Summary of the Evaluation Report “Family Planning - Social Marketing of Contraceptives – Pakistan”

on behalf of
Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development
- Evaluationdivision -

This report entirely reflects the observations of the consultants and does not commit any of the institutions involved in the cooperation partnership.
German development Cooperation with Pakistan
Short Version of Evaluation Report
“Family Planning - Social Marketing of Contraceptives”

Summary
Objective of the evaluation was the assessment of measures and impact of a programme for
the procurement, distribution and marketing of contraceptives by private distribution and
service networks (Social Marketing) which has been supported by the Kreditanstalt für
Wiederaufbau (KfW) in Pakistan since 1995. The aim of the programme was to contribute to
the improved provision of hormonal contraceptives and condoms to the poorer segments of
the urban and peri-urban population while respecting their individual contraceptive choice.

The executing agency, the Pakistani non-governmental organisation ‘Social Marketing
Pakistan (Guarantee) Ltd’, has been supported by the international consultant Population
Services International. National co-operating partner was the Ministry for Population Welfare.
Aims of the evaluation included the assessment of the effectiveness of the social marketing
approach for population planning, its development policy relevance and the elaboration of
proposals for the future direction of the programme.

Findings
Policy environment: With the first-ever formulation of a distinct population policy in 2002, the
Pakistani government has taken an essential step for overcoming its population problem.
Primary objectives of the policy are to reduce the annual population growth rate to 1.9 % in
2004 (from 2.1% in 2002) and to achieve a fertility rate of 2.1 children in 2020. A respective
set of reproductive health measures has been jointly developed by the Ministry of Health and
the Ministry of Population Welfare.

In the last years, a generally positive attitude towards family planning has evolved in the
general population as well as among quite a number of religious leaders. The demand for
family planning services particularly in urban areas is high and the unmet need as recently
been estimated to be just above 30%. However, the sometimes limited service delivery
capacity, particularly of the rural health centres, has in many places resulted in an insufficient
quality of family planning programmes.

Sectoral context: Social marketing strategies use marketing methods developed by the
commercial sector - like brand development, marketing campaigns, research, distribution,
franchising systems, service provider networks - for the achievement of social goals. Social
marketing products, distributed through commercial channels and those of the health sector,
are often subsidised in order to make them affordable to low-income population groups. The
strength of the social marketing approach lays in reaching the urban (lower) middle class.
However, it is assumed that approximately 30% of condoms distributed for the urban market
will also penetrate rural areas.

The role of social marketing as well as the co-operation between the public and private sectors
(public-private-partnership) have been highly acknowledged by the Pakistani government. Yet,
a national social marketing policy is still lacking.

Implementation and goal achievement: The goals achieved are in line with results planned and
implementation has been timely and been carried out by professional standards. Meanwhile,
SMP is marketing more than 10 products under the brand ‘GREENSTAR’ including
contraceptives, drugs, medical goods, nutrition products, as well as training programmes.
Today, the non-governmental organisation has 175 employees and 6 branches nation-wide.
SMP has developed from a product-oriented organisation towards a service oriented one and
has - since its consolidation in the nineties - elaborated efficient management-systems which
have replaced the former ad-hoc business procedures and have contributed to SMP’s
professional upgrading. SMP has now a differentiated system for recruiting and qualifying personnel and pays a lot of attention to quality control measures as well as to the training of co-workers of the distributing agency. These efforts have resulted in the development of a complex training- and supervision-programme for the members of the GREENSTAR-network.

Cost-Benefit Analysis: An important parameter for measuring efficiency of family planning programmes are the costs for one year of contraception (Couple-Year-Protection - CYP). SMP has shown that it can sustain CYP numbers at costs of around one fifth of the cost of CYP's generated by public health services and that its cost per CYP in 2001 was the lowest among 60 social marketing organisations world-wide.

Impact: Marketing achievements - i.e. CYP's - have exceeded planning objectives and the market share of SMP/GREENSTAR contraceptives (including all methods, public and private sector) is around 25% (1.6 million CYP's). Other private contraceptive providers have not been driven out of the market. To the contrary, it can be assumed that the increased acceptance of family planning products - facilitated by the information campaigns of SMP - have led to increased sales also of other contraceptive providers. The distribution of branded contraceptives by a high number of private outlets as well as the GREENSTAR-franchising network have contributed remarkably to the use of contraceptives in Pakistan. Since 1995, more than 12,000 private providers have been trained in family planning and more than 1,500 in the management of sexually transmitted infections as well as other reproductive health services. Likewise, clients' use of the franchising network of private clinics has increased: from 1.8 clients per week in 1997 to 16 clients in 2001. SMP has thus created the conditions for improving reproductive health.

The programme has shown high significance. This can be concluded from the rise of the national contraceptive prevalence rate during the programme's life-time to which SMP has contributed by its high contraceptive market share as well as its large service provider network. Likewise, with the definition of quality services and the creation of training programmes SMP has supported structural development of the reproductive health sector. It remains to be seen to what extend the programme will be able to assist in the institutional development of the public sector and/or of non-governmental organisations.

By contributing to the development of social infrastructure - with particular consideration of poorer population groups - the programme enjoys high development policy relevance. The private clinics supported by SMP/GREENSTAR offer services of higher quality than the public sector and are affordable for the majority of Pakistani women.

Today, SMP is by far the largest social marketing organisation in Pakistan based on its contraceptive sales figures, its number of products and its regional coverage. With the intensive integration of the private sector for family planning and reproductive health services in urban and peri-urban areas SMP has developed a successful concept to respond to the unmet need, particularly of lower income groups. For its remarkable performance SMP has received the population award from the government in 2002.

Challenges: SMP sees further potential for increasing contraceptive sales among the urban population. Yet, the extension of activities into rural areas - requested by KfW - is taken up slowly since respective expertise is still lacking. SMP has formed a number of alliances with research institutions as well as organisations experienced in community development in rural areas. Nevertheless, there remains as risk that SMP will not succeed in transferring expertise and performance of its work in urban areas into rural ones.

SMP has carried out extensive marketing research. What is lacking, however, is research of impact, appropriateness of methods as well as studies concerning the quality of contraceptive use. A respective completion of the research programme may still increase effectiveness of interventions and thereby acceptance and use of family planing.

Sustainability: Resulting from its high contraceptive market share, the development of quality standards, respective training programmes - which are also open to the public sector - as well as its comprehensive information campaigns the programme has had broad sectoral impact.
Based on its efficient management systems and its innovative ability the programme can well serve as a conceptual model and may - with socio-cultural adaptation - be replicated in other countries and regions.

The achievement of SMP's status as a highly acknowledged national organisation, the network „GREENSTAR Social Marketing“ as well as distribution and sales figures reached so far have to a large extend been made possible by the support of German financial co-operation. Since financing of programme costs as well as the costs for contraceptives cannot be expected from other sources (public sector, sales revenues) in the near future, SMP’s dependence on external financing will sustain. Therefore SMP will only be able to maintain its performance by the degree it receives further financial support or by its ability to diversity its financial base - not only by the acquisition of donor funds but as well by the generation of own capital. Whether and to what extent the latter can be realised by the introduction of fees, the sale of consulting services to non-governmental organisations in the international context or through other measures is a question SMP should address in the following years.

Recommendations

- Initiate a comprehensive consultative process involving the government, donor agencies, social marketing organisations as well as non-governmental organisations aiming at the development of a national social marketing strategy with particular recognition of the role of German developmental co-operation for dynamic and moderation of the process as well as the development of objectives.
- Conceptualise complementary measures, e.g. in the framework of pilot approaches for social marketing in rural districts of the North-West Frontier Province and the north of the country.
- Strengthen considerably the research capacity concerning user research and impact assessment of social marketing programmes.
- Support the internal capacity of SMP for the assessment of quality and performance, e.g. by regular peer reviews.
- Reflect jointly with other donor agencies and the government on long term financing models for social marketing programmes in Pakistan.
- Discuss the future development of SMP/GREENSTAR from a - so to speak - social marketing monopolist to a social marketing service-and umbrella-organisation.

General Conclusions

The success of social marketing programmes is generally assessed by its degree of cost recovery; its primary field of implementation are densely populated urban and peri-urban areas. In the framework of poverty reduction it is also increasingly expected from social marketing programmes to extend their concepts to the poor rural population. This will inevitably lead to a decrease in efficiency and subsequently to decreasing cost recovery - due to the need for developing adapted sensitisation strategies, longer distribution channels, limited purchasing power of the rural population and a relatively slow acceptance of family planning. Governments and donors should be aware of these aggravated conditions and their implicit consequences necessitating a larger need for financial assistance.

Basic data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project title</th>
<th>Family Planning (Social Marketing of Contraceptives) I and II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Project period</td>
<td>1995 - 2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Costs (financing through FC)</td>
<td>24.8 million EUR</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executing Agency        Social Marketing Pakistan (SMP)
Recipient               Republic of Pakistan
Counterpart:            Ministry for Population Welfare

Period of Evaluation
13.08-23.08.2003

Expert
Mrs. Dr. B. Niebuhr