fund members; administrative and IT challenges for Russian authorities; and understanding fees and controlling costs. The conference agenda is appended.

4. The conference opened with a welcoming speech by Mr. Mikhail Dmitriev, First Deputy Minister of Economic Development and Trade of the Russian Federation. Additional opening remarks were delivered by Mr. Ambrogio Rinaldi, the Chair of the OECD Working Party on Private Pensions and Mr. Yuri Lyublin, First Deputy Minister of Labour and Social Development. In his introductory speech, Mr. Dmitriev stated that Russia’s reform legislation was in place and the main efforts of the Government are focused on the successful implementation of the legislation. The goals of the government in implementing pension reform were stated as follows: reducing old age poverty without compromising fiscal solvency, ensuring the financial soundness and stability of the retirement system in both the transitional phase of reform and in the long run, and strengthening the administrative capacity, accountability and transparency of the pension programs. The Minister emphasised the importance and timeliness of the organisation of the OECD conference, which would enable the high-level exchange of international expertise and experience in the pension area.

Session 1: Overview of Russian Pension Reform and the Road Ahead

5. This session started with an overview of the wide-ranging reform of the pension system that has taken place in Russia in recent years. The reforms further implement a major shift from a single, publicly managed, pay-as-you-go scheme to one that is significantly supplemented by a privately managed component in which individuals are given choice of investment managers. The most recent reforms provide for increased individual choice with respect to the management and investment of their mandatory pension contributions. Individuals will be able to choose where to invest these contributions, including
from a number of private asset management companies. At a later date, investment choice will expand; specifically, the non-state pension funds (NPF), which currently manage assets in the voluntary component of the Russian pension program, will be able to participate in the mandatory program. To date, 55 asset managers have been licensed.

6. The speakers, Mr. Dmitriev and Andrei Vorontsov of the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation, identified the key challenges and obstacles facing the expansion of private pensions in Russia. These include the need to adequately regulate and supervise investment managers; reassess limitations that permit asset management companies to offer only one investment portfolio; and sufficiently inform the public about their rights and responsibilities in the reformed pension program. Another challenge will be program administration: for the new pension reforms to succeed, the government must be able to provide accurate recordkeeping for individual accounts, contributions, investments and benefit payments. Effective co-operation among the different authorities involved in contribution collection and data management will be necessary to ensure success.

Session 2: Introduction to OECD/INPRS Principles and Guidelines for Pension Funds

7. This session reviewed the key activities of the OECD Working Party on Private Pensions and the International Network of Pension Regulators and Supervisors (INPRS). It also provided an introduction to the principles and guidelines development by the OECD in conjunction with INPRS in pension and those being developed by OECD in other related financial areas – including insurance and collective investment schemes.

8. Russell Galer, representing the OECD, described the OECD standard-setting work, focusing on the development and promotion of pension regulatory and supervisory guidelines and principles. These are intended to set forth good practice as endorsed by OECD and INPRS member countries and to be used as a self-assessment tool for regulators and supervisors. He reviewed the principles and guidelines already endorsed, which cover the following areas: regulation of private occupational pension schemes, pension fund governance, and protection of rights of members and beneficiaries in occupational pension plans. Future OECD and INPRS work is planned to focus on funding, investment, and pension supervision.

9. Evgeny Yakushev of the Expert Council of Inspection of Non-State Pension Funds (under the Ministry of Labour and Social Development), addressed the application the OECD/INPRS principles in the Russian regulatory context. Mr. Yakushev highlighted the valuable role of the OECD/INPRS 15 principles for the regulation of private occupational pension schemes as a benchmark for the elaboration of the Russian private pension regulatory framework. He compared the standards set forth in the Russian regulatory regime to the 15 principles. He pointed to some shortcomings in the Russian pension program and its regulations that could be identified by this comparative exercise. These included the need to improve the system of protections of the rights of members; develop appropriate minimum funding requirements for defined benefit schemes; adopt a more favourable tax regime for pension savings; encourage self-regulatory practices and promote the role of independent actuaries; address the investment of pension assets abroad; regulate the winding-up procedure of non-state pension funds; improve disclosure requirements for all entities participating in the pension market; and introduce a code of professional ethics for the managers of non-state pension funds and asset management companies.

Session 3: Asset Management: Regulatory Standards for Investment and the Investment Process

10. This session focused on the regulations governing the investment of private pension assets and portfolio risk management practices. Mr. Galer of the OECD introduced the topic by identified the two main approaches to investment regulation: 1) the prudent person standard and 2) quantitative portfolio
limitations. He noted that a clear trend in recent years has emerged towards the adherence to a prudent person principle, a trend confirmed by the recent adoption of the European Union directive, which favours the prudent person approach.

11. Evidence from several European countries was provided, with a particular focus on the Dutch prudential investment regulations and their operation in practice. An overview from the Dutch perspective was provided by Peter Kraneveld, a representative from PGGM, a leading Dutch pension fund. It was pointed out that regardless of whether regulators took a prudent person or quantitative approach to regulation, that pension fund governance and a rigorous process of making investment decisions is critical for assuring good investment decisions and acceptable portfolio performance.

12. Peter Davies, a private sector expert in risk management with the US firm RiskMetrics, addressed the issue of risk management in the investment process. He identified a number of risk factors (risk of expectation for asset returns and future liabilities, market value risk, credit and liquidity risks, etc.) that should be taken into account when making asset allocation decisions for pension fund assets. Mr. Davies explained that although a precise measurement of risk is difficult to obtain, the process of measuring and evaluating risk factors would lead to the selection of more suitable asset allocations that better manage risk.

13. Ms. Natalia Drobyashenko, a representative from the Russian asset management community, presented the key parameters of Russian investment regulation and outlined the rather limited range of investment instruments now available to asset management companies in Russia. She observed that the scope of permitted investments substantially limited by current regulation. Proposed amendments to the law regulating the activity of non-state pension funds would liberalise the restrictions placed upon the composition of pension fund portfolios and thereby provide more freedom in investment choice and greater asset diversification.

Session 4: Impact of Guarantees on Pension Plan Funding and Investment

14. This session addressed guaranty programs. Csaba Feher, a World Bank expert, discussed the reasons for considering the role of guarantees in private pension programs and the issues that arise in creating and implementing various guarantees. The issue of guarantees frequently arises when traditional government sponsored PAYGO programs are to be replaced or supplemented by private programs. Private pension systems, especially those that are defined benefit in nature, may be insufficiently funded, thereby exposing workers to the risk that their benefits may not be paid if their pension fund has insufficient assets to meet pension obligations. Even in defined contribution programmes concerns remain about investment and longevity risks that individuals may be asked to assume. Mr. Feher focused his discussion in part on the example of Hungary and the lessons that could be drawn from that example. He argued that the protection of retirement benefits should be primarily achieved first, by adopting adequate regulations that ensure that minimum funding levels are met and prudential investment rules are followed, and second, by enforcing disclosure and transparency requirements so that members are informed about the financial status of their pension plan. Additional protection could be attained by using private insurance mechanisms; the issuance of government sponsored guarantee mechanisms might be considered as a last resort option.

15. Mr. Steven Kandarian, Executive Director of the US Pension Benefit Guaranty Corporation, discussed the potential advantages and drawbacks of establishing government-sponsored guarantees to increase pension security in retirement systems, focusing on the US program. In the United States, plan termination insurance is provided through the Pension Benefit Guaranty Corporation (PBGC), which is a government-owned entity. This insurance is required of defined benefit plans. As a result of some large corporate bankruptcies in the US and an unfavourable financial market environment (low interest rates, bear stock market), the long-term financial soundness of the PBGC has become a major concern, and
legislative reform is being considered. Mr. Kandarian identified some proposed reforms that would increase the minimum funding requirements for defined benefit plans, place a cap on the insurance guarantee the PBGC provides, and enable PBGC to charge a market price for its insurance. Both experts underlined that where public guarantee programs are put in place, emphasis should be placed on achieving an adequate pricing of the guarantees so that established premiums accurately reflect the true risks posed.

Session 5: Investment Opportunities in Russia and the Role of Pension Funds as Institutional Investors

16. This session reviewed the investment opportunities and constraints in the Russian capital markets and presented information about the potential role of pension funds as large institutional investors with reference to the experience in OECD countries. Andrei Uspensky of the Russian asset management firm PioGlobal provided an overview of the investment opportunities for pension funds in Russia. Further detail and perspective was provided by Ulf Schneider of Russia Consulting. The recent improvements in the Russian macroeconomic and fiscal environment, favouring greater financial stability and economic growth, will benefit newly established privately managed pensions. Total pension assets under private management are expected to grow rapidly in the coming years and will provide an important incentive for the fostering of the capital markets in Russia. At present, however, the financial instruments currently available on the capital market for the investment of pension assets are somewhat limited. At the same time, it was noted, the pension laws require significant investment in domestic investments; investment in foreign securities is highly restricted. Furthermore, it was noted that the lack of long-term saving instruments provided in the Russian marketplace could lead to asset/liability matching problems, and the immature market of corporate bonds presented a significant issue.

17. Mr. Stephen Lumpkin of the OECD discussed the role of pension funds and other institutional investors in corporate governance, presenting an overview of practices in OECD countries. Mr. Lumpkin indicated that historically institutional investors across OECD countries (with the notable exception of some large US public pension funds) have not been very active in corporate governance matters. There are some signs that pension funds will be more active in the future. He explained that the investment strategy of a pension fund will have implications for how active it may become as a shareholder in the firms in which it has invested. For example, a pension fund that is a passive (or index) investor or one that has a large, illiquid position in a company may be more inclined to be a more active shareholder. Active investors – those that buy and sell holdings frequently – may be less likely to be attentive to firm governance, because they are more inclined to ‘vote with their feet.’ As pension funds grow and become larger shareholders relative to the size of a particular market, they may be inclined to play a more active role in corporate governance matters. Mr. Lumpkin noted that effective corporate governance can play an important role in enhancing shareholder value – and as pension fund asset increase – in enhancing value for pension funds and their members.

Session 6: Supervisory Structure, Perspectives and Techniques: Focus on Supervision of Asset Management and Financial Institutions

18. This session reviewed the various models of private pension supervision employed in OECD and other countries. Vinicius Carvalho Pinheiro of OECD provided a broad overview of this area based on a survey of OECD countries. Three main models for organising pension supervision were identified: 1) a specialised pension model, which devotes a single supervisory authority exclusively to pension supervision; 2) a partially integrated model, in which supervision over pensions is integrated with supervision over another financial area, such as insurance; and 3) an integrated model, in which a single supervisor is responsible for all institutions in the financial sector (e.g., banks, insurance and pension providers). Regardless of the model used, it is important that the supervisor have the enforcement powers necessary to carry out its mission. Institutional features that could contribute to the successful design of a
supervisory agency include sufficient operational autonomy, adequate financial and human resources, and insulation from political interference.

19. The following presentations addressed specific supervisory issues and techniques in three OECD countries (United States, Ireland and Hungary) and in Russia. William Poole, President of the Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis, focused on the development of self-regulatory practices and voluntary compliance incentives within the US pension system. Mr. Poole emphasized the role of the government in designing regulatory incentives to encourage private firms to act in the interest of pension plan participants by establishing appropriate financial rewards and penalties. He also discussed the need for the adequate disclosure of financial information to plan participants so that they are better able to monitor the governance and financial health of their pension plans. Mr. Gaal of the Hungarian Supervisory Authority discussed the specific supervisory structure in place in Hungary, focusing on the regulation of investment. Ms. Hutch of Ireland’s Pensions Board described the supervisory role of the Irish Pensions Board, providing an example of the breadth of authority that might be provided to a supervisory entity and the scope of activities that an authority might conduct under its governmental mandate.

20. Mr. Bataev from the Inspection of the Non-State Pension Funds at the Ministry of Labor and Social Development focused on the organisation of Russian supervision over non-state pension funds participating in voluntary private pension provision. Starting next year these NPFs will also be able to participate in the mandatory private pension system. He pointed out that the laws governing the NPFs is currently under review with a view to further permitting the efficient integration of NPFs into the mandatory pension system. He further indicated that, in order to achieve more effective monitoring over all entities participating in the private pension market, the creation of unified supervisory agency/body is presently under consideration in Russia. He highlighted as well the importance of introducing self-regulatory mechanisms as part of the supervisory system for pensions in Russia. David Shavishvili, speaking on behalf of the Pension Investment Council of Russia, emphasized first, the role that citizens and members of pension programs must play in pension supervision and oversight, and second, that supervisors should not lose sight of the social protection and retirement security goals of the pension programs.

Session 7: Explaining Reform to the Public, Educating the Consumer and Protecting Pension Fund Members

21. Appropriate disclosure regimes, meaningful information campaigns and the financial education of the public are key elements for the successful implementation of private pension reform. Several Russian participants in this session – Mr. Dmitry Konshin of the Institute for Social Insurance Development, Mr. Andrei Stoliarov of NPF Gazfond and Elizabeth Hebert of Pallada Asset Management – discussed the issue of public education in the Russian context. All parties noted that the information campaign launched in Russia thus far has proved to be insufficient. Key issues are the limited availability of financial and operational resources and the need to target a very large population (72 million are in the working population) that is dispersed across the country’s large territory. The Russian speakers generally agreed that private sector entities engaged in the pension market (asset management companies and NPFs) might also be able to play a significant role in educating the public.

22. The presentation of Ms. Mary Hutch of Ireland’s Pensions Board provided an excellent illustration of the wide range of governmental measures that can be taken to inform and educate the public about pension reform. The Irish authorities have recently undertaken a National Pension Awareness program, which is planned to last for three years. This program seeks to heighten pension awareness with a view to increasing pension coverage. As part of the campaign, the Pensions Board is actively engaged in outreach activities to provide information to the public and to pension providers. The Pensions Board has used a wide range of techniques and effectively used the internet and media. It has also used other relatively low-cost information channels (e.g. producing messages on grocery receipts and advertising on
buses). The Pensions Board also produces a range of informational booklets targeted towards specific audiences and issues. It also has prepared handbooks for pension trustees and offers trustee training. Mr. Weyer of Germany discussed the new pension products available in Germany, described their design parameters and analyzed the disappointing uptake rates thus far, in part identifying product design as a key issue. Product design, especially design of voluntary products, must include appropriate financial incentives and must be designed so that the product can be easily explained and understood.

Session 8: Administrative and IT Challenges for Russian Authorities

23. This session focused on the administrative dimension of Russian pension reform. Speakers presented views based on experiences in Ukraine, Hong Kong and the United States, as well as Russia. Mr. Greg McTaggart of the USAID Pension Reform Project in Ukraine provided background on the status of reform in Ukraine and its experience in considering the design and implementation of the administrative mechanisms that would be needed to make its reform a success. In Ukraine, the reform of pension system started in 1998, resulting in adoption of legislation in 2003. During this period the Pension Fund of Ukraine began to plan for the necessary enhancements to its computer systems in order to assure that the required recordkeeping tasks could effectively and accurately be managed when the program started. The main challenge for Ukraine will be the installation and testing of the software and procedures necessary for the successful management of the contribution collection process, individual accounts, and the payment of pension benefits.

24. In contrast to the Ukrainian system, Hong Kong adopted an employer-based program that is regulated and supervised by the Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Authority (MFSA). Ms. Hendena Yu of the MFSA provided an in-depth review of the lessons that could be learned from the implementation of their program. She focused, in part, on compliance issues related to small employers and issues arising from the fact that some employers could not transmit data electronically. She also recommended that systems implementation be well considered. Hong Kong implemented its automated systems early, but then had to make significant changes to the system after it was implemented. She noted it would have been easier and less expensive if temporary systems were used until all systems parameters had been clearly identified.

25. Janet Rubenstein of the US consulting firm Milliman USA, focused on the main duties involved in pension administration and recordkeeping. She noted that an important aspect of successful administration was meeting the expectations of program participants. Thus, a program should establish standard procedures for timely submission of contributions and their accurate crediting to individual accounts and for the provision of accurate, timely account information (transaction confirmations, account statements, etc). She also discussed other key components of program administration, including contribution audit and record reconciliation, and the allocation of pension fund earnings to individual accounts. Finally, Ms. Rubenstein discussed basic systems requirements (e.g., centralized versus decentralized database; processing and storage capabilities; back-up and disaster recovery; standardized date formatting, etc.) that are fundamental to program success. She noted that the government should view successful administration as central to building trust in the pension program.

26. Mr. Yuri Lyublin, First Deputy Minister of Labour and Social Development of the Russian Federation, focused on the main administrative issues confronting Russia. These include the development of an accurate, integrated, personalised national database that would keep track of the pension credits and account balances of each individual and the introduction of a modern financial management system for contribution collection and pension payments. He noted that the underlying goals are threefold: to increase trust, transparency and accountability; to enhance the co-ordination among the different authorities responsible for the pension programs; and to assure regular member access to account information.
27. The final session discussed the issue of fees and costs associated with the pension funds administration. Agnieszka Chlon of the Gdansk Institute for Market Economics provided data on the fees and costs associated with the pension programs of a number of countries, focusing primarily on several Central European countries. Her presentation identified the types and level of charges in the pension systems of Hungary, Kazakhstan, Poland, Latvia, Croatia, Bulgaria, Estonia and Macedonia. Most countries regulate the structure and partially regulate the level of charges. Charge levels differ across countries and reflect legal design, supervision practices and competition. Based on presented data, Ms. Chlon concluded that generally, economies of scale in charge levels have not been observed as pension funds grow in size, but some economies of scale can be seen with respect to the actual costs of managing pension funds. She noted that in part this discrepancy arose because charges are regulated, diminishing the likelihood of competition based on charge or fee levels. Also, charges are not necessarily transparent or meaningful to many program members and therefore, program members are less likely to put pressure on pension providers to lower fees by selecting providers with lower charges.

28. Pavel Teplukhin of Troika-Dialog Asset Management discussed the situation in Russia, focusing on the fees levied by NPFs and asset managers. He pointed out that under the Russian Civil Code, asset management could be rewarded only if the company makes a profit on pension assets. He suggested that legislation was needed to rectify this situation. He also suggested that only a limited amount of pension assets would likely be transferred to private management from the mandatory program in its early years. In light of this expectation and the costs related to asset management, he predicted that there would be consolidation of the private pension asset management industry to attain necessary economies of scale.

Concluding remarks:

29. Closing remarks were made by Yuri Lyublin, First Deputy Minister of Labor and Social Development, Mr. Ambrogio Rinaldi, Chair of the OECD Working Party on Private Pensions and Mr. Douglas B. Baker, Deputy Assistant Secretary of the US Department of Commerce. Mr. Lyublin expressed the wish to continue a policy dialogue with the OECD in the private pension field and indicated a strong desire for further cooperation, including the desire to actively participate in the work of the OECD Working Party on Private Pensions, where the Russian government has applied for observer status. Mr. Rinaldi confirmed the desire of the OECD to provide technical assistance and advice to the Russian policy makers in the area of private pension policy and regulation. Mr. Baker indicated that the current US administration was committed to strengthening co-operation with the Russian public and private sectors at the international level and by supporting the initiatives of the private sector to provide training on technical issues related to private pension plan management, administration and regulation.
APPENDIX 1

AGENDA
OECD Conference
Pension Reform in Russia: From Legislation to Implementation
Moscow
September 24-26, 2003

Supported by the Government of the Russian Federation

Co-sponsored by:

- US Department of Commerce
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
- Russian and US industry partners, including: Gazfond, Milliman USA, PioGlobal, Pallada Asset Management
- International Network of Pension Regulators & Supervisors
- NGO Institute for Social Insurance Development

Conference Description and Goals:

Over the past two years, the Russian Federation has passed sweeping pension reform laws, including a law on investments of the funded part of the state pension system and amendments to the law on non-state (private) pension funds. According to the new legislation, from January 2004 private pension funds become part of the national mandatory pension system of the Russian Federation. Providing a range of investment choice to all Russian citizens, this aspect of the pension reform is crucial to the provision of retirement income security for the Russian people and has been cited as a critical step in the development of capital markets in Russia, but much depends on successful implementation. Both Russian officials responsible for the reform and private sector participants have identified a number of critical issues that must be addressed to ensure that the reforms are implemented successfully. These issues include:

- Enhancement of regulatory and supervisory framework to ensure effective and efficient monitoring of pension fund investment practices and regulatory compliance;
- Additional reform of laws that may limit or render less attractive securities as an investment;
- Development of a public information program to educate and disseminate balanced information and education to new pension fund members; and
- Further development of administrative infrastructure enabling accurate recordkeeping and reporting of individual investment account balances and transactional activity.

This conference is intended to focus on these and other important issues related to Russia’s pension reforms, discuss relevant practices, standards and experiences in OECD and other countries, and provide a forum for dialogue among conference participants, who will include representatives from governmental authorities with experience in implementing, regulating and supervising pension fund programs, as well as private sector representatives with experience in investing pension fund assets in their home countries and internationally.
Program:

**DAY 1**

9:00-9:30 Welcome and Introduction

Ambrogio Rinaldi, COVIP, Italy and Chair of OECD Working Party on Private Pensions

Mikhail Dmitriev, First Deputy Minister of Economic Development and Trade of Russia

Yuri Lyublin, First Deputy Minister of Labour and Social Development of Russia

**Session 1**

9:30-11:00 Overview of Russian Pension Reform and the Road Ahead

This session will set the stage for the conference by providing a basic and comprehensive overview of the key elements of reform. It will identify some of the key tasks and challenges lying ahead from a variety of perspectives within Russia.

**Moderator:** Ambrogio Rinaldi, COVIP, Italy (10 minutes)

Mikhail Dmitriev, First Deputy Minister of Economic Development and Trade of Russia (30 minutes)

Andrei Vorontsov, Ministry of Finance of Russia (30 minutes)

Discussion (20 minutes)

11:00-11:30 Refreshment break

**Session 2**

11:30-12:30 Introduction to OECD/INPRS Principles and Guidelines for Pension Funds

This session will provide a brief overview of the principles and guidelines being developed by the OECD’s Working Party on Private Pensions in conjunction with the International Network of Pension Regulators and Supervisors. Presentation will focus on work in the area of governance standards for pension funds, as well as OECD work in progress on similar standards for insurance companies and collective investment schemes (CIS).

Russell Galer, OECD (25 minutes)

Evgeny Yakushev, Expert Council of Inspection of Non-State Pension Fund Under the Ministry of Labour and Social Development (20 minutes)

Discussion (20 minutes)

12:30-14:15 Lunch
Session 3

14:15-17:00 Asset Management: Regulatory Standards For Investment and the Investment Process

This session will cover topics related to the investment management activity of pension funds and its regulation by examining standards and industry practices in Russia and other countries.

Moderator: Russell Galer, OECD (10 minutes)

Pension fund investment regulation: Prudent person and quantitative limits approaches
Russell Galer, OECD (20 minutes)

Brief overview of Russian pension fund investment standards and supervision
Natalia Drobyashenko, Pallada Asset Management (30 minutes)

15:15-15:35 Refreshment break

Discussion on evaluation and risk management
Peter Davies, RiskMetrics, United States (30 minutes)

Pension investment country case study: Netherlands
Peter Kraneveld, PGGM, Netherlands (30 minutes)

Discussion (25 minutes)

Session 4

17:00-18:15 Impact of Guarantees on Pension Plan Funding and Investment

This session will address country experience with guaranty programs and the impact of these programs on pension funding and asset allocation. The role of and recent controversies regarding government-sponsored guaranty funds will be described. The speakers will also address the international trend from a defined benefit to a defined contribution framework for pension provision.

Moderator: Ambrogio Rinaldi, COVIP, Italy (5 minutes)

Guaranty Programs: Principles and Application
Csaba Feher, World Bank (25 minutes)

United States Case Study
Steven Kandarian, Pension Benefit Guaranty Corporation, United States (25 minutes)

Discussion (20 minutes)

Reception hosted by PioGlobal

DAY 2
Session 5
9:00-10:40 Investment Opportunities in Russia and the Role of Pension Funds as Institutional Investors

This session will discuss the Russian capital markets and financial instruments available for investment in Russia. The role of international markets in the investment of pension assets will also be addressed. The potential role of pension funds as large institutional shareholders will also be discussed with reference to the experience in OECD countries.

Moderator: Ambrogio Rinaldi, COVIP, Italy (5 minutes)

Asset Management for Pension Funds in Russia: Discussion of recent developments and limitations in Russian capital markets and domestic investment opportunities for and constraints on pension funds. The current regulatory climate, overview of available instruments and who is allowed to participate in these investments, as well as tax and property code issues will be reviewed. Pension fund and life insurance company constraints will be compared. The perspective of foreign institutional investors will also be discussed.

Andrei Uspensky, PioGlobal (20 minutes)

Ulf Schneider, Russia Consulting (20 minutes)

Andrei Sharonov, The Federal Commission of Securities Markets (15 minutes)

The Institutional Investor Role in Corporate Governance: Discussion on the role and impact of private pension funds as institutional investors in both OECD and other countries, including market impact and role in corporate governance.

Stephen Lumpkin, OECD (20 minutes)

Discussion (20 minutes)

Solange Vieira, Telecommunications Workers Pension Fund Foundation, Brazil

10:40-11:00 Refreshment break

Session 6
11:00-13:30 Supervisory Structure, Perspectives and Techniques: Focus on Supervision of Asset Management and Financial Institutions

This session will discuss various models of supervision of pension funds and related financial institutions and review the variety of structures (e.g., consolidated or separate regulatory regimes) and supervisory methods employed. Discussion will address the issue of over- and under-regulation and the nature of the public-private (supervisor-regulated entity) relationship. Case studies will be presented.

Moderator: Vinicius Carvalho Pinheiro, OECD (5 minutes)

Discussion on supervisory structures and techniques in OECD countries, with reference to developing ‘good practices’ from study of OECD countries

Vinicius Carvalho Pinheiro, OECD (20 minutes)
The role for self-regulation and voluntary compliance incentive.

William Poole, The Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis, United States (25 minutes)

Case Study 1: Hungary (25 minutes)

Attila Gaal, Hungarian Financial Supervisory Authority, Hungary

Case Study 2: Ireland (25 minutes)

Mary Hutch, Pensions Board, Ireland

The Russian perspective

Vyacheslav Bataev, Inspection of Non-State Pension Funds at the Ministry of Labor and Social Development (15 minutes)

David Shavishvili, Pension Investment Council (15 minutes)

Discussion (20 minutes)

13:30-15:00 Lunch

Session 7

15:00-17:30 Explaining Reform to the Public, Educating the Consumer and Protecting Pension Fund Members

This session will discuss the manner in which governments have undertaken the task of informing the public of the pension reforms and retirement savings opportunities. The role of private sector institutions (pension funds and financial institutions) in educating, assisting and advising consumers regarding new pension and savings products will be addressed. The role of disclosure regimes and adequate regulatory standards to protect pension fund members also will be discussed.

Moderator: Dmitry Konshin, Institute for Social Insurance Development (10 minutes)

Discussion on the Russian perspective on information dissemination to the public

Andrei Stoliarov, NPF GAZFOND (25 minutes)

Discussion on the role financial sector and other private sector entities can play in educating and otherwise assisting the public

Elizabeth Hebert, Pallada Asset Management (25 minutes)

16:00-16:20 Refreshment break

Country case study: Germany

Markus J. Weyer, Germany (25 minutes)

Country case study: Ireland

Mary Hutch, Pensions Board, Ireland (25 minutes)

Discussion (20 minutes)
**Dinner hosted by the Gazfond**

**DAY 3**

**Session 8**

9:00-11:00 Administrative and IT Challenges for Russian Authorities

This session will discuss the administrative challenges that the Russian authorities may anticipate as they implement the new pension fund program. The discussion will focus on collection of contributions; clearinghouse infrastructure, administration and record keeping; and the relationship among government clearinghouse facilities, asset managers, and the public.

**Moderator:** Greg McTaggart, USAID Pension Reform Project, Ukraine (5 minutes)

*The Ukrainian perspective*

Greg McTaggart, USAID Pension Reform Project, Ukraine (20 minutes)

*The Russian perspective*

Yuri Lyublin, First Deputy Minister of Labour and Social Development of Russia (25 minutes)

*Hong Kong, China perspective*

Hendena Yu, Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Authority, Hong Kong, China (25 minutes)

*Reflections on the Russian Case*

Janet Rubenstein, Milliman USA, United States (25 minutes)

**Discussion** (20 minutes)

11:00-11:15 Refreshment break

**Session 9**

11:15-12:30 Understanding fees and controlling costs

This session will discuss the array of potential fees and costs in pension fund products and administration, describe experiences with controlling costs and fees in various countries with similarly structured pension fund programs, and take a critical look at various country experiences.

**Moderator:** Stephen Lumpkin, OECD (5 minutes)

*Discussion on the impact of economies of scale and competition on fees and expenses in the pension asset management industry.*

Pavel Teplukhin, Troika-Dialog Asset Management (25 minutes)

*Cases in countries in transition*

Agnieszka Chlon, Gdansk Institute for Market Economics, Poland (25 minutes)
Discussion (20 minutes)

12:30-13:00 Summary and Conclusion

Yuri Lyublin, First Deputy Minister of Labour and Social Development of Russia

Douglas Baker, Deputy Assistant Secretary, U.S. Department of Commerce

Ambrogio Rinaldi, COVIP, Italy and Chair of OECD Working Party on Private Pensions
APPENDIX 2: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

GERMANY

Mr. Juergen TIEZTE
Director
Bundesministerium der Finanzen (Federal Ministry of Finance)
Wilhelmstrasse 108
D-10117 Berlin

Mr Markus Weyer
Attorney at Law
Rechtsanwalt Markus Johannes Weyer
Ostmerheimer Str. 257
51109 Köln
Germany

HUNGARY

Mr. Attila GAÀL
Chief Supervisor
Hungarian Financial Supervisory Authority
H1013 Budapest, Krisztina Krt. 39
Hungary

IRELAND

Ms. Mary HUTCH
Head of Information and Training
Pensions Board
Verschoyle House
28-30 Lower Mount Street
Dublin 2
Ireland
ITALY

Mr. Ambrogio RINALDI
COVIP-Pension Fund Supervision Commission
Via in Arcione, 71
00187 Rome
Italy

THE NETHERLANDS

Mr. Peter KRANEVELD
Chief Economist
PGGM
Zeist
The Netherlands

POLAND

Ms. Agnieszka CHLON
The Gdansk Institute for Market Economics
Ul. Kolobrzeska 16,
Warsaw
Poland

Mr. Tomasz IWANCZUK
Legal Advisor in the Legal-Licencing Dpt.
Insurance and Pension Funds Supervisory Commission
Niedzwiedzia 6E, 02-737 Warszawa
Poland

Mr. Pawel SAWICKI
Insurance and Pension Funds Supervisory Commission
Niedzwiedzia 6E, 02-737 Warszawa
Poland

TURKEY

Ms. Hülya Çatpinar BALCI
Expert
Prime Ministry
The Undersecretariat of Treasury
General Directorate of Insurance
Inönü Bulvari, No: 36
Kat: 14
06510 Emek
Ankara - Turkey
UNITED KINGDOM

Mr. Mervyn GREIG
Citigroup Centre
Level 18 - Maildrop CGC-18-58
Canada Square
Canary Wharf
London EC14 5LB
United Kingdom

Mr. Edward LEVIN
Citigroup Centre
Level 18 - Maildrop CGC-18-58
Canada Square
Canary Wharf
London EC14 5LB
United Kingdom

UNITED STATES

Mr. Douglas B. BAKER
Deputy Assistant Secretary
Service Industries, Tourism and Finance
U.S. Department of Commerce
14th & Constitution Avenues
Washington, DC 20230

Ms. Lydia BORGATTA
Senior Vice President
A.G. Edwards & Sons, Inc.
280 Park Avenue
29th Floor West
New York, NY 10017
United States

Mr. Michael CORBIN
Program Manager, Russia/NIS
Office of Finance
U.S. Department of Commerce
14th Constitution Avenues
20230 Washington
United States
Mr. Peter DAVIES
Vice Chairman
RiskMetrics Group
44 Wall Street
22nd Floor
New York, NY 10005
United States

Mr. Donald HUNTER
Chief Operating Officer
Harbor Global Company Ltd.
One Faneuil Hall Marketplace
Boston, MA 02109
United States

Mr. Steven A. KANDARIAN
Executive Director
Pension Benefit Guarantee Corp.
1200 K Street NW Suite 210
Washington DC
United States

Mr. Stephen KASNET
President
Chief Executive Officer
Harbor Global Company Ltd.
One Faneuil Hall Marketplace
Boston, MA 02109
United States

Mr. William POOLE
President
The Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis
411 Locust St.
St. Louis, MO 63102
United States

Ms. Janet RUBENSTEIN
Senior Benefits Consultant
Milliman USA
1301 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3800
Seattle, WA 98101-2605
United States

Mr. Ken SIMONS
Vice President of OAS
SunGard Corbel
1660 Prudential Drive
Suite 400
Jacksonville, FL 32207
United States
NON-MEMBER COUNTRIES

BRAZIL

Ms. Solange VIEIRA
President
Telecommunications Workers Pension Fund Foundation
Av. Presidente Vargas n°290-10º andar, Centro
Rio de Janeiro
Brasil, cep: 20091-060

HONG KONG, CHINA

Ms. Hendena YU
Chief Operating Officer
Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Authority
21/F & 22/F One International Finance Centre
1 Harbour View Street, Central
Hong Kong, China

Mr. Joseph Kai-Wang LEE
Manager, Investment Regulation Division
Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Authority
21/F & 22/F One International Finance Centre
1 Harbour View Street, Central
Hong Kong, China

KAZAKHSTAN

Mr. Nurzhan ALIMUHAMBETOV
Deputy Chair of the Board
Private Pension Fund of the
National Bank of Kazakhstan
Ul. Masanchi, 26
480091 Almaty
Kazakhstan

RUSSIAN FEDERATION

Mr. Dmitry V. ALEXEEV
Executive Director
Institute of Social Insurance Development (ISID)
44a, Varshavskoe shosse,
Moscow, Russian Federation
Ms. Elena V. ARTEMVOVA  
Head of the Pension Reform Division  
Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of the RF,  
1st Tverskaya-Yamskaya street, 1-3  
A-47, Moscow, GSP-3  
125993, Russian Federation

Mr. Vyacheslav BATAEV  
Head of Inspection of Non-State Pension Fund  
Under the Ministry of Labour and Social Development  
Slavyanskaya pl, 4, Stroenie 1  
109074 Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Vika BELAGUROVA  
Analyst  
31, Krasnaya Presnya  
Moscow 123022  
Russian Federation

Mr. Sergey BROVCHAK  
Executive Director  
NPF Progress-Garant,  
Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Nikolay BRUSNIKIN  
Deputy Chairman of the Social Committee  
The State Duma  
Ul. Okhotniy rayd, 1  
103265 Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Vassiliy CHEKULADEV  
Head of Sales & Marketing  
Non-State Pension Fund ‘ING’  
31 Krasnaya Prushya  
Moscow 123022  
Russian Federation

Mr. Alexander CHERBAKOV  
Director General  
Ingosstrakh  
Ul. Pyatnizkaya, 12  
115998 Moscow  
Russian Federation
Mr. Alexander CHERNOIVAN
Deputy Chairman
The State Pension Fund of Russia
Ul. Shabolovka, 4
119991 Moscow
Russian Federation

Ms. Maria CHURAEVA
General Director
Pio Global
Gazetnyi pereoulok, 5
125993 Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Mikhail DMITRIEV
First Deputy Minister
Ministry of Economic Development and Trade
1st Tverskaya-Yamskaya street, 1-3
A-47, Moscow, GSP-3
125993, Russian Federation

Mr. Konstantin DOBROMYSLOV
Pension Strategist
Center of Strategic Development,
Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Sergei DUBROVIN
Advisor
The Administration of the President of the RF
4 Staraya Square
Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Oleg EREMEEV
Director General
Russian Coordination Employers’ Council

Mr. Kirill GORYATCHI
Actuary
Non-State Pension Fund ‘ING’
31 Krasnaya Presnya
Moscow 123022
Russian Federation

Ms. Elizabeth HEBERT
PALLADA
Ul. Bolshaya Yakimanka, 1 "Alexander House", office 4.28
Moscow
Russian Federation
Mr. Erhard JOERCHEL  
Ost-West Allianz  
3-d Samotechny per., 3  
103473 Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Anvar IRCHAEV  
Head of Sales Department  
Deutscher Investment Trust Ltd.  
Podosenskij per, 30  
105062, Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Sergey KABALKIN  
Director  
NPF Interros-Dostoinstvo  
Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Maxim KARAGODIN  
Deputy Director of the Social Policy Department  
Ministry of Economic Development and Trade  
1st Tverskaya-Yamskaya street, 1-3  
A-47 Moscow, GSP-3  
125993 Russian Federation

Ms. Anastasia A. KLIMOVA  
Attorney  
LeBoeuf, Lamb, Green & MacRae, L.L.P.  
Nikitsky pereulok, 5  
125009 Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Dmitri S. KONSHIN  
Counsellor to the Federal Minister  
Ministry of Economic Development and Trade  
1st Tverskaya-Yamskaya street, 1-3  
A-47, Moscow, GSP-3  
125993, Russian Federation

Ms. Irina KRIVOSHEEVA  
General Director  
Deutscher Investment Trust Ltd  
Podosensky per, 30  
105062 Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Alexander KUZNETSOV  
Chief Counselor  
CCMD  
Moscow, Russian Federation
Mr. Nathan LANE
Economic Section
Embassy of the United States of America
Bolshoy Devyatinskiy Pereulok, 8
Moscow, 121099
Russian Federation

Mr. Vadim LISHINSKY
President
AIG Russia
Ul. Tverskaya, 16/2
125009 Moscow
Russian Federation

Alexander LORENZ
Director of the Non-Bank Financial Services, Chairman of the Pension Group of the Russia-Europe Business Council
ING Bank

Mr. Sergey LUKONIN
Deputy Director
Russian Coordination Employers’ Council
Malyi Dolmachevskyi pereulok, 8/11, stroenie 3
119017 Moscow
Russian Federation

Ms. Dorothy LUTTER
Senior Commercial Officer
US Foreign & Commercial Service
22/38 B. Molchanovka, Bldg. 2
121069 Moscow
Russia

Mr. Yuri Z. LYUBLIN
First Deputy Minister
Ministry of Labour and Social Development
Birzshevaya pl., building 1
101999 Moscow
Russian Federation

Ms. Tatiana MEDVEDEVA
Chief Legal Advisor
CCMD
Moscow
Russian Federation
Mr. Andrei MOVCHAN
Head of Asset Management
Renaissance Capital
22 Voznesensky pereulok
103009 Moscow
Russian Federation

Ms. Holly NIELSON
International Counsel
Debevoise & Plimpton LLC
Business Centre “Mokhovaya”
Ul. Vozdvishenka, 4/7
Stroenie 2
125009 Moscow
Russian Federation

Ms. Tatyanna OLIFEROVA
Consultant
Social Development Depart of the Office of the Government of the
Russian Federation
Moscow, Russian Federation

Mr. Wil OLSTHOORN
General Director
ING Non-State Pension Fund
31 Krasnaya Presnya
123022 Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Dmitry PISKULOV
Associate Banker, Financial Institutions
European Bank for Reconstruction
and Development (EBRD)
36/1 Bolshaya Molchanovka str.,
121 069 Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Viktor PLESKACHEVSKY
Chairman of the Committee on Property
The State Duma
Ul. Okhotniy rayd, 1
103265 Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Alexander P. POCHINOK
Minister of Labour and Social Development
Birzshevaya pl., building 1
101999 Moscow
Russian Federation
Mr. Douglas PRENTICE  
EuroCapital Group  
Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Denis RODIONOV  
Co-Director  
Brunswick UBS Warburg  
Moscow,  
Russian Federation

Mr. Charles RYAN  
United Financial Group  
10 Povarskaya Street  
121069 Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Oganes SARKISOV  
US Commercial Service  
Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Alexey SAVATYUGIN  
President  
NAUFOR  
Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Alexander SCHERBAKOV  
Director General  
Ingosstrakh  
Ul. Pyatnizkaya, 12  
115998 Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Ulf SCHNEIDER  
Russia Consulting  
Ul. Bolshaya Yakimanka, 1 "Alexander House", office 4.28  
Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Andrei SELIVANOV  
Chairman of the Social Committee  
The State Duma  
Ul. Okhotniy rayd, 1  
103265 Moscow  
Russian Federation
Mr. Yuri SHAMALOV  
First Vice-President  
NPF Gazfond  
Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Alexei SHARONOV  
Federal Commission on Securities Markets  
Leninskii Prospect, d.9, et.13  
117939 Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Alexey SHKRABKIN  
Investment Company “Capital”  
Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Valeriy SIVASHENKOV  
Vice President  
NPF “Gegest”  
Volgogradskiy av., 2  
109316 Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Andrew B. SOMERS  
President  
American Chamber of Commerce in Russia  
Ul. Dolgorukovskaya, 7, 14th Floor  
127006 Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Vadim SOSKOV  
“ATON” GROUP  
Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Andrei STOLIAROV  
NPF Gazfond  
Vice President of Non-State Pension Fund Gazfond  
Pr. Vernadskogo, 41  
117415 Moscow  
Russian Federation

Mr. Bernard SUCHER  
Chairman  
Alfa Capital  
9 Mashy Poryvaevoy Street  
107078 Moscow  
Russian Federation
Mr. Victor I. TARASOV
President
Non-State Pension Fund NPF Gazfond
Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Pavel TEPLUKHIN
President
Troika Dialog
4, Romanov pereulok
125009 Moscow
Russian Federation

Ms. Capitolina TOUBINA
Director
GeneralCologne Re
Ul. Chayanova, 7
125047 Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Andrei USPENSKY
Chief Investment Officer
Pio Global
Gazetnyi pereulok, 5
125993 Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Konstantin UGRYUMOV
Chief of Pensions
IFC Capital
Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Yuri V. VORONIN
Director of the Pension Department
Ministry of Labor and Social Development
Birzshevaya Pl., building 1
101999 Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Andrei VORONTSOV
The Ministry of Finance,
Deputy Director of the Sovereign Dept Department, Pension Section
9 Ilinka Street
109097 Moscow, Russian Federation
Mr. Evgeny YAKUSHEV
Chair of the Board
Chair of the Board of Non-State Pension Fund Globex
Smolenskaya pl 3
Business centre “Smolensky passage”
121 099 Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Igor YURGENS
Vice-President
Russian Union of Industrials and Entrepreneurs
Staraya pl. 10/4
103070 Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Eugeny ZAITSEV
Investment Company “ATON”
Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Alexander ZARETSKY
General Manager
AIG Life
Ul. Sadovaya Chernogryazskaya, 13/3
105064 Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Leonid ZUBAREV
Partner
Cameron McKenna, LLP
Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Mikhail U. ZURABOV
Head, State Pension Fund of Russia
4 Shabolovka Street
117049 Moscow
Russian Federation

Ms. Irina BAGNYUK
Deputy Head Pension Reform Department, Ministry of Labor and social Policy of Ukraine
6/8 Frolivs’ka St.
Corpus 1
Kyiv
04070 Ukraine
Ms. Natalia GORYUK  
Pension Reform Expert,  
PADCO/USAID  
6/8 Frolivs’ka St.  
Corpus 1  
Kyiv  
04070 Ukraine

Mr. Yevgeny IVANOV  
Head of Department on Investment Activity, State Securities and Stock  
Market Commission of Ukraine  
6/8 Frolivs’ka St.  
Corpus 1  
Kyiv  
04070 Ukraine

Ms. Marina LAZEBNAYA  
Senior Specialist of the Department for Strategy  
Development and Social Policy, Secretariat of Cabinet of  
Ministers of Ukraine  
6/8 Frolivs’ka St.  
Corpus 1  
Kyiv  
04070 Ukraine

Mr. Greg McTAGGART  
Chief of Party  
USAID Ukraine Pension Reform Implementation Program  
Planning and Development Collaborative International (PADCO)  
6/8 Frolivs’ka St.  
Corpus 1  
Kyiv  
04070 Ukraine

Mr. Andrei RYBALCHENKO  
Director of the Department for Supervision on Non-State Pension Funds  
Activities, State Regulation of Financial Markets Commission of Ukraine  
6/8 Frolivs’ka St.  
Corpus 1  
Kyiv  
04070 Ukraine

Mr. Sergy SAVCHUK  
Joint Stock Commercial Bank for Social Development “UkrSotsBank”  
29 Kovpaka Str.  
Kiev 03150  
Ukraine
INTERNATIONAL ORGANISATIONS

Ms. Svetlana MISIKHINA
Social Protection and Labour Market Statistics Expert
International Labor Organization
Ul. Petrovka, 15, office 23
107031 Moscow
Russian Federation

Mr. Csaba FEHER
Managing Director, Hungarian Private Pensions Guarantee Fund
The World Bank
1818 H Street NW
Washington DC 20433
United States

Ms. Elena ZOTOVA
Technical Specialist
World Bank
Ul. Bolshaya Molchanovka, 36
121069 Moscow
Russian Federation

Ms. Juana Mera Cabello
First Secretary
Head of Tacis HR Sector
Delegation of the European Commission
Moscow
Russian Federation

OECD SECRETARIAT

Mr. Stephen LUMPKIN
Principal Administrator
Financial Markets and Policies
Financial Affairs Division
OECD
37 bis, boulevard Suchet
75016 Paris
FRANCE
Mr. Russell GALER  
Administrator  
Insurance and Private Pensions Unit  
Financial Affairs Division  
Directorate for Financial, Fiscal & Enterprise Affairs  
OECD  
37 bis, boulevard Suchet  
75016 Paris  
FRANCE

Mr. Vinicius CARVALHO PINHEIRO  
Consultant, Pensions  
Insurance and Private Pensions Unit  
Financial Affairs Division  
Directorate for Financial, Fiscal and Enterprise Affairs  
OECD  
37 bis Bd. Suchet  
75016 Paris  
France

Judyta FIEDIN  
Administrator  
Russia, NIS and SEE Unit  
Centre for Co-operation with Non-Members  
OECD  
2, rue André Pascal  
75775 Paris Cedex 16  
France

Ms. Nina PAKLINA  
Research Assistant  
Insurance and Private Pensions Unit  
Financial Affairs Division  
Directorate for Financial, Fiscal & Enterprise Affairs  
OECD  
37 bis, boulevard Suchet  
75016 Paris  
FRANCE